TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER SIX   CONCLUSIONS AND LOOKING AHEAD

CHAPTER ONE

BACKGROUND INTRODUCTION AND PARADIGM POSITION

> While apartheid did end in 1994, its effects will be felt for many years
> to come, and the memory of it will not easily disappear from the
> country's consciousness – and, I hope, it never does.

> (Van Wyk 2003:6)

1.1   INTRODUCTION

A new democracy in South Africa, with a new constitution, has led to new forms of
policing. This research project explores how police officers are adapting to work
within a new constitution. While there have been many achievements and improved
relationships between the police and the communities they serve, there are still many
challenges that lie before us. My desire is that some of these will be acknowledged
and explored creatively in this research. Before recording my research, this chapter
will describe the background motivation for this research, what areas of research are
focussed upon, my own paradigm position I have worked within, and my research
procedure. Included will also be the limitations of this research and how I have sought
to maintain ethical standards.

1.2   A NEW ERA IN SOUTH AFRICAN POLICING

1.2.1   The changing South African context

On the 2nd February 1990, President F.W. de Klerk, in an historic speech at the
opening of Parliament, announced the un-banning of liberation movements in South
Africa and the release of political prisoners including Nelson Mandela. This paved the
way towards negotiations between different political players and a new constitution in
South Africa. Following the national elections in April 1994, the new Constitution of
the Republic of South Africa, Act 108 of 1996, was enacted by the new Parliament,
replacing the interim Constitution of 1993. This new constitution, after a process of

public consultation and amendments, was signed by President Nelson Mandela on 10th December 1996 at Sharpeville and came into effect on 4th February 1997. In a booklet edited by Juta's Statutes Editors entitled "The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa" it is written:

> The choice of Sharpeville, where apartheid police had opened fire on an unarmed crowd of pass-law protestors in March 1960, was both a symbolic gesture to the memories of the 69 people killed on that day and a statement of the country's determination to turn its back on a past marked by racism and the gross violation of human rights.
>
> (Juta 2004:xv)

This quote appropriately connects the turning away from abusive policing patterns in the past (or at least the intention to do so) to the adoption of a new constitution as South Africa moves towards a new future. I view this connection as being consistent with the focus of this research project as well.

In keeping with that constitution, policing has had to undergo changes from its past practices. As William Fox, Belinda van Wyk and Marius Fourie pointed out: "…a whole new conception of how a police service should function within a democratic society had to be developed and learned" (Fox, van Wyk & Fourie 1998:i). This necessitated policy and structural changes within the police force.

1.2.2 Structural changes in the police

Structural changes within the police were primarily aimed at adapting them to be more congruent with the new constitution. F. Sydney Mufamadi, the minister of Safety and Security in the early years of South African democracy, was quoted from a media release on 25th May 1994 saying: "South Africa now has a democratically-elected and representative Government and the time has come to formulate a policing vision in keeping with both the letter and spirit of our Constitution" (Van Rooyen 1995:ii). For example, a name change occurred from being called the "South African Police Force" to the "South African Police Services."

But changes within the Police went beyond a name change. In his book on community policing, Jan Van Rooyen outlines the necessity of changes from the "para-military model" implemented in 1829 by Sir Robert Peel in the London Metropolitan Police, which was adopted by most Western police institutions including South Africa, towards a more community based policing structure. Van Rooyen argues that policing in the Western world has to change in order to address community needs and demands. He further acknowledges that: "While significant stumbling blocks exist for change and arguments can be made for the maintenance of outdated strategies, enough evidence exists that a process of change is absolutely essential and inevitable" (Van Rooyen 1995:8).

For many years there has been an acknowledgement for a need to change the police towards an institution that is more accountable for its actions to the community. All agreed that this would be a major challenge. Since then we have seen police powers, and the abuse thereof, being curtailed through accountability structures such as Community Police Forums (see 2.3.5) and the Independent Complaints Directorate (see 2.3.7). However, even before my research began, I was aware that there has been some debate on whether these new structures have brought about their intended aims or not. My impression was that there has been a mixture of successes and places that have been less successful. As a result, structural changes are continually occurring, making this research an ongoing challenge.

Chapter Two will outline what some of these developments were before and during the time of this research project. I have had personal experience in some of these changes (see 1.3.2). I have seen the implications of those changes that are still being experienced and the problems that are gradually being addressed. Other researchers have written extensively on this, so my account on that history will be brief. The question now is about where this research project is heading.

1.3   THE FIELD OF RESEARCH

1.3.1   The Research question

Within the above context, I was curious about what effects these changes have had upon South African police officers. Some of the changes may have a positive effect, while others may be experienced negatively or as a future challenge.

This research focuses specifically on White, middle-management police officers in the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands. The reason for this is not simply because of their willingness, but because this category of policemen was once central in the structures and are now more marginalized. White policemen once held all the positions of power in the police, but that is no longer the situation. Many top positions are being held by those of other races and White policemen are becoming marginalized in the police because of their past association with upholding apartheid laws. Narrative researchers (a position I will elaborate on in 1.6.2) are interested in the marginalized stories of people (the stories that people do not give much attention to in their lives) and the stories of marginalized people (people who have been sidelined by society structures or circumstances). I wanted them to be able to speak about their experiences and how those experiences affected their lives. Later we would explore whether their stories were unique within the broader experience of police officers.

While having my own questions of curiosity, I wanted to be open-ended enough with my research question. In each conversation, I allowed each participant to describe their experiences in their own words and what they felt the most important issues were. This is because I agree with Elliot Mishler who states: "We are more likely to find stories reported in studies using relatively unstructured interviews where respondents are invited to speak in their own voices, allowed to control the introduction and flow of topics, and encouraged to extend their responses" (Mishler 1986:69). The process I followed is explained further in 1.7.

A secondary question centred upon whether there are helpful and unhelpful ways of dealing with policing under a new constitution. My hope was that, as people spoke about their experiences and engaged with a wider audience's response later in the

process, that they would see those experiences in a new and preferable light – something Michael White refers to as a "unique outcome" (see 1.6.5). Not only would this have therapeutic value for the participants in the research, but might help other police officers deal with their working environment. This would be consistent with a narrative approach in research as Elmarie Kotzé and Dirk Kotzé put forward:

> Research too often becomes an intellectual activity with researchers obtaining degrees on or receiving acknowledgement based on the suffering of others – with the latter most likely not to benefit from the research. We are committed… to participatory action research that will primarily be to the advantage of the participants.

(Kotzé & Kotzé 2001:9)

While these questions are central to my research, I also need to acknowledge my own personal reasons for choosing this pathway. This is so that I can be as transparent as possible and recognise the fact that I am not a total outsider who is absolutely neutral in this research.

1.3.2   Personal reasons for choosing this field

As an ordained minister in the Methodist Church of Southern Africa, I became interested in working with the police through the Community Police Forum (hereafter referred to as the CPF) since 1996. Prior to 1994, when abuse amongst police officers was notorious, I had no desire towards such a partnership. But, as the political landscape in South Africa changed and new challenges of policing emerged, my thinking began to change. I was deeply challenged by the words of Gordon MacDonald as he wrote about his own "…renewed challenge of insisting that my life of following Christ be absolutely nose to nose with what is going on in the 'streets' where people live and work" (MacDonald 1989:10). Consequently, I became involved in the Meyerton CPF where I lived.

During my participation there, I learned about the multi-faceted tasks facing members of the SAPS under a new constitution. As Peter Stevens and Dianna Yach put it: "a service model which values the omnicompetent generalist who plays a multiciplicity

of roles – diplomat, negotiator, investigator, peacekeeper, crime fighter, enforcer of law, coach and counsellor" (Stevens & Yach 1995:89). Conversations with policemen led me to appreciate and seriously consider the issues facing them. My curiosity gathered momentum through watching actuality programmes on television and reading newspaper articles. Continuous stories of frustrations and stresses in their lives compelled me to respond. I then embarked upon a Masters course at the University of Pretoria, where I learnt about a narrative approach to research and I focussed on the effects of violent crime upon their lives. At that time, I was stationed in Camperdown and Richmond in Kwazulu-Natal. Again, I was involved in the local Community Police Forum and met police officers willing to share their stories with me. Two of them, along with a new participant, become my co-researchers (a term explained in 1.6.6) in this project as well. In Chapter Three the names of these participants are recorded as Jody, Pieter and Leon. They are the people whose stories I listened to first.

One of the emerging themes from my previous research was that of policing within the boundaries of a new constitution. This, with the resultant changes in policing practices, became something these policemen and I wanted to explore further. Alongside the research question I have outlined in 1.3.1, my personal aim that I needed to acknowledge was twofold. Firstly, it was to discover a pastoral response from my perspective as a minister in the church. This would possibly help other pastors and caregivers who share a similar interest in this field. And secondly, I would hope that this benefits these policemen in their work environment, particularly in expressing their stories and concerns as well as helping them grow as individuals as a result of such reflection. These aims stem from my own passion in the area of Practical Theology, the subject that opened me to these opportunities in the first place.

1.4   MY JOURNEY IN PRACTICAL THEOLOGY

Coming from a background of Practical Theology, I need to acknowledge the influence of many scholars in my journey. There are too many to mention by name and the history of Practical Theology is beyond the scope of this thesis. However, my supervisor and I felt that it was important to mention some of them for at least three reasons. Firstly, everything in this research, including the methodology, does not

emerge in a vacuum. There is a history of valuable contributions that has led us to our approach. Secondly, this thesis is done within the subject of Practical Theology, which affects the evaluation of the discourses and conclusions that emerge. In other words, I am not doing this research as a Criminologist or a Social Worker etc, but as a Practical Theologian. And thirdly, we felt that it is also consistent with my thesis when it comes to evaluating the discussions with my co-researchers. This is because the thoughts and opinions of the police officers have a particular history to them that need to be explored. After discussing these historical influences, I will position myself in terms of the paradigm I chose to work within. But first, let us focus on some of the contributions through my journey in Practical Theology.

1.4.1   Early historical developments

Practical Theology is a subject that has been forced to justify its existence as a separate discipline within theology as well as a credible scientific discipline. From biblical times, theology has sought to be both practical and theoretical, but practical theology as an autonomous subject received varying degrees of recognition throughout church history. For the most part, practical theology was seen as the application of a theoretical theology. However, during the Enlightenment, practical theology increased its influence as an autonomous discipline. The Roman Catholic, F.S. Rautenstrauch (who proposed practical theology as a theological subject at the University of Vienna, which was accepted in 1774) and the Protestant, Friedrich E. Schleiermacher, were instrumental in making practical theology an accepted discipline, albeit applied dogmatics (Wolfaardt 1978). This was taken further in the Twentieth Century in a way that relates directly to research in Practical Theology.

1.4.2   20th Century developments

In terms of practical theology becoming a source of information that contributes to theology (rather than the other way around), the 20th Century contributions of scholars such as Seward Hiltner became significant. Hiltner was a student of Anton Boisen, a hospital chaplain and founder of Clinical Pastoral Education in the U.S.A. According to John Patton, Boisen "understood both patient and chaplain to be learners from the crisis experience" (Patton 2000:51) and so "contributed to the breaking down of the

rigid barriers between patient and pastor" (Patton 2000:51). I immediately liked the idea of breaking down barriers and learning together, which has become an important value for me and helped me embrace a "not-knowing position" later (see 1.6.4). Hiltner took this further by lifting practical theology out of a mere technique and give it a more scientific footing, whereby its practice could contribute to the development of theory through reflection upon our experience. As Hiltner himself said:

> Pastoral theology is defined here as that branch or field of theological knowledge and inquiry that brings the shepherding perspective to bear upon all the operations and functions of the church and the minister, and then draws conclusions of a theological order from reflection on these observations.

(Hiltner 1958:20)

The influence of psychology upon practical theology was also part of the work of those like Hiltner, Paul E. Johnson, Carroll A. Wise and Wayne E. Oates (Lapsley 1969:37). Their contribution to the subject of practical theology, and especially its relationship to other disciplines, still has a significant role in this thesis insofar as interdisciplinary relationships have developed, which is the focus in Chapter 5. John Patton, however, points out one of the weaknesses as being too individualistic in its psychological bias. It was up to practical theologians to rise to the growing challenges of ethics, hermeneutics (interpreting situations) and contextual issues such as race, gender, class and power (Patton 2000:49).

Don Browning, one of Hiltner's students, recognised the pressures of pluralism and contributed towards Practical Theology in terms of ethical considerations. He correctly saw secular psychology, for example, as seeking to be neutral in terms of values. But he said, "there are good reasons for believing that modern psychologies, rather than being neutral, have simply introduced alternative religio-ethical visions, some of which are compatible and some incompatible with various expressions of the Western religious tradition" (Browning 1990:364). While we make use of other disciplines, we do not accept their views uncritically. It means that when we deal with situations, there are ethical considerations (both personal and within the community) from our Judeo-Christian tradition that are part of the encounter. We cannot remain

neutral in our encounters with others, not even within research (see 1.6.2.2 and 1.7.5). In addition to bringing theological ethics and social sciences together in this way, Browning argues that in practical theology: "Morals, meanings, and ideals should shape a vision of humanity and the kinds of activity that help to work towards this vision" (Woodward & Pattison 2000:89). Within a pluralistic and interdisciplinary context, those ethical and visioning considerations mean that the practical theologian has a valuable contribution to make while working alongside other disciplines. The ethics involved not only include ethics on an individual level with the people I work with but seek to benefit the wider community as well. I also value the idea of working towards a new vision for the individuals and the community. My hope is that this research will contribute towards this new vision.

Howard Clinebell has been another important influence in shaping my understanding in practical theology. Speaking about pastoral care, he says that: "The image of the *life saving station* must be put alongside the image of a *garden* where persons' growth is nurtured…" (Clinebell 1984:28). In other words, pastoral care is not only about ministering to people during times of crisis, but also to enable people to grow into their full potential and "be agents of wholeness in the lives of other people and in society" (Clinebell 1984:28). I think that this not only applies to pastoral care, but is applicable in my research in practical theology. This idea has helped me embrace the view that this research can be beneficial in the growth of the people I work with, rather than only seeing help in terms of therapeutic value. As people engage on a growth journey, their lives take on new meaning and their potential can be actualised. Thus, this research is not just about my growth but also the growth of the policemen I had conversations with.

Charles Gerkin based his pastoral theology on hermeneutical principles. This means that the pastor and congregation member interpret their situation and seek to recover religious meaning in their life, albeit with the limitations of language. The interpretation of situations is done with reference to our biblical heritage, seeking to interpret biblical metaphors of God's relationship to people and seek metaphors for today's world. Hence, other disciplines and cultural considerations are not simply received uncritically by the Practical Theologian or pastoral counsellor. This position helped me correct possible imbalances brought about through adopting other

disciplines' methods uncritically. A similar contribution to my thinking occurred in my exposure to liberation and feminist theology.

1.4.3   Liberation and Feminist Theology

The issues of the wider context, which were brought to the fore by feminist theologians and liberation theology, have also influenced my approach. The approach of liberation theology was to examine the broader context in which people lived and to challenge those ideas that contribute towards the abuse of power. Hence it tended to side with the poor and oppressed whose stories were marginalized by those in power and the dominant culture. Liberation theology questioned these dominant powers and the way in which society was structured. Because of that, it can be noted that liberation theology was viewed negatively by the State in South Africa during the apartheid era. This theology also used the concept of "drinking from our own well" or taking as one's starting point, your lived experience. Susan Rakoczy, writing about feminist theology, a branch of liberation theology, says: "Feminist theology has two tasks: to deconstruct and critique the male cultural paradigms in theological thought and to construct and formulate new perspectives" (Rakoczy 2004:17). In terms of practical theology, we utilise the lived experience of people as a source of information to shape theology further. Liberation theology has also given us tools to critique or deconstruct the discourses and ways of thinking we have taken for granted in our various cultures and experiences. Questioning our experiences and the wider societal and cultural influences, particularly the way in which those things have sidelined certain groups (namely the poor), is an important contribution that liberation and feminist theology have made. Some, however, may feel that liberation theology has over-emphasised the context and neglected the theoretical considerations of our heritage. Nevertheless, liberation and feminist theology have forced practical theology to wrestle with the relationship between theory and practice, especially within the broader cultural context, in critiquing and deconstructing it.

1.4.4   My positioning on the theory-practice relationship

So where does this history leave me positioned in terms of Practical Theology? There are considerations from each of the above that I have valued and contributed to my

paradigm positioning. With Alastair Campbell, I would be against a purely *inductive* method as Hiltner uses (practice contributing to theory) and a purely *deductive* method as Eduard Thurneysen uses (practice as merely applied theory). I agree with Campbell when he says that bringing theory and concrete situations together "is more an exercise in creative imagination, the interplay of idea and action, with all the ambiguity and inconclusiveness which this implies" (Campbell 2000:85). In other words, concrete situations are reflected upon theologically, shaping and being shaped by theology (and other disciplines) all the time.

In this research, I begin with the concrete situations that police officers find themselves in. But I do so with the awareness that there is already a theology and way of thinking mixed in with their opinions and coping mechanisms. I also know that there is still reflective work that needs to be done as we move towards a new future. There we use tools of various other disciplines, including theology and revelation (the bible and historical traditions), to assist and enrich our understanding.

The works of Browning and Gerkin have forced me to ask questions in my research about God and ethics in the lives of my co-researchers. This has not been in conflict at all with the narrative approach, which opens doors to the stories of God in our lives as well. I have sought to do this reflective and interpretative work together with the police officers throughout my research process, so that we can learn together. This aspect of the research is recorded mainly in Chapter Four. The policemen I work with in this research is, in my opinion, an emerging sidelined group, whose stories need to be heard so that they may discover a positive vision for the future in their lives.

1.5   PARADIGMATIC POSITIONING

With the above influences in my life and continuously being exposed to new ones, I needed to place myself within a scientific paradigm in which to operate as a practical theologian. Through my years of training I have journeyed through a modern and postmodern paradigm and now find myself in a postfoundationalist worldview. This section will describe each of these shifts and its effect on my methodology.

1.5.1   The Modern (foundationalist) paradigm

My early training in practical theology had a distinctly modernist flavour. The modernist view was that there are universally true foundations that are applicable for all times and situations. When one knows those foundations, one becomes an expert in that field and enables one to be totally objective in every situation. Wentzel van Huyssteen describes modernism (a foundationalist paradigm) when he says that:

> [I]t is the belief that scientific progress and true discoveries are the result of adhering to a universally accepted, value-free, and objective methodology. This not only implies that truth results from an adherence to objectivity, but also reveals the foundationalist assumption that all true knowledge rests on a few unquestionable beliefs.

(Van Huyssteen 1999:29)

The effect that this paradigm and subsequent training had upon my ministry is that people viewed me as an expert in my field and would seek me out to sort out their problems. In many cases this approach worked, but this created a certain level of dependency upon "expert knowledge" rather than people discovering their own resourcefulness. This is despite the contribution Boisen had made regarding the partnership of learning between the patient and pastor. Another dynamic I discovered was that police personnel were reluctant to go for formal counselling with an outside expert, but would share their stories during informal discussions with me. This is confirmed by what Evelyn Slaght, a Social Work professor, discovered when she wrote: "not all officers are comfortable with sharing individual and family issues with 'outsiders'" (Slaght 2002:34). By "outsiders" she was referring to "expert" professionals. From a pastoral and research point of view, this "expert" approach was not satisfactory for me.

As far as research was concerned, the researcher was viewed as the expert with privileged knowledge and the subjects being distantly researched and making universal conclusions. Mats Alvesson describes this as being: "eager to establish a context-free truth about reality 'out there' through following a research protocol and

getting responses to it, minimizing researcher influence and other sources of bias" (Alvesson 2003:15). Julian Müller captured something of my own dissatisfaction with this approach and its claim to universal truths when referring to a report by the Reformed Ecumenical Council on HIV/AIDS in Africa. The report had a typically modernistic style in giving an overview of the situation, the theological principles involved and some applications for caring. He says of this:

> Although the last few pages of the publication seem to provide good "theories for praxis", the publication still leaves the reader with a feeling of frustration and even hopelessness, the reason for it being the lack of integration achieved between context and principles from the gospel. The application part is detached from the descriptive part. It is as if all contexts are the same. Africa could have been Iceland for that matter.

> (Müller 2004:293)

While my early training in counselling and research had been distinctly modernist, I was excited by new possibilities in a postmodern worldview. The postmodern view may have many variances in terms of how it is understood and applied. Therefore, the next section describes the way in which I understood and utilised it in my further development.

1.5.2   The Postmodern (nonfoundationalist) paradigm

During my Masters studies, I was introduced to the scientific paradigm of postmodernism. Regarding postmodernism, Kotzé and Kotzé assert that: "It is generally accepted that we are in a process of an important paradigm shift, moving from a modern to a postmodern society" (Kotzé & Kotzé 1997:28). The postmodern epistemology emerged in reaction to the claims of certainty made by modernism and the accompanying confidence in objective truth. Furthermore, they state that: "Postmodern discourses… seek to distance us from and make us sceptical about beliefs concerning truths, knowledge, power, the self, and language that are often taken for granted…" (Kotzé & Kotzé 1997:40). Van Huyssteen, who uses the terms "nonfoundationalism" or "anti-foundationalism" (a rejection of the foundationalist

position of universal truths) and sees it as "one of the most important philosophical roots of postmodernism" (Van Huyssteen 1999:11), says something similar when he says:

> …postmodern science and postmodern philosophy of science have moved away quite dramatically from positivist and technocentric conceptions of scientific rationality with its closely aligned beliefs in linear progress, guaranteed success, deterministic predictability, absolute truths, and some uniform, standardized form of knowledge.

(Van Huyssteen 1999:6)

This paradigm opposes the idea of an outside, objective observer or researcher who is unaffected by the research data. This, in turn, paves the way towards a social constructionist position of co-researching (see 1.6.1), rather than an "expert" objectively researching various participants who are passive. I have been encouraged to take a respectful look at people's lives and allow them to tell their story in their own words, as already stated in 1.3.1. I will say more about this later when dealing with the narrative approach to research in 1.6.

There have been some concerns regarding postmodernism that have been raised by other theologians. Two examples are Michael Cassidy and Klaus Nürnberger. Cassidy describes his understanding of postmodernism as follows:

> …Postmoderns see truth as that which basically is located within the individual communities in which we were raised and conditioned. So they reject the Enlightenment search for a universal, supra-cultural and timeless truth. Rather do they see truth as that which is simply the expression of how a specific community sees things…. So truth is no longer universal but rather local in nature. There is not one truth, but many different truths. This plurality of truths can exist alongside one another and in juxtaposition to each other and even in contradiction to each other. This introduces a species of radical relativism and pluralism.

(Cassidy 2005:160)

He says that everyone has their own, equally valid opinions (Cassidy 2005:161) and concludes that: "All this leaves people swimming or even drowning in a sea of moral, philosophical and intellectual relativism" (Cassidy 2005:163).

Another example of a South African theologian who has concerns about postmodernism is Klaus Nürnberger. Certainly, Nürnberger appreciates aspects of postmodernism, for example, "that it appreciates variety and respects the right of others to be different" (Nürnberger 2007:222), rather than the "the dogged determination of modernity to get everything under control, force everybody into a system, or achieve pre-determined goals" (Nürnberger 2007:223). However, his argument is that we need foundations or guidelines to determine our values and relationships. Without foundations, we fall prey to what he says "*may suddenly assume a power you may never have suspected*" (Nürnberger 2007:225). He lists many examples such as the tolerance of witchcraft, excessive wealth versus poverty, apartheid and so on, as extreme expressions of appreciating diversity without the criteria of validity and acceptability (Nürnberger 2007:228-229). Thus, he opposes the postmodern notion that there is no need for universal foundations. But he correctly goes on to add that: "What we can learn from postmodernity is that we must become more humble in our claims to be in possession of the truth" (Nürnberger 2007:233).

With these concerns about a postmodern paradigm, the question then becomes: Is there a way to utilize the strengths of both modernistic and postmodern worldviews? The answer to this came during my further studies in the form of postfoundationalism.

1.5.3   The Postfoundational paradigm

Recently, I have been exposed to the work of Wentzel van Huyssteen who introduces a concept called "postfoundationalism." He has developed a model "to move beyond the epistemological dichotomy of foundationalist objectivism and nonfoundationalist relativism. This option is what I have called *postfoundationalism*" (Van Huyssteen 1999:8). In other words, postfoundationalism moves "beyond the extremes of absolutism and the relativism of extreme forms of pluralism" (Van Huyssteen 2000:430). This is done as we communicate meaningfully with each other and

between different disciplines in an ongoing process of evaluation and assessment together.

One of the aims in postfoundationalism is to see "whether any form of interdisciplinary rationality can be credibly achieved" (Van Huyssteen 1999:3). This is especially so between theology and other sciences. Van Huyssteen utilises the term "transversality," which "identifies different but equally legitimate ways of looking at issues or disciplines" (Van Huyssteen 2000:429). He speaks strongly against any claims of certain sciences being a superior form of knowledge to others and against any universal statements of knowledge. Rather, he argues that each discipline has its own contribution to make where there are points of meeting one another and points of differences. Knowledge is also found in the local situation rather than making the claim to being universally true. Thus, he says that:

> …while we always come to our cross-disciplinary conversations with strong beliefs, commitments, and even prejudices, epistemological postfoundationalism enables us to identify the shared resources of human rationality in different modes of knowledge and then to reach beyond the boundaries of our own traditional communities in cross-disciplinary conversation.

(Van Huyssteen 2000:430)

As I work with multiple disciplines such as theology and criminology, this approach has been helpful in my research "to identify possible points of consonance, but also possible points of difference between widely divergent reasoning strategies" (Van Huyssteen 1999:7). His term "transversality" where different disciplines can speak respectfully to one another, finding points of common ground, is applicable here. While this approach does not force us all to agree with one another, it does help us appreciate each discipline, including our own, in order learn from one another and to gain a greater understanding of the issues facing us.

In their article, Karlijn Demasure and Julian Müller argue in favour of a similarity between postfoundationalism and social constructionism (1.6.1), and thus compatible with the narrative research approach. The article argues for a link between the

hermeneutics of Paul Ricoeur's prefiguration (the knowledge, prejudices and feelings we bring with us into a situation), configuration (encountering the situation or event) and refiguration (new interpretations that emerge) with social constructionism (1.6.1) and postfoundationalism. They summarise the common criteria as follows:

> Preference for stories in stead [*sic*] of concepts and arguments
>
> Locally contextual
>
> Socially constructed stories and identities
>
> In dialogue with the tradition
>
> Exploring interdisciplinary meaning

> (Demasure & Müller 2006:419)

With this paradigm position in mind, I believe it affects my understanding of narrative research (1.6) and my methodology (1.7).

1.6   NARRATIVE RESEARCH CONCEPTS

Through reading and group discussions in my studies, I saw the connection between our paradigmatic position and a narrative approach to therapy and research. Being different to my previous studies, I had to learn new terminology used in a narrative approach. Concepts such as "social constructionism," "narrative," "discourses," "a not-knowing position," "unique outcomes," and "co-researchers" were all new to me. Here is a brief explanation of these terms and their consequences for this research.

1.6.1   Social constructionism

The narrative approach positions itself within the paradigm of social constructionism. As Jill Freedman and Gene Combs discovered: "As we read and studied more widely about the stream of ideas from which David Epston, Cheryl White, and Michael White had taken the narrative metaphor, we found that another important current in the same stream was that of *social constructionism*" (Freedman & Combs 1996:16). Julian Müller, Wilhelm van Deventer and Lourens Human confirm this when they write: "As narrative therapists, pastors and researchers, we position ourselves within

the social-constructionist (some would say: postmodern) paradigm" (Müller, van Deventer & Human 2001:77).

Social constructionism emphasises that reality and knowledge are socially constructed. Our knowledge does not emerge in a vacuum. It comes from a history of other stories that are found in our cultures, our society and as we interact with other people. Our opinions or interpretations of events are formed together with other people and institutions various disciplines. Freedman and Combs state that "…its main premise is that the beliefs, values, institutions, customs, labels, laws, divisions of labor [*sic*], and the like that make up our social realities are constructed by members of a culture as they interact with one another from generation to generation and day to day" (Freedman & Combs 1996:16). Julian Müller connects social constructionism with postfoundationalism when he writes: "Van Huyssteen does not use the terminology of social-constructionism, but clearly uses a similar line of thought when arguing for postfoundationalist rationality" (Müller 2004:299) and goes on to say that, in social-constructionism and postfoundationalism, there is "a deep-rooted belief that we, with our rationality, are socially constructed" (Müller 2004:299).

There is thus an interrelationship between people themselves, their culture, beliefs, etc. that help people interpret their world. As such, their worlds are continually changing as this interaction continues. It is for this reason that I used a number of different sources in my research, such as newspapers, documentaries, other people working in a related field, etc. Each form part of how we interpret our world. As we read and interact with these sources, encountering them often on a daily basis, our opinions are shaped, challenged or reinforced. These stories from other sources were present during the research process and needed to be taken in account when listening to my co-researchers. As with our experiences, these need to be deconstructed or critiqued as well, so that their opinions are not simply adopted wholeheartedly into our beliefs and worldview.

Language and imagining also form part of social constructionism. Modernists would view language as a way to describe an objective reality, but postmodernists "focus on how the language that we use *constitutes* our world and belief" (Freedman & Combs 1996:28). Likewise, Kotzé and Kotzé write the way in which meaning is created

through conversations with one another and go on to say that: "Life is experienced within language and how we experience is given meaning to within the parameters of our language. The language we grow up and live in within a specific culture, specifies or constitutes the experiences we have" (Kotzé & Kotzé 1997:32). Finding new ways of imagining and speaking about our reality can open the way towards preferred ways of living. For this reason, I was interested in the way my co-researchers worded their stories and I have included transcripts as an appendix.

1.6.2 Narrative

1.6.2.1 What is a narrative approach?

A narrative approach emerges out of the social constructionist paradigm. It seeks to listen to various "stories" including those of the person, the society and the culture. By listening in a respectful, non-blaming way, it "centres people as the experts in their own lives…. and assumes people have many skills, competencies, beliefs, values, commitments and abilities that will assist them to reduce the influence of problems in their lives" (Morgan 2000:2). As a result, each story is unique because no person experiences the same variables of circumstance, beliefs and interactions with people. This sets the tone for the distinctiveness of a narrative approach to research.

Popular methods of doing research include qualitative, quantitative, literary and structural approaches. A narrative approach, while using elements from these approaches due to its social constructionist framework, is distinct from them. In order to outline the distinctiveness, I will briefly compare a narrative approach to some of the other methods.

1.6.2.2 The distinctiveness in narrative research

The closest association to a narrative approach would be that of a qualitative nature. This is because it explores people's stories as one would with case studies, seeking to describe and understand the context and meaning of their stories. According to John Florell: "In the case study method, an in-depth analysis of a single individual using qualitative terms and concepts is frequently used. The research question may highlight

an unusual problem, or demonstrate how to work with a particular individual" (Florell 1990:354). This method is not foreign to the police as they take detailed statements of people's stories that must be thorough enough to withstand the scrutiny of a court. The narrative approach, however, differs from the case study research method in that it does not take an outsider, objective position, but "strives for participatory interaction" (Müller, Van Deventer & Human 2001:78). My co-researchers did not only give me data but were involved in the interpretation process as far as possible.

If one did research in a quantitative manner, one would utilise statistical data. This is a popular method used within the SAPS in analysing and reporting crime. Comparing figures help them with strategic planning and performance ratings. However, the results are often generalised, placing people and events in categories. Antoinette Louw from the Institute of Security Studies simply states that: "Crime statistics are, and always will be, a source of debate" (Louw 2001:1). Elliot Mishler says that the "awareness of the contextual grounds of meaning is suppressed… and excluded from the interpretation of findings" (Mishler 1986:5). I would not want to discard this method of research entirely, simply because statistics also influence people's stories and perceptions. The use of statistical data can be used within a narrative approach as one story amongst many others.

Another popular method of research is turning to literature, reading critically and processing the information into our own words. According to J.J. Kritzinger: "The discovery of *something new* is only a minor issue here" (Kritzinger 2001:15). This method, on its own, may become lifeless and produce an "expert" in that field. One can manipulate this approach by choosing one's authors and manipulating information. Despite its limits, this can be valuable for narrative research because it brings our stories into dialogue with other opinions, forming a new story. As Müller put it: "Jy as leser is nie op die oomblik net besig om my as skrywer se boek te lees en onbevange my storie te ontvang nie. Jy is besig om jou eie verhaal en hierdie nuwe verhaal wat jy lees, gelyktydig te gebruik in *storymaking*" (Müller 2000:18). [As a reader, you are not reading my book in a detached way. You are simultaneously using your own story and the story you are reading together in storymaking]. As narrative researchers, we deconstruct the literature, examining its biases, and in effect, become co-authors in creating a new story.

Another approach to research uses structured questions. These questions tend to limit responses to a restricted choice of answers. It elicits information out of people's story that will be useful to the researcher. Mishler describes this interviewing practice as: "where respondents' stories are suppressed in that their responses are limited to 'relevant' answers to narrowly specified questions" (Mishler 1986:68). A narrative approach, however, listens to the story as told in the person's own words and "the meaning that members attribute to events…" (White & Epston 1990:3). This I found both quite difficult and fulfilling because I had to keep checking whether I understood the meaning that each co-researcher wanted to convey, or whether I was filtering the information for my own purposes. One of the things I found helpful was to examine the discourses that lay behind each story that was shared.

1.6.3   Discourses

Narrative researchers listen for discourses that have shaped people's perceptions and behaviour. Vivien Burr defines discourses as "a set of meanings, metaphors, representations, images, stories, statements and so on that in some way together produce a particular version of events" (Burr 1995:48). He goes on to say: "For each of us, then, a multitude of discourses is constantly at work constructing and producing our identity" (Burr 1995:53). An example of a discourse would be that of our picture of God. Trevor Hudson, for example, writes that: "…the way we live is profoundly shaped by our picture of God" (Hudson 1995:19). Some would use their picture to justify harsh penalties such as the death penalty. Others would emphasise the call for forgiveness. In this thesis, some of the discourses shaping the lives of police officers become clearer in the themes that emerge from our discussions. We then explored these further in Chapters Four and Five where, within the narrative approach, we deconstruct these discourses, viewing them critically to see where they come from and whether they are still appropriate for us today.

1.6.4   Not-knowing position

A "not-knowing position" does not mean that the researcher has no knowledge or expertise regarding the conversation, but rather to "…empower the companion to take

on the role of being the actual expert" (Müller 1999:10). The "not-knowing position" means "turning our backs on 'expert' filters" and "not asking questions from a position of pre-understanding" (Freedman & Combs 1996:44). Freedman and Combs go on to say that: "We are curious about people's unique answers and we encourage people to develop them more fully" (Freedman & Combs 1996:45). I would prefer to use the phrase "not all-knowing" because when we enter a conversation with someone, we usually have some knowledge of the subject, but could never claim to know everything, nor draw universal conclusions regarding the topic. Certainly, over the years of working within the Community Police Forum, some ideas have taken shape in my mind, including my own biases and prejudices. But within a narrative approach, I sincerely attempt to open myself to new stories that are shared by my co-researchers.

1.6.5 Unique outcomes

Because each story is dynamic and ever changing, it can produce insights that have not been predicted. Michael White coined the term "unique outcomes" to refer to such instances. Within narrative therapy, it refers to "…'facts' or events that contradict the problem's effects in their lives and in their relationships" (White & Epston 1990:56). These are also referred to as "sparkling events" (Freedman & Combs 1996:89). Part of my research involves listening for such instances in how police officers deal positively with their work under a new constitution. One cannot predict whether these moments will occur. As Müller, Van Deventer and Human put it: "A narrative researcher is patient and interested and curious. He or she doesn't know beforehand what the solutions are or should be" (Müller, Van Deventer & Human 2001:84). But when these moments arise, they are inspirational for everyone in the discussion.

1.6.6 Co-researchers

Within a narrative approach to research, the term "co-researchers" is used. This is because I as a researcher writing this thesis do not take an outsider, objective position. Instead, I want to remain consistent with a social constructionist position. As such, a narrative approach "strives for participatory interaction" (Müller, Van Deventer & Human 2001:78). In doing such research "we would choose not to use language such

as 'research objects', or 'research population', but rather refer to them as *research participants* or *co-researchers*" (Müller, Van Deventer & Human 2001:77). As a result, Dirk Kotzé writes that: "The participants are the co-owners of the research and cannot be left out at any stage" (Kotzé, Myburg, Roux & Associates 2002:28). I have tried as far as possible to involve my co-researchers in the entire process of research. This process is the topic to which I now turn to.

1.7 RESEARCH PROCEDURE

An article on postfoundationalism by Müller helped me connect my paradigm position to my research procedure. In it Müller quotes a definition of postfoundationalist theology by Van Huyssteen (1997:4) and develops a seven movement process of research. The quote he uses is:

> … a postfoundationalist theology wants to make two moves. Firstly, it fully acknowledges contextuality, the epistemically crucial role of interpreted experience, and the way that tradition shapes the epistemic and nonepistemic values that inform our reflection about God and what some of us believe to be God's presence in this world. At the same time, however, a postfoundationalist notion of rationality in theological reflection claims to point creatively beyond the confines of the local community, group, or culture towards a plausible form of interdisciplinary conversation.

(Müller 2004:300; see Van Huyssteen 1997:4)

From that quote, Müller developed the following 7 movements:

The context and interpreted experience.
1. A specific context is described.
2. In-context experiences are listened to and described.
3. Interpretations of experiences are made, described and developed in collaboration with "co-researchers."

Traditions of interpretation.
4. A description of experiences as it is continually informed by traditions of interpretation.

God's presence.

5. A reflection on God's presence, as it is understood and experienced in a specific situation.

Thickening through interdisciplinary investigation.

6. A description of experience, thickened through interdisciplinary investigation.

Point beyond the local community.

7. The development of alternative interpretations that point beyond the local community.

(Müller 2004:300)

I have used these seven movements to guide me through my research procedure. This is so that my paradigm position and my research methodology would be congruent. The following is an overview of how I went about doing my research. Some of the movements overlapped with one another as I implemented them, but were useful in giving me direction in my continuing conversations.

1.7.1   Movement One

A specific context is described.

For the first movement, where a specific context is described, I have given a brief outline at the beginning of this chapter (1.1 – 1.3) of the context the police work within. Furthermore, I will outline of some important contextual considerations in Chapter Two, particularly regarding the structural changes that have taken place. Because I have been involved in this arena for many years, much of that information may be "taken for granted" knowledge. But for others who may be unfamiliar with it, I felt it was necessary to give that background information in order to place the conversations I had with my co-researchers within the wider context.

I also needed to describe my own context to my co-researchers, particularly those who had never worked with me before. Once I had approached members of the South African Police Services who lived and worked in the same area as myself (namely,

the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands), I explained the narrative approach to my research both verbally and with an information sheet (Appendix 1). During the explanation I assured them of my ethical considerations (see 1.9), I asked for their willingness to participate and they signed a consent form (Appendix 2).

The members who were willing to participate (namely Jody, Pieter and Leon) were White middle-management Police officers (holding the rank of Captain), working at various stations in the area. This was my chosen focus as stated in 1.3.1. Each of them had experience in being the Station Commander and Branch Commanders at nearby police stations or presently work in such a position. Although they all know each other, none of them work at the same police station. They are all married men, with grown up children.

In this movement, I acknowledge having some knowledge of the issues facing the police and am clear about my methodology. However, during these initial stages, I allowed my co-researchers to discern what topic we would explore, namely policing under a new constitution. That decision had an impact upon the specific context that needed to be described from both their side (the topic) as well as from mine (my methodology).

1.7.2   Movement Two

In-context experiences are listened to and described.

Julian Müller and Kobus Schoeman made the important point that: "Stories need to be listened to and to be heard in their intentional meaning" (Müller & Schoeman 2004:8). They went on to say that: "The very first requirement for entering into a respectful relationship, is to make a movement towards the other instead of expecting the other to move towards you" (Müller & Schoeman 2004:8). By that they mean going to the people in their context to listen to their stories. This I tried to do by firstly meeting with my co-researchers in their homes for the interview and also by visiting them at their place of work. Their workplace gave me a visual picture of the things my co-researchers described, and going to their homes had a number of advantages.

My first formal interview with each of my co-researchers was done in their own homes. This was done, firstly, so that they would be the ones who felt in control of the discussion in terms of the time we met and the content and flow of the discussion. I wanted to counteract the perception of my "power position" as a clergy / researcher / expert as much as possible because of our postmodern sensitivity to the "power imbalances between participants" (Kotzé, Myburg, Roux & Associates 2002:18). This is because I agree when Dirk Kotzé says: "Those who have a voice and power have an ethical obligation to use the privilege of their knowledge/power to ensure participation with the marginalized and silenced, to listen *to* them, but not to decide *for* them, and to engage in participatory solidarity *with* them" (Kotzé, Myburg, Roux & Associates 2002:18). Going to the homes of my co-researchers was one way of shifting the "power" of the interview process onto them, rather than onto me had it been done in my church office.

The second reason I went to their homes individually was because I did not want to deal with the problems related to trying to get a whole group together at once. This is difficult when people work at different times with various other commitments. As Jo Viljoen discovered in her research: "All the participants were not always present at the group meetings, as work pressure, stress leave, vacations and personal crises did not always allow for their presence" (Viljoen 2001:18). This conversation was an extensive interview, covering the stories that my co-researchers felt were the most relevant for them within the scope of our agreed topic. And I wanted to give each participant as much opportunity to share their individual story in the time and space that was most convenient for them. Apart from the logistics of hosting a big group, I did not want the conversations to be interrupted by too many inputs at once. Also, I did not want to limit what was said by having my co-researchers self-editing themselves in front of other colleagues for whatever reason.

These conversations were recorded and checked with the person involved giving an opportunity to make corrections and additions or withdraw certain statements. If through further discussions they came to a new point of view, the original view would be recorded as such, with any new insight being recorded later as a possible unique outcome. The discussion topics are recorded in Chapter 3 alongside the third movement of the interpretations we made together.

1.7.3   Movement Three

Interpretations of experiences are made, described and developed in collaboration with "co-researchers."

From that first interview, I gathered the themes I observed. I then checked with my co-researchers whether they were accurate and if they wanted to add any information. Here they were exposed to issues others had raised and could comment on it too. For example, if one police officer raised a particular topic, I could raise it with the other co-researchers for their comments, without betraying confidentiality, although I suspect they knew each other well enough to know who had said what. Events in the community regarding policing and reported by the media also added flavour to the conversation and "thickened the story."

Chapter 3 of this thesis thus contains movements two and three under relevant headings and are therefore the descriptions of our conversations and interpretations made together. Through this process, I have tried to listen as carefully as I can to the intention of their stories and placing them within their historical context.

1.7.4   Movement Four

A description of experiences as it is continually informed by traditions of interpretation.

The fourth part of my interviewing process was to try to discover where these thoughts stem from. This has to do with the discourses (1.6.3) that lie behind our ideas. Just as my own approach in narrative theology and research developed from my growth in Practical Theology, so did the ideas of the policemen I interviewed. In terms of a narrative approach, this where we explore the discourses that lie behind our behaviour and attitudes, and leads into the deconstruction stage of my research. Admittedly, this was a difficult aspect of the research because people do not always think along these lines. Many ideas are "taken-for-granted." But, with the encouragement of my supervisor, I went ahead with this process so as not to make

those deductions myself. My supervisor correctly pointed out that this project would be far richer if I spoke to my original co-researchers about this.

In order to help me in this process, I included discussions with an outside "audience." These would be people such as police officers of other race groups and retired policemen. I was also privileged to have a conversation with some police personnel at provincial level as well, which helped clarify and verify some of the conversations I had before. Of course, their views could also differ from the ones I had been exposed to initially. So these conversations became a catalyst for deconstructing the various discourses we worked with. The content thereof is contained in Chapter 4 alongside the next movement.

1.7.5   Movement Five

A reflection on God's presence, as it is understood and experienced in a specific situation.

The second section of Chapter 4 has to do with God's presence. I have undertaken this research as a practical theologian and pastor for reasons already mentioned in 1.3.2. As a practical theologian, I am working under the direction of the Department of Practical Theology at the University of Pretoria. Thus I write from the perspective of a practical theologian as distinct from, for example, a criminologist or psychologist. A reflection on God and faith is therefore an important part of this research. Because each of my co-researchers knows me as a pastor in the community and CPF structures, I was comfortable with introducing a reflection on God and faith in the conversations. As a pastor, I believe that our perception of God's nature and God's presence influences us. And so I was curious about how these policemen's faith and work influenced each other, if at all. In my conversations with them I looked for clues that could be followed up on at a later stage. That later stage is what Movement Five is all about. With my co-researchers knowing where I was coming from, I was confident that their reflection of God's presence would emerge.

1.7.6 Movement Six

A description of experience, thickened through interdisciplinary investigation.

Various disciplines were used to enhance our understanding of the situation police officers were in. Criminologists, authors, those involved in organisations such as the Institute of Security Studies (ISS), business and political commentators, and those in the social sciences formed part of this movement. They formed an external story for us, commenting on these themes or discourses in terms of their research. These comments would be through books, articles and television documentaries. Their comments would form part of Chapter 5.

Once these had been incorporated into the thesis itself, I then returned to my initial co-researchers who could verify or disagree with the conclusions reached. This would give them the final word to say as well as giving them other perspectives to think about in their line of work. Thus, the opinions of other disciplines would not be adopted uncritically. Hopefully, we would all benefit from this process of reflection and discover ways of dealing constructively with the future with a renewed sense of hope. These discoveries then contributed to the final chapter containing the last movement in this research process.

1.7.7 Movement Seven

The development of alternative interpretations that point beyond the local community.

The final stage of this research is to take it into the wider community. It does not mean that our conclusions can be generalised and applicable to everyone, everywhere. However, I hope to enrich the further development of thought around these issues.

The wider community would include police management, Community Police Forums and organisations dealing with various aspects of policing. I am aware that much has been written about policing by other disciplines. Some of it has been well received and implemented by the police structures. Other material has been perceived as over-critical comments made by those who do not understand the dynamics police

personnel are faced with at station level – whether they are written from outside bodies or police management at such high levels that they have lost touch with the ground level. While I have no idea where this research will leave them, it forms part of a wider body of information for debate.

But, being a pastor, this wider community would include the church as well. My experience, certainly of the Methodist Church of Southern Africa, is that they have been silent on the issue of crime and policing since the changes in the political climate of South Africa. The first time this issue has received some attention was in the 2006 Yearbook (sometimes referred to as the Minutes of Conference). On page 295, item 3.3.2.2 speaks vaguely about crime and calls upon its members to uphold values of the Kingdom by observing the Law of God; involvement in rehabilitation of criminals and participation in crime prevention structures such as Community Police Forums. This research can have an impact within the life of the local church in working alongside police officers in a way that is prophetic, pastoral and constructive.

1.8   LIMITATIONS OF THE RESEARCH

Limitations to this research project involve conversational dynamics as well as localised issues. In this section I will try to explain what some of these were.

1.8.1   The localised scope of this research

This research is limited to the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands region where I work. It focuses more specifically upon the experiences of White, male police officers who are in middle management positions. Writing about case study methods, Florell confirms this limitation stating: "One problem with this approach is its lack of generalizability to other populations or individuals" (Florell 1990:354). Therefore, this cannot be viewed as applicable to all police personnel. In order to balance opinions and move away from a one-sided view, I included others, such as other members of the SAPS, including those of other racial groups, chaplains, and others related to this field such as criminologists and psychologists (my outside audience, see 1.7.4 and 1.7.6) to critically assess whether they agree or not with the emerging themes and issues arising. This consultation examines literature and relevant media reports, because they

all contribute towards formulating our ideas and discourses. But even if there is disagreement between my research and theirs, this project will contribute further towards growing our understanding. My hope is that, through this, anyone wishing to pursue this topic further will benefit from the procedure I used as well as the information elicited.

There is also the localisation of time in this research. It must be noted that these interviews took place in 2006 and there were certain issues that were prominent at the time. However, as with any story, circumstances change and new issues arise. Thus the information contained in this document is localised in terms of time as well as geography. For example, as I wrote up my process, there was discussion in the media about new ways of running Community Police Forums, changing them to Community Safety Forums that have different powers. I am still convinced, though, that the process of research and much of its content still has relevance further a-field, which I will highlight in the conclusion.

1.8.2 Levels of honesty

Levels of honesty play an important role in this research. Some participants may have felt they had nothing to lose and may have shared more openly and honestly. Some of them already knew the process and had participated before, thus a level of trust had been established and could be built upon. Others may have been guarded in their words, either to protect a tough image or not to place their careers in jeopardy. Some may have wanted to present the SAPS in a positive light, others more negatively. The daily influences of my co-researcher's work before the interview could also colour their participation (multiple interviews sought to neutralise this as much as possible). I am therefore aware of the warning put by Mats Alvesson when he says:

> It is important not to simplify and idealize the interview situation,
> assuming that the interviewee – given the correct interview technique
> – primarily is a competent and moral truth teller, acting in the service
> of science and producing the data needed to reveal his or her "interior"
> (i.e., experiences, feelings, values) or the "facts" of the organization.

(Alvesson 2003:13)

I am aware that other interests are involved in any research data collection and there is never any guarantee that the results are 100% truthful and that: "Many researchers are aware of problems of trust and limited control over the interviewee responses" (Alvesson 2003:16). Certainly, Antony Altbeker, who spent a year on the streets with the SAPS, makes a similar observation by saying: "… I had never been naïve enough to think that I'd get anything approaching the unvarnished truth from men and women I seldom knew for more than a few days and who worked for one of the most defensive institutions in the country" (Altbeker 2005:205). No method of research can guarantee absolute truth. However, I have tried as far as possible to ensure a high level of truth through using more than one occasion to have conversations, checking with an outside "audience" and the wider social context, and working at building trust between myself and the other participants. Ultimately, however, I have to take their word as their truthful experience.

1.8.3 Racial issues

I need to acknowledge from the outset that I am a White male who, in terms of the Church, is also in middle management. This similarity with my co-researchers has a dynamic of its own. Attitudes of racism, especially within the context of South Africa, need to be faced. At one level there may be a certain amount of trust where views and frustrations can be shared without everything being interpreted at racism. But we also need to be aware that our past "privileged position" as Whites in both the church and the police, who may or may not feel sidelined in a new political landscape, is a factor. As a narrative researcher, I am listening for the marginalized voices – in this case White police officers – which are just as legitimate as other voices. But, in order to help me deconstruct the conversations I conducted, I have deliberately chosen to have outside voices as well.

1.8.4 My own "blind spots"

A further limitation would be my own "blind spots" in the area of analysis. There is, firstly, a large amount of literature on policing issues. Not being a criminologist, I cannot claim to have read them exhaustively and, therefore, may omit other valuable

contributions. I have, however, tried to read as widely as possible through my years of involvement. Secondly, in analysing the conversations, I may overlook some aspects. For that reason, I have included the transcripts of the conversations. Other researchers may identify aspects that were marginalized by my co-researchers and I and utilize them for further research. And thirdly, I need to acknowledge that being a pastor will create blind spots as well. Either it will be through my co-researchers perceptions of what a pastor needs to hear, leaving out the unsavoury or un-Christian aspects. Or it will be through my own theological prejudices and assumptions based on my past experience with the police, both prior to 1994 and thereafter. However, I have tried to be as honest as I can in terms of these biases with the help of my co-researchers, other students and my supervisor.

1.9   ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

From the beginning of my research, I have taken ethical factors into consideration. Some of these I have already mentioned earlier in the chapter. But I've summarized these considerations here in terms of recruitment; the initial process explanation; the wide involvement in gathering and recording stories; the benefits of involvement; confidentiality; storage of information and the final document.

As far as recruitment goes and explaining the process, I have already discussed this in 1.7.1. I approached police officers in the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands area and accepted all those who were willing to participate. Some of them have already worked with me before. And, in order to balance the racial issue and other biases, I invited others to be outside voices or commentators (narrative researchers use the term "audience") to participate as far as the emerging discourses were concerned.

Explaining the process of this research project was done with each of the research participants. Initially, it was done verbally but then followed up with a written information sheet and a consent form. There was opportunity throughout the process for participants to ask any questions in this regard.

Participants were involved in the process right from the beginning to the end. They helped me choose a topic that we all felt would be worthwhile. Obviously, my co-

researchers were the ones who told me their stories as my initial data collection. I then worked on emerging themes, which I then took back to them for verification and adjustments for the sake of clarity. Opportunity also existed for them to remove any material they did not want included. These "edited" interviews are the ones in this thesis. Thereafter we tried to elicit some underlying discourses by deconstructing (asking questions about) the themes, asking ourselves where these ideas come from.

Other ways in which risks were minimised were in terms of confidentiality. The use of pseudonyms was an option for each of the co-researchers to protect themselves. Further discussions were then done in terms of themes and underlying discourses, rather than on "who said what." The audiocassettes were also destroyed after the conversations had been written in a way that was acceptable to my co-researchers.

In terms of who benefits from this whole process, I would hope that everyone involved benefits, albeit in different ways. I could not anticipate how each one would benefit when I embarked on the process. My speculation was that I would eventually receive a doctorate; and my co-researchers would have found the process therapeutic (although research is not therapy, simply telling one's story can be therapeutic) and, as they deconstruct some of the themes, they would be able to work more constructively within their careers. Perhaps a benefit for them would be in simply contributing meaningfully to a research project as we took a journey of growth together. I would also hope that this research would benefit others in the police and those in helping professions. But, this process may produce benefits that I will never be aware of as well.

My co-researchers also commented upon the final form of this project. This gave them a large degree of participation throughout the process. As a result, they could help determine what would be a helpful contribution to the wider community. Each of them was also aware that this research goes into the university library, making it public knowledge and so it was important to include them in this last stage of the journey. My sincere thanks go to them for all their patience and assistance in this regard.

1.10   SUMMARY

In this chapter I have given an introduction to the research topic and have described some of the reasons for it. The research topic, which was partly determined by my co-researchers, is focused upon the effects of a new constitution upon White, male policemen and their working situation within the new structures that have emerged. I wanted to discover whether there are helpful and unhelpful ways of working constructively and creatively within the new South African Police Services. I have outlined my own background, particularly as a practical theologian working within this field, and the paradigm position I choose to work within. I highlighted the congruence between a postfoundationalist paradigm and a narrative approach to research. More specifically, I explained my process in terms of the seven movements of Van Huyssteen's postfoundationalism proposed by Julian Müller, which guided my research process. This chapter also included the limitations of this research and the ethical considerations I needed to address.

In Chapter 2 I give an overview of some of the structural changes that have taken place within the Police Services since our new constitution. Chapter 3 consists of the interpreted interviews I had with my co-researchers. These need to be read and understood within the context of news items that occurred simultaneously in 2006. That is the reason I included relevant media material in the third chapter. Chapter 4 highlights the fourth and fifth movements of reflecting on those experiences, examining where the ideas come from and God's involvement. Chapter 5 addresses the sixth movement of engaging with contributions from other disciplines. And the final chapter consists of a critical reflection of this research as well as concluding remarks regarding the research's contribution into my life as a pastor; it's contribution to my co-researchers and how this is to be conveyed to the wider community.

While this is a shared discovery between my co-researchers and I, I need to take responsibility for the content of this document and the way in which it has been formulated.

CHAPTER TWO

THE HISTORICAL CONTEXT DESCRIBED

A key criterion of the success of policing change in South Africa was
the legitimation of the police, who had once oppressed the majority
of the country's citizens.

(Shaw 2002:120)

2.1   INTRODUCTION

Before entering into conversation with my co-researchers, there was a lot of
information that I already knew, having participated in the new structures from the
early stages of its development. This information formed the background context to
the discussions I had with my co-researchers and others. There are essentially three
reasons why I have included this chapter.

Firstly, I recognise that other readers may not be familiar with the information I
would regard as "taken-for-granted" knowledge. The information may help readers
understand what is said in the various conversations and the themes that emerge.

Secondly, if I have to be honest with myself, this chapter was included because of my
own anxiety. I was initially unsure about how many elements would be included in
the conversations with my co-researchers. In order to put my mind at ease and focus
fully on what my co-researchers wanted to discuss, I recorded the historical context of
changes in South African policing. As it turned out, my fears were unwarranted
because they had more than enough issues to discuss.

Then thirdly, and most importantly, my research methodology provided the structure
requiring this chapter. The first of the seven movements (describing the context)
necessitates this chapter. For my co-researchers it was a comparison between how
things used to function and how new developments were unfolding. This chapter will
outline some of the necessary changes in structures under a new constitution.

2.2 PRIOR TO 1994

Prior to 1994, police officers experienced a great deal of power in South Africa. This resulted in a history of abuses within the policing structures. The abuse of power by police was closely linked to upholding apartheid laws, which led to tremendous community distrust of the police, particularly amongst marginalized people. Mark Shaw wrote:

> Crime control under apartheid was indistinguishable from political control, as the police sought to prevent crime largely through controlling the movement of black people, the putative perpetrators, into white areas. Harshness, brutality and racism were hallmarks of apartheid era 'law enforcement.'

(Shaw 2002:xi)

Many of these abuses have been recorded by various writers and in the findings of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC). The TRC was established to hear the stories of South Africans who suffered under Apartheid laws. Other authors have also written extensively on the history of police brutality and covert operations in maintaining White minority rule. These authors include those from a wide range of disciplines. One such writer is Gavin Cawthra who says that, even during the F.W. De Klerk era, they were "seeking to destabilise the ANC and its allies to weaken their position at the negotiating table" (Cawthra 1994:5). Details of those abuses fall outside the scope of this thesis because they are already being documented in various forms. Yet, for this thesis, it is important to remember that the history of the police in South Africa has meant that future challenges become more complicated.

As South Africa moves further in its new democracy, "the police in the new order must achieve two apparently competing goals – to abandon their authoritarian past and to repel the crime wave" (Shaw 2002:xi). In terms of revamping the police Cawthra acknowledged that:

> Action is needed on many fronts: within the police force, in the external environment in which they operate, and in communities

themselves. Democrats broadly agree that the main aim is to restore public confidence and involvement in policing so that a genuine partnership between police and community can emerge, in which consensus rather than coercion is the norm.

(Cawthra 1994:161)

In seeking to address these challenges, there have been structural changes that have affected the way policing needs to be done. As stated in Chapter One: after the 1994 elections, the South African government realised the need to change community perceptions regarding the police. These changes have not been done overnight, as this chapter will further illustrate.

2.3   A BRIEF HISTORICAL OVERVIEW

Amongst the tasks that needed to be done was the joining of eleven law-enforcement agencies into one; the process of writing a policy framework for policing; introducing name changes to shift people's perceptions of the police into more positive ones; altering the leadership structures; community police forums and other accountability structures to curtail the abuse of power and to refocus police attention onto fighting the ever-increasing levels of crime.

2.3.1   Amalgamating eleven agencies into one

In what is referred to as "the old South Africa" (prior to 1994), eleven different law-enforcement agencies were operating. These were the law-enforcement agencies in the TBVC States (Transkei, Bophuthatswana, Venda & Ciskei), the Self-governing Territories (Gazankulu, Kangwane, Kwandebele, Kwazulu, Lebowa & Qwaqwa) and South Africa. Each had different uniforms, rank structures and worked under different laws. The first task was to incorporate all these agencies into one unified structure. One of the political problems was that two of the main forces were the SAP (the old South African Police Force) and the Kwazulu Police (essentially an armed wing of the Inkatha Freedom Party). Both had been in violent opposition to the ANC. Members of the armed wing of the ANC joined to the South African Defence Force (which

became the South African National Defence Force) and thus did not have many candidates for leadership and rank-and-file positions in the SAPS. Those who were willing to go into the SAPS had no "significant hands-on experience with public order policing, classic detective work, or crime prevention" (Laufer 2001:16). Other problems included those of illiteracy, previous (often inferior) training, different rank structures and how many years of service people had. All these problems had to be ironed out.

As part of my research question of how policemen are adapting to a new situation in South Africa, the question for me here was whether past relationships of antagonism were overcome? And how did the police personnel experience this amalgamation of other agencies and even previously opposed forces?

2.3.2   Green and White Papers

Along with that integration, a whole new policy on safety and security needed to be drafted. The new government's policy on safety and security was twofold: firstly, to re-orientate the police towards becoming protectors of the communities they serve; and secondly, to mobilise people to participate in the provision of safety and security. The initial policy was outlined in the 1994 Green Paper, which emphasised democratic control, police accountability and community participation. The Draft White Paper was released in May 1998 for public consultation and the final White Paper was presented in September 1998. This then informed national legislation on safety and security.

2.3.3   Name changes

Regarding the re-orientation of police work, a number of changes in names occurred. This was an attempt to change the perceptions from a militaristic structure to a government service provider.

Firstly, the government department in charge of the police changed its name from the "Department of Law and Order" to the "Department of Safety and Security," and during 2006 changed to the "Department of Community Safety and Liaison." Also

during 1995/6 the South African Police Force became the South African Police Service (with a new logo and uniform). What was referred to as the "Charge Office," became the "Community Service Centre" (or CSC). This also formed part of the later "Batho Pele" White Paper. "Batho Pele" means "People First" and was formulated to say that all government departments must provide good service to all South Africans through consultation, better service standards, courtesy, information, accessibility, openness and transparency, and giving value for money. In order to facilitate this, the SAPS management was divided into tiers, namely national offices, provincial offices, area offices and, at the lowest level, local police stations.

Along with these changes, the police rank structures also changed, with fewer ranks amongst the personnel and, amongst the higher ranks, titles such as "Superintendent," "Senior Superintendent," "Director" and "Commissioner." These senior ranks replaced the military rank names of "Colonel," "Brigadier," and "General."

With all these name changes, I wondered whether they were just changing the label of what is essentially the same product. In other words, were the police going to go about their business as usual, or would the new names influence their behaviour in any significant way? Would it make them better policeman in fighting crime or would it result in the deterioration of discipline? And, in terms of their original intention, would the new names help bridge the gap between the community and the police?

2.3.4   Moving towards new leadership and complimentary institutions

According to Stephen Laufer, the newly elected ANC (African National Congress) government had the "fear of an organised white backlash led by security forces against the young democracy" (Laufer 2001:14). As a result, according to Jonny Steinberg: "The new government stressed continuity, appointing George Fivaz, a white policeman from the ranks of the old order, to lead the police force into democracy" (Steinberg: 2001:9). Actually, Nelson Mandela's first minister of the police, Sydney Mufamadi, first had to ease General Johann van der Merwe, the national commissioner of police (who had Security Branch experience), into retirement on the 31st March 1995, before appointing Fivaz (who did not have Security Branch experience) into the position on 29th January 1995. Many other

experienced members left around this time too. It was then that the Community Police Forums (see 2.3.5) gathered momentum in line with the National Crime Prevention Strategy (see 2.3.6) that was developed.

In August 1997, Meyer Kahn, the executive chairman of South African Breweries was appointed as the police chief executive officer, to work alongside Commissioner George Fivaz. Fivaz remained in charge of policing and Kahn was tasked to use his "business skills in reorganising major SAPS assets, personnel, and resources" (Laufer 2001:19). This, according to Laufer, was a plan that failed and faded into obscurity.

As the problem of crime gained greater prominence, other institutions were formed in order to fight crime. One was a single National Prosecution Authority, which was created in terms of Section 179 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. Bulelani Thandabantu Ngcuka was drawn in as the National Director of Public Prosecutions, thus heading up the NPA. Their office was established on the 1st August 1998 that was comprised of seven core business units:

- National Prosecution Services (NPS) remaining with the court prosecutors;
- Asset Forfeiture Unit (AFU – established in May 1999) headed by a retired judge, Willie Hofmeyr, who worked within the Prevention of Organised Crime Act 121 of 1998. Confiscated assets of criminals were used to resource the fight against crime;
- Directorate of Special Operations (DSO, better known as the Scorpions, which started on 1st September 1999, although legally gazetted on 12th January 2001 – No. 21976). Initially, it was headed by Frank Dutton and later by Advocate Leonard McCarthy;
- Sexual Offences and Community Affairs (established in October 1999);
- Specialised Commercial Crime Unit (SCCU);
- Witness Protection Unit (WPU); and
- Priority Crimes Litigation Unit (PCLU, established on 23rd March 2003, focussing on issues like war crimes, genocide, terrorism etc.).

Applicants for some of these units, notably the Scorpions, came from prosecutors, investigators and detectives (many with roots in the Office for Serious Economic Offences established in 1992). They tended to investigate high profile criminal cases.

(http://www.npa.gov.za 18 July 2007). In addition to those sorts of units, there was the Special Investigating Unit (SIU) investigating civil cases (where the NPA and Scorpions deal with criminal investigations) such as fraud, corruption and mal-administration in state departments. Judge Willem Heath headed this Unit from 1996 until 2001 when the Constitutional Court ruled that a judge could not be in charge of the SIU. President Thabo Mbeki re-established the Unit later in 2001 with Willie Hofmeyr as its head. Initially, there were problems of litigation, but there seems to be a growing success rate each year in the courts. Then, too, the media reported some antagonism between some of these units and the SAPS. The extent to which this is true in my co-researchers' experience remains to be seen.

All these developments happened in conjunction with tough political talk against crime. Steve Tshwete (a former Umkhonto we Sizwe commander – the armed wing of the ruling ANC) who was the national Minister of Safety and Security (after Sydney Mufamadi) adopted a tough talk image against crime. Jacob Sello (better known as Jackie) Selebi was appointed the national police commissioner in October 1999 (as Fivaz's term of office ended in January 2000), a surprise appointment because he had no previous policing experience. Initially, these were seen as appointments in crisis management. But over time, they were intended to change public perceptions that major crime was being dealt with. I will elaborate more on this tough talk image in 3.2.4 b.

Obviously, leadership has changed since then. For example, Bulelani Ngcuka was replaced by Advocate Vusumzi Patrick Pikoli, incidentally after Ngcuka exposed corruption in the government. It was after my interview period that Pikoli was replaced by Advocate Mokotedi Mpshe on 23 September 2007, also due to political interference. Charles Nqakula replaced Steve Tshwete who died on 26th April 2002. And Jackie Selebi remained the national police commissioner until December 2007.

With regards to leadership, I was interested to hear how my co-researchers dealt with their own role in leadership (as they were all in middle management) and the leadership exercised over them. But I was also interested in how the police worked with other institutions, especially since they were entirely separate government departments. Before 1994 it seemed to me that they worked entirely independent of

one another, but are now having to have a closer relationship. Furthermore, there needed to be a closer working relationship with the community and these institutions.

2.3.5   Community Police Forums

Regarding community participation, the idea of Community Police Forums was formulated. Community Policing was implemented for approximately 3 years under the SAPS Interim Regulations for Community Police Forums and Boards. The Station Commander at each police station was meant to ensure the establishment of a Community Police Forum. At the end of 1994, the Change Management Team of the police established a Technical Team on Community Policing. This team commenced their work in January 1995 to draft a national policy on Community Policing that was contained in the Green Paper. It was done by consolidating successes and dealing with specific problems encountered in the embryonic stages through a questionnaire. A discussion document was compiled based on the feedback. The Green and White Papers then promoted and institutionalised community policing, seeking to ensure the support of all levels of the police.

The formal establishment of Community Police Forums was incorporated into chapter 7 (18-23) of The South African Police Service Act No. 68 of 1995 (otherwise known as The Police Service Act of 1995). This Act, as well as Section 12 of The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa Act No. 108 of 1996, formed the legal framework for setting up Community Police Forums. The practical implementation thereof was elaborated on in numerous other documents, such as the Community Police Forum Tool Kit issued to all local CPF structures.

These CPFs were set up with the aim of greater police accountability to the community they serve and to build a partnership between the police and community in combating crime. Later, Section V of the White Paper said of this:

> Initially, CPFs were established at police stations across the country
> to ensure that station commissioners were more accountable to those
> they served. This was done primarily to build trust and legitimacy,
> particularly in those areas in which the relationship between the
> police and the community had been characterised by mistrust and

conflict. Many CPFs function effectively and sound relationships have been built.

(White Paper 1998 Section V:26)

While I acknowledge that this has been more successful in some places than in others, this has been an important development in South African policing practices. Personally, I can remember the initial stages of building a partnership as being difficult, especially in the light of their practices during the apartheid years. In my opinion, establishing a partnership has, in itself, been a noble accomplishment. Whether my co-researchers would agree with that remained to be seen.

At the outset of this research, I did not know the extent of my co-researchers' involvement during the initial stages of CPFs. However, I was curious about their early perceptions of such a forum and whether they changed over the years of its development. I certainly wanted to listen for any stories they had in this regard.

2.3.6   National Crime Prevention Strategy

In May 1996, the government adopted the National Crime Prevention Strategy (NCPS), which outlined a multi-dimensional approach to crime prevention, looking at crime control and crime prevention. It recognised that crime prevention is not only the task of the police and the courts, but includes all sectors of society. This document officially brought together the problems related to crime and what I have outlined in 2.3.4 and 2.3.5.

The NCPS recognises that crime is caused by a number of factors, requiring a multi-dimensional approach to combating crime. Regarding the causes of crime, the NCPS identified, among others, the following causes: gender inequality; vigilantism; inadequate support to victims of crime; proliferation of arms; social-psychological factors; youth marginalisation; poverty and unemployment; institutionalised violence; and international criminal groups (White Paper 1998 Section I:8).

As a result, the response needs both law enforcement and crime prevention strategies. Law enforcement initiatives are the reactionary elements such as improving criminal investigations, visible policing and service to victims. Crime prevention has to do with addressing social issues such as poverty, housing, education and recreation. Crime prevention would also include educating the community in terms of what the law is about (e.g. explaining the Domestic Violence Act to people, warning against alcohol abuse and tips on lowering your risk of becoming a victim of crime). Community Police Forums would play an important role here through representing various organisations and developing projects to prevent crime and assist those in need.

While the NCPS affirmed that greater cooperation between the community and the police, it has not been easy to implement. Wilfried Schärf, who speaks about the need to improve communication between different police specialised units, says:

> Although the National Crime Prevention Strategy urges state departments to work together in order to accomplish a multiplier effect towards a common goal, the reality is usually far removed from it. It is still one of the really big challenges facing the criminal justice system to get its systems speaking to each other and their staff seeing each other as partners.

(Schärf 2001:63)

In terms of this research, I was again interested in how this document has been viewed and implemented (or not) from their perspective.

2.3.7   Independent Complaints Directorate

Where authoritarian, paramilitary policing did not have many accountability systems towards the community in place, the new democracy required them. The Independent Complaints Directorate (ICD) was formed in April 1997. According to Section IV of the White Paper on Safety and Security, the ICD "functions independently of the Department of Safety and Security and reports directly to the minister of Safety and

Security" (White Paper 1998 Section IV:22). Operating in terms of Section 53(2) of the South African Police Service Act, it was tasked to do the following functions:

- Investigating police misconduct or any offence allegedly committed by a member of the SAPS, whether it be criminal activities, poor service, or failure to assist or protect victims of domestic violence.
- Investigating any death in police custody or as a result of police action.
- Investigating any matter referred to it by the Minister or MEC [Member of the Executive Council] for Safety and Security.

When one looks at their annual reports, available on http://www.icd.gov.za, it is clear that the ICD has a lot of work on its hands, receiving many complaints against the police, with few human resources. According to Shaw, "The ICD itself has a difficult task, operating in an environment where it can expect little support from the police" (Shaw 2002:39). As a result, I was curious about how my co-researchers and, for that matter, police officers across a broader spectrum than middle management, viewed the work done by the ICD from their personal perspectives.

2.3.8 Section 49 of the Criminal Procedure Act amendment

Section 49 of the Criminal Procedure Act 51 of 1977 has to do with the use of force by a police officer when carrying out an arrest, including lethal force. An amendment to this legislation was proposed in 1998 on the use of firearms, which would allow for lethal force only in self-defence or if a third party is under threat or if there is the risk of future harm being done by the suspect. This amendment evoked sharp reaction. Many police officers felt that power was taken away from them and that they would be targets for criminals who would use this law to their advantage, shooting first before the police could return fire.

Criticism of this amendment came from various quarters. I recall a policeman saying to me, "We might as well hand in our weapons, because we won't be able to use them when we've already been shot dead." Traggy Maepa from the Institute of Security Studies also warned that: "The violent nature of South African criminal activity brings members of the SAPS into situations where the use of lethal force is often needed"

(Maepa 2002:12). Newspapers throughout the country reported such frustrations from the police and public alike. These kinds of laws added fuel to (or as we would say in narrative research, "thickened the story") to the perceived rights of criminals being protected at the expense of police officers and law-abiding victims. Within a Constitution that is based upon human rights, this issue can become highly contentious. It goes without saying that there was a lot of initial confusion regarding its implementation that needed to be overcome. This also had an impact on public perceptions on the police and justice system's ability to combat crime.

2.4   PERCEPTIONS ON CRIME-FIGHTING ABILITY

While the arena of perceptions on the State's crime-fighting ability is not a structural change that has happened since 1994, these perceptions arise from questioning the effectiveness of those structures. It centres around the goals Shaw mentioned (see 2.2) about how well the SAPS have abandoned their authoritarian past and their ability to repel the crime wave.

Regarding the SAPS abusing their powers, it would be naïve to think that it has been eradicated. Stories of torture, of corruption and manipulating their statistics (and even having a period where no statistics were revealed in the media) are heard all the time. Such behaviour perpetuates doubt and suspicion amongst the public. There seems to be considerable police incompetence and extensive weaknesses in the criminal justice system. When listening to conversations at social gatherings, it is clear that public opinion on the topic is low. Some blame the police who do not respond timeously to calls, gathering insufficient evidence and compromising crime scenes, not to mention bribery, corruption and even criminal involvement by SAPS members. Others blame the courts that let dangerous criminals out on bail, only to have them committing their next crime within a matter of minutes of being released. The researcher, Antony Altbeker, does not paint a rosy picture of the state of crime in our country, pointing out the government's denial through understating the seriousness of crime, and the weaknesses of the police and criminal justice system. As he states: "High levels of crime inevitably erode confidence in government…. [T]he fear of vicious, potentially lethal violence must always leave lingering in people's minds a suspicion that the state is somehow deficient, that something about it is rotten" (Altbeker 2007:65).

But that's not the only story. There are many stories, including my own, that testify of exceptional professionalism and success. These stories need to be balanced with the negative pictures and perceptions as well. All the above, of course, makes policing in a new era all the more challenging. Since 1994, as crime levels have increased (as opposed to political violence), many have left the country, and those who remain regard crime as a major challenge South Africa faces. And there is little point in having new structures and policies unless they significantly reduce crime.

2.5   SUMMARY

The first movement of research in the postfoundationalist model of Müller (2004:300) calls for the specific context to be described (see 1.7.1). In this chapter I have sought to give some background information on the context. This movement is important in order to understand the content of the conversations that are to be recorded in the next chapter. Not only have I described some of the changes that have occurred since 1994, but also some of my resultant areas of curiosity. Despite those areas of concern, I had to put aside those biases and listen to what my co-researchers felt were the areas of importance for them. It is to the narratives of three Captains, Jody, Leon and Pieter in the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands that we now turn in Chapter Three.

CHAPTER THREE

DISCOVERIES THROUGH OUR CONVERSATIONS

If stories come to you, care for them. And learn to give

them away where they are needed. Sometimes a person needs

a story more than food to stay alive. That is why we put these stories

in each other's memory…. Never forget these obligations.

The Badger (Lopez 1990:48)

3.1 INTRODUCTION

In this chapter, as I stated in Chapter One, I am exploring the conversations I had with my co-researchers. In terms of the seven movements of research from a postfoundationalist view, this chapter focuses on movement three where interpretations of experiences are made, described and developed in collaboration with my co-researchers. For any who may be interested, transcripts of the conversations (which form part of movement two's listening process) are included as an Appendix to this thesis. Once the initial conversations had taken place, I organised the emerging topics that I saw into separate headings. In order to be consistent with the values of social constructionism, I returned to them with these themes and altered them into the fashion they felt necessary. This chapter presents them as we jointly decided upon. Additionally, we felt it necessary to note that these conversations took place in 2006 and so acknowledge that their situations will have changed by the time this document is presented. In order to place them in a specific context, my co-researchers and I have used articles from the media as well, which will give a fuller description of the stories conveyed and, in narrative terms, "thicken" their stories.

3.2 EMERGING THEMES

From our discussions and later agreement, these were considered some of the most important issues for my co-researchers at the time. Some of them contain numerous aspects to them, which I have recorded systematically for the sake of the reader.

However, it must be remembered that people's stories are not always neatly compartmentalised as this record may imply. Many issues are inter-related and overlap with one another. In summary, we have looked at narratives on the following:

- Low quality of work
- Relations between Police members
- Further training and promotions
- Top structures and politics
- Community involvement
- Human Rights and Abuses
- The effects on their family life

3.2.1 Low quality of work

Very early in the discussions with my co-researchers, the topic about having to deal with a low quality of work emerged. While each co-researcher had their own stories to tell and were not together when this subject was spoken about, I was surprised at how quickly it came to the fore. This took the form of a general evaluation of how police officers do or don't do their work (their work ethic that has diminished) and the issue of corruption in the police. I also record in this section how my co-researchers have dealt with the situations in this regard.

3.2.1.1 A diminished work ethic

a) Jody's story of the "Robot System"

Jody opened his discussion with one of the methods implemented to measure police effectiveness in their work, namely the "robot system." This system used the statistics of the police station's previous year as the target figures for improvement in the current year. If there were fewer crimes reported in the current year than the previous year, the station's statistics were recorded as green; more cases would be red; and the same amount as yellow. While its aim was to improve the quality of policing, creating healthy competitiveness between stations, there were obvious weaknesses to the system. It did not evaluate response times to crime scenes, nor conviction rates and it

was easily manipulated. Jody described it as "every station commander's nightmare." His reason was that it is impossible to maintain a number one position, because crime will never be eradicated and "one event throws your figures out" and the station looks as if it is failing in its targets. This then means that: "some policemen are reluctant to open cases…. Or they will open the case under another charge." In other words, statistics are manipulated so that the station will not look bad. It was after this discussion with Jody that I realised why Camperdown's previous station commander (now retired) had always rejected the "robot system" whenever our CPF Chairperson raised it at meetings. It is not surprising that this system was scrapped in March 2006. It was not an effective way of measuring what actually happens at station level policing. It added to a diminished work ethic by de-motivating police officers and in manipulating statistics. I will say more about this under the heading of statistics later on (3.2.5.3).

b) Leon's story of uncaring detectives

Leon opened his conversation with his frustration that most policemen "don't want to work." He made it clear that: "They don't care about whether they are doing their work or not, as long as they get their salary." When his wife, Estelle, said, "There are some who work hard," he partially agreed but emphasised that "the *majority* do not." When I asked Leon for examples of such stories, he was able to give many. But we thought it would be best to focus on one particular story. The story was about a poor statement taken by detectives from a surviving victim who was shot by a gang of 5 people. Two things bothered Leon in this case. Firstly, he saw that the way in which the detectives dealt with the victim was uncaring. They did not show any compassion towards the victim, as Leon said he would have, "even though they live in the same community." And secondly, because poor statement taking would not be able to stand the scrutiny of the court, he requested them to re-take the statement, which they did not do. Instead, they told Leon that they had tried but could not get hold of the man. They said that he was a suspect in another case and so would avoid them when they visited his house. Upon personal enquiry, Leon discovered from the victim's father that this was not the situation and that no detectives had been there at all. Now, not only did the detectives fail to do their work, they had also lied to Leon. In the end, those detectives were investigated by the Independent Complaints Directorate and

were sentenced. The effect of this sort of thing left Leon very frustrated. In his frustration, Leon told me he thinks of them as "defectives" rather than "detectives" (a comment I will return to in terms of relations between police members in 3.2.2.3). Not caring about their work (no compassion, poor statement taking and not informing witnesses of the court dates) means that cases have to be withdrawn from court. As Leon put it: "Batho pele is totally non-existent." He went on to compare this to "the old days" where they regularly recovered stolen goods and "we were proud of what we achieved."

c) Pieter's story of poor station management

Pieter directed his attention immediately to the station commander at the station he worked at. The relationship between him as branch commander of crime prevention and the new station commander (superintendent) was very tense. He told me that the new superintendent had "upset a lot of people at the station." Not only had he made the racist remark that "the station is too White," even though the station reflects a proportionate balance of all race groups, but the way in which he treated members at the station was de-motivating. Pieter cited how the vehicle given to him for his work had been taken away and given to junior members "who are now busy wrecking it" and who "have nothing to show for all their travelling" in terms of making arrests. The quality of his own work is also being compromised as a result. Without a vehicle he is now unable to get to his informers regarding information about crime and to build relationships with the community. He further thickened his story by referring to incidents involving other personnel at the station. For example, a competent Indian Inspector in charge of the Community Policing had his job description removed and it was given to a Black member "who has not attended a CPF. Even after he was tasked with the job, he's not been there." When another member had to get her child to a specialist for medical treatment, he refused to let her take time off. He changed arrangements with the students without consulting the Inspector in charge of them. Thus, Pieter experienced the low quality of work in terms of management skills he saw lacking in the Superintendent and, for himself, being prohibited from doing his job well through the removal of his vehicle. This, in turn, affected the quality of work in the rest of the station. In order to cope, some members, including civilian clerical staff, had resigned or asked for transfers to other stations. Other members "shrug their

shoulders and keep quiet." The Indian Inspector "just does what he's told to do now and no more." But Pieter said that he is dealing with it differently: "I refuse to keep quiet." He chose to record every incident and build a case against the Superintendent. I couldn't help wondering whether this tension was exacerbated due to Pieter having been a station commander before at another station, and now experiencing poor management from someone promoted by affirmative action. And I wondered whether this was due to a lack of training in managerial skills as opposed to a hierarchical, military-type training. It was also impossible to determine the outcome of this situation at the time of this interview.

   d) Stories in the media

Further a-field, similar sentiments have been expressed through the press. An example of a diminished work ethic has been in the Chatsworth Police Station. Since early in 2006, the *Sunday Tribune Herald* has written many articles in regard to this station. The issues were summarised in an article on page 4 of the 17th September 2006 edition entitled "The thin blue line." In it Ronnie Govender (Secretary of the Kharwastan Safety and Security Forum) summarised the situation there:

> Corruption in a small sector of the police force (*sic*), inefficiency and an apparent lack of proper training in investigative techniques had resulted in shoddy case preparation…. Complaints include the slowness of police to respond when summoned to crime scenes, an inability to reach the station by telephone (despite assurances of better systems in place), and a lack of visible policing and feedback on progress made in investigations.

> (Sunday Tribune Herald, p 4)

Another example of the SAPS not doing their work was featured on page 3 of *The Witness* on the 24th October 2006 headed "Police 'wouldn't help man.'" A man was stabbed opposite the Alexandra Road police station in Pietermaritzburg and, naturally traumatised and hysterical, went to the police for help. Instead of assisting the man, police members began shouting back at him and he had to ask a nearby market stall owner for help (The Witness, p 3).

Personally (and fortunately), I have never been on the receiving end of this sort of behaviour by police members. But I have to acknowledge the reality of a low quality of work that is based on the stories my co-researchers and the media have shared. Along with these incidents is the increasingly prominent story of corruption.

3.2.1.2 Corruption

a) Media reports

The awkward area of corruption in the police was also discussed in our conversations. Corruption seems to be as much a part of police practice as is found in the rest of society. Almost every day, newspapers have reports of corruption involving government, businesses and individuals. Here are some examples that provides some background to this overall culture of corruption.

At a government level, what became known as the "Travelgate scandal," rocked the government, with officials misusing travel allowances for their personal benefit. Then the Deputy President was suspended due to rape and corruption charges against him. As a result of these sorts of investigations into government officials by the Scorpions, the ruling ANC [African National Congress] have sought to close down this unit. But even the National Prosecuting Authority (NPA) did not escape scrutiny.

The NPA was exposed in the *Sunday Times* whose headline on the 23rd April 2006 read: "NPA in corruption scandal" regarding the irregular awarding of tenders and appointments to posts that were not advertised (Sunday Times, p 1). And the list seems to go on endlessly.

As I engaged my co-researchers on this subject, there was one major aspect I was always aware of – that of "the blue code of silence" referred to in the *Sunday Tribune* article on 2nd April 2006: "Bent cops are a sticky issue" by Jani Meyer. It refers to police (who wear blue uniforms) sticking together and never betraying each other in the face of opposition. This would include not giving evidence when a fellow policeman is implicated in wrongdoing. Otherwise known as "Blue glue," this is

"unwritten, but embedded in police culture, and is found at all levels of its infrastructure" (Sunday Tribune, p 12). On the 16th October 2006, *The Star* headlines gave an example by reporting that the Independent Complaints Directorate faced police members covering up for rape charges of their colleagues entitled "Cops cover up rapes." The ICD made the point that their task of investigation was made more difficult as police officers were uncooperative (The Star, p 1). While this news report was in line with what I quoted Shaw stating in 2.3.7 about expecting little police support for the ICD, it was not congruent with page 3 of the ICD's Annual Report of 2005/06. There the Acting Executive Director, Leslie Xinwa wrote that, "The level of co-operation with the police… has been sterling" (http://www.icd.gov.za). In the light of this, I wondered how much information I would receive on this subject and the levels of honesty. But I found that everyone spoke frankly with me. That does not mean their stories cannot be challenged, but I could only record them as they were told.

b) Jody's story of a vehicle theft investigation

As Jody and I spoke about corruption, I expressed my view of the tension police officials possibly face between reporting corruption that one is aware of and of that being perceived as a betrayal of trust with people who might deliberately let you down in dangerous situations. That was my understanding of the "Blue glue" mentioned in (a) already. But he shared a story with me where he said it becomes difficult to prove. It was the story of a vehicle theft suspect who was caught and who was willing to point police to where other stolen vehicles were. But he was not prepared to share this information with the police at Jody's station because some of them were friends of the other gang members. Jody was on a course at the time and so asked the station commander of a nearby police station to deal with the case. However, when that station commander went, another detective had taken things into his own hands and had not done a proper job. Hence, the case was withdrawn in court because the process was not done properly. An unanswered question is whether that was done deliberately or not by the detective. At the time of the interview, it was too early to tell, but Jody said he was keeping a document on the incident, which may be useful if there are further developments in the vehicle theft cases. Through this, he hinted that the truth has a way of eventually emerging.

3.2.1.3 How my co-researchers deal with these influences

I realised in my research that the SAPS must be aware of these issues and must have tried putting things into place that address them. In 1996 an Anti-Corruption Unit was formed but was closed in 2002. The Independent Complaints Directorate, as explained in Chapter 2, was tasked with investigating the SAPS. But in our conversations, my co-researchers did not mention much about these institutions, except Leon who said that the two detectives who neglected to do their work were investigated by the ICD and sentenced. The question I posed to my co-researchers with regards to the low quality of work they experienced steered the conversation in a different direction. Instead of discussing institutionalised solutions, we spoke about what keeps them going. As a result, the subject of incentives emerged.

        a) Stories of incentives

The idea behind giving incentives to police officers is to motivate them to do their work well. It is a financial reward that is given to them for excellence. While the idea is good and there are those who get what they deserve, it is not without its problems.

When I spoke to Pieter about incentives, I was thinking about the broader issue of motivation. He, however, answered in terms of the police understanding of incentives. He told me "incentives are given out. But I won't get any. The Superintendent does not like me and so he will never approve an incentive for me." From a narrative researcher's "not knowing position" I should have asked him to explain, but my fear of revealing my ignorance got in the way. Instead, when I interviewed Jody, I asked him to explain what the system of incentives was all about. As he explained, each police member who applies for an incentive (a bonus) needs to "sell him/herself," justifying why they feel they deserve it. The station commander then approves up to a maximum of 33% of the staff in each branch (e.g. Detectives, Crime Prevention) for those incentives, which get approved by the Area Commissioner. I then understood how the strained relationship between Pieter and his station commander meant that he would never get recognition for the work he does at the station. As far as their own

work goes, my co-researchers said that it is important to keep their own slate clean and to provide a public service to the best of their ability.

b) Leon's story of exceptions

In my discussion with Leon, I was taken aback by his reference to "Batho Pele" (2.3.3) as being "totally non-existent" because there would surely be exceptions. But Leon in his initial frustration was adamant about the extent of incompetence. However, as the interview progressed, he conceded to exceptions. His wife, Estelle's comment that there are police officers that work hard got him to speak of perhaps 4 out of the 15 detectives worked well. He then spoke about how he tries to do his work with compassion, saying: "I really do feel for the suffering of the victim and their family." And later on he spoke about the achievements of the station commander saying: "He has managed to bring most crimes statistics down since 1998. We used to have about 30 murders a month. Now there are only 3 or 4 a month." So, while there was a story described in extremely frustrating terms, there were elements of hope that emerged as the conversation continued. This is an example of social constructionism, where our reality gets shaped and re-shaped as we enter conversation with others.

Hearing of incidents of a low quality of work amongst police members does not encourage a hopeful picture for the future. Perhaps that is why the temptation to take matters into their own hands (such as vigilantism, which I cover in 3.2.5.4) is so strong. But there are also stories that are different from an almost hopeless one of low quality in police work. For example, in their 5th October 2006 edition, *The Mercury* reported on cocaine worth R45million and 2 British nationals being seized in Tongaat (The Mercury, p 2). In the same newspaper, 24 cash-in-transit heist gangsters were arrested in the early hours on the 3rd October at the Mvoti Toll Plaza near Kwa-Dukuza (The Mercury, p 3). So while a low quality of work was an early theme in our conversation, the presence of alternative stories of successes and compassion means that the low quality of work can be challenged.

3.2.2   Relations between Police members

There is the idea that the police are like a family on their own, covering up for each other for crimes committed. Certainly there is a lot of evidence for this, such as the news coverage regarding corruption. Another incident was that of the devotion displayed where four policemen were killed by robbers on the 25th June 2006 in Jeppestown. A reporter, Alex Eliseev, wrote on the 2nd July 2006 that he asked one of the policemen surrounding the house where the robbers were: "Have you got a negotiator here?" The policeman replied, "Policemen have died. There's nothing to talk about!" (Sunday Tribune, p 5). But I discovered that stories of police officers' devotion to each other are not the only story. Closely connected to the low quality of work were stories of how it affected relationships between police officers. While there are stories of strong relationships, issues such as the lack of trust and respect, racism and affirmative action were also prominent.

3.2.2.1 A story I had witnessed of tensions

After Jody shared the story of probable corruption, I recalled a similar incident I had witnessed many years ago where a White policeman had made an arrest, but later could not find his prisoner in the cells. The only explanation was that one or both Black policemen in the Community Service Centre (then called the Charge Office) had accepted a bribe and released the man. As furious as this policeman was, he could not prove which one of them (or both) had allowed the prisoner to escape. And Jody and I agreed that corruption leads to tensions between police officials who want to do their work well and those who don't. Further spin-offs include a lack of trust and a lack of respect for other policemen.

3.2.2.2 Jody's story of a lack of respect for ranks

But another factor Jody spoke about was the lack of respect due to fewer ranks. With some ranks being removed, it created less of a difference, for example, between an Inspector (not an officer) and a Captain (an officer), as there is no Lieutenant in between anymore. As a result, "the respect lessens between them." The problem of a lack of respect was made worse by the presence of Unions. Jody said that, "In the

past, the commanding officer could compel a policeman to do something or work extra to close a case. Now there are unions to deal with. So now you have to ask the policeman if he would do whatever, even if he has a lower rank. You can't compel him to do anything." When I asked him how he dealt with it, he said that he invited the Unions to attend management meetings and Community Police Forum (CPF) meetings so that they are part of the decision-making process, and notes their absence in the minutes.

There were also other examples Jody spoke about which were conducive to a lack of respect. One was of an Inspector who was unable to make an OB (Occurrence Book) entry because he was illiterate, while a Constable could. Another was of people being transferred on promotion to other units without training or experience in those specialised units. That also led to a lack of respect that was unfair on all parties concerned.

3.2.2.3 Leon's story of racism

Leon, who spoke about policemen who don't care about their work, said that it definitely caused tensions between those who want to work and those who don't. His referral to some detectives as "defectives" has been interpreted as racist, even though Leon said he calls any incompetence defective, no matter what their race. The issue of most of the detectives (who are predominantly Black) not doing their work properly was turned around to try blame White policemen at the station for poor investigations. Leon spoke about a march that was organised by some members and a meeting with top brass of the Midlands Area and from the National offices. It was a deliberate effort by certain Black members of the station to get rid of White members, especially the White station commander. Leon commented that he wished the detectives would do their police work with the same amount of effort that they had put into advertising the march. Both events turned out to be a defeat for those members (hardly anybody attended) because the community, a Black residential area, support the White policemen. The community have seen White policemen taking initiative in fighting crime in the area. In terms of these tensions, I asked Leon what kept him going. He mentioned his retirement and his station commander who told him he must always stay positive.

An incident happened at Leon's station after our conversation, which highlighted tensions between police officers. In this case it was between two Black policemen. *The Witness* reported on it on the 24th October 2006 under the heading: "Families baffled at death of cops who shot each other." Apparently, they had an argument with each other a few days before, but now after coming off night duty with each other, they shot each other dead (The Witness, p 3). The real reason behind this remains a mystery because these two policemen had been friends for many years. However, this incident does reveal that tense relationships between police officers are not simply along racial lines.

3.2.2.4 Pieter's story of undermining management

Pieter spoke about his station commander whose management style negatively affected the morale of the whole station. Poor management skills led to low morale at the station and a strained relationship between officers who should be on the same side fighting crime, not each other. I wondered whether this was from a lack of training in management skills (as opposed to a previous military type training). Pieter was quick to point out that the station commander had less years of experience and, because of affirmative action, received a rank for which he only later went on a course to qualify for. This I will explore further in 3.2.3 when I look at further training. But there was another issue that caught my attention.

Pieter spoke about the station commander taking away his vehicle, thus inhibiting his work. For one thing, Pieter had to ask permission from a policeman of lower rank whenever he needed a vehicle. This was something that Pieter refused to do. And I couldn't help thinking about what Jody had spoken of regarding ranks. It seemed that policemen have tried to make a move from a para-military police *force* with orders coming down the rank structure towards a police *service* that is less authoritarian. Later, I discovered that it was not an issue about lower or higher ranks, but about the way he was being treated by his commanding officer who undermined Pieter's rank at the station. Pieter did not appreciate higher ranks being undermined in front of junior ranks. This seems to be a common complaint, as I discovered when reading about

National Commissioner, Jackie Selebi, which I will come to in 3.2.4.3 that looks at police management.

3.2.2.5 Pieter's story of distrust

Also related to the vehicle issue, Pieter mentioned that he could not get to his informers. Again, his station commander instructed him to give the names of those informers to the detectives at the station. This was something Pieter refused to do because he said they were his informers – there was a relationship with them stretching over many years. Pieter's concern was that if the detectives made a mess of the information they received from these informers, the informers would never trust Pieter again. Just the fact that Pieter did not trust all the detectives in the station spoke volumes to me of little trust between policemen.

Pieter also reminded me of a story he shared in my previous research with him about the first person he shot and killed as a young policeman. Other policemen who were investigating this case told him openly that they were going to do all in their power to have Pieter prosecuted. His "crew" (a slang term for a Black partner) did not make any attempt to help him apprehend the suspect (a mental patient attacking Pieter), but had locked himself in the back of the police van. It was only through the testimony of a civilian witness that the magistrate ruled in Pieter's favour as acting in self-defence. Thus, Pieter knew that he could not even trust his partner for help during dangerous situations or to support his story of such incidents.

3.2.2.6 Dealing with these tensions

When I asked Pieter how he deals with these tensions he mentioned a number of things. Firstly, he tries to get away from the station as much as possible. This includes going on courses, taking leave or taking "time due" (when he has worked additional hours to those stipulated in labour laws). He said he never used to take "time due" until now, because he loves his job but can't work with his station commander. Secondly, he tries to do his job as well as he can to show that he is a better policeman, and tries never to lose his cool (lose his self-control) when the station commander does things to provoke Pieter. Thirdly, he was building a case by documenting all his

grievances and taking them to the Union, mainly because the top management have not paid much attention to him without the Union. His wife, Marian, who was an admin clerk at the station, chose to transfer to another station, but Pieter, while open to other possibilities, does not want to move away from the community in which he has lived and served for a long time. Building a case of grievances was Pieter's way of confronting the situation where others may choose to avoid it.

Strained relationships threaten the effectiveness of police work, as I have discovered. These can become racially stereotyped in nature regarding the quality of work delivered and in terms of affirmative action promotions (which I discuss in 3.2.3). Within these relationships, the station commanders have a lot of power. They can help police members work well, as Leon's does, but can also make things very difficult, such as in the station Pieter works in. Jody, whose wife still works in the same station as Pieter as a civilian administration clerk, made mention of this too. He had warned those in Pieter's station not to complain when they had privileges because, as they discovered, it is worse when they have been taken away. According to Jody, the station commander there was doing everything within his power to legally make life difficult for the personnel. The strained relationships can also be personality clashes where the officers cannot find their way through an impasse.

These stories have certainly gone against my early perceptions of a closed organisation where each police officer looked out for the interests of other members and everyone was on the same side fighting crime. Working at odds with one another will not help anyone in doing the main task of combating crime.

3.2.3   Further training and promotions

Without a doubt, crime is becoming more sophisticated and more criminals seem to execute their deeds with calculated precision. As a result, better training and equipment is needed to deal with this growing challenge of fighting crime. And then, once training has been provided and experience accumulated, it should translate into promotions. In business terms, that would seem to be the logical way to proceed, but again, I discovered a different reality in my conversations with my co-researchers. All

three of my co-researchers told me they had been Captains for many years and, because they are White, in Jody's words: "there is very little chance of promotion."

3.2.3.1 Jody's story and unexpected outcome

In Jody's situation, the higher authorities had sent him to a troubled police station for two weeks. Nine years later he is still there! But, despite having sorted all the problems out, it "does not count for anything. And then you get a Black policeman who is your junior in terms of experience, getting promoted." In my own past experience in the Vaal Triangle, I knew a policeman who became a Senior Superintendent and yet had not passed his Sergeant's exams years before. Our present national commissioner of police, Jackie Selebi, does not have any police experience. And so Jody admitted that people have been promoted without the necessary training or experience, which can sometimes make it hard for policemen to respect them. A surprising twist to Jody's situation came a short while after my conversation with him. He was the only White policeman in Kwazulu-Natal to receive a promotion to Superintendent in July 2006. So in his case, his patience and hard work *did* count for something.

3.2.3.2 Leon's stories of contentment and of pointless courses

Leon's frustration was slightly different when it came to training and promotions. With regards to his own promotion, he had resigned himself to the fact that he won't get promoted. That no longer concerned him, as he will be retiring soon. According to other policemen I spoke to, Leon would have to sign on for further years of service if he got promoted – something Leon admitted he would definitely not consider. He intends taking his retirement and told me he is satisfied with what he has. He said he knew Pieter was fighting for a promotion and said: "Good luck to Pieter." Instead, Leon's frustration was about his detectives who are supposed to be the "cleverer" police members. He said that they attend courses but that does not necessarily mean they pay attention in lectures. And if they do, they return to the station with the same attitude of not caring.

3.2.3.3 Pieter's use of Unions amidst Affirmative Action

Pieter made the point that he has more experience than the station commander who, because of affirmative action, is where he is. The fact that he owns a farm next to another top brass policeman at the Head office makes the station commander a well-supported candidate for the post. The station commander only attended the relevant officer's course after being given the post he now fills. When I asked Pieter whether a managerial course would help the superintendent (station commander), he said that the superintendent had told him he does not need to go on courses. A little later, I picked up on the issue of people getting promotions ahead of others. His reply was that he could appreciate the powers that be that want to redress previous inequalities and have better representation throughout the structures. But at the same time, it has been more than 10 years and "they should start promoting people again based on their experience and performance."

He then told me his own story of struggling to get a promotion. Last year he heard of other Captains in Gauteng who were in a similar position going to the CCMA [Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration of South Africa], an organisation specialising in mediation and arbitration especially with labour issues. In the second half of 2006 he filled in an official application, which was not without problems. The station commander deliberately delayed signing his application form, just to frustrate Pieter. Fortunately Pieter had established contact with the Union before and brought this to their attention as well. Rather than losing his temper, which would simply give ammunition to the station commander, he has gone the route of documenting these incidents and only attends meetings with a representative of the Union.

3.2.3.4 Promotions amongst other races

With regards to promotions, it seems that White policemen are not the only ones struggling to get promoted. On the 15th October 2006, page 1 of the *Sunday Tribune Herald* ran an article: "Call to probe Indian cop saga." It reported that the South African Human Rights Commission was going to investigate an e-mail sent from

National Assistant Commissioner NNH Mazibuko to provincial heads of Kwazulu-Natal. The newspaper reported that:

> 128 African, 65 coloured, 57 white and no Indian males be promoted in the province. It further recommended that 197 African, 38 coloured, 14 white and, again, no Indian policewomen be promoted. [Human Rights] Commission chairperson Jody Kollapen stated that promotions must be on the performance of the employee, otherwise it was considered unconstitutional and an unfair labour practice. Even though they are guidelines, it shows the thinking of the high ranks of the police.

> (Sunday Tribune Herald, p 1)

Certainly, the Indian policeman (an Inspector) I worked closely with in community projects, who was part of my audience, was amongst those who were very angry about these reports. Antony Altbeker relayed a similar story of a Black policeman with the pseudonym Inspector Solomon Makaye. Although he had many years of service from the time of the old police force, he had never been considered for promotion. As a result, he was still doing patrol work and was very bitter. As Altbeker put it, democracy had come too late for these ageing, embittered Black policemen, who had been regarded as sell-outs in the 1980s and were still unappreciated in a new democracy (Altbeker 2005:209).

While the reason given for such promotion policies are to eventually reflect the demographics of society, many members across all racial groups experienced it as being unfair practice.

3.2.3.5 Pieter's story of further training and technology

In another part of the conversation, Pieter and I focused on other training offered in terms of fighting crime. We spoke about the SAPS Automated Fingerprint Identification System (AFIS), a national database of fingerprints, and Morpho Touch (provincial). These instruments take the fingerprints of a person and, within minutes, can link that person to crimes they have committed. With changing laws, such as

those around the use and sale of alcohol, one needs to be kept up-to-date. Competency or "Street Survival" tests are also being done on police officials to evaluate whether they are fit and able to carry out their duties (such as chasing a suspect and in the use of firearms).

In a contrasting story we also spoke about one of the best detectives in the station who has a Masters degree in forensics who has just resigned to join an insurance company. His salary is far higher than he would ever earn in the SAPS and he's using his knowledge to save the insurance company millions of Rand in fraudulent claims. He was someone to whom the station commander had said, "Why are you bothering with forensics? The police will never use you in that." It is that kind of attitude that made him resign and we have lost an excellent policeman.

It comes as no surprise, then, when the *Sunday Times* headlines on the 1st October 2006 read "Why criminals are walking free: Police forensics is a mess, with R100m machines to test DNA gathering dust." It was a report about 2 state-of-the-art machines bought to process thousands of DNA samples a day and combat staff shortages were gathering dust (Sunday Times, p 1). The technology is there and yet magistrates and judges continue to see long delays and postponements. Judge G.A. Hattingh was reported on the 3rd September 2006 as one who spoke harsh words referring to Selebi who wasn't doing his job (Rapport, p 4). The same newspaper further reported that the SAPS have also acquired a helicopter with an infrared camera that can find criminals even at night through heat sensors. This will come into operation from early in 2007 (Rapport, p 6). It would seem to the public that there is the capability to fight crime but there is something missing, something that has to be addressed from the top. The question is: will they?

3.2.4   Top structures and politics

Before 1994, the South African Police Force was considered the enforcer of the Nationalist Party's apartheid policies. And now they were forced to work with a government they had once opposed. My initial curiosity was about how my co-researchers were dealing with this change (as I mentioned in 2.3.1). And yes, each of them had something to say about those in positions of influence within the political

sphere – speaking broadly about Labour Unions [POPCRU is the Police and Prisons Civil Rights Union and SAPU is the South African Police Union] and Government officials and top police management. But their stories led me to different conclusions to my stereotyped picture of police officers.

3.2.4.1 Unions – two sides of a coin

According to Wilfried Schärf, "…'unions' is the dirtiest six-letter word among the police. It is perceived by most white managers and by many white members as an evil, a betrayal, and as an excuse to get away with poor performance on the part of (mainly black and 'under-skilled') union members" (Schärf 2001:60). My discovery was that there are actually two sides of the coin as far as Unions go.

Regarding the Unions, Jody spoke about Union involvement contributing to the lack of respect for higher ranks. "In the past," he said, "the commanding officer could compel a policeman to do something… Now there are unions to deal with… You have to ask the policeman… even if he has a lower rank." Leon expressed similar sentiments by saying: "Whenever you want to try reprimand policemen, they come back [with the Unions] and want to lay a complaint against you." As I have noted in 3.2.2, Jody involves the unions in all his meetings so that: "They can't come back to me when I implement those decisions."

Pieter's story, on the other hand, is one of turning to the Union for assistance. He has sought their assistance in both his case against the station commander and in his application for promotion. He had tried taking his grievances to the top management, but he felt as if he wasn't getting anywhere with them. Unions are there for the purpose of helping workers to get their voices heard and so, as a final resort, turned to them for assistance. Now he tells me that he does not attend any meeting without a Union representative. That representative keeps Pieter calm during tense moments and makes sure that others don't try to intimidate or provoke Pieter.

3.2.4.2 Politicians

a) Our stories

When we spoke about politicians, Leon and Jody were not enthusiastic about their involvement. Jody mentioned that, "some political people who get voted on [to the CPF] soon lose interest and fade away." I shared my experience and resultant perceptions with Jody saying that, when I was involved in Meyerton in the Vaal Triangle and democracy was still new, politicians were using CPF meetings to gain political points. They would come to the Annual General Meeting (AGM) to be voted onto the executive, but after another meeting or two, we would never see them again.

At the station where Pieter works, there are one or two local council politicians involved because the CPF chairperson has worked hard at involving them. However, having worked alongside him, I know he insists that the CPF must be a-political as it is written in the CPF constitutions of each station.

Leon made it clear that he has never had time for politics. He told me that, even in the days of political violence in Kwazulu-Natal when people were being slaughtered, he was not impressed by politicians "coming with their big Mercedes cars" and "stand in your face and ask you what you are doing about it." He just goes about trying to find out who the culprits are. I tried to push him on the way politics and police work have been intertwined and he agreed that within the CPF politicians "tried to get involved and sway things for their own benefit." He went on to say that, "fortunately we have managed to address that and people are getting on with fighting crime rather than just getting political leverage."

Each of my co-researchers and I then agreed that the rumours of the CPF structure shifting away from the Department of Safety and Security to the municipality would not be beneficial. Community Police Forums must be a-political and inclusive of as many stakeholders as possible. I will return to the topic of CPFs in 3.2.5.1.

b) The media's version of political involvement

Within the media, the government has come under heavy criticism in the way it deals (or does not deal) with crime. Since the releasing of crime statistics for the 2005/6 financial year, there have been numerous articles criticising the government's inability to combat crime. For example, the editorial comment on the first page of the *Sunday Times* on the 1st October 2006, said that "the government's response to crime amounts to a gross dereliction of duty." Later it made the scathing remark that: "This newspaper would like to suggest that, in-between the mandatory back-stabbing sessions at this weekend's gathering, the ANC's high-ups reserve some time for an in-depth discussion on this crisis [of crime]. If they do not do so, it will confirm our worst fears: that they do not care" (Sunday Times, p 1). This comes in spite of promises by the National Commissioner to deal effectively with criminals, which was the headline of *The Mercury* on the 12th September 2006 "Nqakula pledges assault on crime" (The Mercury, p 1). Earlier in the year, Gauteng's MEC for Community Safety and Liaison, Firoz Cachia was quoted in *The Star* headlines on the 12th July 2006 that he would resign if he felt he wasn't doing his job in fighting crime in his 6-month plan (The Star, p 1). Bheki Cele, the MEC for Community Safety and Liaison for Kwazulu-Natal had made similar promises in an article entitled "We shall win the fight against crime, promises Cele" on the 27th July 2006. He said, "The promise I make is that, working together, we shall overcome crime. The city will be safer, the province will be safer and that is our plan" (The Mercury, p 12).

One such plan was to disband specialised units, redeploying those police officers to station level with the intention that stations would benefit from their expertise. However, newspapers such as the *Rapport* on the 8th October 2006 reported that some of them found no furniture provided for them at stations and officers complained that they now don't know who to refer serious cases to anymore (Rapport, p 1). The breaking up of specialised units, according to an article on 1st October 2006 in the "Insight & Opinion" section of the *Sunday Times* ("Top cop casts fearful shadow over force"), interrupts development and honing skills and focuses on the short-term, but does not understand the long-term effects (Sunday Times Insight & Opinion, p 19). Another plan proposed by a meeting between Business Against Crime and the government in Pretoria on the 4th October 2006 (reported by *The Mercury* on the 5th

October) was to bring back ex-police officers who have experience to tackle violent crime in the light of a 74% increase in cash-in-transit heists (The Mercury, p 1). But the *Rapport* headline article on the 8th October 2006 reported that these ideas were rejected by many police officers, saying they would never come back (Rapport, p 1). It would seem then that all these promises by government are just words at this stage. The question is whether they are realistically going to be implemented.

3.2.4.3 Top police management

a) My co-researchers' perspective

Leon spoke briefly about the top structures of the police, saying: "Their attitude is clear: You have been posted to that particular station. So you must sort out your own problems. The police at Area [the province was divided into various areas that had oversight over local police stations, but these demarcations were later done away with in favour of smaller clusters of stations] say they have enough problems of their own and don't need our problems too. So, no, there is no support from the top structures." Jody put it slightly differently when he said that station commanders have a lot of power and can make things easy or difficult for those under their command. It means that those in higher ranks have placed a lot of control in the hands commanding officers of local stations and will only intervene in desperate situations. Obviously, there are orders or instructions that come from the National offices through to the Provincial offices that have to be complied with and auditing that takes place from Area offices, but much is left to those at station level.

In Pieter's situation, I asked him whether there was anyone at the top who might be on his side. Certainly, I had heard comments that Pieter's approach could be detrimental to his prospects of promotion – the approach of listing and submitting pages of grievances. He said that he had spoken to a Senior Superintendent for whom he had a lot of respect, and asked his advice. This person, he felt, would support him in both issues of tension with his station commander and the issue of his promotion. And then, too, he felt that there might be one or two others at the Area office who could see his point of view. The problem, possibly, was that they needed to play a political game and so could not openly support the promotion of a White policeman.

b) The media on the national commissioner

The person who was the National Commissioner at the time of writing this dissertation, was Jackie Selebi. There was article on him in the *Sunday Times: Insight and Opinion* section on 1st October 2006 entitled "Top cop casts fearful shadow over force". In it nobody interviewed would offer a full endorsement nor a complete condemnation of his work. Coming from a civilian background with no policing experience, the report said he was doing a better job than his predecessor and has "been useful in the transformation of the old apartheid-era police force into a new police service better equipped to serve an emerging democracy." However, he had a "Lack of overall strategy and analysis of the character of crime" and did not try to find out what police on the frontline actually need. Some in top management gave examples of how he had "humiliated senior officers – black and white – in front of their juniors and in which he had publicly berated civilians, often with profanities that many find offensive." As one person said, "On the one hand, he is operationally sound and committed to getting the job done, but on the other he destroys much that he has built in the way he treats people." One example was of calling an African policewoman a "chimpanzee" on the eve of assuming command (Sunday Times Insight & Opinion, p 19). This attitude, as I have stated, bears a strong similarity with Pieter's comments referred to in 3.2.2 on how police officers treat and humiliate each other even in the presence of junior ranks. Part of my audience from Head Office confirmed these sentiments. They added that if Selebi does not like someone, he calls them "Chief." Thus, a title reserved for showing respect is turned into sarcasm.

In a democratic society, there have been many changes and police have had to learn to work with a new attitude of transparency without relying on just "giving orders." In terms of management style there seems to be a tension between respecting higher ranks and treating those right down to the lowest ranks with courtesy and consideration. This includes the way politicians deal with the issue of crime and the promises they make. It seems to me that those who are able to make that shift in their approach are going to be the ones who survive and, hopefully even prosper in the long term.

3.2.5 Community involvement

The mantra that is played repeatedly in the media makes the point that fighting crime is not the sole responsibility of the police, but that all sectors of the community should play a role. Government (such as political and welfare roles), businesses, religious organisations, education institutions and non-governmental organisations (NGOs) all have a contribution to make. This is something I found to be true in the conversations I had with my co-researchers. In terms of my conversations, this community involvement included topics such as the Community Police Forum and its projects, transparency issues such as an open door policy and speaking about crime trends, security companies and vigilantes, the role of informers, developing partnerships with the courts, and the role of the church.

3.2.5.1 The Community Police Forum

a) Jody's experience

When I asked Jody about Community Police Forums, he told me that, initially, they were difficult. I could also remember how police members sat on one side of the room and the community on the other side, our body language reflecting very little relationship between the two groups. Certainly, there have been the threats of political manipulation, of criminal infiltration and meetings degenerating into police-bashing sessions of unlimited community complaints. But Jody and I were able to celebrate together on how well the community and police worked together. One of the projects Jody spoke about was an awareness program in the local schools. As a result, schoolgirls have had the courage to come forward and report cases of rape by the taxi owners who transport them to school. Before this project, they might not have opened these cases and so, for Jody, it meant that a greater trust in the police was slowly developing.

b) Leon's experience

Leon was not very involved in the CPF, but he did recall how the community would treat the police badly when they went into an area to investigate a crime. This would

be through throwing stones at them or showing the police a "brown eye" (pulling down their pants and showing the police their bums). He spoke about how, when CPFs started, "they were the local complaints forum, where complaints formed the major portion of the agenda." A deliberate effort had to be made for people to rather approach the station commander with complaints and only if that was unsuccessful, should they bring it to the CPF meeting. That seems to be the general practice these days in areas where the CPF structures are working well. While Leon did not speak about community projects, saying that that was the domain of the crime prevention branch, not the detectives, his story involving the failed march (referred to in 3.2.2.3) was an indication that the community supported the White policemen who the community viewed as doing their work.

c) Pieter's experience

One of the projects Pieter spoke about was that of working in the schools in the area. Awareness projects were held in the local Primary Schools where various presentations would be made. The Dog Unit, Organised Crime (drug) Unit, the Rape Unit, the Traffic Department, and myself on Domestic Violence would each do a short presentation for the children. Through it, the children were informed of the work that the police do, the dangers facing them and their rights as victims of crime. Judging from the response and thank-you letters, these projects were very successful. As Pieter said, "Even if just one child who was thinking about drugs or whatever and has changed his or her mind, it will be worth it."

d) What others have experienced

Bheki Cele, in his promises to fight crime (reported on 27 July 2006), spoke about how communities need to talk about crime in their area; deny criminals shelter and a market to sell their stolen goods; and for parents and churches to talk about the ills of crime. In the article he relayed a story: "We recently faced a very embarrassing scene when we had to arrest a woman, fully clad in a church uniform, for having been dropped at the churchyard in a stolen vehicle. She probably knew that her son could not afford the vehicle that she was being driven in." He also spoke about the contribution big businesses had, especially in funding crime-fighting plans; and of

using the youth who know the locals well to work under a policeman to increase visibility (The Mercury, p 12).

I have found that it is wonderful to talk about community involvement, but a comment from Sammy Sayed, Area Board Chairperson of South Durban [each area had an Area Board comprising the CPF chairpersons, who elected an Area Executive], rang true as quoted in the *Sunday Tribune Herald* on 17th September 2006: "Resourcing and funding have been the greatest hurdle facing the community police forums. While there are legal mandates for the creation and functioning of community police forums, there is no legislation dealing with financing them" (Sunday Tribune Herald, p 4). In my own experience within Kwazulu-Natal, in December 2005, there was still R1,8 million for CPF projects sitting at Bheki Cele's office that needed to be spent by March 2006. Despite the Area Boards throughout the province having approved various projects in the province, no funding had been passed on to them to distribute. A huge function with all CPF chairpersons and SAPS coordinators of each station was held in prime holiday season (December) in Durban with hotel accommodation to spend most of this budget. I could not help feeling this was an absolute waste of resources that could have been spent on constructive projects.

Another example in Kwazulu-Natal where CPFs have experienced problems has been in Chatsworth. Over the year, the *Sunday Tribune Herald* has reported on tensions that have been deepening between the community and the police. Even though the *Sunday Tribune Herald* reported on the front page on the 2nd April 2006 that 190 additional police officers were moving into the area, these tensions continued to grow. In the 17th September 2006 edition of the *Sunday Tribune Herald* it seemed that frustrations between the community and the police were still present. There was a feud between "Chatsworth and District Against Crime" (Cadac) and the Chatsworth CPF. Cadac deputy president, Visvin Reddy, was quoted as saying: "Our problem lies with the dysfunctional and ineffective police forum in Chatsworth, which has failed to identify with the plight of victims of crime and address the concerns of the community" (Sunday Tribune Herald, p 4). Needless to say, the Area Board of the CPF has had to step in to help resolve the issue as Cadac had also met with vigilante groups in the area. But community involvement does not always have to deteriorate into vigilantism (a topic I will deal with under 3.2.5.4 d).

As a result of the above considerations, my co-researchers and I came to a mixed conclusion about Community Police Forums. While there are stories of success, where it works very well, there are also places where it has not worked at all. We agreed that criticism of their effectiveness should not be based on a one-sided view, but recognise that some CPFs have worked better far more quickly in some situations than in others.

3.2.5.2 An Open Door policy

Transparency at local police stations is ultimately ensured through the Community Police Forum. Any complaint regarding the quality of service can be discussed at CPF meetings. However, in order to ensure the smooth running of a meeting without the agenda being consumed by individual complaints, the station commanders have adopted an "open door policy." That means that most matters are dealt directly with the station commander and solutions can be found.

　　　　a) Leon's station commander

Leon spoke about his station commander who managed to get this right in his station. Most people in that community use that route to get immediate satisfaction, rather than waiting for the monthly CPF meeting. But, as Leon added, "That's if they haven't shrugged their shoulders at the incompetence of the SAPS." Fortunately, his station commander is popular and, according to Leon, his open door policy has resulted in "the people love him."

　　　　b) Pieter and Jody's stories

Pieter had also adopted the same policy when he was station commander at another station previously. Jody expressed that there are definite benefits to such an approach. One of the benefits is that immediate solutions can be administered, leading to client satisfaction, without wasting other people's time at a community meeting. I experienced the openness of both Pieter and Jody when visiting their stations. Pieter was station commander at another police station when I was busy with my Master's

degree. And shortly after my interview with Jody, I visited him at his station. On both occasions, I had to wait (pleasantly so) for them because they were attending to a member of the public, in line with their open-door policy.

3.2.5.3 Statistics and crime trends

Along with the theme of openness and transparency with the community has been the issue of crime statistics. Since 1994, crime statistics have increasingly become an issue of much debate and controversy, especially with greater community participation and accountability structures. At one stage, the government came under severe criticism for its moratorium on crime statistics. National crime statistics for the 2005-6 year were released in September 2006 and received much media attention. While the media criticised statistics only being released once a year, the reality is that local CPFs are kept up-to-date and discuss crime in their area once a month. Having said that, there are other dynamics at work in the compilation of statistics.

One of the dynamics is the one mentioned in 3.2.1.1 by Jody, where policemen are reluctant to open cases or will open them under a different charge. That is fundamentally manipulating the statistics so that the station does not look bad. Joan van Niekerk, co-ordinator of Childline South Africa, went so far as to say in the *Sunday Times* on the 1st October 2006 ("Women and children bear the brunt") that: "What we have experienced in the past nine months is victims being turned away from police stations. When they go to report crime, they are literally, physically being turned away. It could be that the officers are under enormous pressure to reduce their crime statistics" (Sunday Times, p 4).

Another dynamic is that people do not always have confidence in the SAPS ability to apprehend the culprit and the justice system to convict them. It may also be that the crime is considered minor, either by the police or by the victim, for example, when a minor item such as a hosepipe is stolen and nobody was hurt during the theft. As such, the incident goes unreported or unrecorded. The Camperdown CPF chairperson, John de Jesus, is well known for his plea in this regard. He points out that if there are only a few reported crimes at a station, police officers are removed to other stations where there appears to be more crime. The same principle is used when determining the

number of vehicles that a police station needs. Thus the vicious cycle of the lessened ability of the SAPS to apprehend suspects begins again.

3.2.5.4 Law enforcers outside the SAPS

Security companies also play a vital role in the fight against crime. Many people rely on paying security companies to protect their property. With the joining of 11 law enforcement agencies in South Africa, I wondered what kind of relationship the police had with those outside of that merger. I also wondered what sorts of dangers there are to having so many organisations working at maintaining law and order.

a) Pieter's story of good relationships

Pieter spoke about "a good working relationship with the security companies and farm protection units." He said that: "They often help us in making arrests when there are robberies." On the day of the Comrades Marathon (16th July 2006) there had been a murder in Camperdown (on the runners' route) and one of the security companies was informed via cell-phone. The security vehicle happened to be driving past the suspect walking in the street and promptly arrested him. Successful operations with Metro Police and the traffic department, who also attended CPF meetings, were mentioned.

b) Media stories of opposition

On the other hand, South Africa has also witnessed tensions between law enforcers. For example, when security guards went on strike on the 23rd March 2006 for the next few months, the police had to intervene when strikers turned into riots, firing rubber bullets at them. For some it looked like what once took place in the apartheid era. But others were looking to the police to protect their property from security guards who had turned into thugs. For me, the irony was in how one day both groups would have worked well together, the next day they are at loggerheads and, once the strike was over, would work together again. I wondered what those incidents do to the long-term relationship between those law-enforcement agencies. My co-researchers did not deal with this question because the security companies in the areas they work in were unaffected by the strike.

Another example of tensions between law-enforcement agencies becomes apparent when reading the newspapers. It becomes clear that, between the SAPS, the NPA, the Scorpions, Metro Police and RTI (Road Traffic Inspectorate / Traffic Department), there are often investigations done by one or more of them on each other. For example, on the 6th August 2006, the front page of the *Sunday Times* read, "Scorpions pair bust at airport" on suspicion of being part of a drug syndicate. They claimed to be working under-cover. The report went on to say: "The arrest of the Scorpions investigators is likely only to inflame the tension that already exists between the two law-enforcement agencies. The police and Scorpions have been engaged in a bitter turf war over the past few years" (Sunday Times, p 1). In another example, *The Mercury* printed an article on the 17th October 2006 entitled "SAPS man takes on Metro Police: Officer sues for R500 000." It reported that 5 Durban Metro policemen broke into Director Mzikayifani Zondi's house, and assaulted him and his family, based on information that illegal firearms were there (The Mercury, p 4). Reading this, I wondered about these law-enforcement agencies continually investigating one another's corruption and low performance levels and what this did to their relationship. My co-researchers claimed they all worked well together, which led me to wonder how much of this tension is just media hype.

One of those policemen in my audience, however, mentioned something similar to Wilfried Schärf about specialized units depending on the work down by stations and then closing the cases and taking all the credit for the work (Schärf 2001:53). This policeman also said that when members had been recruited to these units, notably the Scorpions, they burnt their bridges with the old units they were involved with.

Going back to my co-researchers about this, they felt it was partially true, although it is a generalised statement to make. According to them, they still worked very well with units such as the Organised Crime Unit and the Serious and Violent Crimes Unit.

c) Leon and vigilantes

One danger I encountered of other enforcers of the law is that of vigilantes. This is something Leon spoke about, where people became frustrated with the low quality of

policing and took matters into their own hands. Leon told me a story of something that happened a few days before our conversation. He witnessed a mob killing a suspect who had been caught by the community. Before this, he had always arrived at the scene after the deed had been done, but this time he was there when the community burnt this suspect to death. And there was nothing he could say or do to stop it. Even his wife, Estelle, who admitted that Leon doesn't talk about his work at home, said that the incident "affected Leon badly."

d) Increasing cases of vigilantism

Similarly, on the 27th October 2006, *The Witness* had a front-page article entitled "Terrorised people stone rapists to death." It relayed the story of the castration, assault and killing of a serial rapist and his accomplice (part of a gang of 4) who had terrorised residents in KwaMashu. On the 26th October, the police took two suspects to a victim for identification, when an angry mob recognised the men as those who had victimised over 12 families in that street and dragged them out of the vehicle and mutilated them to death. The police tried unsuccessfully to stop the crowd from meting out street justice. Bheki Cele said he understood that the people were angry but the community only had the right to arrest people and hand them over to the police. While a few community members expressed shock, most were jubilant over their deaths (The Witness, p 1). The speculations of my co-researchers and I, although not condoning these actions, agree that the attitudes and actions of this community are partially informed by the low quality of work in 3.2.1. People have become frustrated, not only with the police, but also with the court system of bail and long delays as well as the early release of offenders from prison. Suspects are let out on bail at 12 noon, committing their next crime by 2pm, and communities see few viable alternatives.

There are examples where the community has worked well together in combating crime. On the first page of the *Sunday Tribune Herald* on the 17th September 2006, there was an article about a farming community in Bergville who helped save two women farmers who had been held up by two armed men. One of the women had managed to call a neighbour for help and the community eventually trapped the suspects at a nearby river with the police on one side and the community on the other (Sunday Tribune Herald, p 1).

e) Bringing in the SANDF?

In the light of the surge in cash-in-transit heists, the *Sunday Times* headline on the 15th October 2006 was "Bring in the army." Security personnel responsible for transporting large amounts of cash around the country threatened a nationwide strike if nothing was done to improve their safety. The argument was that the South African National Defence Force (SANDF) would be able to equal the firepower of gangsters. The article stated that: "Armed troops were last seen on South Africa's streets in the dying days of apartheid when the National Party government was battling to keep a lid on township violence. The South African government is known to be cautious about deploying troops to do police work as this would militarise society and create a siege mentality" (Sunday Times, p 1). This, in my experience, is not entirely true. For example, in the mid-1990s, when the N2 freeway between Somerset West and Cape Town was a gauntlet of Black criminals randomly throwing rocks at passing motorists, the SANDF was deployed to patrol the freeway and the problem was solved. Similarly, when I was in Meyerton as the CPF Chairperson, we regularly had joint projects involving the SAPS and SANDF. Nevertheless, a meeting was held between National Commissioner Jackie Selebi and Emily Fourie, spokesperson of the Motor Transport Workers Union on the 16th October 2006 and measures to combat this sort of crime have been put in place without using the SANDF, according to *The Mercury* on the 17th October 2006 (The Mercury, p 3).

3.2.5.5 Informers

Leon and Pieter were clear about the importance of informers. Without them the police could not do their job effectively. Prior to 1994, these informers were mainly used to give information to the Security Police about those undermining apartheid. It was candidly said that one could not sneeze in a Black township without the police knowing you had sneezed. People suspected (even with no proof) of being informers in the townships were "necklaced" by the community, through tying them up, placing a petrol-filled car tyre around their neck and setting it alight until the person burnt to death. Although informers were well paid, it was undesirable to be accused of being one. I was one who had also been approached by the Security Police in 1990 to work

for them while at Rhodes University – I declined. And there were those who applied for amnesty in front of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission for having been informers.

After 1994, this network of informers ceased to exist, which left a gap in the police structure as their primary focus shifted to crime. With Leon being involved with the detective branch, informers form an integral part of his work. However, he made the comment that he had not seen any of his detectives fill out an application for reward money to any informers, meaning that they did not have any informers (or "sources" as they are now called).

Trust is an important quality in the relationship between the police and the informer. Pieter spoke about a relationship of trust that must be established between the police member and the informer. That is something nurtured carefully over time. For that reason, he admitted that he would not reveal his informers to the detectives for fear of them bundling a case and losing their trust in him. The chairperson of the Camperdown CPF also told me a story of informers who came to him with information about a crime. He took them to the police station, but when the informers saw certain policemen in the Community Service Centre, they refused to give their information. As the station commander was new to the area, they did not know him and so could not trust him either. The chairperson had to refer them to the Organised Crime Unit in Pietermaritzburg instead.

3.2.5.6 Partnership with the courts

Once again, Pieter spoke about a good relationship with the local courts. He said, "They tell us when they need more information… and we get it to them even before it goes to court." The prosecutors help them oppose bail in relevant cases "as long as we do our side properly." Admittedly, some of the police don't do their part properly "when they are not well led" by the branch commander.

Leon expressed his own frustration with the court system "especially if you've put in many hours, a lot of sweat" and the person is released on technicalities or inexperienced prosecutors. He acknowledged that police are sometimes at fault too,

referring back to the low quality of their work, even on basic things like taking proper statements.

When Jody spoke about the robot system, mentioned that it did not reflect conviction rates – the problem being that it took very long before cases were finalised in court or through the withdrawal of cases during that long process and postponements. Those cases reported and where arrests were made would only be reflected many years later.

3.2.5.7 Church involvement

Prior to 1994, the involvement of the church in the police force was through chaplains. At the same time there were churches fighting against apartheid and, as such, found themselves in regular confrontation with the police. My conviction in the years since 1994 has been that, while the church must still speak against things like racism, corruption and so on, the political landscape has changed and so has the role of the church.

Jody was able to tell the story of what happened in Richmond. Before 1994, there had been political turmoil in the area that extended well beyond the birth of a new democracy. Violence was a continuous problem, as well as having a police service that seemed ineffective. The higher authorities eventually removed all the police members in Richmond and replaced them with personnel from around the country. One of them was Jody who was made station commander. Initially he was sent there for two weeks, which actually became 9 years. During this time, the churches prayed earnestly for Richmond and would go everyday to pray for the policemen going on duty. When the situation finally stabilised after the assassination of Nkabinde, a political leader in the area, this prayer time changed. One of the elderly members of the Methodist Church still goes twice a week to share a Scripture reading and prayer with the police.

In my situation in Camperdown I was invited to do something similar. Once a week I went to do a Scripture reading, a short meditation and prayer at the local police station. However, I was always curious about how this time was received by the members. I asked Jody what his experience was in Richmond and he told me that

most appreciated it. He said that one or two were clearly disinterested, but that was their own choice. But on the whole, people appreciated that someone took the time and effort to come to them. Pieter expressed something similar to me when he told me how meaningful my visits and sermons were to him. While I have no reason to doubt his comment, I was still unsure how widespread it would be. This was particularly because in a new democracy there has been a new respect for other religions, where before Christianity was the religion pushed into prominence. It has only been in the last couple of months that police members have started opening up to me more freely. They have expressed their appreciation for the messages of encouragement and challenge in a way that has not forced one religion or denomination onto anyone. As Pieter put it, when there is a message that people can relate to in their pressurised job, it becomes meaningful and people can receive it.

Leon spoke a little about his experience of chaplains in the police and how his faith helps him. The chaplains, he said, were under pressure to get to too many people and so would rush from place to place, never having time to build relationships. However, his personal devotions and church attendance helped him deal with his work pressure. He finds that calms him down from the tensions he faces from both criminals and colleagues alike.

The context in which members of the SAPS work makes it necessary for the church to have an effective ministry to them. They are exposed to continuous stress, both from within the organisation as well as from criminal elements they deal with. There are the community's, often unrealistic, expectations of them, requiring of them some superhuman courage and expertise. When police officers are killed, there is the need for that trauma to be dealt with. And the list goes on. Yes, there are still chaplains doing magnificent work and social services who do counselling, but the wider community and the church play a vital role as well. It saddened me that my denomination, the Methodists, was so slow in their response. However, I was encouraged by a recent meeting of clergy from 24 major Christian denominations and organisations in Kempton Park, convened by Dr. Coenie Burger (Dutch Reformed Church) and chaired by Rev. Ivan Abrahams (Methodist Church). This meeting obtained headlines of the *Sunday Tribune* on the 22nd October 2006: "Churches tackle crime." In that meeting: "The church leaders agreed that neither the government nor

the police alone could solve the crime problem…. This was why they wished to create a broad, civil society initiative including church, business and schools…. They recognised the church had a huge responsibility." Amongst other things they "challenge churches countrywide to take responsibility for changing hearts and minds, including more involvement with the SA police services" (Sunday Tribune, p 1).

Where the community and the police work well together, the relationship can be beneficial and enriching for both parties. Unfortunately, there are places where this is not so and lots of effort still needs to be invested in this relationship. I am convinced, though, that frustrations can be overcome and crime and corruption can be significantly reduced.

3.2.6   Human Rights and Abuses

3.2.6.1 Treatment of suspects

It was only Pieter who told me a personal story where he was involved in human rights abuses. It was the story of him torturing a suspect in a criminal case where he knew this person had information but refused to give it. In order to try to extract valuable information to apprehend others, he hit this man with a hosepipe. While doing so, another policeman came into the room and later reported Pieter. As a result, Pieter was charged and sentenced. Although this happened many years ago, it did teach Pieter a valuable lesson. As Pieter put it: "Actually, that policeman did me a favour." It taught him that violent ways of extracting information and dealing with policing matters is not the only way. Other tactics of interviews with suspects and letting the pen do the talking in relationships of conflict can be effective as well.

The newspapers have also given many examples of suspects being treated badly by the police, despite a new era of democracy and human rights. *The Star* on the 28th July 2006 reported on the way police raided a block of flats – albeit a problem building – using rubber bullets; breaking down doors; forcing people to lie on the ground in the cold; and beating anyone who spoke. Senior Superintendent Chris Wilkin responded saying that the police had a warrant, "but we will not tolerate the behaviour of some officers, and people are entitled to open cases," which they did at the Booysens police

station (The Star, p 6). In another incident, reported in the *Saturday Star* on the 2nd September 2006, Phillip Nyathi, a gardener was arrested twice on suspicion of being an illegal immigrant. His identity document was taken and police refused to give it back until he paid them a bribe. He was only released from the infamous Lindela Repatriation Centre when his girlfriend paid a R600 bribe. The second time he was asked for a R500 bribe and only released when his employer brought his passport (Saturday Star, p 5).

I went back to Pieter regarding human rights and the treatment of suspects to find out why abuses continue taking place. I wanted to know whether human rights was seen as a soft approach by policemen towards criminals, or if there were other factors. On the one hand, we agreed that there was a lot of carelessness on the part of police officials. They made hasty arrests to appease a community, only to discover that their investigations were not thorough enough, resulting in wrongful arrests. But perhaps the main reason was that of the horrific nature of crimes witnessed by police officers. Once a police officer has seen the intimate places of people's lives having been violated in house robberies and the like, there is no way they are unaffected. So when they catch a suspect, who is usually not cooperative to a police officer's invitation into custody, the natural inclination is to mete out immediate justice. However tempting that option may be, we agreed that the anger we feel toward the criminal, must be redirected constructively and intelligently to ensure a successful prosecution.

3.2.6.2 The use of firearms

Section 49 of the Criminal Procedure Act (Act No. 51 of 1977) amendment has to do with the use of weapons by both civilians and police officers. Initially, as stated in 2.3.8, this was met with a lot of resistance. Many felt that they would be unprotected in dangerous situations, which in the South African context is a frequent occurrence. However, political leaders like Charles Nqakula, Bheki Cele and others have stated that policemen must shoot suspects when their lives are in danger.

Jody pointed me to a ruling made by the Constitutional Court on the 21st May 2002. The Constitutional Court delivered its judgment on Case CCT 28/01 between the State versus Edward Joseph Walters and Marvin Edward Walters. They had shot at a

fleeing suspect. It declared that Section 49(2) of the Criminal Procedure Act (allowing an arresting officer to shoot a fleeing suspect if the likelihood exists that they will harm any person in the future) is unconstitutional. This does not affect principles related to private defence and the defence of any other person. Hence, if there is no reasonable way to remove such a threat on one's own or another person's life, the use of a firearm is permitted. In a letter to all police stations (dated 2002-05-24), National Commissioner Selebi wrote in bold: "The right – and indeed the duty – of police officers to protect their lives and personal safety and those of others is clearly endorsed and in no respect diminished."

As far as the Section 49 legislation goes, my co-researchers told me that it has not affected the way they do their police work. Pieter spoke a little about his own past as a young policeman where he had shot suspects. When he was young he earned himself the nickname "Piet-skiet." He does things differently now because of his conviction for torturing a suspect that I have already recorded.

Interestingly, as far as firearms are concerned, none of my co-researchers spoke about the Firearms Control Act 2000 and the Firearms Control Amendment Bill. These laws require gun-owners to go to an accredited training service provider and then renew their firearm licence at the police station by applying for a competency certificate. The police are then required to conduct a background evaluation and physical inspection of the person's safe before forwarding the training certificate and competency certificate to those issuing the licence. This process received a lot of criticism from legal gun-owners, saying that it is the illegal weapons that should be targeted. Those opposing the amount of weapons on our streets have generally welcomed this law as a long-term plan to reduce the high numbers of weapons amongst civilians. At Camperdown we invited all interested parties to a CPF meeting where all of this was explained and questions addressed – one of our most well attended meetings! But, as I stated, none of my co-researchers mentioned this in our discussions.

3.2.7 Effects on family life

Faced with so many pressures, it does not come as a surprise to read of the destructive effects these have on the family life of police officials. One reads of posttraumatic stress disorder, of family violence and even suicide in their lives. This is understandable given the things they are exposed to in their daily work and not having anywhere they can safely receive counselling. But, again, that is not the story of every police officer. Having interviewed them in their homes, I was able to gather other valuable information from their wives who participated, albeit in the background. Not every family situation has destructive effects from the workplace of policemen.

Jody was glad to say he had managed to put his children through school and he knows he has the security of a reasonable pension. Other policemen who went on early retirement or who took a package are not so lucky, such as the one Jody mentioned who works as a security guard at Macro. He told me he was proud of what he had achieved, which put him in a good position spiritually and mentally. Regarding his family life, he admitted he was away a lot and that his phone is always ringing, even late into the night. But his family understand this, especially his wife, Karen, who works as a clerk in a police station herself. The work pressure she shares about the station commander puts him in an awkward position as a station commander himself because, as he said, "he's really doing everything he's his allowed to within his power to do." When I asked whether he shares what happened in his day with her he said, "No, not really. Work stays at work wherever possible."

Leon shared a similar sentiment, both in looking forward to a good retirement and in separating work from home life. He spoke about his satisfaction with what he has – a house, car, etc – and his faith. I will return to the issue of faith in Chapter 4. He admitted that he doesn't speak much about his work, but Estelle can recognise when something has badly affected him, such as the mob burning a suspect to death, and she will ask about it. Estelle told me that even in this interview, it was good to hear him talk about his experiences and thinks that it is healthy for him to do so.

Pieter's wife gets to hear more about his complaints at work as they worked at the same station until she took a transfer. She told me that she had never seen Pieter in all

the years of policing as frustrated as he was with the new station commander. But Pieter has also tried to separate work from home in that he supports his children's events and takes a keen interest in doing things with his family in order to unwind. For example, they go regularly to picnic spots and watching the children participate in school sports.

3.3 SUMMARY

Each of the above themes has taken place within the context of Kwazulu-Natal, particularly in 2006. There have been some similarities with what has been portrayed in the news over the year. It needs to be remembered that the situations my co-researchers shared with me are context bound and do not take into account ongoing changes in the structures and situations. For instance, the structure of Areas changed to smaller zones as from 23rd October 2006, which had ramifications for the way top management became structured. However, with the ongoing story that continues, there is still the importance of listening as carefully as one can to the stories of people. This I did and then checked my recording of these themes with my co-researchers to eliminate as much incorrect information and as many misunderstandings as possible. The chapter has tried to accurately record the findings of my initial interviews within a wider Kwazulu-Natal (and sometimes South African) context. Having listened to the stories and developed them alongside my co-researchers, I was ready to move on. I was encouraged by my supervisor to find out more about what contributed to the thinking behind those themes and formulate them into the underlying discourses, those "traditions of interpretations" that influence or entrench the views we have (movement 4). With that, I also engaged in a reflection on God's presence (movement 5), the seeds of which I found in those initial conversations. This I did through follow-up interviews and having conversations with an outside audience. These discourses or traditions as well as our reflection on God's involvement are recorded in Chapter Four.

CHAPTER FOUR

REFLECTION ON EXPERIENCE

[I]t is through the experience of reflecting on

our experience that we make meaning of it.

(Freedman & Combs 1996: 169)

4.1   INTRODUCTION

In Chapter One I indicated that this chapter would record the fourth and fifth movements of a postfoundationalist theology as proposed by Müller (1.7). Movement four is about describing the experiences as they are continually informed by traditions of interpretation. I must confess that, out of all the movements, I found this one to be the most difficult. This was because my co-researchers had not necessarily explored their experiences in this way before. But we went ahead with this process to unveil these "taken for granted" traditions lying behind their experiences outlined in Chapter Three. Like with the previous process of listening, these traditions or discourses were also discussed in the individual homes where the spouses added their insights around these topics. Unlocking these things helped us to understand the values that were at the root of the opinions about my co-researchers' experiences. It also led us into movement five, namely our reflections on God's presence in the situation.

4.2   DESCRIBING THE TRADITIONS BEHIND EXPERIENCES

Essentially, there were four traditions or discourses that were important to understand the views expressed in Chapter Three. Through our conversations we worked hard to get to the "taken for granted" traditions and discourses that shape our behaviour and attitudes. We were finally able to distil four traditions of interpretation, namely:

- An Afrikaans culture of respect
- Pride in your work
- Discipline

- Values of honesty and compassion

4.2.1 An Afrikaans culture of respect

Respect has to do with the way we treat other people. It touches on many aspects covered in Chapter Three, such as the relationships between police personnel whether of a higher or lower rank (3.2.2 & 3.2.4); the way in which the community are treated and the effectiveness of a partnership between the community and police (3.2.5); and their general family life. The focus of our discussion, though, centred round the way police officers treat each other.

When my co-researchers spoke about the lack of respect for higher ranks (see 3.2.2.2), they are speaking from a para-military and Afrikaner background. Prior to 1994, commands were given from top to bottom and orders were carried out, irrespective of whether the individual policeman approved or not. Respect was shown to higher ranks through either standing upright with arms straight beside their body or saluting if the higher rank was an officer. Since becoming the South African Police *Service*, this practice is being applied less and less. Commanding officers complain that they are often not even acknowledged through salute or "strek" (upright posture) when they enter a room. While this seems to be a minor issue on the surface, my co-researchers (and my audience of policemen from Head Office and from other race groups) agreed that this attitude spills over into a further lack of following orders. As they said: "You have to *ask* them to do something, rather than give an instruction." This has led to a deterioration of service delivery rather than an improvement. It means that, if a policeman refuses to obey, there is a tedious process of filing a grievance that needs to be followed, a process that is unsatisfactory to the policemen themselves, not to mention the public in the heat of their crisis.

Related to the above is the issue of undermining a police officer in the presence of junior members. It was unanimous amongst the police members I spoke to that this is unacceptable behaviour. Not only does it show a lack of courtesy, but also encourages disrespect and insubordination. This kind of behaviour displayed by Pieter's commander (3.2.2.4) and Selebi (3.2.4.3 b) comes across as newly elected Black commanders with a "chip on their shoulder" trying to prove themselves as powerful. I

was interested in my co-researchers' comment that they respect the rank (and so will salute their rank), but do not respect the person wearing the rank.

In my interviews I could understand the above, but wanted to scratch deeper as to why this was so important for them. Leon and Pieter turned to their Afrikaner upbringing to explain. Both told me (independently of each other) that they were taught to respect their elders, calling them "Oom" and "Tannie" (Uncle and Aunty), whether you liked them or not. I then asked about the Black culture and tribal system of chiefs in the region, as that would surely cultivate a similar culture of respect for elders. They referred to a culture that is creeping in of children speaking as they please to adults, even swearing at them. This, according to them, applied also to Blacks growing up in cities rather than in rural areas.

4.2.2   Pride in your work

In the same way as I explored the issue of respect, I wanted to find out more about the traditions lying behind their ethics of work (see 3.2.1). The question we spoke about here was where the de-motivation came from, this attitude of not caring. Was it because their hard work was not recognised and rewarded, or was it due to always being under a critical eye (be it from higher ranks, the community or the media)? Some of the thoughts we spoke about were as follows:

- Leon mentioned that policemen become hardened and can perhaps lose heart when people are always complaining. Pieter commented that it is not good to work within a context of everything being negative. But they were quick to add that this is not an excuse for poor performance and that they still try to lead by example.

- Pieter's wife, Marian got a conversation going when she identified the problem being that: "Being a policeman is no longer a calling; it's just a job for some people." From that, Pieter acknowledged he saw his work as a calling, as something he believes God has called him to do as his contribution to a better life for all. And then the conversation steered towards the idea that, for many recruits, this is the only secure job available, exacerbated through

standards in recruitment dropping. I will come back to this in terms of discipline in 4.2.3.

- Leon spoke about a value he had learned from early in his life – that of doing a job well or not doing it at all. Going back to his early comments of how policemen used to be proud when they made breakthroughs, he said that today policemen have no sense of urgency. They will rather sit in the office and read the newspaper. They have lost their pride in their work.

To do their work with excellence, it is necessary to go for further training on a continuous basis. In chapter three we mentioned the street survival course (3.2.3.5), which I then spoke about with those at Head Office. It just so happened that the police officer I had this conversation with there was the one who had put the course together. He told me that, originally, it was designed to be a one-month course. Those in higher places had, however, shortened it to two days. Not only is this insufficient, but it reveals the lack of commitment to training with excellence.

I will return to the subject of a work ethic in terms of our theological reflection in 4.3. But, for now, a closely related topic to a low work ethic is the subject of discipline within the SAPS. It is a topic intertwined with their work, but we felt it necessary to deal with it as an important aspect on its own.

4.2.3 Discipline

The tradition of discipline was spoken of mainly in terms of training (see 3.2.3). Not having that "military" approach anymore has led to an originally unintended but nevertheless undesirable lack of discipline. Pieter was quick to point out that this starts off in the police college during their basic training. Standards there have definitely dropped, which is an opinion shared by all who participated as my audience. Everything from the way their beds had to be made to marching and physical fitness has deteriorated. While those "military" behaviours were seen as peripheral by the new government in the light of it being a "Service" rather than a "Force," it has led to a lazy culture. In the words of my co-researchers, "Training has become soft and watered down." One of the people I interviewed went so far as to say that we are training a bunch of "moffies" (slang word for someone who's not tough).

I also had the privilege of speaking to an instructor (a female) who, without knowing I had any previous conversations with police officers, told me similar stories. She said that policemen had to be physically fit and able to jump over walls etc. with ease. Now, she says, the new recruits she is expected to train "can't get their fat arses moving."

When I probed the importance of this, I got the answer I was expecting. My co-researchers said that a lack of discipline led those policemen not to be alert, which is highly dangerous within the violent nature of crime in South Africa today. They said it comes as no surprise that police officers are killed on a regular basis, even being attacked in the police station's Client Service Centre. It's because they are not alert anymore.

The other contributing factor they said lay behind this lack of discipline was Unions. Old policemen have always perceived Unions as a symbol of anarchy. While they do not have that role anymore, and would probably claim to want their members to work to excellent standards, perceptions differ. Unions bear the brunt of blame (correctly or incorrectly) for trainers not being allowed to make a trainee run and exercise. And similarly they bear the brunt for not allowing police officers to be disciplined when they don't do their work, such as being slow to get up from their newspaper reading when a member of the public walks in. While I am not convinced that this is entirely true, that there are actually clear guidelines for discipline, the role played by Unions in the SAPS is still difficult to deal with.

A proposal that my co-researchers and I discussed was not to throw the proverbial "baby out with the bathwater." There has to be some way of retaining discipline factors from the past police force and building a more efficient service for the public. Clues of that approach are evident in Jody's dealing with Unions, through inviting them to participate in the process and ultimately ensure each police member's safety.

4.2.4 Values of honesty and compassion

Lying behind the stories of manipulating statistics, of corruption and a general lack of care about police work (3.2.1) was my co-researchers' desire for values of honesty and compassion. What had led those policemen to behave in those ways, we could only speculate on, but there were some things that became clearer. One of the things that became clearer was that it was not simply the actions of a few "bad apples" but values that were lacking and passed on throughout the ranks.

One example of management level behaviour was that of Pieter's station commander. It came to light between my initial and final interviews that Pieter's station commander did not open official criminal cases until the suspects were found. He would then open and solve the case, making his crime statistics look good, but it did not reflect the reality.

Another example given from the person I interviewed at the provincial offices was in the case of incentives. There would be some files put aside right at the beginning for guaranteed incentives and thereafter they would look at all the other applicants. My co-researchers were not surprised and referred to a culture of comrades and "birds of a feather flock together." They knew that in the new order it's not a matter of being suitable for the job but about who you know, who you've had sex with or given cows to. In their attempt to create equality, those in higher places have compromised quality. These values are passed on to the policemen down the ranks. A paper by the Canadian Don Loree and Durban's Metro Police deputy head, Titus Malaza, once said: "Corruption is learned. We need to go beyond the bad apple and look at the 'barrel'. While acts are committed by individuals or small groups, they do not occur in isolation from culture, structure and leadership in the organisation which can support, tolerate or even attempt to hide them" (Sunday Tribune, p 12). That is when policemen harass and then accept bribes from prostitutes while on night shift, as if that is acceptable behaviour to get out of their own financial troubles.

Leon offered an explanation that went beyond his initial comments of accepting bribes for the sake of escaping the financial trouble of policemen living above their means. He said that perhaps the police members become "hard" once they have lived

and witnessed the system for long enough and they break away from God along the way. With not enough chaplains to help them through the threatening pessimism that comes from being in a system bigger than the individual, those policemen join in so that they can keep their job. That comment challenged me to take seriously the role of the church in shaping theology and identifying God's presence amongst policemen.

4.3   THE PRESENCE OF GOD AND THEOLOGY

As stated in 1.7.5, this section deals with theology and the presence of God that my co-researchers and I spoke about in terms of Movement Five. This section is included because of the personal reasons I had as a pastor for this research (1.3.2) and because of the field of Practical Theology (1.4) that we are working within. Much of what was said evolved from a picture of God that my co-researchers felt was relevant to their issues. Again, our neatened reflections were about the following:

- A God who calls us
- A moral and just God
- A God of compassion
- A God who gives us a vision
- A God of community

4.3.1   A God who calls us

In the light of seeing policing as a calling versus a job, my co-researchers saw God as giving them this task to do. They expressed their thoughts of how God wanted them to do police work rather than another career. Other careers in a similar field may be more financially lucrative but they felt that this was where God wanted them. Two of my co-researchers expressed this differently, but agreed that this was under the ambit of God's call. And God's call upon their lives affected the quality of their work.

Leon had originally wanted to be a dominee (minister in the church), but finances prevented him from studying further at the time. That closed door opened another door into the police, which he saw as the hand of God at work. His aim was not to get rich but to make a positive contribution into the lives of people because that is what

God wanted of him. That was why he got frustrated when policemen only did the bare minimum of work, not caring, as long as there is a salary at the end of the month.

Pieter used the biblical text of some receiving five talents, others two talents and others one talent (Matthew 25:14-30). He saw this as everyone having been given a task with different abilities. As he put it: "We are all called to use it to the best of our ability and to be respected because of *that* rather than affirmative action or connections to influential people. Pieter spoke about going on regular courses to keep up to date on the changing laws and how to use new equipment, in order to develop the abilities and resources God has given him.

Related to this was the topic of stewardship of our gifts, where we had spoken on the need for ongoing training in 3.2.3. When I spoke to a police officer at the provincial offices, he expressed his frustrations where the month long "street survival course" he developed was watered-down to a two-day course by those in authority above him. For those above him, it seemed to be better stewardship. But he saw compromising training as bad stewardship. Similar to Leon's story in 3.2.3.2, he said that policemen were trained in computer literacy and yet still did not answer e-mails, blaming their computer illiteracy. In other words, some members did not want to learn anything. Unused high-tech equipment (see 3.2.3.5) was another example of bad stewardship.

It seemed to me that until we gain an understanding of this being more than a job to be done (or minimally done) and see it as something God has given us to do, using all the expertise God has given, we are not going to get far. We will not get far in raising the standard of work and service delivery to one of excellence. I then shared a comment from Eugene Peterson by way of encouragement:

> The persons we meet on the pages of Scripture are remarkable for the intensity with which they live Godwards, the thoroughness in which all the details of their lives are included in God's word to them, in God's action in them. It is these persons, who are conscious of participating in what God is saying and doing, who are most human, most alive.

(Peterson 1983:13-14)

As we thought about this, we reminded ourselves that the people in the bible were not people who had it all together. They were fallible, as we all are, and yet God was able to use them in their places of work. But the question was still to identify what we are up against. And it is here that we turned to a God who is moral and just.

4.3.2   A moral and just God

We had identified issues such as corruption (3.2.1.2). But what lies at the heart of such behaviour and is there a way in which we can "unlearn" corrupt behaviour?

Leon spoke about this issue in terms of a struggle between good and evil, between God and Satan. Each is seeking the hearts and allegiance of people. As he sees it, corrupt behaviour goes beyond the outward actions. It may start with a little financial trouble, progressing to becoming an easy option and, as he put it: "…then you are hooked." He used the imagery of opening the door slightly starts the slippery slide into deeper trouble and Satan has got you where he wants you. And that is why he highlighted the importance of knowing the difference between right and wrong. "People," he said, "must know that wrong is wrong. When there are too many grey areas, that's when things go wrong." According to him "grey areas" have led to a soft approach. As we discussed this we felt that a soft approach is one that people take advantage of. And then, when it comes to violent crime, the criminal makes use of human rights to their own advantage while ignoring the rights of victims. This will be mentioned again under 4.3.3.

Pieter also took an anti-soft approach when speaking about God's dealing with wrongdoing. He used the examples of Sodom and Gomorrah from the Old Testament and Jesus overturning the tables in the temple from the New Testament. Some of the phrases we spoke about (including those during other informal conversations) included: When evil takes place, God gets angry. God does not turn a blind eye. Our God is a God to be respected, paving the way for a respect for parents, higher ranks and so on.

Jody did not explicitly use religious language in his conversations with me, although he had grown up in the church I ministered in and his children attended. However, I picked up on the comment he made in our original conversation that the truth eventually emerges. It hinted at a God who is ultimately in control, despite the work of those opposed to good. He simply nodded when I suggested that God's hand might have been involved in his eventual promotion, and that this may be consistent with truth and goodness winning in the end. But my promptings did not elicit any comment.

What I did find is that there was a hierarchical picture of God – and God is the One who is ultimately in charge. It was something that kept these co-researchers on track with their work. But I also needed to steer the conversation towards compassion.

4.3.3 A God of compassion

Before the conversation on God became one of "hell, fire and brimstone," I steered it towards asking about a compassionate and forgiving God. While this was a clear manipulation of the conversation, I was curious to see how they married their view of a just God with a God who is compassionate and merciful (just as God had been merciful when Pieter was convicted many years ago of torturing a suspect – 3.2.6.1).

The first answer that came back to me was that the two aspects of God are complimentary. They were quick to say that compassion can be misunderstood as letting people off the hook. There are still consequences to our actions, even once we are forgiven. Leon said that Pieter, for example, still had to face his sentence of house-arrest, community service and compulsory therapy sessions. My co-researchers pointed out that discipline and acting justly is not in opposition to compassion, but an integral part thereof.

It was at this point that I threw in the word "human rights" as an expression of compassion. While they conceded that policemen sometimes misuse this by meting out their own justice, it was now becoming a question of: "Whose human rights are we talking about?" Is it the criminal's or the victim's? In their view, God was on the side of the victim. This does not justify the abuse of the criminal when taken into

custody (although the temptation is always there), but my co-researchers felt that we must not lose the perspective that the criminal *chose* to act the way they did, while the victim did not ask to be robbed or raped or murdered. Leon and Pieter ascribed it to the work of the Holy Spirit that they could now act with compassion towards the victim and restraint towards the criminal.

We spoke about the thorny issue of human rights for a while and, in the end, came to the view that God is both just and compassionate. We would therefore agree with Chris van der Merwe and Pumla Gobodo-Madikizela who, though writing about a narrative approach to healing victims of trauma, state: "When we reflect on the notion of justice, particularly in relation to human rights abuses, we need to think of justice not as an end in itself, but as a process. In that process we should strive towards a critical balance between justice and compassion" (Van der Merwe & Gobodo-Madikizela 2008:50). They agreed that nobody would come away from the Final Judgement with an unfair ruling, because God knows the whole story with all the extenuating circumstances. They came to view their role as policemen as being part of the bigger picture of God's justice and compassion.

4.3.4 A God who gives us a vision

In a totally different line of thinking, my co-researchers and I spoke a little about leadership issues that had emerged in our initial discussions (see 3.2.4). Within that context, we had spoken about political and police structure leadership, giving more expression to the frustrations than its benefits.

To evoke deeper reflection, I asked a question about the role of leadership in terms of casting a vision for those down the ranks. At first, my co-researchers focussed on politicians who speak in visionary language in the heat of the moment of grief or anger to appease the crowd or the police. For example, at the death of policemen, they would encourage the police to shoot to kill. But at the same time, my co-researchers were reluctant to speak highly of political and police leadership. It was then that the conversation shifted to God who gives visions to people.

In the scriptures, God often gives people (sometimes through an individual) a vision. This was something that my co-researchers were more willing to talk about. This vision, as they perceived it, had to do with things like justice and peace being established in our country. It is an ideal they still work towards, but they acknowledge that many people are in the system to get what they can out of it. Again, what keeps them persevering is the hope that God will bring about the fulfilment of this vision one day. They have had glimpses of that realisation through certain successes, when the judicial system works, when people work well together and so on. Even though we still have a long way to go, Leon said, "We will get there eventually."

4.3.5 A God of community

One of the visions in terms of a new style of policing has been that of community involvement. But, as Leon said: "The community have always been involved (through informers or sources), otherwise the police cannot do anything." From whichever perspective it is viewed from, there is now the explicit acknowledgement that we all need each other if we are to succeed. The question for reflection by my co-researchers was whether they saw any theological significance behind this community emphasis.

The conversation, I confess, did not get into the subject of the Trinity and of God being one of a relationship between the Father, Son and Holy Spirit. Any attempts by me to steer the conversation that way were met with polite smiles. Instead, they used the scriptural examples of how God worked with people, inviting them into a full participation with God's work. Some of the examples discussed included where Jesus used the five loaves and two fish brought by a little boy to miraculously feed the five thousand (John 6:1-14). Furthermore, intercessory prayer is based on us influencing God and being influenced by God, as in any living relationship. Jesus calling some people into community life and discipleship formation is echoed by Paul's writings of the church being a community life of respect, mutual edification etc. Many other examples could be mentioned, but we were satisfied that there is a biblical imperative to work as a community. It was more than just a new political strategy of fighting crime.

Within this community participation was the role of the church. Some of these issues have already been mentioned in 3.2.5.7 such as prayers with the police going on duty. Those sorts of actions are the "comfortable" side of community involvement. It is easy to perceive this as being supportive of the police in their dangerous work and, even those who do not wish to participate can appreciate the voluntary effort made by others. However, the Community Police Forums were originally set up for oversight to prevent abuses of power etc. and the Church has also, in the past, exercised a prophetic (and thus a less popular) role. We spoke, on my prompting on the role of the Church in this light in the present and future situation. While I agreed that criticism could be destructive, I proposed that criticism could also be beneficial when the recipient realises that the one imparting criticism is in favour of the recipient's growth. For example, when my wife criticises my sermon, I know that she does so in my best interests rather than to break me down. And so, after some debate, my co-researchers and I found some common ground of a church role being supportive and prophetic. Perhaps God's dealings reflect something similar in being compassionate and just.

4.4   SUMMARY

This chapter recorded my research findings in terms of movements four and five of a postfoundationalist theology. While this portion was the most difficult to probe, it also turned out to be one of the most fulfilling. It was here that we interrogated our beliefs and assumptions that these White police officers in middle-management lived with under a new constitution and discovered some ground for hope. It was a process that involved a fair amount of debate between my co-researchers, other opinions and myself.

The traditions we covered in this chapter included a culture of respect, having pride in your work, the importance of discipline, and holding onto the values of honesty and compassion. Much of this related to our reflections on God's presence, which included doing this work as a calling and not simply as a job; recognising a moral and just God, balanced with God's compassion; capturing a bigger vision given by God; and acknowledging that God uses the community in accomplishing a better society. These traditions or discourses have a direct bearing on the themes in Chapter Three,

such as the work ethic of excellence rather than of a poor quality; how policemen need to treat each other, beyond the tensions of racism and bad management; of developing constructive relationships with the wider community and human rights.

Once again, we recognise that the elements we discussed are not exhaustive, but merely prominent at the time of the research, and that we are all still developing in our thinking about these things as the debate continues. The way in which this debate continued was through the next movement of an interdisciplinary investigation, which is the subject of the next chapter.

CHAPTER FIVE

CONVERSATIONS FURTHER AFIELD

Sharing our views and judgements with those inside and outside our
epistemic communities can… lead to conversation, which we should
enter not just to persuade but also to learn from.

(Van Huyssteen 2000:431)

5.1   INTRODUCTION

This chapter has to do with the interdisciplinary exploration of the discourses already
raised. As stated in 1.7.6, this is the sixth movement in Müller's seven movements in
postfoundationalist research procedure. This included the work of researchers from
various fields, such as criminology, theology and social sciences. Here I have drawn
on comments made in articles and books regarding the material discussed between my
co-researchers and I, which added to our ongoing discoveries. The aim was to see
what points of transversality (see 1.5.3) there are between the various disciplines.

5.2   CATEGORIES OF DISCUSSION

For the sake of recording this movement in an organised way, I formulated four
categories, which covered the discussions covered in Chapters Three and Four. The
four major areas I explored are:

- Leadership

Under leadership we considered the previous topics of new leadership (2.3.4),
including the poor management mentioned in 3.2.1; the top structures and politics
(3.2.4); the culture of respect (4.2.1); and of God who gives us vision (4.3.4).

- Human Rights policies guiding police behaviour

Points covered from our research includes that mentioned in 3.2.6 as well as the
underlying values of honesty and compassion (4.2.2) and our picture of God as moral
(4.3.2) and compassionate (4.3.3), which should affect police behaviour.

- Internal police relationships

Things taken into consideration here include what was researched in 3.2.2 regarding relations between police members. Relationships between different law enforcers and units (2.3.4 & 3.2.5.4) and of units being disbanded (3.2.4.2 b); racial and affirmative action issues (also in 3.2.3); and the effects of corruption and a low work ethic (3.2.1) fall under this heading. It also assumes what we have discovered in the God who calls us (4.3.1) and the God who helps us discern between right and wrong (4.3.2).

- Utilizing communities and technology

Here we grouped those aspects related to the wider community such as Community Police Forums (2.3.5 & 3.2.3 & 3.2.5), which assumes the different perceptions by the community on the SAPS's ability to fight crime (2.4). We also see the material covered in the God of community (4.3.5) as part of this discussion. And in terms of utilizing technology, this was discussed under 3.2.3 regarding further training.

Through this part of the process, my co-researchers and I tried to discover some of the insights that come from other disciplines that can be brought into further conversation with our thinking.

5.2.1 Leadership

Thus far, we have looked at leadership at the level of politicians and the kind of leadership given by police management (see 2.3.4 and 3.2.4). We acknowledged that some have practiced leadership in more preferable ways than others. And we touched on the leadership God provides through giving us a vision (4.3.4). This discourse on leadership motivated us to read more on this topic to see whether other insights could help us in this regard. We looked at perspectives that come from the church, business, politics, social sciences and criminology.

5.2.1.1 Church and business perspectives

The first thing we noted was that those in leadership need to have an appreciation for what is happening in people's lives throughout the organisation. Although speaking about church leadership, Jurgens Hendriks' comment applies to policing leadership:

"…leadership living with people at grass-roots level, addressing their needs, helping them to face and handle the realities confronting them, despite some tough measures and difficult decisions, thrives" (Hendriks 1995:29). John Maxwell, who presents seminars to business leaders worldwide, notes the mistake of many leaders spending too much time in their offices and suggests that a leader must "take time to walk slowly through the halls" in order to connect with those working under you (Maxwell 2005:214). The model of a few executive members making policy decisions in a Head Office, removed from the realities is clearly inappropriate in a country seeking to shape itself on principles of democracy. The concern was raised with those I interviewed at the SAPS Headquarters in Pietermaritzburg that they had not worked in a station for many years. It also worried us that leaders like Selebi and Nqakula were perceived to be distant from local activities. We all acknowledged, though, the logistical problems with that (time constraints and other responsibilities etc.), and that is perhaps where a police officer in middle-management has a distinct advantage of "being in touch," presuming they have been promoted there with the necessary experience beforehand. Jody made a comment that if a person does not have the necessary experience (a reality with affirmative action), they should ask those "under" him or her who have the experience for help. That kind of humility in seeking to understand those he or she works with will win respect and cooperation.

The humility of a leader is closely linked to the concept of "servant leadership." It has been expounded on in theological circles as a style Jesus used: leading through example, showing the disciples how to do what needs to be done, and then sending them out to do it, with a time of reflection afterwards. This sort of leadership style is very different from the bureaucratic one characterising the police in the past. Peter Storey, a former bishop in the Methodist Church of Southern Africa, offers the following definition: "Servant leadership begins with the understanding that our task as leaders is to serve those we lead and that we serve them best by empowering them" (Storey 1995:73). This is not to be misunderstood as meaning that everybody can do as they please in the name of local empowerment. Management still needs to provide vision and direction for the organisation. The purpose, however, of top management should be to shape policies that will best serve the local stations and specialised units. And middle management (the focus of this thesis) is to translate those policies into practice, empowering rather than inhibiting the work at station level. It means, for

example, explaining the correct use of firearms so that police officials on duty know exactly when to use them. It means ensuring that the personnel at the station are sent on regular courses to update their knowledge on technology. That's what a servant leader does.

5.2.1.2 Political perspective

From a politician's point of view, F.W. de Klerk, a former president of South Africa facilitating the transition to a new South Africa, summarized the requirements for leadership based on his experience, looking at the big picture of South African politics. He wrote about the ability to make an impartial assessment of the situation; to accept the need for real change (not just doing old things better); basing decisions on strong values; and shaping and implementing visions (De Klerk 2002). While these applied within the high-profile political circles, it is applicable for other levels of leadership too. Certainly there is change happening in the SAPS. Papers and policies are filtering through at a rapid rate. New decisions are made (for example on how zones and areas are to function; or the closure of specialised units) and later retracted. The question is: how much is leading to an improvement and how much is taking them on a pathway to deterioration? That is the criteria that those in middle management are looking for. Those who have remained in the SAPS, such as my co-researchers, say that they can deal with any changes if they can see positive results. The risk always remains that not all changes will lead to the desired outcome, which is why De Klerk points out that the process of change never ends, that: "There is no point at which leaders can say that they have 'solved' any problem in a rapidly changing environment" (De Klerk 2002:614).

5.2.1.3 Social sciences perspective

Social sciences have spent considerable energy on analysing leadership styles. One has been in the various usages of authority, from being exploitative to encouraging full participation by everyone. Another has been on whether one focuses on task achievement or upon the needs of people. Alvin Lindgren and Glenn Asquith state that: "No single leadership style is universally appropriate because of the differences in leaders, members, and situations" (Lindgren & Asquith 1990:635). Some situations

require a greater emphasis on tasks, while others can focus on group participation. Levels of supervision also depend on commitment levels to the task and the maturity of the group. The ideal would be to get the tasks done well, with a high degree of personal growth and morale. Within the context of my co-researchers, this did not seem likely in the foreseeable future, because of this lack of "calling" to the job by many members of the SAPS. They felt they could contribute, albeit insignificantly, through their own example of honesty, reliability and integrity (keeping their own slate clean). They said that perhaps something would rub off onto those around them. And, while they wanted the support from management above them, they wanted it exercised in a way that displayed a trust in their ability to get on with the job.

5.2.1.4 Criminology perspective

Altbeker, as he accompanied two Black policemen, asked them about what politicians such as Minister Nqakula could do for policemen. The response was: "Nqakula? Who is he? … Shouldn't a man who owns a large herd at least go out to see the cows sometimes? But he is nowhere. He knows nothing. What does he know about the police officer and law enforcement?" (Altbeker 2005:207). Comments like these certainly thicken the story of policemen who feel that their leaders are out of touch with what is happening on the frontline (covered in 3.2.4.2). Even in the public's perception, political talk of crime being under control does not ring true. The public know that statistics are manipulated and not congruent with what they see and read around them. There seems to be a growing distrust in what high level leaders speak about, whether it is their tough talk and their manipulated reports or their verbal support of police officers.

5.2.1.5 Summary on leadership

My co-researchers and I came up with several conclusions regarding leadership at all levels. One is that leaders (in their case, middle management) must always remain in touch with what is going on at ground level policing. Servant leadership would not necessarily be the term they would use, but would certainly agree with a position of humility in order to obtain cooperation from other police officers. Secondly, fairness and integrity should be the guiding influences when it comes to top management

making political speeches, releasing statistics and so forth. Thirdly, leaders need to be able to adapt to change and new situations while holding onto strong values. Fourthly, leaders must provide an inspiring vision for others to follow. And fifthly, though not mentioned in our further reading, my co-researchers reminded me that undermining other police officers in front of junior ranks is unacceptable, not only because of the way things were done in the old order, but a matter of good management style.

5.2.2 Human Rights policies guiding police behaviour

This research covered the topic of human rights in 3.2.6, particularly the treatment of suspects and the use of firearms. The main point of discussion went around "who's human rights are we talking about – the criminal's or the victim's?" African countries, including South Africa, are not known for their impeccable track record when it comes to human rights. Despite structures such as the Independent Complaints Directorate (2.3.7) and legislation such as that which controls the use of firearms (2.3.8), we still have a long way to go. Many papers have been compiled to guide police behaviour. In Chapter Two, I wrote about policies such as the Green & White Papers (2.3.2) and the National Crime Prevention Strategy (2.3.6) in the light of *batho pele* (2.3.3). We also discovered through the research process, the underlying values of honesty and compassion needed (4.2.2) and reflected upon a God who is moral and just (4.3.2) and compassionate (4.3.3). This research made the observation that police officers can adapt and integrate policies when they can see the benefits through improved service delivery. Unfortunately, there is often a discrepancy between what is on paper and what happens in practice.

5.2.2.1 The gap between policy and practice

It was interesting to read an article by Eric Pelser and Antoinette Louw from the Institute for Security Studies on the gap between policy and practice. Their article speaks of possible reasons for the gap between policy and practice being either due to recommendations not being acceptable to those implementing them, or the problem of adopting Western models who have accountable governments and functional service delivery. They argue that crime prevention is the task of departments of welfare, education and health, who are each struggling with their own service delivery, and so

are unable to co-ordinate with other departments. Because of these sorts of difficulties, politicians seem to revert to tough law enforcement methods (which have immediate results) rather than long-term preventative ones. Pelser and Louw go on to propose a national crime prevention centre located at the highest levels of government to provide leadership, strategy and funding to stimulate more effective partnerships. Until then, police will continue crime prevention in terms of high visibility through setting up roadblocks, random search and seizures and the like (Pelser & Louw 2002). So, while policies may seem good on paper, the implementation tells a different story. In order to try overcome that gap between policy and practice, we proceeded to explore what other disciplines had to contribute.

5.2.2.2 Amnesty International report

We had at our disposal a document published by Amnesty International outlining the findings of human rights abuses in the Southern African region (SADC countries, which include Mauritius, Angola, Zambia, Tanzania, Malawi, Mozambique, Zimbabwe, Swaziland, Botswana, Namibia, South Africa). Results showed that many deaths occurred as a result of police action such as during arrest or while in police custody. Discriminatory attitudes were seen in "police failure to take action against human rights abuses committed by others" (Amnesty International 2002:21). Women reporting cases of rape and domestic violence are still met with insensitive police members who refuse to investigate these cases, labelling them as family or community matters. Street children, homosexuals, illegal immigrants, poor and illiterate people are also vulnerable to human rights abuses by police. The political misuse of the police is not new in the region either. While this was prominent in South Africa's past, such political involvement has diminished since 1994. The report recommended considerable training in human rights, training that goes beyond the one-day workshop. This includes incorporating it into the training of new recruits, regular refresher courses for older police members and ongoing monitoring and evaluation. The newness of such courses has made their effectiveness difficult to establish at this stage. Lisa Vetten from the Centre of the Study of Violence and Reconciliation has also spoken repeatedly on television documentaries on the lack of care and concern shown by police members towards victims of rape.

5.2.2.3 Theological perspective

What does theology have to say about the issue of human rights? Does God's love for all people mean that they can get away with murder? Do we treat hardened criminals with tender love, or is there a tough love that needs to be applied? How much of this is realistic in the heat of the moment? Some of these questions are addressed in Chapter Four, as we balanced a God of justice (4.3.2) with a God of compassion (4.3.3).

John Stott gives a brief history of where human rights come from and provides a helpful biblical basis for them. Apart from the fact that human rights were not invented in the last few years by the new South African government – but have a history as far back as Plato and Aristotle who also wrestled with the subject of freedom and justice; Britain's *Magna Carta* in 1215 and Bill of Rights in 1688-9; and the American 'Declaration of Independence' in 1776 – human rights also have a theological basis. Stott uses the three words of "dignity," "equality," and "responsibility." Having being created in the image of God (Genesis 1:27-28), we have been given dignity and the right to become fully human. This does not mean we can do as we please. We need to live the way God intended. The example he gives is that convicted criminals may be deprived of their right to freedom while imprisoned, but that does not justify the right to treat that prisoner inhumanely (Stott 1984:144-146). Regarding equality, Stott admits the tragedy that human rights have degenerated into "*my* rights" irrespective of the rights of others. For that reason, he goes on to highlight the biblical imperative to champion the rights of the powerless, showing no favouritism (Stott 1984:146-148). And about responsibility, Stott highlights defending the rights of others above our own through loving our neighbour. This is to counteract notions of self-centredness that human rights may evoke. Philippians 2 is about Jesus who did not insist on his own rights despite being falsely accused and dying an unjust death. Through this he argues that we should entrust any injustice to a just Judge and focus our attention on taking a loving interest in others.

Furthermore, Johannes van der Ven, Jaco Dreyer and Hendrik Pieterse state that Christianity's belief in salvation "prompts people to claim and defend – even fight for

– the human rights enshrined in the Bill of Rights" (Van der Ven, Dreyer & Pieterse 2004:454). While their focus was on Grade 11 pupils from a multicultural school and a mono-cultural school, their aim was to explore the relationship between religion and human rights. They argue that issues such as criminality, poverty, AIDS and unemployment need human rights to be enforced and that "Christianity must help to invigorate an inspiring human rights culture, otherwise it will lose all relevance" (Van der Ven, Dreyer & Pieterse 2004:454). And in their conclusion, they call upon the church to "crawl out of their cocoons and approach society with open and critical minds so as to contribute to the development of common social interests and values" (Van der Ven, Dreyer & Pieterse 2004:587).

5.2.2.4 Criminology perspective

Altbeker's research relayed a story told by a Black Inspector who spoke against the idea of human rights in a similar fashion to my co-researchers. He spoke of criminals who will kill others for nothing. If they are caught, they are treated in jail with free meals, expensive hospitals etc. Suffering while being imprisoned would, in his opinion, be a deterrent for crime. For him it was as if the government cared more about making criminals feel comfortable than treating the police with respect (Altbeker 2005:208-209).

One of the related areas is that of torturing suspects in order to extract information. While dealing with a policewoman trying to obtain information about a murder, Altbeker asked her why she did not revert to such methods, as tempting as they are. Her answer was that it was not worth her while to get into trouble over someone else. He made the concluding remark that: "If society refuses you permission to use any and all means to get the evidence you need, well, that's its problem. Fewer cases will be solved, and more bad guys will walk the streets, but that's a choice made by society, not by individual police officers" (Altbeker 2005:57).

5.2.2.5 Political perspective

Khehla Shubane, the Executive Director of the Nelson Mandela Foundation, also raises the point that some criticise the government's concern for "the wellbeing of

criminals rather than the rights of the victims" (Shubane 2001:192). But he goes on to say that "the argument that crime is increased by the overly generous human rights regime is not as self-evident as it seems" (Shubane 2001:193). He then makes a comparison with Brazil whose police, despite democratisation, use extra-judicial ways of maintaining order. Using force in combating crime did not have more successful results in Brazil. All my co-researchers and our audience disagreed with this view. For one thing, they said we could not compare South Africa to Brazil. And secondly, a criminal does not care about anybody's human rights while doing the crime, but shouts loudly about human rights when they are caught.

One thing we did take note of was of the work done by an Australian criminologist, Joan Wardop. According to Altbeker, she worked with the Soweto Flying Squad and argued that "excessive toughness is frowned upon" by their colleagues because "in Soweto, you never know who is watching, how many of them are armed, and who might take offence" (Altbeker 2005:141). So the message becomes: for the sake of self-preservation as a police officer, not because of any ideological commitment, one should not abuse a criminal's rights.

5.2.2.6 Summary on human rights

This topic is one of many differences between the ideal on paper and the reality on the frontline for police officers. The report by Amnesty International is correct as it identifies the insensitivity towards human rights, particularly towards certain vulnerable groups, and that more effort is needed in terms of training. Two things must be remembered when dealing with the topic of human rights. On the one hand there is the difficult and dangerous work that the police encounter every day. As such, split-second decisions need to be made, because a criminal will not hesitate to shoot a policeman, and mistakes can be made resulting in police fatalities. The police members I spoke to (both my co-researchers and audience) unanimously agreed that the criminal is not interested in anybody's human rights except their own. On the other hand, even though the criminals are perceived, by the public, as having more rights than their victims, we live in a democracy with a constitution. Theologically, we also affirm that people have been created in the image of God; that we have all sinned (not only the criminal); and that God can bring about change in people's lives.

As such Christianity needs to advocate human rights for both victims and criminals based on our common dignity, equality and responsibility. Tackling crime has to be done in a different way from using only bullying tactics. Creativity and perfecting our technology, detective and intelligence skills are going to be essential in combating crime that has become more sophisticated. Laufer sums it up well when he says:

> Of course, the police have a tough job and have to be tough in many situations, sometimes using deadly force. But equally, there are many situations – arguably the vast majority faced by officers each day – in which they have to be smart and disciplined in dealing with criminals, and empathetic to victims. This takes training and leadership.

(Laufer 2001:23)

5.2.3   Internal police relationships

Internal relationships between units, racial tensions, incentives and corruption formed the next portion of our reading material. Most of the commentary surrounding this topic came from a criminology perspective. But in the later part of this section I look at a perspective from business and from social sciences.

5.2.3.1 Relationship between units

We have discussed the SAPS relationship with other agencies involved in fighting crime in 2.3.4 and 3.2.5.4. I mentioned Wilfried Schärf who wrote that specialised units encourage a lack of co-operation "because of the manner in which the specialised units are measured and rewarded for success" (Schärf 2001:53). This causes tension with those at station level whose contribution often goes unrecognised. But simply amalgamating these units into the local SAPS stations will not bring a solution either, as we discovered with other disbanded units (3.2.4.2 b).

The restructuring of various units in the SAPS has also produced much tension and uncertainty. Bilkis Omar from the Institute of Security Studies gave an overview of this process. He pointed out that the initial intention (or so it seemed) was to restructure the SAPS to avoid duplication. For example, the Area Offices were

removed because they duplicated the work done by the Provincial Offices. Those staff members would be redeployed to local stations to bring their expertise back into station level policing. But this restructuring also affected the "Family Violence, Child Protection and Sexual Offences Unit" (FCS), the "Serious and Violent Crimes Unit" (SVC), and the "Area Crime Combating Units" (ACCU). Omar goes on to describe how the unions tried to stop this, or at least ensure that it was done in a consultative way. This was not communicated well to the police members, who claimed that the unions "sold them out." The effects of this restructuring in order to strengthen local police stations still needs to be evaluated over time (Omar 2007:25).

Most of my co-researchers felt that the restructuring process was not well handled. One of them felt that it was the right thing to do, but the others did not think it was a good thing. Their reasons were that it was not consultative with those on the ground; that the local police rely on the expertise of specialised personnel to help them solve complicated cases; and that they now had nobody to turn to, as their smaller stations in the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands were not given any of these experts. Before the restructuring proposals came, they, as we spoke about before, could not see the problem with existing relationships. The impression was that those in top management made their decisions regardless of what middle-management and unions had to say.

5.2.3.2 Racial tensions

Placing oneself anywhere on South African soil, one will find that the issue of racism is a highly emotive one. Racism does not only occur within the SAPS, but is found in all sectors of our society, including the political, business and religious community. Verbally it is condemned and denied, but if we are honest, racism is embedded within our South African situation. After all, we have lived separately from each other (even if some have lived in the same geographical location) for many years. Suspicions between people of different races flourish in such conditions. What happens in the SAPS is a mirror of what is taking place in our wider society. The question is not so much around analysis of the situation (because so much has been done there already), but on how to deal with it in practice.

Racial tensions (3.2.2), according to Schärf, are an issue that can easily be overcome through teamwork and celebrating their diversity. He writes: "White detectives cannot gather quality evidence if they don't speak the language of the residents. Black detectives who do not have driver's licences cannot do their work without transport" (Schärf 2001:63). Before we see this as simplistic, he does acknowledge the problems related to promotions that have definite racial connotations.

The overall impression my co-researchers and I had was that we are in the middle of a long process. As much as we would like the past to be swept clean, we are all still finding our way through our racism. While there is a lot of effort put into politically correct language and being critical of racism (sometimes to the point of absurdity – viewing each incident through "racist" eyes), not many people have solutions. Perhaps it will take another two or three generations before we shake free of our emotional prisons.

Jo Viljoen, who also did narrative research into the SAPS, sought to address the issue of racism in their group of participants. Viljoen used a counselling project for Aboriginal people in South Australia and incorporated narrative therapy practices in their group-work. While there were initial resistances amongst both Black and White participants, they eventually trusted the process. The process they followed was, firstly, naming the injustice (not denying it or becoming defensive); secondly externalising the problem (enabling them to talk about its effects without laying blame); thirdly, taking steps of resistance against racism towards more respectful practices even when in the company of one's own race group; and developing respectful practices, such as apologies, as an alternative way of living (Viljoen 2001). The helpful element we found from Viljoen's research was that changes of attitudes and behaviour begin with each one of us, not through policies and papers.

5.2.3.3 Promotions

A related issue to that of racism is the issue of affirmative action (or even favouritism) promotions. The changes that have come about in terms of promotions (3.2.3) have been summarised by Schärf as he writes:

Under apartheid one had to earn one's stripes through climbing up the ladder in a particular way, skewed as it was by limitations on advancement for 'blacks in the broad sense'. Affirmative action has meant accelerated promotions for those staff members who had been prohibited from rising up the hierarchy in the past. This process is widely perceived by the white police as putting people into positions for which they are not ready, and as therefore unfair to the career advancement of those who believe they are eligible for the jobs"

(Schärf 2001:60).

As we discovered, though, Indian policemen in Kwazulu-Natal were also not eligible for promotion and Altbeker mentioned Black policemen who felt overlooked (3.2.3.4). They even went so far as to say that they were purposefully failed in exams so that Black policemen would never be in charge of White policemen (Altbeker 2005:205). While acknowledging that management in the police before 1994 was dominated by Whites, my co-researchers did not agree that others were purposefully failed – at least not to their best knowledge. However, to get into the top management of the police did require some experience in the Security Branch (hence the dilemma of replacing General Johann van der Merwe, settling eventually for George Fivaz – see 2.3.4), or being part of the *Broederbond* (an elite organisation of top Afrikaners in politics, church, business etc). Looking at the situation surrounding promotions, both past and present, it seems to remain true that it has more to do with "who you know" than about "what you know."

David Bruce, from the Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation (CSVR), came to similar conclusions in their assessment of policing. He writes:

While employment equity and affirmative action policies are necessary, it appears that the SAPS has been somewhat overzealous in adhering to them. Particularly where implementation of these policies is combined with other factors, such as nepotism or favouritism, it is likely to contribute negatively to staff morale.

(Bruce 2007:18)

The result seems to be a lack of respect for those in authority and jealousies when some do a good job. This sort of situation cannot be good for morale and cannot provide an incentive to work with excellence.

5.2.3.4 Corruption and low work ethic

In 3.2.1.1 we discussed the low quality of work and in 3.2.1.2 recorded the influence of corruption. We discovered that a lot of it is learned behaviour. The "Batho Pele" document had no tangible consequences in improving service delivery. It seems as if corruption and poor service delivery are taught to the new recruits when they enter stations to do their practical training.

Again in our reading, we found that these factors were not new. There is a history to corruption, legitimised by the previous government and it overflows into the present. In their article "Lessons learnt on anti-corruption" the National Anti-Corruption Forum (The NACF being a partnership between government, business and civil society) stated: "Since the apartheid government had to limit transparency to achieve its ends, such context was a breeding ground for corruption…. Given South Africa's past the presence of corruption was not surprising but must not be tolerated" (http://www.nacf.org.za 7 May 2008). In the same article, they quote from President Nelson Mandela's opening address to parliament in 1999 who said that: "we must admit that we have a sick society" (http://www.nacf.org.za 7 May 2008). It also says that: "Although the Minister of Safety and Security… and the Deputy Minister of Justice are members of the NACF there is very little input from them or their representatives at forum meetings" (http://www.nacf.org.za 7 May 2008).

Antony Altbeker, after working with the Anti-Hijacking Unit for a week wrote: "Within their own unit, the detectives acknowledge the existence of corruption. One officer, whom they all suspect of consorting with hijackers and stealing dockets, is despised and ignored" (Altbeker 2001:39). So there is an acknowledgement that we are a corrupt society, and the police will also reflect that in their ranks.

There is, of course, another way of looking at the low quality of work some police members display. It may be in terms of the multiple tasks they are called upon to do. Police work is not simply a case of fighting criminals "out there" who prey on innocent victims. For example, in terms of domestic violence, often where both parties are drunk, Altbeker writes: "Cops resent being dragged into these things…. They would infinitely prefer to hunt criminals who prey on strangers rather than ex-boyfriends with anger-management problems" (Altbeker 2005:24). Yet, my co-researchers and I were not satisfied with this because they had done this sort of intervention before 1994. Shubane reminds us that: "Before the transition, the South African Police (SAP) was reputed to be the best in Africa: members had what appeared to be an insatiable capacity to apprehend suspects, bring them to trial and obtain a high record of convictions" (Shubane 2001:190). Why was it becoming a big issue now amongst some "lazy" policemen? Why do the police seem so ineffective and open to corruption?

According to Schärf, "One of the biggest causes of police ineffectiveness has been the breakdown of the cop-culture that was so strong during the apartheid years" (Schärf 2001:60). He states that the reason is twofold: One is the new criterion for promotion, based on affirmative action and the other, the presence of unions. "Together these two factors have broken down the former solidarity, the unity of purpose and the commitment of police to put their lives on the line in the fight against crime" (Schärf 2001:60). This ties in with what Leon spoke about when he said that policemen used to be proud of successful breakthroughs. Now it is no longer there, at least not to the same extent as it was before 1994.

5.2.3.5 Business perspective

Maxwell writes about leaders motivating others around them to increase their productivity. Here, he says leaders need to be creative because people are different and circumstances change all the time. Among those creative ideas are: putting out a challenge, providing further training, encouraging or setting up incentives (Maxwell 2005:272). Certainly the old method of obeying orders from above no longer works

and so, as difficult as it might be to adjust, police officers need to learn new ways of leading and inspiring the police members under their charge.

5.2.3.6 Social sciences perspective

Interpersonal relationships and motivation are two of the subjects dealt with within social sciences that relate to the above. For example, much has been written on getting to a win-win situation in our relationships. And psychology has also contributed considerably to our understanding of what motivates people to give of their best. This was the sort of reading material my co-researchers and I found helpful in terms of relating at work.

A win-win goal applies to relationships of any kind. It is proposed as a goal in our relationships within our family, our churches, our workplace and any civil situation of conflict. It was this principle that was used by peace-monitors in conflict resolution and it is still something we feel is applicable within the workplace of police officers. This approach values all parties involved in the relationship equally and seeks to go beyond compromise towards a position where all parties obtain maximum benefit as a solution. How is this made applicable in the police service? For one thing, promotions and incentives based on performance and rewarding hard work, rather than favouritism or affirmative action (which we discovered is also not entirely true), would mean a better motivated police officer, an improved public image for those in higher management and greater public satisfaction as crime is effectively dealt with. In other words, all parties would stand to benefit from such an action.

Psychology speaks of teleological and causal explanations to our motivations. When behaviour is motivated by goals, intentions and purposes, it is referred to as teleological. And when behaviour is mechanical or just obeying laws, it has a causal explanation. Getting positive and negative feedback; the need or drive for achievement and the fear of failure; satisfying self-interests or motivated out of concern for the well-being of others; instinctual motivations for protection or curiosity; and Maslow's hierarchy of needs – all these are spoken of within psychology. Industrial psychologists are enthusiastic investigators into what motivates workers. They have looked at external factors such as salaries, the policy of the

organisation, working conditions and job security. And they have considered internal factors such as achievements, completing important tasks, being praised or recognised and promotions. We agreed that these are all important components. Unfortunately, at the moment, these factors are short-circuited by affirmative action, or rather cheapened by unfair practices, favouring certain people over others irrespective of experience and competence.

5.2.3.7 Summary on internal police relationships

These views echo what has already been discovered in our journey thus far. Here we have explored the relationships between different units (and their restructuring), at racial tensions, promotions based on who you know (before 1994, it was linked to the Broederbond, now selective affirmative action), and corruption. We also tried to find insight from business and social sciences in improving motivation and pride in what work policemen do. After amalgamating eleven forces into one (2.3.1) and having to overcome tensions between different racial groups, work ethics and policies about promotions, my co-researchers' thoughts were mixed between pessimism and hopefulness. They were not convinced that the situation will get better any time soon, especially as many good policemen have left the SAPS and training courses were too brief and not implemented (3.2.3.2 & 4.2.2). Yet they held onto a vague hope that things would not deteriorate beyond redemption in the long term. There are still good police members who want to do well and are well disciplined. And those are the kind of members that my co-researchers are willing to work with irrespective of their race, rank or what unit they belong to.

5.2.4 Utilizing communities and technology

5.2.4.1 Informers / Sources

As mentioned in 3.2.5.5, these are members of the community who provide valuable information to the SAPS about criminal activities on the streets. Once referred to as "informers," they are now known as "sources" because of the political connotations. Informers prior to 1994 were seen as betrayers of the community to an apartheid government. But what, according to the criminologists, has happened to this practice?

Writing from a criminology perspective, Schärf points out some tensions between the detectives and intelligence branches of the SAPS because of their different methodologies. Detectives, he says, want information that is going to be admissible evidence in court cases. And those in crime intelligence pass on information to their colleagues gathered from their 'sources' in the field. For safety reasons, crime intelligence has a legal obligation not to reveal their sources. According to Schärf, these methods conflict with the demands for 'evidence' that can stand up in court" (Schärf 2001:55). He claims that the source of this rivalry comes from apartheid days "when the security branch trumped all other police units" (Schärf 2001:56). Schärf used the example of the arrest of Deon Mostert who later claimed to be an informer regarding the St. Elmo's bomb blast in Camps Bay, near Cape Town, on 8 November 1999. He goes on to recommend that their working relationship needs improvement and clear policies and mechanisms be introduced regarding each operation including the limits of the amount of crime such agents be allowed to do.

In my reading I also found instances where the police do not want help and information is not used. One example was relayed through the newspaper on the 28th October 2007 about a retired General, Suiker Britz, who established an investigation company. He reported that he found the police unhelpful even after giving them information about suspects, witnesses, photos etc. They still did nothing with the information. He even offered to train detectives free of charge but Selebi never got back to him (Rapport, p 13). In a similar article on the same page, Mr. Tristan Melland wanted to start "The Criminal Record" to help get eyes on the road for wanted criminals. Ground level police were in favour, but management (Senior Superintendent Vishnu Naidoo being mentioned) was against it, saying police methods were sufficient and such publications will give the impression that crime is out of control (Rapport, p 13).

5.2.4.2 Community Police Forums

From a criminology point of view, Altbeker recalled the early experiences of police having to work with civilians saying that, apart from a few exceptions, most police officers hated civilians, regarding them as "know-nothing *hase*." Civilians at the time

were sceptical of the police management's politics, competence and honesty (Altbeker 2005:248). While we partially agreed with Altbeker here, we felt that much has been achieved since those early, awkward days of uncertainties. Some of my co-researchers did not experience these early tensions, either because they were not directly involved or because the towns they worked in were small enough for everyone to know each other before the formalised relationships. Wilfried Schärf, Gaironesa Saban and Maria Hauck, on the other hand wrote about "an initial surge of interest and activism in the post-1993 phase" (Schärf, Saban & Hauck 2001:68) followed by a decline into deeper scepticism about the success of CPFs and a corresponding growth in vigilante activity.

5.2.4.3 Vigilantism

Altbeker's research took place at the Maluti police station where they encounter a lot of stock theft. There the police need members of community, chiefs, headmen and "peace committees" because they cannot be everywhere all the time. When the police told Altbeker that they sometimes find bodies on the mountain, he initially felt that they approved vigilantism. But he goes on to say:

> It wasn't that I was wrong to worry about vigilantism, it was that I had completely failed to grasp what was interesting about the relationship between the police and the peace committees, who were, in effect, negotiating the position of the boundary between the modern state and something else [the informal, tribal institution of justice].

(Altbeker 2005:40)

An article by D. Singh highlighted some of the root causes of vigilantism and proposed an African form of restorative justice "to co-exist with the current criminal justice processes" (Singh 2005:49). Singh summed up the causes by saying that "there exists, currently within the townships, little confidence or trust in the police or the criminal justice system" (Singh 2005:46). Regarding police action, the article speaks of community frustrations with police not responding or following up on information, even when the community members catch suspects. The slow justice system with easy bail conditions, poor investigations and free meals if and when the person is

imprisoned add to these frustrations about crime in the community. It is much easier, quicker and apparently more effective for the community to apprehend and punish the criminal themselves. A proposal Singh comes up with is similar to the jury system as in the U.S.A. where a suspect is placed on trial in front of fellow citizens for crimes through a firmly and responsibly managed process. In doing so, "a synergy between the traditional practices of the criminal justice system and community justice" can be developed towards restorative justice (Singh 2005:49).

5.2.4.4 Crime statistics

From a criminology viewpoint, Antoinette Louw and Martin Schönteich reminded us of the national moratorium that was placed on releasing crime statistics after May 2000. One can appreciate that this was done due to concerns about their reliability and accuracy. They mentioned an example of a station who recorded incidents of pick-pocketing while traveling in a taxi as "cash-in-transit heists." However, it created a lot of media criticism of it being a political cover-up to hide the government's incompetence in dealing with crime. The article then went on to say: "Ironically the better an area is policed, the more crimes the officers will witness, detect and record and the more people will want to report crime. Thus good policing often results in higher levels of recorded crime" (Louw & Schönteich 2001:47). They then say that the effectiveness of the justice system is in how many arrested people are prosecuted.

5.2.4.5 Fighting crime with technology

Altbeker's contribution in the last chapter of latest book gives some common sense solutions with regards technology. For example, he speaks about cars (as with cell-phones) being blacklisted and rendered useless, having parts with electronic signatures making them safer. Technologies that can identify, track and convict offenders through DNA databases; real-time tracking of vehicles; and electronic tagging of less dangerous criminals to decrease prison population are some of his other suggestions. He says that, "Technology-based improvements in safety are unstoppable and irreversible. They will not end crime in South Africa, but their contribution could make a huge difference to levels of safety" (Altbeker 2007:177).

5.2.4.6 Business perspective

Writing about leadership, Maxwell says that, because leadership is complicated and we all have our blind spots, organisations need to develop teams at all levels. He writes: "A group of leaders working together is always more effective than one leader working alone. And for teams to develop at every level, they need leaders at every level" (Maxwell 2005:265). In other words, having a network of people with various insights will benefit the organisation as a whole. Before the early 1990s, the police were reluctant to work with a network that was too wide, apart from their own chosen informers. But over the last decade, they have, in places, seen the benefits it can have, having the community's help financially (for example "Business against Crime") and neighbourhood watches where members of the community are their eyes and ears.

5.2.4.7 Social sciences perspective

Right at the outset of his book "The 7 Habits of Highly Effective People," Stephen Covey opens his acknowledgments with the words: "Interdependence is a higher value than independence" (Covey 1999). Although he says that independence precedes interdependence, we agreed with the statement because we all need each other. People can try to work independent of others, but our lives are enriched when we recognise the diverse contribution that others can make. Just as we are convinced that our world is socially constructed, so too we recognise our dependence upon each other in a mutually beneficial relationship. People with different insights and expertise working towards a common outcome (such as fighting crime) can be a very effective strategy.

5.2.4.8 Summary on utilizing communities and technology

Cooperation will only be possible when there is mutual respect fostered between police officers themselves and between members of the SAPS and the public. Bruce, in his assessment, writes that the SAPS have struggled to work with the public. Their reluctance to make crime statistics available, even within some CPF meetings, undermines their efforts to be transparent in a new democracy and gain the cooperation of the public in fighting crime (Bruce 2007:17). This section has taught

us the importance of teamwork in utilizing sources (both those referred to in the past as informers and using information voluntarily provided by the public) and working together in CPF structures to avoid the temptation towards vigilantism. We need to recognise our interdependence upon one another and thereby the necessity to be transparent in correct statistics and conviction rates. And we recognised the value of technology, its availability and usefulness, if only it would be implemented.

5.3   SUMMARY

In this chapter we have dealt with the sixth movement in our research procedure. In it I have tried to gather comments from different disciplines pertaining to the stories my co-researchers had shared with me. Four major areas were explored, each with their own sub-headings of contributions from other disciplines. Together we discovered many areas of transversality, places where we could find common understanding from the disciplines of business, politics, social sciences and, in some cases, theology. There were also, of course, places where disagreement occurs (even within a specific discipline) as opinions differ. However, one of the major common threads was a longing for a police service that is accountable and provides quality in terms of service delivery to the public. Middle-management are essential components of this process, because they are the ones who monitor the day to day occurrences at station level. They are usually the ones on the frontline of police-work and face the community on an ongoing basis. As such they are the ones who need training and support to fulfil these requirements and meet the challenges. Taking this further, we now move to movement seven as this research moves towards a wider community.

CHAPTER SIX

CONCLUSIONS AND LOOKING BEYOND

Your hands made me and formed me;
give me understanding to learn Your commands
(Psalm 119:73 NIV)

6.1   INTRODUCTION

In this final chapter I will be writing about the final seventh movement of our research procedure as I draw this document to a conclusion. Essentially it is the conclusions that we, as co-researchers, want to take to the broader community. While the research stems from a specific local situation, namely the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands, it must move towards the wider community. Those who helped me in this research have something to contribute to others and it is my commitment to enable their stories to be heard. The way I have structured this chapter is as follows:

- A summary of the content of this research, starting with an overview of the chapters and then identifying the unique outcomes;
- A brief description on my co-researchers' lives since the research was conducted;
- A critical evaluation of this research, particularly about whether I felt we achieved our aims, questions that remain unanswered, what I could have done differently, and what this whole process did for me;
- And finally, looking at where this research points to next, as I take it back to a wider community.

6.2   A SUMMARY OF THE CONTENT

6.2.1   Overview of the chapters

This research project began by explaining the changing political landscape of South Africa and I defined the primary research question as being how police officers

(specifically White, male Captains in the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands) are dealing with these changes and working within a new constitution (1.1 & 1.3.1). This topic, although jointly decided upon, emerged from my interest in practical theology and my growing involvement in community policing. Personally, I wanted to discover a pastoral response (1.3.2), contributing towards other carers and helping police officers in their own creative growth.

From our primary research question, other secondary questions emerged that formed part of my initial curiosity and helped us explore this topic more thoroughly. These questions included:

- Have the new structures such as CPFs and the ICD achieved their aims in bringing about accountability (1.2.2, 2.3.5 & 2.3.7)?

  Not much was said about the Independent Complaints Directorate, except Leon, who had two detectives investigated (3.2.1.3). But he spoke of it as if it were a matter of natural course rather than as something new in South Africa. Further than that, my co-researchers offered no comment. Even using media and the ICD website on reports on corruption (3.2.1.2) did not elicit any controversial discussion.

  However, the role of the community including CPFs, the open door policy, transparency on crime statistics, vigilantism, church involvement etc. (3.2.5) gathered more than enough material to reflect upon in terms of its supportive and prophetic/critical role.

- How has the relationship between different law-enforcement agencies worked – firstly through amalgamating eleven of them into one (2.3.1), then having other institutions (NPA etc) complimenting them (2.3.4)… or not?

  Problems surrounding the amalgamation were spoken of in terms of those who received a high rank in the new SAPS still being illiterate, while lower ranks may be quite articulate and educated (3.2.2.2). Apart from educating them or sending them on courses, not much else was said on this topic.

  Regarding other institutions, we saw that the media highlighted every hint of tension between different law enforcement agencies and specialised units (3.2.5.4b). While tensions and distrust exist between some police members (3.2.2), and some of those who moved to other units burnt their bridges, there

was (amongst my co-researchers) a view that they all worked well together and relied on each other's expertise.

- Have the policy and name changes (2.3.3) made any real difference in policing, or has it remained "business as usual" with racism and human rights violations (1.2.1 & 2.3.6)?

We agreed that there was a gap between policy on paper and what actually happened, for example, "batho pele" being non-existent (3.2.1.1b), a new racism against White officers who wanted to do their work well (3.2.2.3) and in terms of human rights (5.2.2.1). But these policy and name changes did have an effect – sometimes curbing abuse (3.2.6.1 & 5.2.2.4), but also, negatively, retarding discipline, work ethics and training standards (4.2.3).

- Are their stories unique to White male police officers or are they issues experienced by other racial groups in the SAPS as well (1.3.1)?

Certainly, many of the frustrations were shared across all racial groupings, such as blockages in promotions and between hard working versus lazy members. But the impression I got of White middle-management police officers was of a comparison between how things used to work and their deterioration now, such as a growing lack of respect for ranks (3.2.2.2), poor management skills (3.2.2.4) and undermining officers in front of juniors (3.2.4.3). These officers saw themselves as still working hard, with a growing majority of other races deteriorating in terms of work ethics (obviously acknowledging a few exceptions).

- How have these police officers dealt with their own role in leadership (middle-management) and with the leadership exercised over them (2.3.4), whether politicians (3.2.4.2) or top brass (3.2.4.3)?

Their faith in the leadership exercised over them was not flattering. A lack of being in touch with station-level realities, a lack of support in terms of incentives, corruption even at the highest levels and so on, filled the content of our discussions with negativity. Regarding their own role in management, they initially felt in a hopeless situation, but learnt valuable lessons when we read about business middle-management 5.2.1.1 about the leaders who are in a position to connect with people at the bottom and have some insights about what is happening at the top.

- And a question that was not originally considered, but which emerged through our discussions, was that of dealing with unions (3.2.4.1).

    Here we discovered two sides of the coin. On the one hand, was dealing with the deterioration of standards caused by unions. And on the other hand, where unions became the source of assistance.

Thus, the questions were posed in the first chapter and were addressed, to some degree, in the remainder of the thesis. I will critically evaluate this in 6.4.

The first chapter went on to describe the way in which I went about addressing these questions. I chose a narrative approach, taking seriously the stories of my co-researchers. I explained that this approach is within a postfoundationalist paradigm, which is consistent with the view that our world is socially constructed. Our lives change as we interact with others. And so this research is not simply gathering data, but respectfully intervenes in the lives of these policemen, deconstructing our views so that we can live more creatively. The method I used was the seven movements proposed by Julian Müller to guide me through this process.

Chapter Two gave some historical background. This was in line with the first movement that described the context (1.7.1). This context painted a wider picture of the policing situation in South Africa, before getting to the specific, local context of my co-researchers. It also provided an initial background for any readers who might not know the wider context and "taken for granted" knowledge during the interviews.

A listening process that identified issues these police officers were facing was addressed in Chapter Three. This was done in terms of the second and third movements (1.7.2 & 1.7.3) where experiences were listened to and interpretations were made. Although I recorded these stories under different headings, many topics overlapped and may give the impression of being untidy. But it would seem as if life cannot be neatly categorised and so we had to work within that untidiness. Among the themes we identified were the following:

- A low work ethic that included corruption, uncaring attitudes and poor management in the SAPS. The media also tended to capture these negative sentiments, but we also had stories of exceptions where good work was being

done. The way my co-researchers dealt with this was through incentives, staying positive, recognising good work when it happens, trusting that the truth will emerge and holding out until retirement.

- Relations between police members were not always healthy, characterised by tensions, distrust, a lack of respect for rank structures and racism.

- Further training being watered down by being less thorough and promotions being based on selective affirmative action. Training was either not implemented or far too short in duration to be of long-lasting value. And promotions, as in the past, seemed to be based on "who you know" rather than "what you know." There must surely be exceptions to that, but the general consensus in this research and that done by other researchers mentioned was that promotions were based more on favouritism than performance.

- Top structures and politics identified politicians who have a tough talk approach but are often viewed as being out of touch with local level policing. Top police management, including the national commissioner, did not seem to care about police officials at local level, leaving each to sort out their own problems (unless they cause trouble). It seemed as though leadership issues were difficult to deal with, moving from a structure of obeying orders from the top, to dealing creatively with problems.

- Community involvement through Community Police Forums, having an open-door policy, transparency about statistics, working with other law enforcers (even vigilantes), sources (or "informers" as they used to be called), courts and the church. My co-researchers seemed to say that they worked well together with others, although the media and some criminologists differed by pointing out elements of antagonism. Certainly we have seen a maturing happening from community involvement being simply a complaints forum and a political point-scoring opportunity to something far more constructive.

- Human rights and abuses was a topic we looked at predominantly in terms of the treatment of suspects and the use of firearms. Hard lessons are being learnt within a democracy based on a Bill of Rights – lessons that have cost policemen their lives and have been detrimental to their careers. Without a doubt, the use of force is necessary at times, but other options also need to be explored so that violence is not always our default reaction to every situation.

- The effects on family life have been a separation as far as possible between work and home life. I was not always satisfied that this was possible because the spouses picked up on the negativity in indirect ways and seemed glad that this research got their policemen husbands to speak about it in their presence. But there are also those who have tried to bottle up their emotions, and who have ended up in places of domestic violence and even suicide.

In some of the above themes the seeds of unique outcomes for both my co-researchers and I emerged. I will return to the subject of unique outcomes in 6.2.2.

These themes became the centre of our further enquiry into the discourses (explained in 1.6.3) or traditions of interpretation (explained in 1.7.4) that shape our attitudes – terms that I have used interchangeably. These constituted the fourth movement recorded in Chapter Four. This chapter also included the way we picture God's activity in our lives (as Hudson's quote in 1.6.3 states) – constituting the fifth movement (1.7.5). After much discussion, we distilled four discourses and five aspects of God that influence my co-researchers' reactions to the themes raised in Chapter Three. The four traditions of interpretation (discourses) were:

- An Afrikaans culture of respect, which affects respect for higher ranks and those with more experience (as one would respect one's elders). One must still respect the rank even if one does not respect the person wearing the rank. This culture of respect is also being undermined in other racial groups, being replaced with insubordination or having "a chip on your shoulder."
- Having pride in your work is being replaced with losing heart through continuous negative criticism and no longer seeing police work as a calling. Striving for excellence is no longer the prevailing desire and neither is it encouraged nor properly facilitated by top management.
- Discipline standards have dropped since becoming a "Police Service" rather than a "Police Force." Unions have to bear part of the blame for increased laziness, which makes police personnel less alert and open to lethal danger. However, Jody's approach of involving unions to improve discipline was the most creative approach I encountered.
- Values of honesty and compassion need to form the foundation of relationships with each other and with the community, from the way clients

are dealt with to releasing statistics for accountability to be a reality. This is the only way we can begin curbing corruption from the highest to the lowest ranks. It is here that the church plays a vital role, which led us to the next movement in our reflection.

The aspects of God that contributed to our thinking were:

- A God who calls us.

  The career of policemen (and women) is more than just doing a job, but a calling to make a contribution into the lives of people, using the talents God has given them. God wants us to strive for excellence, which is compromised by recent sub-standard training and under-utilised technology.

- A moral and just God.

  This explored what lay at the heart of corruption, where people no longer see a distinct line between right and wrong and the slippery slide into corruption is created. Examples of God's dealing with wrongdoing were cited from Scripture and linked to the comment that the truth eventually emerges.

- A God of compassion.

  This counter-balanced a possible God of vengeful wrath (coming from the moral and just picture of God). The two need to be held together as pure compassion could lead to the idea that people get let off. The area of human rights as pertains to victims and perpetrators of crime can be distorted if the two are separated.

- A God who gives us a vision

  In contrast to political and top management leadership, God gives an inspiring vision that kept them working towards a peaceful country. It still has a long way to go before we see the fulfilment thereof, but there are glimpses of it when communities work together and crime-fighting breakthroughs are made.

- A God of community

  Here we spoke about how God used people in miraculous ways and the biblical imperative into community life characterised by mutual respect and edification. The church plays an important role here in supportive care to members of the police as well as a prophetic role of constructive criticism.

Chapter Five contained the work of the sixth movement (1.7.6) – that of dialogue with other disciplines. In this chapter we discussed the categories of leadership, human rights policies, internal police relationships and utilizing communities and technology. In each of these categories, we brought them into dialogue with the disciplines of politics, business, criminology, social sciences (for example, psychology) and theology to see what we could learn from them.

- Under leadership, we affirmed the need for top managers to remain in touch with station level activities so that when they shape policies and provide direction, it facilitates growth and maturity where it is most needed. Likewise, we learned that having the qualities of humility, fairness, integrity, adaptability and respect are important values to possess in order to gain cooperation.

- When it came to human rights policies, we acknowledged the gap between policies and what happens in practice. There is still abuse that occurs, even of some victims of crime. We also had to face the reality that criminals use human rights to their own advantage, including life-threatening attacks on police officials' lives. But in terms of dealing with apprehended suspects, improvements in intelligence and information extraction exercises need to replace reverting automatically to bullying tactics.

- Internal police relationships looked at the restructuring of units (the intention being to bring expertise to local stations, but smaller stations don't benefit and have nowhere to turn to in complicated cases); racial tensions reflecting what's happening in the wider society through, for example, racially defined promotions and favouritism (which was a factor even in the "old South Africa"); corruption and poor service delivery being a learned behaviour in comparison to policemen being proud of their work before. We looked to the insights of business and psychology to try discover new sources of motivation, be that through external or internal factors, which we can only hope will not be short-circuited by affirmative action for many more years to come.

- Utilizing technology and communities explored some of the literature that stated that there are situations where they are well used, but also cases of regretful neglect. Where there was a lack in these areas, vigilantism has sometimes been resorted to. Both the business and social sciences perspectives

spoke about interdependence and developing teams to effectively deal with problems. There is no excuse why this cannot occur with policing and, where technology and communities have been used, we affirmed the work that has been done.

6.2.2 Unique outcomes

Through the course of this research there were some unique outcomes (as defined in 1.6.5) that we identified. I have briefly reported them here next to each of the names of my co-researchers, including some of my own.

Jody   The "robot system" (3.2.1.1a) was scrapped in March 2006. Top management realised that the intention of creating healthy competition between stations was not being actualised, but resulting in stations manipulating statistics.

His promotion to Superintendent (3.2.2.1) came despite affirmative action (3.2.3.4 & 5.2.3.3) and Pieter's approach of regularly going on courses and who tried using the unions to get promotion (3.2.3.3 & 3.2.3.5). Whether God was involved here (4.3.2), we can only speculate.

Pieter His arrest and community service sentence many years ago for torturing a suspect turned into a unique outcome (3.2.6.1). Since then he has developed a greater understanding about dealing with suspects that will not contravene human rights considerations.

Regarding his relationship with his station commander (3.2.1.1c), Pieter was moved to another station. While this does not solve the problem, it enabled Pieter to do the job he loves. It is not the sort of unique outcome we hoped for, because there must be better ways to deal with conflict than simply transferring one person to another station. But it is a better situation than the one of continuous grievances and counter-charges being made.

Leon Despite his initial negativity about defective detectives (3.2.1.1b), his story also had elements of hope, such as a positive station commander who was able to bring crime rates down (3.2.1.3b), reflected in a failed march by Black policemen against the White police officers (3.2.2.3).

We also observed that tensions were not simply a matter of race because two Black policemen at his station, who had been good friends, shot each other dead (3.2.2.3).

Although it is not the ideal unique outcome, Leon's retirement comes after a lifetime of service to an (often) ungrateful community. Yet, even though there have been frustrations, he has made it through with other aspects of his life intact, such as his family and faith.

Myself Relationships between police members was probably the biggest unique outcome for me. I always thought that they held to a code of secrecy and covering up for each other. A decreasing work ethic was not new to me – that has been plain to see. However, the frustration attached to it by police officers who still tried to work hard in the face of lazy or incompetent SAPS members was astonishing.

A further unique outcome for me was that these issues are not only experienced by White police officers, but by those of other racial groups too. For example, Whites were not the only ones to suffer stoppages to their promotions.

Further training, that should have given greater competence in terms of street survival, human rights and promotions etc, was insufficient to meet the demands placed upon a police service in a democracy with high levels of crime. It surprised me that little was being done to rectify this. However, the unique outcome here was when I realised again that God used fallible people too (4.3.1). And even though the SAPS limp at times, there are moments of excellence as well.

And then there is the unique outcome of the community-police relationship. For so many years these two bodies worked separately (except when it came to informers) and were suspicious of each other. Now there has been a heroic attempt to overcome past antagonism and hurt in order to work in partnership against crime. Some places have struggled here more than others, but we cannot underestimate the amount that has been achieved in these few years.

That, then, is a summary of the research project so far. Essentially, it is that content I take to the wider community, adding to the wealth of data already in the public

domain (Movement Seven). But we must remember that this is an ongoing process. People's lives did not stagnate after this research. And so I also want to include the next section of what happened to them between the time of completing the writing process and my final consultation with them regarding these conclusions (so that they would be involved from the formulation of the topic to the conclusion). In my final consultation, I found out about some of the developments in their lives.

6.3   MY CO-RESEARCHERS' LIVES NOW

When we read stories, we want to know how it ends and what happens to each of the characters. The truth is that people's stories do not end. Their lives go on and they hopefully continue to grow into better human beings. I realised that, by the time this document is finished, it would be outdated in terms of my co-researchers ongoing development. But I wanted to bring their contribution to some point of conclusion for the benefit of ongoing research. In 2007 I moved away from my co-researchers to Pretoria. As such I needed to travel back to them with my conclusions from our discussions. There I found how much their situations had changed, mostly for the better.

In Pieter's case, as I stated under the unique outcomes heading (6.2.2), he was transferred to another bigger station due to the charges and counter-charges between him and his commanding officer. The Prosecutor did not pursue these charges and the entire case was dropped. Pieter stayed at his new post where he was again under the command of a Black station commander. However, his new commander had tremendous faith in Pieter's ability and gave him the space to do his work. When I saw Pieter at the end of 2007, I could not believe the difference in this man. He was thriving in his new post! The only thing was that the issues of poor management over him were not dealt with. But Pieter was happy and that was, for him, a unique outcome of how God worked things out. It was not what he expected in terms of his grievances to be followed up on, but a satisfactory alternative had opened up. Furthermore, his previous commander was facing an auditing inspection on his high "success rate" of possibly opening cases only after the suspect was apprehended. The results of that audit fell beyond the scope of this thesis.

As I already mentioned earlier, Jody was promoted for his hard and innovative work. He was still at the same station and continues to do well. Further than that I was unable to ascertain whether his theology had changed as a result of our conversations. He gave no verbal indication thereof.

And as for Leon, he is now happily retired. The unique outcome for him was being able to see some of the successes despite the frustrations he experienced. His last station commander, who brought down crime in his area, still commands a great deal of respect across the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands and I wish I had the opportunity to have a conversation with him. Nevertheless, I wish Leon well – a person who did not always get the recognition he deserved for his hard work.

In terms of the politics of policing, there are also changes that continue to take place. The national commissioner, Jackie Selebi was relieved of his post in December 2007 on charges of corruption and defeating the ends of justice. And the African National Congress (ANC) are still trying to disband the Scorpions before the ANC president, Jacob Zuma goes to court over corruption charges.

6.4   A CRITICAL EVALUATION OF THIS RESEARCH

6.4.1   Did we achieve our aims?

I have a mixed response in regarding the extent to which we achieved our aims. My co-researchers thought we did achieve them. They expressed their gratitude in having someone taking their stories and contribution seriously. They found it therapeutic in being able to talk to someone about their joys and frustrations. This was because the process forced us to question our assumptions and taken-for-granted knowledge, deconstructing where it came from and seeking an alternative understanding for our lives. Further reading and other external voices stretched our thinking as well. Some of these were mentioned in 6.2.1, which gave a brief answer to each of the secondary questions posed in the first two chapters. And a lot more information came to the fore during our conversations that were beyond my initial questions. While I acknowledge these aspects as true and am deeply grateful for the privilege of sharing in those stories of successes and challenges, there were still things I felt we did not achieve.

For one thing, I wondered whether true unique outcomes were achieved or whether they were circumstantial. Did these police officers come to a point of dealing creatively with some of those challenges as a result of our conversations? Or did their lives turn out well in the end due to circumstances such as getting the promotion, the transfer and the long-awaited retirement? I can only hope that our discussions together had more than therapeutic value, but that they gained insight into their lives as we dialogued with each other and with the views of other disciplines.

I also wondered about the political role of policing. Again, while I acknowledge that the SAPS have come a long way since the days of enforcing apartheid laws towards a crime-fighting role, we did not deal thoroughly with politics. It was a topic that was sidelined in the name of not being interested in politics and only focussing on crime. Yes, there were police members who were uninvolved in political activity and who will continue focussing solely on crime irrespective of who is in government. But I don't think we got to grips with politics, albeit our passivity towards it. We did, however, speak about continued practices of racism (and reverse-racism) and torture that still occur.

I was not sure whether we were able to close the gap between policy and an inward conviction or belief. Was there any change in our beliefs about, for example, the death penalty and human rights as a result of our conversations and reading? And did my co-researchers' own style of management change as we looked at leadership? They implied that they already practiced new styles of leadership and management in their own situations. There was, however, a partial appreciation for where those underlying values came from theologically, once we had completed this process.

On the other hand, we sought to look forward towards better policing and an alternative story that we hope will develop. We all had the desire for an end to corruption and for people to be given their due reward of incentives and promotions irrespective of race. Along with what we hope is the majority of our society, we want to work together to end crime through effective community policing and partnerships with various specialised organisations.

Regarding areas of transversality (1.5.3), which we tried to find in the fifth chapter, were there significant points of agreement between disciplines? Here, I have to say that there were. There were agreements about the negative aspects of policing under a new constitution and about some possible ways forward. Different language may be used, such as "servant-leadership" in theological terms would not necessarily be used in a business forum. However, the sentiment of empowering others and delivering a good service would be shared, even though the terms each discipline uses may differ. The issue of human rights will also always be the source of vigorous debate between human rights activists and the law-enforcers. That dialogue still needs to continue as each party learn from each other and appreciate the situations each one encounters. Not only that, but such debate will prevent the extremes of a too-soft and a too-abusive approach. Also, there are differing opinions about how well the police work with communities and with other specialised units. There it is probably dependant upon where one lives, because it seems as if experiences differ from place to place.

Despite my own mixed feelings on whether we achieved what we set out to do, we did listen as best we could to the various narratives. We tried as best we could to understand the discourses that lay behind them – why we view our reality the way we do. I would argue that we were consistent with a social constructionist and postfoundationalist paradigm (1.5.3). This is because I involved them from the beginning to the end of the process. We acknowledged that we came into our discussions with certain views and knowledge. We spoke about situations or stories that were happening personally as well as in the nearby context (news articles), rather than jumping straight into concepts (as a predetermined questionnaire may have led us into). We looked for new interpretations on our experiences through engaging different ideas and opinions of other police members (other races and higher ranks) and other researchers, journalists and disciplines. And although we began with a local situation, it has a contribution towards the wider community (both in terms of our method and the data collected). Finally, in their graciousness, the various participants (including the other police officers I listened to) expressed their appreciation and their willingness to embark on this ongoing journey with me. As the word journey implies, we are still on a road of discovery, not having reached our final destination (whatever that destination may be), and so there are also some unanswered questions at this stage.

6.4.2 Questions that remain unanswered

In terms of my original questions, there were some that were left unanswered. This is because some questions I had were not necessarily important for my co-researchers at the time. The conversation went in a new direction from the one I presumed it would go in. Other questions may not have been discussed because I neglected to follow up on them sufficiently or did not obtain their permission to discuss them. And still other questions, such as the future structures of policing units, will only be answered in time to come. Here is a list of some of those unanswered questions.

In 3.2.1.1a, we never came to any satisfactory answer regarding the measurement of successes. Is there not a better measurement of success rates than statistics (the robot system was not replaced with anything better) or annual incentives? Delays in the judicial system make it difficult to measure successes in terms of conviction rates and rehabilitation of offenders. Although this question does not have anything to do with the experience of White police officers, it has been an issue in terms of accurately measuring whether standards have dropped or not since 1994. So the question of measuring success remains unanswered.

Under 3.2.1.1c, we failed to find a more effective way to deal with conflict. Transfers to another station, or avoidance by going on courses, or making sure there is a union representative present in order to keep calm did not present the best ways of dealing with conflict. We failed to explore other alternatives and it did not seem as if there was much effort from higher management to intervene, other than to transfer Pieter out of the situation.

With regards to Jody's story of a corrupt vehicle theft investigation (3.2.1.2b), we still do not know whether it was a deliberate act or pure neglect by the detective. That, probably with many other corruption cases, will only be discovered in time to come.

Closely related to corruption investigations was my question of how the work of the Independent Complaints Directorate was viewed (2.3.7 & 3.2.1.3). Not much was said, except by Leon. Some writers and journalists seemed to suggest that there was

very little cooperation between the SAPS and the ICD, but the ICD's own report suggested otherwise. I did not feel that such stringent accountability structures were fully investigated in this research, but my co-researchers did not suggest it as something that could make a contribution to this thesis.

The use of firearms and laws pertaining to the control of firearms (3.2.6.2), which has come into effect since 1994, were also not fully addressed. We did have discussions about the topic, where Jody gave information about the Walters & Walters case in the Constitutional Court and a circular letter from the national commissioner. Pieter also said that these new laws did not change or hinder the way he operated as a police officer. But in terms of our further reading, it was not a subject that was pursued in our research together.

With these limitations, the question becomes whether I consider the narrative approach to research within a postfoundationalist paradigm a worthwhile one.

6.4.3   Is a narrative approach to research satisfactory?

What I found very helpful in this research project was having the space to utilise the insights of other research methods as well. There are many dynamics at work when people tell their stories. Postfoundationalism opened the way to recognise that the context influences how we interpret our experiences and it allowed for a careful listening to the discourses that inform our attitudes. Furthermore, postfoundationalism gave respectful consideration towards an interdisciplinary conversation using Scripture and theology as well as non-theological disciplines to enrich our discussions and discoveries. And yet there may be researchers who would approach this topic differently.

Some investigative researchers, for example, might argue that more aggressive questioning is required, even picking up on the sensitive political issues of racism, deteriorating policing skills since affirmative action was implemented and politicians making ill-informed decisions. I chose not to do so because I did not want to alienate my co-researchers or put them in a difficult position. Neither did I want to focus on every area that *I* thought was important, irrespective of what the policemen I

interviewed thought. I let them determine much of the content and flow of the discussion. That was also a reason why I did not use predetermined questionnaires in my interviewing method. When I did try to steer the conversation, as I admitted to in places, I was met with polite smiles. The one exception was when I introduced the deconstruction phase of the research, where we explored traditions of interpretation and God's involvement. There we needed to be more thorough, but it was in terms of the themes we had already discussed.

A literature study on the topic would be another approach to this research. I could have limited my research to the available literature that was available through other disciplines of criminology and other social sciences. But a purely literary approach would not be consistent with a practical theological approach that I value (see 1.4.4). I began with the concrete experiences of police officers. The conversations then entered a dialogue with literature and "theory" before returning to a new way of viewing our experiences. I used literature to get a spectrum of thought on each topic to help us understand our experiences and compare them to the insights others bring to the conversation.

While this process did not guarantee constructive changes in my co-researchers, it did provide an opportunity to think about their lives and ideas. The choice to change their attitudes and actions would still be left to them. However, this movement from their practice (and that of other policemen) to theoretical reflection and back to practice (future, preferable ways of acting) was a fulfilling process for me to engage in.

6.4.4   What this process did for me

As I stated in 1.3.2, prior to 1994 I had no inclination towards a constructive relationship with the police. Since my involvement with them began, I have not stopped learning. I have said that my co-researchers found this process therapeutic and fulfilling in being able to contribute to my research. The question I am left with is: what did this research process do to me? Because I don't believe I can be totally neutral, I must ask myself how I was affected.

On the positive side, it was a tremendous privilege to listen to the stories of police officers and their spouses over a prolonged period of time. More than my co-researchers, they became close friends because of the depth of sharing we were able to reach. We were able to break down many of the "expert-client" distinctions and attain relatively deep interaction. With them I have learnt about how discourses influence the way in which people choose to live their lives. We could listen to our stories and the way in which they were worded and deconstruct them, finding new ways to speak about our experiences.

Because the narrative approach positions itself in the social constructionist and the postfoundationalist paradigm, we could utilise diverse sources. We used newspapers, academic articles and opinions from different disciplines to thicken our stories and enrich our understanding of our lives. The input of other police officers from, for example, Head Office and those of other racial groups provided valuable outside voices. Some of their experiences were not all that different from those of my White co-researchers in middle management. These included things like neglect and being overlooked for promotions. In other instances we discovered differences such as station level members working well with specialised units while battles over territory raged in the higher levels and were exploited by the media. I found this process very fulfilling. Strangely, the most fulfilling portion was initially the most difficult. That was in movements four and five where we explored the traditions and theology that lie behind our stories. It was difficult because we do that usually think about our lives in that way, taking those things for granted as unwritten laws. But as we struggled through, we made discoveries (certainly not exhaustive ones) that enhanced our insights.

Apart from gaining insights into the lives of police officers, I was also challenged personally. I did not come away from those interviews thinking: "I'm glad I have some information to write up in a thesis." My predominant feeling was: "I need to explore some of the discourses, traditions and taken-for-granted realities in my life as a practical theologian and pastor." I experience joys and frustrations in my career too that need to find a voice and then discover preferable ways of living.

On the more negative side, I ended these conversations feeling somewhat frustrated. The reason for that is that I felt I could not do anything to help my co-researchers, except to listen and observe. They had to discover their own ways of dealing with their situation. That was a humbling experience for me as I discovered the truth of not being the "expert." They truly have to be the experts of their own lives. All I can do is journey with them for a portion of their lives, asking questions that will help them uncover some of their insights. Thinking about this frustration at not being able to take on the "saviour role," it is possibly a unique outcome for me. It saves me from my compulsion to understand their lives fully (which I knew intellectually I could not do) and simply walk a part of the way with them.

6.5   WHERE DOES THIS RESEARCH POINT TO?

I believe that we must take each other's story seriously because we will never have a total understanding. This we do through allowing them to tell their story in their own words and then evaluating it together. Through that, I believe people can look at their lives in new ways, even if it seems insignificant to the researcher. This is a value I would want to hold before anyone seeking to do further research in this field. As we do this in our various contexts (even around the world), we grow in understanding and appreciation of each other, contributing towards the wider pool of knowledge. This knowledge is not only limited to practical theology, but to other disciplines too. It is for this reason that I would want to take the insights of this thesis into a wider context.

The first context I have taken these insights into is that of Community Police Forums. Stories shared with me have helped develop understanding in the local CPF structures I have been part of. When people take time to listen carefully enough, we are able to comprehend (even partially) some of the dilemmas facing police officers. The community can then provide a place of supportive accountability to those in middle management to lead well amidst the ever-changing challenges.

The second context is to take portions of this research to higher management. Obviously they know about many of these things, having been there themselves at one time. As a result, they may not appreciate what has been said about them now. But they need to be reminded of the gap between what happens in an office somewhere

and what happens at local stations. The intention is not to be de-motivating and destructively critical. We share a passion to reduce crime and to lead those in the SAPS with due consideration.

The third context to point towards is other organisations. These may include other crime-fighting organisations or helping professions. Other crime-fighting groups can seek ways to dovetail with the work of the police who have multiple tasks before them. In terms of helping professions within the SAPS structures and those assisting from outside, I would hope that some of this research would help them understand White middle-management experiences better. But more than that, that helping professions will take the process of listening and evaluating as partners (rather than as "experts") with SAPS members seriously.

The fourth context is the international one. Police throughout the world have their own stories to tell. Some of them will be similar to those of members in South Africa, others not. But every person has a story to tell and we may find echoes through each other's voices, perhaps encouraging us and imparting hope. Community policing, for example, is a growing practice and we are sure there are those who struggle with it too. Corruption, human rights abuses, accountability issues, crime prevention methods etc. are not limited to South Africa. Other places deal with them too. Surely in our speaking and listening to each other we will find greater insight and suitable solutions.

The church I work within is the fifth context I want us to point to. As stated at the beginning of this research, the Methodist Church of Southern Africa remains largely silent on the issue. I have encouraged greater debate on this at Synods and Radio Pulpit. In my own local church, I have encouraged our members to actively participate in partnerships with the police. This has been through neighbourhood watches, conducting workshops on domestic violence at farms and factories, trauma counselling, prison ministry and teaching basic values of relationships.

Articles to various journals are another way of reaching beyond my local situation. Through them there can be a practical theologian's contribution towards other disciplines. Those disciplines, such as criminology and social sciences, have

contributed to my understanding and perhaps the stories shared with me can contribute towards theirs.

6.6   CONCLUSION

As I stated in the beginning, many structural and policy changes have taken place since the President's speech in 1990. With a new Constitution, the police have had to change their own patterns of behaviour and ensure that other South African citizens do the same. Management of this is crucial to ensure that a successful and mature democracy emerges. Those in the middle ranks of management are the ones who make those constitutional policies a reality because they are face to face with the public. So, while White male police officers feel stuck in those positions without promotion, they need to remember the vital role that they play in South Africa's present history. Other incentives and continued training need to be explored to keep these officers motivated and self-motivated to grow into excellent leaders. We have to believe that God is at work through their lives and their contribution at this time.

A last word of thanks goes to those who shared their stories with me. It was a privilege to be invited into their lives and then to discover you are standing on holy ground.

Works consulted

Altbeker, A 2001. Policing the frontier: seven days with the hijacking investigation unit in Johannesburg, in Steinberg 2001:24-40.

Altbeker, A 2005. *The dirty work of democracy: A year on the streets with the SAPS*. Jeppestown: Jonathan Ball Publishers.

Altbeker, A 2007. *A country at war with itself: South Africa's crisis of crime*. Johannesburg: Jonathan Ball Publishers.

Alvesson, M 2003. Beyond neopositivists, romantics, and localists: A reflexive approach to interviews in organizational research. *Academy of Management Review* 29(1), 13-33.

Amnesty International 2002. *Policing to protect human rights: A survey of police practice in countries of the Southern African Development Community, 1997-2002*. Oxford: Amnesty International Publications.

Browning, D S 1990. s v Ethics and Pastoral Care, in Hunter, R J (ed) *Dictionary of pastoral care and counseling*.

Bruce, D 2007. Good cops? Bad cops? Assessing the South African Police Service. *SA Crime Quarterly* 21, 15-20.

Buchanan, D & Hendriks, J (ed) 1995. *Meeting the future: Christian leadership in South Africa*. Randburg: Knowledge Resources.

Burr, V 1995. *An introduction to social constructionism*. London: Routledge.

Cassidy, M 2005. *Getting to the heart of things: Reflections on Christian basics*. Vereeniging: Christian Art Publishers.

Campbell, A 2000. The Nature of Practical Theology, in Woodward, J & Pattison, S (eds) 2000:77-88.

Cawthra, G 1994. *Policing South Africa: The South African Police & the transition from apartheid*. Cape Town: David Philip Publishers.

Clinebell, H 1984. *Basic types of pastoral care & counseling: Resources for the ministry of healing & growth*. Rev ed. Nashville: Abingdon.

Covey, S R 1999. *The 7 habits of highly effective people*. London: Pocket Books.

De Klerk, F W 2002. On leadership. *Verbum et Ecclesia* 23(3), 608-614.

Demasure, K & Müller, J 2006. Perspectives in support of the narrative turn in pastoral care. *Ned Geref Teologiese Tydskrif* 47(3&4), 410-419.

Eybers, Koenig & Stoop (eds) 1978. *Introduction to theology*. Pretoria: DRC.

Florell, J L 1990. s v Empirical research in pastoral care and counselling, in Hunter, R J (ed) *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*.

Fox, W, Van Wyk, B, & Fourie, M 1998. *Police management in South Africa*. Kenwyn: Juta & Company.

Freedman, J & Combs, G 1996. *Narrative Therapy: The social construction of preferred realities*. New York: Norton.

Hendriks, J 1995. Facing the Facts, in Buchanan & Hendriks (ed) 1995:17-32.

Hiltner, S 1958. *Preface to Pastoral Theology*. Nashville: Abingdon.

Hudson, T 1995. *Signposts to Spirituality: Towards a closer walk with God*. Cape Town: Struik Christian Books.

Hunter, R J (ed) *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*.

Independent Complaints Directorate. 2006. *ICD Annual Report 2005/06*. [Online]. Available: http://www.icd.gov.za/reports/2006/annualrprt06.pdf [29 April 2008].

Juta's Statutes Editors 2004. *The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa*. Second Edition. Lansdowne: Juta & Company.

Kotzé, E & Kotzé, D J 1997. Social construction as a post modern discourse: an epistemology for conversational therapeutic practice. *Acta Theologica* 17(1), 27-50.

Kotzé, E & Kotzé, D (eds) 2001. *Telling Narratives: Spellbound Edition*. Pretoria: Ethics Alive.

Kotzé, D, Myburg, J, Roux, J & Associates 2002. *Ethical ways of being*. Pretoria: Ethics Alive.

Kritzinger, J J 2001. *Research in the Faculty of Theology: Guidelines for Students*. Unpublished article: University of Pretoria.

Lapsley, J N 1969. Pastoral theology past and present, in Oglesby, W (ed), *The new shape of pastoral theology*, 31-48. Nashville: Abingdon.

Laufer, S 2001. The politics of fighting crime in South Africa since 1994, in Steinberg 2001:14-23.

Lindgren, A J & Asquith, G H 1990. s v Leadership and Administration, in Hunter, R J (ed) *Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling*.

Lopez, B H 1990. *Crow and Weasel*. San Francisco: North Point Press.

Louw, A 2001. Figure it out: Getting to know police crime statistics. *Nedbank ISS Crime Index* 5(3), 1-5.

Louw, A & Schönteich, M 2001. Playing the numbers game: Promises, policing and crime statistics, in Steinberg 2001:41-49.

MacDonald, G 1989. *Forging a real world faith*. East Sussex: Highland Books.

Maepa, T 2002. How much might is right? Application of Section 49 of the Criminal Procedure Act. *SA Crime Quarterly* 1, 11-13.

Maxwell, J C 2005. *The 360° Leader: Developing your influence from anywhere in the organization*. Nashville: Nelson Business.

Methodist Church of Southern Africa. *2006 Yearbook: Minutes of Conference*. Cape Town: Methodist Publishing House.

Mishler, E G 1986. *Research Interviewing: Context and Narrative*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Morgan, A 2000. *What is narrative therapy? An easy-to-read introduction*. Adelaide: Dulwich Centre Publications.

Müller, J 1999. *Companions on the Journey: The art of narrative conversation*. Johannesburg: Logos Electronic Publishers.

Müller, J 2000. *Reis-geselskap: Die kuns van verhalende pastorale gesprekvoering*. Wellington: Lux Verbi.BM.

Müller, J 2004. HIV/AIDS, narrative practical theology, and postfoundationalism: The emergence of a new story. *HTS* 60(1&2), 293-306.

Müller, J, Van Deventer, W & Human, L 2001. Fiction writing as metaphor for research: A narrative approach. *Praktiese Teologie in Suid-Afrika* 16(2), 76-96.

Müller, J & Schoeman, K 2004. Narrative research: A respectful and fragile intervention. *Sociale Interventie* 13(3), 7-13.

National Anti-Corruption Forum. 2007. *Lessons learnt on anti-corruption: Case study on the South African National Anti-Corruption Forum*. [Online]. Available: http://www.nacf.org.za/lessons-learnt/index.html [7 May 2008].

National Prosecuting Authority. 2007. *NPA Annual Report 2006*. [Online]. Available: http://www.npa.gov.za/ReadContent380.aspx [18 July 2007].

Nürnberger, K 2007. *The living dead and the living God: Christ and the ancestors in a changing Africa*. Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications.

Omar, B 2007. In whose interest? Police unions and the 2006 restructuring of the SAPS. *SA Crime Quarterly* 21, 21-26.

Patton, J 2000. Introduction to Modern Pastoral Theology in the United States, in Woodward, J & Pattison, S (eds) 2000:49-58.

Pelser, E & Louw, A 2002. Where did we go wrong? A critical assessment of crime prevention. *SA Crime Quarterly* 2, 1-4.

Peterson, E H 1983. *Run with the Horses: The Quest for Life at Its Best*. Illinois: InterVarsity Press.

Rakoczy, S 2004. *In Her Name: Women doing theology*. Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications.

Rapport 3 September 2006. SAPD se werk al meer geknou: Wil forensiese laboratoriums regruk vir beter steun, p 4.

Rapport 3 September 2006. SAPD-heli's het valkoog, p 6.

Rapport 8 October 2006. Kundiges sê nee vir Nqakula, p 1.

Rapport 28 October 2007. Suiker looi polisie oor chaos, p 13.

Rapport 28 October 2007. Nee! vir koerant wat misdaad wil bestry, p 13.

Saturday Star 2 September 2006. Arrested twice for no good reason, p 5.

Schärf, W 2001. Bombs, bungles and police transformation: when is the SAPS going to get smarter, in Steinberg 2001:50-64.

Schärf, W, Saban, G & Hauck, M 2001. Local Communities and Crime Prevention: Two experiments in partnership policing, in Steinberg 2001:65-85.

Shaw, M 2002. *Crime and Policing in Post-Apartheid South Africa: Transforming under fire*. Cape Town: David Philip Publishers.

Shubane, K 2001. A question of balance: Crime-fighting in a new democracy, in Steinberg 2001:186-200.

Singh, D 2005. Resorting to community justice when state policing fails: South Africa. *Acta Criminologica* 18(3), 43-50.

Slaght, E F 2002. Revisiting the relationship between social work and law enforcement. *Journal of Community Practice* 10(2), 23-36.

Steinberg, J (ed) 2001. *Crime Wave: The South African Underworld and its Foes*. Johannesburg: Witwatersrand University Press.

Stevens, P & Yach, D M 1995. *Community Policing in Action: A practitioner's guide*. Kenwyn: Juta.

Storey, P 1995. A Leader's Vision, in Buchanan & Hendriks (ed) 1995:69-77.

Stott, J 1984. *Issues facing Christians today*. Hants: Marshalls.

Sunday Times 23 April 2006. NPA in corruption scandal, p 1.

Sunday Times 6 August 2006. Scorpions pair bust at airport, p 1.

Sunday Times 1 October 2006. Why criminals are walking free: Police forensics is a mess, with R100m machines to test DNA gathering dust, p 1.

Sunday Times 1 October 2006. This is a crisis, not just a problem, p 1.

Sunday Times 1 October 2006. Women and children bear the brunt: Country's most vulnerable citizens again in the frontline with only one in nine victims having faith in the police, p 4.

Sunday Times Insight & Opinion 1 October 2006. Top cop casts fearful shadow over force: Colleagues are sharply divided in their opinions about the national police commissioner, and some analysts think he should go, p 19.

Sunday Times 15 October 2006. Bring in the army: Cash heists prompt call for soldiers to help fight crime wave, p 1.

Sunday Tribune 2 April 2006. Bent cops are a sticky issue, p 12.

Sunday Tribune 2 July 2006. Four slain cops hailed as heroes, p 5.

Sunday Tribune 22 October 2006. Churches tackle crime: Clergy propose new national peace accord to deal with 'crisis', p 1.

Sunday Tribune Herald 2 April 2006. KZN police pour into Chatsworth, p 1.

Sunday Tribune Herald 17 September 2006. Farm attack thwarted, p 1.

Sunday Tribune Herald 17 September 2006. The thin blue line, p 4.

Sunday Tribune Herald 15 October 2006. Call to probe Indian cop saga, p 1.

The Mercury 27 July 2006. We shall win the fight against crime, promises Cele, p 12.

The Mercury 12 September 2006. Nqakula pledges assault on crime, p 1.

The Mercury 5 October 2006. Ex-police officers to fight crime: Business-govt joint
        bid to tackle violent crime, improve justice system, p 1.

The Mercury 5 October 2006. Police score with R45m drug bust in KZN, p 2.

The Mercury 5 October 2006. "Gang linked to crimes in 3 provinces, p 3.

The Mercury 17 October 2006. Selebi and cash guards make plan: industry to get
        boost from police, p 3.

The Mercury 17 October 2006. SAPS man takes on Metro Police: Officer sues for
        R500 000, p 4.

The Star 12 July 2006. His head on a block: Gauteng police boss reveals 6-month plan
        to fight crime, p 1.

The Star 28 July 2006. Police raiders treated us like animals, say residents of flats,
        p 6.

The Star 16 October 2006. Cops cover up rapes, p 1.

The Witness 24 October 2006. Police 'wouldn't help man', p 3.

The Witness 24 October 2006. Families baffled at death of cops who shot each other, p 3.

The Witness 27 October 2006. Terrorised people stone rapists to death, p 1.

Van der Merwe, C N & Gobodo-Madikizela, P 2008. *Narrating our healing: Perspectives on working through trauma*. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Van der Ven, J A, Dreyer, J S & Pieterse H J C 2004. *Is there a God of human rights? The complex relationship between human rights and religion: A South African Case*. Leiden: Brill.

Van Huyssteen, J W 1997. *Essays in postfoundationalist theology*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co.

Van Huyssteen, J W 1999. *The shaping of rationality: Toward interdisciplinarity in theology and science*. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co.

Van Huyssteen, J W 2000. Postfoundationalism and interdisciplinarity: a response to Jerome Stone. *Zygon Journal of Religion and Science* 35(2), 427-439.

Van Rooyen, H J N 1995. *Community Policing*. Pretoria: Promedial.

Van Wyk, C 2003. *Post-traumatic: New South African short stories*. Joubert Park: Botsotso Publishing.

Viljoen, H J I 2001. Deconstructing secondary trauma and racism at a South African Police Service station. Unpublished MTh dissertation, University of South Africa.

White, M & Epston, D 1990. *Narrative Means to Therapeutic Ends*. New York: Norton.

White Paper on Safety and Security. 1998.

Wolfaardt, J A 1978. Practical Theology in Eybers, Koenig & Stoop (eds)
Introduction to Theology, 268-285. Pretoria: DRC.

Woodward, J & Pattison, S (eds) 2000. *The Blackwell Reader in Pastoral and
Practical Theology*. Oxford: Blackwell.

APPENDIX 1

INFORMATION SHEET

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

INFORMATION SHEET FOR INVITED PARTICIPANTS

Researcher	Rev. Brian Burger
	P.O. Box 123
	Camperdown
	3720
	(031) 785 1419
Department	Practical Theology
	University of Pretoria
Title	Exploring narratives of White male police officers serving in the South African Police Services in the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands area under a new Constitution: A practical theological journey.

Introduction

Thank you for your interest in this research that you and I will be engaging in regarding working under a new constitution in the SAPS. Please read this information carefully before finalising your decision to participate. Should you have any questions regarding the content of this information sheet, please do not hesitate to ask me.

What is the purpose of the study?

I am in the process of completing a Doctorate in Practical Theology at the University of Pretoria. The course uses a Narrative Approach to research and therapy, an approach that seeks to listen carefully to the stories of people's actual experiences described in their own words rather than answering a questionnaire. I believe that there are many stories that are untold or silenced that need to be heard so that others may benefit and discover hope for their own stories. In order to meet the requirements for this degree, I must write a research thesis. Furthermore, this will assist me in my work as a pastor, gaining new insights into people's life experiences. My hope is that, as we explore the topic together, you will also benefit through telling and re-interpreting your stories.

Why have I approached you?

For this project I need to interview members of the South African Police Services. As you are involved and have expressed your willingness verbally, I would appreciate anything we can learn together.

What will you be asked to do?

I would like to meet with you and any members of your family who are willing to participate, listening to your stories in relation to the above topic. This interview will be audio-taped and transcribed afterwards. This transcript will be made available to you for verification and/or adjustment. No-one else will listen to the audio-tapes except myself and they will be erased afterwards.

In the meeting, at a place of convenience for you (eg your own home), I will explore conversationally your story as a member of the SAPS and invite each of the other family members to share their views or responses regarding the topic. While I have certain areas of interest, the agenda for these conversations will be determined by you and your family. And, even though my primary role will be to ask questions regarding where influences and opinions emerge from (eg. your experience, the media, the bible etc.), you also need to feel free to ask your own questions. This is because I believe in the principle of us researching this topic together.

At the outset of our meeting, each participant has a right to set the boundaries of their conversation. This includes not needing to answer a question you prefer not to respond to and terminate any line of questioning with which you are uneasy with or which detracts from what you feel are more important aspects of your story. These boundaries include the right to use a pseudonym if you prefer to do so.

Once the initial interview is done, I will extract themes from each of the interviews which emerge as important. These themes will be checked with you to see whether they are valid and you will be able to respond to the themes other participants have raised (although no personal information will be divulged to others, only the themes). I will also bring these themes into discussion with literature from eg. criminology, psychology, chaplains and other participants, which you may also want to comment on.

In the interests of confidentiality, no personal information will be shared with other participants during the research. Should you later choose to withdraw, all data related to you will be destroyed. Wording in the final document will be carefully scrutinised so as not to jeopardise any participant in any way. You are also invited to participate in that process.

Conclusion

Should you agree to participate, you will be asked to give your consent for the information gathered to be used in the research document. I look forward to working closely with you. I am anticipating that I will work on this thesis between 2005 and 2007. The final thesis will be submitted at the end of 2007.

APPENDIX 2

CONSENT FORM

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA
BRIAN BURGER
CONSENT FORM FOR INVITED PARTICIPANTS

Exploring narratives of White male police officers serving in the South African Police Services in the Kwazulu-Natal Midlands area under a new constitution: A practical theological journey.

I have read the information sheet concerning the research project of Rev. Brian Burger and understand its purpose. All my questions have been answered to my satisfaction. I understand that I can request further information at any stage.

I know that :

1.   my participation in the project is entirely voluntary.

2.   I am free to withdraw from the project at any time.

3.   all the audio-tapes will be destroyed at the end of the project.

4.   that a copy of the final research document will be retained by the University of Pretoria.

5.   I will receive no payment for participating in the study.

6.   all personal information supplied by me will remain confidential and anonymous throughout the project.

I hereby confirm that I am willing to participate in this research project.

…………………………….   …………………………...
Signature of participant   Date

APPENDIX 3

TRANSCRIPT (Pieter)

Brian   Thank-you Pieter for your willingness to participate in this research project. I hope that it will be beneficial for you as well as for my final research thesis. As we discussed before, we are exploring your experience as an officer in the South African Police Services, with particular emphasis on the post-1994 era. In other words, we are exploring your experiences of policing under a new constitution. I know that we have spoken informally about this for some time, but I wonder if, for the record, you have a particular story you would like to share?

Pieter Well, at the moment, my experience is coloured by a stressful relationship with the new station superintendent. When he first came, I was the first officer to go and greet him. I said to him that I am here for him if he needs any assistance. I've been in this area for many years and I know the people very well. So I said I'm here if he wants to work with me. He said yes, he does want to work with me. And I thought that things would go well. But then I started seeing how he ran things and how he treated people. He has really upset a lot of people at the station. And, while others kept quiet, I would not. I spoke to him about the things he was doing wrong. But he just chased me out of his office. He has no idea of how to work with people. One of the things he said was that the station is too White. But there are only a few White policemen. In fact, we are quite a balanced station in terms of races – White, Indian and Black policemen. But he said that we are too White! He's even got the Indian and some Black policemen upset. He even said that the Community Police Forum was too White.

Brian   Yes, I heard about that. Of course, at the Area Board of the CPFs, it was also mentioned, but we were elected by a proper AGM where, when you look at the attendance register, there were many Black people in attendance. But then, we have also co-opted people of other races into the executive.

Marian You, know, in all the years I have known Pieter, I have never seen him like this. Even when he was station commander at Hammarsdale and got all those racial problems, being the only White policeman at the station, with all the death threats, he still was never like this. The working conditions are unbearable now. Brian, do you know what the station commander said about your burglary? [There had been a number of burglaries in our area of which

my house was one, as was Pieter and Marian's house]. He said that Brian could've burgled his own house to get the insurance!

Brian   Well, I suppose it's his job to ask questions, but it does anger me that he would think that. Do you think this is all pure racism?

Pieter   No, because other members are also angry. One Indian officer booked off sick and whispered to me that we would never see him in this station again, because he was going to fight for a transfer. He said he could not work with this man. The problem is that everyone just shrug their shoulders and keep quiet. But I refuse to keep quiet. I will not put up with such treatment. It is definitely de-motivating the people working there.

Brian   What are the kinds of things he's done?

Pieter   Well, for one thing, when he came he told one of the Indian Inspectors who is in charge of Sector Policing and the co-ordinator for the local CPF that he is no longer in charge of that. The job was given to a Black policeman who has not attended a CPF. Even after he was tasked with the job, he's not been there. In the end, the task was given to a Black policewoman.

Brian   And the reasoning behind it?

Pieter   The station commander said that other policemen also need to get a chance to do this work. But they are the ones who aren't there and so don't do the job properly.

Brian   And the Inspector who lost his job description?

Pieter   At first he was angry. He didn't know what he was now supposed to do. But eventually he stopped worrying about it. He just does what he's told to do now and no more.

Brian   And what has your experience of the new station commander been?

Pieter   Well, he started by taking away my vehicle. The double-cab was given to me for my use by Area. That's the vehicle I could use to get me to farms etc. in order to do my work in crime prevention properly. The first thing he did was to take the vehicle away from me. He then gave it to other policemen who are now busy wrecking it. They do not use it carefully or clean it properly when they come back. I give that vehicle a couple of years and it will be run into the ground, guaranteed. When I used to go out in the vehicle, I would come back with people I've arrested. Even now, I take a walk from the police station (because I don't have a vehicle) and within two blocks, I'll make an arrest for

dagga. Those guys will put on two- or three-hundred kilometres without making a single arrest. They have nothing to show for all their travelling.

Brian But what happens when you need the vehicle?

Pieter At the moment I have some informers in Cato Ridge who have information for me about crimes. I can't get to them. The Superintendent says I must give the names of the informers to the detectives. And I won't do that. They are *my* informers. I've developed a relationship of trust with them over the years and they won't trust other policemen. And what happens if those policemen make a mess? Those informers will never trust me again.

Brian And if I came and took you in my private vehicle to them?

Pieter (Smiles) Unfortunately, you can't do that. Because if there's an accident or things go wrong, the state will not take responsibility. The superintendent wants me in the station. If I want to use a vehicle, I have to get permission and then go to a policeman who has a lower rank than me to ask for the keys. It's wrong!

Brian So how do you deal with these frustrations?

Pieter Well, soon after he arrived, he had to go on an officer's course. I am senior to him in terms of years of experience and now, because of affirmative action, he has a higher rank – but he's only just gone on an officer's course now. So when he was away, I was happy. Then over Christmas and New Year I took leave – which he first cancelled but approved Marian's. So Marian and the children almost went on holiday without me, because the place was booked and everything arranged. An Indian Inspector stands in when I'm away and I stand in for him when he's away. But eventually my leave was granted after a long fight with the superintendent. So that month away was a relief. Then, when I am at the station, I get out. I go walking and visiting the businesses in the area to find out if there are problems and to build relationships with them. And I also take my time due. Whenever I have worked overtime, I take the leave that's due to me, which is something I never did in the past. So wherever I can, I avoid him. I greet him in the morning because I have to and then I don't speak to him again. I salute his rank, but not him as a person. I tell others if I'm going out so they know where I am. The Superintendent doesn't tell anyone when he goes out and where he's going to. So I avoid him and, it seems, he avoids me too. The other day he gave instructions to an Inspector to

convey to me that I had to work at the Dusi canoe marathon. I have no objection with working there – it also gets me away from him a bit – but why doesn't he tell me himself. I don't take orders from a junior officer. He must tell me himself.

Brian   Because you have a hardened attitude to each other?

Pieter Yes, I know I can be stubborn sometimes. But really, this situation is really not good. He doesn't know how to deal with those under him. So what I've started doing is this. I spoke to another police commissioner whom I trust and have always had respect for. You can't fault this guy on anything. He *knows* police work. And I now write down everything that happens in meetings etc. And I'm building up a case. Then I'll go back to this commissioner and get him to read it and advise me on adjustments and so on. And then I'll put in a formal complaint. And whenever I have a meeting with him, I will make sure I have a Union representative there with me, so that the superintendent can't just say and do as he pleases. The only problem is that our superintendent is good buddies with all the very high ranking officers. He owns farms and has a fair deal of money. So I need to build a strong case. It'll take time, but I'll get there.

Brian   Do you think it would help him if he went on a managerial course of some kind to help him in his job as a commander of this station in dealing with people in a more helpful and appropriate way? Maybe with the change from a para-military structure to a service provider, new management styles need to be taught.

Pieter He once said that he does not need to go on courses. Remember he is someone who has less experience than me at police work and has got to his position through Affirmative Action and having friends in high places. He only did his officers' course after getting the rank.

Brian   And, Marian, you work there as a clerk. How do you deal with the frustrations?

Marian It really is bad. The other day, one of the staff needed to take her child to the orthodontist and had booked months in advance. And the Superintendent refused to let her take her child. No, things are really bad. But, as for me, I have accepted a new post in another police station. I think the Superintendent

is angry about it, but I don't care anymore. There I am closer to the children's school and won't have any transport worries. I'm just glad to be getting out.

Brian And you, Pieter, would you also consider a transfer?

Pieter At one stage I did, but then I thought: why should I? I know the community well. I've worked in the area for many years. Why should *I* move? No, I'm going to stick it out here. I'll show this guy that I'm a better policeman than he is. I know my job and I do it well.

Brian You spoke just now about the different ranks and people jumping ahead in promotions. Is that a sensitive point for you?

Pieter Yes it is. I know and can appreciate that the powers-that-be wanted to redress previous inequalities and get more representation throughout the police structures right down to local stations. But at the same time, this has gone on for a long time now. We are more than 10 years into a New South Africa. Now that things have been redressed, they should start promoting people again based on their experience and performance. I've been stuck as a Captain for long enough. I've been to further courses and I've done my job properly. I deserve a promotion. And besides, I wasn't the one who invented apartheid. Why must we now suffer for decisions other people and politicians made and continue to make? It's not right! There are a group of officers in Gauteng who have gone to the CCMA to get the promotions they feel they deserve. And they won their case. Then, just before Christmas, the Minister put in an urgent appeal to the High Court preventing this. But the High Court said it wasn't urgent enough and they must wait until the new year. So we will see what happens. I have been in touch with them to find out how I can do something similar if need be. So I am waiting too. Then look at Jason [another policeman in the area]. He's got his Masters degree in forensics and a brilliant policeman. Now he's left and working at Outsurance using his knowledge there.

Brian I hear that his starting salary was in the region of what a Director gets.

Pieter Yes, and he would never have got to that kind of rank being White. He's still young, so he could make that move in his career. So I'm waiting to see what will happen with me.

Brian I guess time will tell as far as that's concerned. That I guess has been a real negative in terms of your policing career. But I remember you telling me of another seemingly negative experience that turned out well in the end for you.

Pieter Oh yes, the time I received a house arrest. That was the time I had caught a suspect who I knew was guilty. And he just would not break when I interrogated him. He would not give me any information. And so, in those days, we used the tube as a means of torture. Torture was often a very effective method of getting information. It is unfortunate that it was done away with because you sometimes battle to get information and the guilty party walks free. But, in this case, I was busy beating this suspect when another policeman walked into the room. He decided to lay a charge against me and eventually I was sentenced to house arrest. I couldn't go anywhere except to work and church and the courses I had to as part of my sentence. But I couldn't go anywhere with my family. The positive side to it was that it brought our family together. And now I deal with suspects very differently as well.

Brian I was reading in a book by Anthony Altbeker about different police officers who used different methods to extract information. One policewoman almost seemed to flirt with the suspects in the hope that they would think she's a friend and give her valuable information. Other policemen would take a more forceful approach and threaten, though not use, physical coercion to scare the person into giving information.

Pieter Yes, there are the methods of interviewing and that of interrogation. We use both in order to try get information. It depends on the situation and how the person co-operates. And then, of course, we still use informers, like I said earlier on. I have my informers and other policemen must get theirs. And then you work on building trust with them and when there is a successful conviction, the informer is rewarded. We fill in an application and the informer gets paid for providing the information necessary.

Brian That kind of resource has been available for some time, of course. But what about now, especially dealing with more sophisticated crimes?

Pieter Yes, there are always courses we go on to train us in new equipment that is coming on the market. For instance, I have recently been trained in the use of a machine that takes a person's fingerprints and then, within a few minutes, it will tell me if this person is a wanted person. It has a data-base that keeps a record of fingerprints that can link the person in front of me to a crime or

number of crimes. So I can put in a request to have the machine (which is kept in Pietermaritzburg) for a couple of days when I go out on the road.

Brian   And then you were mentioning people resources, like informers. But, for me, another obvious people resource is in the Community Police Forum. I know I'm assuming an issue here, but it is one of the new things that have been implemented since 1994. What has been your experience of that? I remember when it first started, there was a lot of suspicion between the police and the community.

Pieter   Well, I was not involved in the CPF in those early years, so I can't really comment. I only got involved in about 2000. And I must say that it has worked very well for me. I have been involved in a few projects together with the CPF that were very successful.

Brian   Well, could we maybe talk about one that stood out for you?

Pieter   The one that stands out is one we had recently involving one of the local schools. As you know, because you were part of it, we had a Sector Policing meeting with the businesses in the area. At one of those meetings (another meeting that our superintendent stopped), a representative from the school was there. Together we spoke about the problem of drugs that is getting into the schools. Many of these Primary School children are being targeted by drug dealers. So together, we decided to do a project at the school. We set a date and I organised the Rape Unit and the Drug Squad to come along. I got the Dog Unit to come along as well. And then, of course, you came to do something on Domestic Violence. We then had the whole school come into the hall for an assembly and each one of the units presented a demonstration for the children and gave them advice on what to do. The school was very cooperative and I think that the morning went very well. The children's attention was kept through the variety of presentations and explanations. And we knew that it was important to start focussing on Primary Schools, because that is who the criminals are targeting. By the time they get to High School it is almost too late. And then, judging from the children's response, it was very successful. The children wrote letters and made cards for each of the units that had come – hundreds of letters expressing their gratitude.

Brian   I know, because I received a big fat envelope with about 80 cards and letters myself.

Pieter   Yes, I would say that was a good awareness project and I hope that it pays off in time to come. Even if just one child who was thinking about drugs or whatever and has changed his or her mind, it will be worth it. We should really do that sort of thing more often, because there are always new pupils coming into school, who won't have heard it before – and we must be even more relentless in our efforts than the criminals are in theirs.

Brian   Any other helpful resources?

Pieter   Yes, as you know, we have a good working relationship with the security companies and farm protection units in the area. They often help us in making arrests when there are robberies. In fact, they have caught many suspects – from stealing chickens to assaults, whatever. Our networks work well together, so that we have more eyes on the street when we are looking for people. When they catch someone, we make sure we get there and take it from there. And then, too, we have a very good working relationship with the courts around the corner from us. Actually, we are very lucky there. They tell us when they need more information, what they need etc and we get it to them even before it goes to court. And if we need to oppose bail when we think the person will disappear if granted bail or if they will be a danger, we have no problems getting that support from the prosecutor – as long as we do our side properly, which doesn't always happen. Some of our guys are a bit slow and things slip when they are not well led.

Brian   I just find it a great pity when police officers sometimes struggle to work together.

Pieter   Yes, that happens from time to time. While we can work well together in some emergency situations, working with other specialised units as well, there are times when it doesn't happen. Remember the story I told you in your previous studies about when I was a young policeman – I had to shoot a mental patient who was attacking me. My "crew" [slang term for a Black partner] didn't help me at all. Instead, he locked himself in the back of the police van to get away from this dangerous patient. He didn't help me at all, not even when the other policemen threatened to have me prosecuted. It was a civilian witness who came to my rescue and the magistrate ruled that I had acted in self-defence. So yes, I wouldn't trust some of my colleagues. But there have also been good

policemen I have worked with and successful partnerships with other units and community initiatives that have kept my spirits up.

Brian   Any other incentives to keep you going?

Pieter Yes, incentives are given out. But I won't get any. The superintendent does not like me and so he will never approve an incentive for me. But that's okay, I'll just carry on with my work as I usually do.

Brian   And I know the question comes out the blue, but Section 49 – how have you found that?

Pieter No problem there. As I've told you before, I have shot a lot of people before. And I know the law. I know when I can and when I can't shoot. It hasn't really changed the way I operate. If I have to chase someone, I will, or send in the dog unit. We now have to go on the same competency tests as the public with regards to weapons. As you've probably seen in the news, we have to do a fitness test, because the government doesn't want unfit and incapable, fat policemen who can't chase fit and well-built criminals. I'm going on my test next week, in fact. There they check if you are fit and able and whether you can use your firearm competently after some running. If you can't, they remove your weapon until you can pass the test. I don't think I'll have a problem with that.

Brian   I'm sure you won't. And again I want to thank you for your participation in this interview.

Pieter Certainly, and if there is anything you want to explore further, please feel free to come and chat some more.

Brian   I certainly will. Once I have drawn out the themes from different participants, we'll talk some more about them.

APPENDIX 4

TRANSCRIPT (Leon)

Brian Thank you for your willingness to participate in this research project. I hope that it will be beneficial for you as well for my final research thesis. As we discussed before, we are exploring your experience as an officer in the South African Police Services, with particular emphasis on the post-1994 era. In other words, we are exploring your experiences of policing under a new constitution. I know that we have spoken informally about this for some time, but I wonder if, for the record, you have a particular story you would like to share?

Leon Ja, I would say that my recent experience of policing has not been very positive. I am finding the situation very frustrating at the moment. Luckily, I am near to retirement, so I am just "hanging in" there, doing the best I can until my retirement. I would say one of the biggest problems is that many policemen I work with don't want to work. I am the branch commander of the detectives at my station. There I have 15 detectives who work under me. And most of them don't do their work.

Estelle There are some who work hard.

Leon But the majority, the *majority* do not. Maybe 4 of them do the work. The rest don't. All they want is to be able to put their card in the ATM every month and draw their salary. They don't care about whether they are doing their work or not, as long as they get their salary. "Batho pele" is totally non-existent.

Brian Can you give me an example, and we'll see where the story takes us?

Leon Let me tell you a story of something that happens on more than one occasion. We were called in to a case where a man was shot 4 times by a gang of 5 people. He survived. Three of them were known by the victim. When the detectives went to question him, they did not show any concern for him or his family. Now, when I go in, I really do feel for the suffering of the victim and their family. My heart goes out to them. But these detectives, even though they live in the same community, they come from the area, but they did not show any care for this man. They just took his statement and left. Because some of the gang were known and named, they managed to arrest one man. The others are still walking free. Now the statement has to be re-taken because the first statement referred to "them" and "they." But the prosecutor needs a statement about what *this* arrested person's role was in the whole incident so that the case can proceed in court. These detectives were too lazy to go find him to

take a statement. I found this out when I was checking on the case myself. I asked them if they had gone to get the other statement and they said that they had tried but could not find him. The reason they gave was that this man who was shot had another case against him, so whenever the police came to his house, he would run away, thinking that they were coming to arrest him. So, later I saw on the docket was a telephone number, which I phoned. The father of the victim answered and I asked him about this whole situation. And he told me it was all nonsense. His son was right there with him, although at that particular time he was visiting someone next door, and that he would call him if I wanted him to. He also said to me that there is no such case against his son and so had nothing to fear of the police. And he said that, to date, no detectives had come to see him or look for him at all. So the detectives were lying to me. They had told me they had been there and yet they were never anywhere near the house! So, in the end, I went out with another officer to get the statement. I then laid a charge against the detectives who were on the case. The ICD, the Independent Complaints Directorate, was also brought in to find out what was happening. In the end, these 2 detectives got a 2-year suspended sentence for defeating the ends of justice. Now it is that kind of attitude of not caring enough to do your work that makes me so frustrated. I sommer call these detectives "defectives"… and then I get told I'm a racist. But I would also say the same if these guys were White detectives, because they are defective. And it's the community that suffer. They do not get to see justice being done.

Brian   And where does that take the community?

Leon   Well, just the other day we had a similar situation where the detectives did not do any work and make any arrests. And the community got hold of a suspect themselves. I was called out to the scene where they had this man and were beating him badly. Now, always before, I would arrive on a scene after the event has happened and there is a dead body already. This time, however, they were still beating this man.

Estelle This event affected Leon badly.

Leon   There was absolutely nothing I could do. I was on my own. The crowd had already put a tyre of petrol on him and were not going to stop until he was burned to death properly. And they did! And all because those detectives had

not done their work and made some arrests. There is no sense of pride in their work. You know, in the old days, we would get information from our sources in the community and we would go and raid the suspect's house. And there we would find TVs, video machines, hi-fis, whatever. And we would arrest the guy and take the stolen goods to the charge office – that it stood that whole room full. And we were proud of what we achieved, that we could smash these syndicates or gangs. And then we would apply for reward money to reimburse our informers or sources. And that motivates them in turn to give information in the future. A policeman cannot work without informers, people giving them information. But in the last few years, I have only seen one application being lodged to reward an informer. One! The policemen today at my station are not interested. They couldn't care about the people, even though they live in that same community themselves. They take no pride in their work and others, like me, end up having to do the work for them. I can't tell you how many cases are withdrawn in court because the police have not gone out to gather evidence to support the case. Or worse, they have not informed witnesses of the relevant court dates. So the cases have to be withdrawn – and that is just from bad police work, or rather, no police work having been done. We used to work closely with the prosecutors, but not anymore. On the other hand, the court system is also frustrating especially if you've put in many hours, a lot of sweat and then the person is released on some technicality by the courts.

Brian   What other recourses would the community have of having their needs for justice met?

Leon   Well, there is the Community Police Forum, which tries to address different areas. But, again, none of my detectives attend those meetings. And they do projects, for example, at schools on drugs and so on, because mandrax is as common as dagga these days. You can search anyone on the streets and you are as likely to find mandrax tablets, or quarter tablets, as you are to find dagga. But those projects are mainly for the Crime Prevention Branch to do. And then, our station commissioner also has an open door policy. Anyone with problems can come and see him and he will try sort it out.

Brian   I remember a stage in Community Police Forums when they were the local complaints forum, where complaints formed the major portion of the agenda.

After a while of working at it, we managed to steer the community to going to the station commissioner, rather than the CPF.

Leon   Ja, most – I would say 95% of the people – go to the station commissioner with their problems. That's if they haven't just shrugged their shoulders at the incompetence of the SAPS. There were days in the past when people used to show a "brown eye" at the police [pulling their pants down and showing their bums to the police]. But our station commander is very popular in the community. He has managed to bring most crime statistics down since 1998. We used to have about 30 murders a month. Now there are only 3 or 4 a month.

Estelle Over the Christmas and New Year period, they didn't have any murders!

Leon   Ja, and so I would say the people love him. And the policemen don't always like that. It shows them up when they don't do their work. Last year, there were most of the detectives that wanted the White policemen removed from the station. They decided to have a community meeting in one of the community halls, where anybody with any complaint whatsoever about the White policemen at the station could come to lodge their complaint. They also invited the Directors from the province to come and sit in to hear the complaints. When this all took place, there was not a single person who came to voice a complaint. So that ended up a huge embarrassment for them. But then, after a few months, they tried something else. They decided to hold a march through the streets to the police station, calling for the White officers to be moved out of the station. And here's where they turn the whole story around – they said that the White policemen don't care about anyone in the community. So for 3 days, these detectives went with loudspeakers to all the sections of the community, announcing this march and that the people must attend. They also had to get permission for the march and got Metro Police to monitor the situation and traffic. They expected between 4 000 and 5 000 people to attend, so there was a large contingent of Metro Police who were sent. I even organised Pieter [a policeman from a nearby town] to come and video the march from one of the rooftops. Well, they went to a nearby stadium where everyone was to gather. As it turned out, there were a few of the detectives (not even all of them), a couple of policemen and about 3 Correctional Services employees – a total of about 14. Nobody else! So they

went to a nearby Primary School and offered some children aged between 6 and 10 years old sweets and T-shirts if they come and march. So that added another 20 or so children to their march. What a waste of time! They've got time to try organise a march, but not enough time to do their work.

Brian   I suppose they came to work the next day with their tail between their legs?

Leon   Absolutely. And it just showed that the community are supportive of the White policemen here. Whenever we do a raid on shebeens or whatever, it is always on our initiative. And this sounds racist, but the other policemen will never initiate those kinds of things.

Brian   And do you think that perceived lack of support in these marches has anything to do with these policemen "getting back" at the community by not doing their job?

Leon   I don't know. Perhaps, but I don't know what happens behind the scenes there. For me, they are just trying to turn the whole thing around. They don't care about their community, but now they are trying to take the attention off themselves and blame someone else. As you said on Sunday in your sermon, they are projecting their own failures and shortcomings onto others to take the focus off themselves.

Brian   Now, could this "laziness" not simply be a lack of training or being incompetent in certain areas. I mean, after 1994, the old SAP had to deal with integrating Kwazulu Police and so on, who may have been trained differently or required for different tasks…

Leon   That may be partly true. The SAPS did encourage literacy training so that policemen could take statements and so on. That was mainly for the other branches. Where I am in the detective side, the police chose the "cleverer" ones. So then it should not have been a problem.

Brian   And further courses to help them improve their detective skills?

Leon   Yes, we do go on courses. But there is more to that… You find that they go on a course and the report comes back that this person has "completed successfully" the course. Now, you don't know if they were just pushed through the course or not. They could've just attended without paying any attention to what was taught. Or when they get asked, "Do you understand?" they just nod their head, but still have no understanding. But this policeman has "successfully completed" the course – he was there. You've also got to

understand, Brian, that policing is more than just getting more skills. Yes, that is important. And neither is it that these people I work with don't have the ability. They *do* have the ability, but they just *do not care* about doing their job properly.

Brian   When you do your work and feel that others are not, and then still get overlooked for promotions, what does that do to you?

Leon   I have been stuck as a Captain for many years now. I am working at my 19th station, but I'm stuck. Although, it would be nice to get a promotion and a better salary with it, it doesn't worry me anymore. I am near to retirement and I have enough. I am blessed to own a house and a car and I am happily married to Estelle. So getting a promotion is not a big issue for me. I do know that some policemen have felt done-in. Jerry [a recently retired station commander in the area] was left out of being promoted, even though he was a very good policeman. They even refused years ago to give him a package, although I think he is grateful now, because it did not stretch very far. And I know Pieter is fighting for a promotion – well good luck to him, but I think that it is unlikely realistically. Maybe the police are trying to frustrate me through not giving me a promotion, so that one of them can get the post. But I will stick around until my retirement.

Brian   Well, it's only people above you that can grant that. Speaking of which, what kind of support do you get from above?

Leon   Their attitude is very clear: You have been posted to that particular station. So you must sort out your own problems. The police at Area say they have enough problems of their own and don't need our problems too. So, no, there is no support from the top structures.

Brian   And that "top" implies politicians as well?

Leon   Absolutely. I have no time for politics. As I once told you, they always tried to interfere, coming with their big Mercedes cars, when violence in Kwazulu-Natal was bad and every morning I found dead bodies from violence the night before – you don't know who is killing who. And the politicians come and stand in your face and ask you what you are doing about it. I don't have time for them.

Brian But politics is intertwined so much in police work and even with policemen themselves. Prior to 1994, it seemed the Kwazulu police had their own agenda too. Surely all that carries over into the present.

Leon Ja, now there are the unions that have also got into the police. Whenever you want to try reprimand policemen, they come back and want to lay a complaint against you. And certainly, there was a stage when the Community Police Forums had a political agenda too. They tried to get involved and sway things for their own benefit. But, fortunately, we have managed to address that and people are getting on with fighting crime rather than just getting political leverage.

Brian And as you look at the future of the police, do you see much hope? I was reading a book by Antony Altbeker that had one chapter in which a policeman described the police service as an "elephant with a dart in its arse" [indicating a slow death for the elephant]. What do you think?

Leon There is a lot of truth in that. If I take another example: next week we are doing an operation where we are going to trace "known" suspects. In other words, these suspects have been identified by name and so there is no extra detective work needed as such. It is being done, again, on the initiative of the officers at the station. If we were not there, the station would collapse.

Brian With all that you have shared with me, how has this affected you?

Leon As I said, it frustrates me. I can't help getting tense. Maybe I shouldn't. The superintendent of the station where I am always says we must stay positive and not give up. But it is hard. I come home tense, but then I sit a while and Estelle and I prepare supper and so on and I can relax here. In the morning, I get up early and sit in this chair in the lounge and have my quiet time with the Lord and that all helps me to keep going.

Brian Has the church helped you in any way?

Leon Locally, yes, it has. I enjoy coming to Sunday worship with Estelle. It puts life into perspective again and calms me down. In the police we used to have chaplains who visited from time to time, but they were also overworked and needed to rush from place to place. It meant that, unless you had a big problem, you never really got to speak to any of them.

Estelle Leon does not really talk about work as such. That's why I am so glad you have got him to speak a little about it. I think it does him good, it's important to talk.

Leon Ja, but I leave work at work and when I come home, I put work aside until the next day.

Brian Well, I want to thank you for what you have shared with me. I will come back to you in time and we can perhaps speak some more on these and other things.

Leon That's fine. If there is anything I can help you with, let me know.

APPENDIX 5

TRANSCRIPT (Jody)

Brian I want to begin by thanking you, Jody, for your willingness to participate in this research project. As I mentioned in our conversation the other day, I am interested in your story as a police officer in the SAPS under a new Constitution. What are some of your experiences in this regard?

Jody Well, as you know, I have been acting station commander at a nearby police station for a number of years. My actual post is here, locally, but when trouble arose in that police station, all the police personnel were transferred out and policemen from all over the country were sent to this station. I was put in charge and we had to rebuild the image of the police in the area. In the long run, I would say that we have succeeded. We are now one of the top stations in Kwazulu-Natal. We have what is called the "robot system" throughout the province. It is every station commander's nightmare. It lists all the categories of crime and has columns for Crime Prevention units and Detectives and convictions. The target that is set is to beat your crime statistics of the previous year in the same time period. So if you had, for example, 4 murders in the same period last year, and there are more in this year's time period, your figures for crime prevention get marked in the red and you go down in the overall rating between police stations. And this is a nightmare for the commanders, because once you are on top, it eventually becomes impossible to maintain and you start going into what is marked on the paper as red. If you improve on the previous figures, it is marked green (hence why it's called the "robot system"). So, in order to prevent going into the "red," some policemen are reluctant to open cases, because it will make them look bad. Or they will open the case under another charge, for example, instead of "attempted murder" they will put it under "assault GBH" [assault with intent to do grievous bodily harm].

Brian But the other side of having more reported cases is that the station will be considered for more personnel to be sent there.

Jody Yes, but that's only in the following year. In the meantime, your figures go down. Like now, I know we are right near the top, and we'll never maintain that. So you go up and down all the time. You could have one incident where there are a few deaths in one event that throws your figures out.

Brian Well, it would make more sense to rate stations on their conviction rate, because you can't stop crime from happening when a gang targets your area.

Jody   Yes, but there, if you catch them, it takes a long time to convict them in court and it only shows in your figures later. That's when the detectives rating goes up.

Brian   Now, changing the charge sheet also sounds suspicious.

Jody   Yes, but there are far bigger problems than that. Corruption is also a problem in the police.

Brian   That's always a difficult subject for policemen to talk about, because it puts them in an awkward position of, on the one side having to report it if you know of it, but also a betrayal of people you have to work with who might deliberately let you down in dangerous situations.

Jody   That can be so. I have a situation here and I'll let you decide for yourself if the person is guilty of corruption or not. We recently had a lot of vehicle theft in our area. And then we got information about one of the gang's vehicles and we were on the lookout for it. Eventually, it was spotted in an attempted robbery of a vehicle on one of the farms. Our guys went out and the suspects fled and only one was caught. The detectives then managed to get him to talk and he said he would be willing to point out where the vehicles and vehicle parts were being kept. But he was worried because he said one of the policemen at the station was friends with the gang members. I was on a course at the time, so the detective phoned me to find out what to do about the pointing out process. I told him that I would contact the station commander at another station nearby who was once an excellent policeman with the vehicle-theft unit. He would then go, with the photographer and correct forms etc. to the pointing out identification. I contacted that commander, who agreed to go the next day in the afternoon and would meet the detectives and the suspect at one of the places. I then informed the detective about these arrangements. However, the next day, when this commander went through, he discovered that another detective at the station had taken things into his own hands and gone to do the pointing out. As a result, the process wasn't done properly and the case was withdrawn in court because of a lack of enough evidence. Now, whether this was a cover-up for the policeman who was involved with this gang by this particular detective, I don't know. At this point we can't prove anything – so you can decide for yourself what you think. I've just kept a record of what took place and perhaps one day we'll find out.

Brian   Well, that does sound very suspicious to me. It's like when I was involved with the Community Police Forum in Meyerton, I went with the police as they raided shebeens and set up roadblocks etc. Later in the evening, one of the policemen could not find one of the suspects he had arrested in the cells, and knew that one of the two Black policemen in the Charge Office must've taken a bribe and let the suspect go – but again, he couldn't prove it or say which of the two policemen did it. But he was bloody angry!

Jody   Yes, it does lead to some tensions between policemen, those who want to do their job well and those who couldn't care.

Brian   One of the other policemen I interviewed also spoke about policemen who didn't care about their work.

Jody   I think that one of the problems regarding that is because there is less respect for each other. When all the different police forces, about 11 of them, were all joined together into one – the South African Police Services – there was a change in the rank structure. The Police became demilitarised and different names got used like "Superintendent" and "Director" for some of the senior positions. Also, there were now less ranks that were created. You used to have a Constable, then a Sergeant, then Staff Sergeant, then Inspector, then Lieutenant, then Captain and so on. Now there are far less ranks, which means that, for example, there is not a big difference between an Inspector and a Captain (not having a Lieutenant in-between) and the respect lessens between them.

Brian   And that is complicated by the promotion policy, too.

Jody   For myself, I have been a Captain for many years now. In the old days, you stayed a Captain for two or three years. But now, as a White, there is very little chance of promotion. They sent me to sort out problems in the station I'm now in. There have never been complaints against me and we've been 1st and 2nd in the province. But that does not count for anything. And then you get a Black policeman who is your junior in terms of experience, getting promoted. The Superintendent in another nearby station became an officer even before he went on an Officers' Course – he's only recently attended it. So they are putting Black policemen into senior positions that they haven't been properly trained for and those who have very little experience. It becomes hard to have respect for those sorts of situations – because there is

nothing that can take the place of actual years of experience. You also have the situation where, perhaps, the policeman is illiterate. One Inspector I asked to write up something in the Occurrence Book (make an OB entry) said to me, "Please be patient with me." He wasn't being stubborn. It was just that he couldn't write properly and was nervous about writing something up. And you have Constables under him who can do it without any problem. And, as I was saying to one of my colleagues the other day, "I just don't have the kind of hours to spend training people to write – as much as I would like to, I have too many other things on my plate." Then there's the other side of the story where you get a good policeman in one area being transferred to take up a management position in another place where he hasn't been trained or experienced. For example, that station commander I mentioned earlier who was with the vehicle theft unit. He did an excellent job there. Now he got a post as a Superintendent at an ordinary police station and the station is deteriorating. I spoke to him the other day where he told me about some of the problems he's facing that are really getting him down. He's more depressed than he ever was in the vehicle theft unit. So I sat with him and tried to give him some advice on how to handle some of the things. I'm sure he'll come right in the end, but it seems so unnecessary to dump him in the deep-end without training or experience. The people higher up seem to just want to fulfil quotas, and couldn't care about whether the guys are coping or not.

Brian   I guess that de-motivation is like when specialised units, where the members had purpose, were disbanded and now they are delivering court summons?

Jody   Absolutely! And the other way around where a policeman with only station experience is put in charge of specialised units. There's no respect and the poor guy becomes despondent.

The other thing about a lack of respect is due to the unions. In the past, the commanding officer could compel a policeman to do something or work extra to close a case. Now, there are unions to deal with. So you now have to ask the policeman if he would do whatever, even if he has a lower rank. You can't compel him to do anything. You can submit a complaint, but that's about all.

Brian   So how do you deal with it?

Jody   Someone once told me to keep my friends close to me, and my opponents even closer. So I invite the unions to attend management meetings and CPF

meetings, so that they are aware of what's going on. Then they can't come back to me afterwards about decisions because they were part of the decisions at meetings. And when they are absent, I note it in the minutes and sent a letter to the union management. So now they send someone, who is often there reluctantly because he's been told to be there by his bosses and will pass a lot of the decisions. They can't come back to me when I implement those decisions.

Brian   You mention CPFs. How have you found them to work?

Jody   Initially, they were difficult. They can be manipulated by various political stakeholders.

Brian   And now there are rumours that CPFs will fall under the municipality instead of the Department of Safety and Security – which is bad news regarding political interference, in my opinion.

Jody   Yes, we'll see what happens – that's if it comes through. But, like with the unions, I have tried to work so that there can be no come-back. And some political people who get voted on, soon lose interest and fade away.

Brian   I had something similar when I was Chairperson in Meyerton CPF – people voted on at the AGM would come to the next meeting or two and then you'd never see them again. But have there been aspects of it that have worked well for you?

Jody   Yes. For example, we've worked in the schools and told them about various crimes. Just recently, as a result, we had pupils coming forward and reporting cases of rapes by owners of taxis on some of the female pupils. We're investigating that at the moment. I'm not saying that these incidents have not happened before. But after speaking at schools, pupils are gaining the confidence to report such things, where they may have been reluctant to trust the police before. And then we have an elderly member of your church who comes twice a week to read from the Bible and say a prayer for the members at the beginning of the day. I know it means a lot to many of the members. He also sits in on our management meetings.

Brian   Is there anything else that keeps you going?

Jody   Look, there is a lot of pessimism if you talk to the guys around the bar. People are feeling let down by the system and feel that they will get nowhere in their careers in the police, and even that the police as an organisation is

deteriorating. But it's not all bad. There is a lot better equipment to work with – better cameras, vehicles, computers, fingerprint apparatus and so on that we didn't always have in the past. There are still incentives that are given.

Brian   I've heard of incentives before, but am not sure how it works.

Jody   Well, it boils down to that policemen have to sell themselves – and that can be difficult if a person is semi-literate. You have to be able to write down why you think you deserve an incentive. And then one third of each branch of the station can qualify for an incentive, a bonus. Once you've motivated your claim, the station commissioner needs to approve it. If only 20% of the guys in a particular branch put in a claim, then they will probably all receive their claimed incentive. But the station commissioner can only claim up to a maximum of 33% of each branch. That recommendation goes to Area who makes the final decision.

Brian   And then, getting back to the question: what keeps you going?

Jody   I try to find ways to unwind when I come home, like watching TV or working in the garage. But, really, I have been in the police for too long now – it's all I know. It's what I've been trained for. I've managed to put my children through school and when they have finished university or whatever, I may reconsider my position. But I have the security of a pension waiting. One guy I know has left the force and is now a security guard at Macro! Even though he doesn't have the same pressure now, he also doesn't have the security of a pension. And really, I would not want to end up being a security guard. I wouldn't be able to find a better job at my age, so I will stay and do the best I can for now. I think also that, when I see crime coming down in my area, I know that I have been a part of that and I'm proud of what I have achieved. Often policemen don't have pride in their work, but I'm proud of what I've achieved.

Brian   I appreciate your care for the family. How have these challenges at work affected your family life?

Jody   One of the things is that I'm away a lot and my cell-phone is forever ringing. On a weekend, I get called 20, 30 times with queries from the station, even until late at night. But my wife, Karen, works at the local station as a clerk, so she knows the story. She tells me all the stuff that happens here. There are a lot of tensions with the new station commissioner. It's a little awkward for me

because I am also a station commander. And he's really doing everything he's allowed to within his power to do. The people at this station were spoilt by the previous commander. The staff would even have arguments about whose turn it is in their lift club to take the police children to school. Instead of seeing it as a privilege, I warned them that it could be taken away…. Now those privileges are gone and they are complaining bitterly.

Brian   And do you tell her what happens with you?

Jody   No, not really. Work stays at work wherever possible. She knows I have to deal with the calls that intrude, but I don't really talk about the details.

Brian   Are there any other issues that you think are important about policing in a New South Africa?

Jody   Well, when you asked me, I got hold of these documents about Section 49 which has to do with the use of firearms in effecting an arrest. And I got you a copy of the judgement given by the Constitutional Court in a matter between the State and EJ Walters & ME Walters.

Brian   Thank you very much for it. What I would like to know is your experience of this law. I remember when it was propose in the 1990s, many policemen just handed in their weapons as a protest to the law, saying they would have to be shot before they could use their weapon, so there's no point in having them. What was your experience?

Jody   Yes, I know that many police members had problems and there were some who used their weapons a lot. But I did not find it changing anything for me. I have really always worked within that mindset of using a weapon if my life or someone else's is in danger. So changes in the law have not really affected me. And as far as I know, the policemen in my station don't have any problems with it any more. I think that's about it.

Brian   Well, thank you for your time that you have given me. You have given me a lot to think about and work with.

Jody   It's a pleasure. If there is anything I can help you with further, please feel free to ask.