

A Critical Response of the English Speaking Churches to the Introduction and Implementation of Bantu Education Act in South Africa

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Of

UNIVERSITY OF PRETORIA

By

Msokoli William Leleki

Supervisor: Prof Graham Duncan

2014

ABSTRACT

Title: A critical response of the English Speaking Churches to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa.

This research study is based on both literature and interviews conducted in four provinces in South Africa from those who were teachers, students and inspectors during the time of the implementation of Bantu education. The aim of this study was to critically investigate the role played by the English-speaking churches during the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa.

The researcher has used the qualitative research design as his guiding methodology. A qualitative approach was adopted by the researcher in which nine participants were interviewed about their experience of the Bantu education and how it impacted their lives and the lives of the African people in general. The key interest of the researcher was to critically investigate the role played by the English-speaking churches in either collaborating with the government or resisting the taking over of education from the mission schools authorities.

The research methodology used in this study incorporated the use of interviews, observation, auto recording and narrative inquiry as sources of data collection. The interviews were conducted in warm welcoming environment with full co-operation and enthusiasm displayed by the participants. The researcher's goal was to obtain a clear convincing analytic view of what transpired in South Africa during the implementation of Bantu education. The methods used to establish the findings helped the researcher to ensure the credibility and trustworthiness of the empirical investigation.

The findings of this research suggest that role played by the churches in their response to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education was influenced by the views of those at the helm of the church and their experience of the apartheid system. Some individuals from almost all the churches were determined that the churches should resist the handing over of the schools to then government, however, the biggest dilemma was how to finance their schools.

The research involved interviews with nine participants who uplifted the roles of their churches in the implementation of Bantu education. The stories of participants clearly show the relevance of the church in the field of education. The historical involvement of the church in education should help us to see their role as the agents and actors of transformation in the field of education.

This study proposes the leading role played by the church in field of education and must be taken serious by those in the leadership of curriculum design in the country.

The study would like to be an appeal, a challenge for the government in South Africa to embrace the role of the church in the field of education with total dedication and thus

endeavour to make the role of the church known and appreciated. In other words, the findings of this study would challenge the department of education to see the impact made by the church on the lives of the people of South Africa. In addition, the findings will help those in power to see the church's role in the field of education and the human response of high quality to God's manifestations and God's presence which is revealed in the provision of education in South Africa. The findings suggest that although the missionary education was not the best and perfect system of education but it left an indelible mark in the lives of the South African people more especial when it comes to morals and ethical conduct.

The setting of this study is Church History. While this study begins by analysing both the written and oral interviews as a theoretical framework, its methodology is church history sociological analysis.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude and heartfelt appreciation to all those who have contributed to make this thesis a reality.

It is impossible to mention all those who helped me by name over the past few years, working on this thesis. But I do wish to express my appreciation to some who have been of particular assistance and inspiration. First and foremost, I wish to thank the Almighty who gave me strength and energy to be able to produce this thesis under difficult, challenging and trying times.

I am also indebted to both the Methodist Church of Southern Africa and Seth Mokitimi Methodist Seminary for having given me the opportunity to further my studies at the University of Pretoria.

Dr Ross Olivier and his staff deserve my thanks for their moral support, prayers and encouragement. At this stage I cannot leave out Rebecca Gumede for assisting me with typing and photocopying.

To my wife and the boys, friends, colleagues and relatives who assisted and offered me their support, love and words of encouragement I wish to say to them all thank you. I cannot make a mistake of forgetting the participants in this study who welcome me in their homes and made it possible for me to be where I am now.

Furthermore, this work would never have been realized if it were not for the patient reading and understanding, rigour and painstaking supervision of my attempts and corrections of my able and dedicated supervisor, namely Prof Graham Duncan. I take this opportunity to express my sincere gratitude and heartfelt appreciation to him for having guided me with patient, love and insights. I am sincerely grateful to my promoter Prof Graham Duncan for lending me his support and encouragement throughout this study.

How can we forget the staff of Cory library based at Rhodes University in Grahamstown under the inspiring leadership of Prof Jeff, for their special care and welcoming hearts whenever we visit their library?

Finally, I would not have considered embarking into the world of academia if it had not been for my late father SybokBonakele Leleki who never attended school but remained a source of inspiration to me by sacrificing all he could for us to be educated. He took me to school and sometime sacrificing going to work.

DECLARATION

I, Msokoli William Leleki hereby declare that the work contained in this thesis is the result of my own original research and it has not been submitted for examination to any other university.

Signature

Date: November 2014

DEDICATION

I dedicate this thesis to my late father and my mother, a special remarkable woman who is 93 years of age this year. Both of them have always believed in me and encouraged me in their own way.

ACRONYMS

ANC	: African National Congress
AME	: African Methodist Episcopal
BEA	: Bantu Education Act
CATA	: Cape African Teachers Association
CCSA	: Congregation Church of Southern Africa
CNE	: Christian National Education
CPS	: The Christian Council of South Africa
DRC	: The Dutch Reformed Church
ESC	: English-Speaking Churches
MCSA	: The Methodist Church of Southern Africa
NP	: National Party
SABMS	: South African Baptist Missionary Society
SACBC	: South African Catholic Bishops Conference
SACC	: South African Council of Churches
RCC	: Roman Catholic Church
UCCSA	: The United Congregational Church of South Africa

Contents

1.	INTRODUCTION AND METHODOLOGY	4 -
1.1.	Introduction	4 -
1.2.	Aims and objectives of the research	5 -
1.3.	Sources	6 -
1.3.1.	Primary Sources	6 -
1.3.2.	Secondary sources	7 -
1.4.	Methods of Research	8 -
1.5.	Organization of Methodology	11 -
1.6.	Research Design	11 -
1.7.	Research Process	12 -
1.8.	Significance of the Study	12 -
1.9.	Research Problem	14 -
1.10.	Hypothesis.....	16 -
1.11.	Theoretical Framework.....	17 -
1.12.	Organization and thematic structure.....	21 -
2.	ORAL SOURCES.....	23 -
2.1.	Introduction	23 -
2.2.	Research sample	23 -
2.3.	Selection of participants	24 -
2.4.	The settings	25 -
2.5.	Methods of data collection	26 -
2.6.	Focus interviews	27 -
2.7.	Research procedure	27 -
2.8.	Context of participants	29 -
2.9.	Instruments.....	32 -
2.10.	Procedures	33 -
2.11.	Interviews.....	35 -
2.12.	Interviewing skills.....	36 -
2.13.	Field notes taking approach.....	37 -
2.14.	Data analysis	38 -
2.15.	The role of the researcher	39 -
2.16.	Oral history used	40 -

2.17.	Presentation of Findings	- 42 -
2.18.	Interviews.....	- 43 -
2.18.1.	Interview 1: Mr.Faku	- 43 -
2.18.2.	Interview 2: Mr. Nogantshi	- 44 -
2.18.3.	Interview 3: Mr. Lubelwana	- 46 -
2.18.4.	Interview 4: Mr. Nabe	- 48 -
2.18.5.	Interview 5: Mr. Myoli	- 50 -
2.18.6.	Interview 6: Mr. Mfengu	- 52 -
2.18.7.	Interview 7: Mrs. Sakati	- 54 -
2.19.	Conclusions	- 55 -
2.19.1.	General observation.....	- 55 -
2.19.2.	Transition from missionary to Bantu education	- 56 -
2.19.3.	The intention of Bantu education	- 56 -
2.19.4.	The churches’ response: A dilemma	- 58 -
2.19.5.	Limited resources.....	- 59 -
2.19.6.	Resistance	- 60 -
3.	BANTU EDUCATION	- 62 -
3.1.	The Origins of Bantu Education	- 62 -
3.2.	Why educate the “Native”?	- 65 -
3.3.	Centralisation of Bantu Education	- 67 -
3.4.	Report of the Eiselen Commission	- 67 -
3.5.	Recommendations by the Eiselen Commission	- 68 -
3.6.	Funding for an African Child.....	- 70 -
3.7.	Racial Divide in Mission Education.....	- 71 -
3.8.	Dr Verwoerd’s speech and presentation	- 73 -
3.9.	Implementation of Bantu Education.....	- 77 -
3.10.	Management of Bantu schools	- 78 -
3.11.	Impact on mission schools	- 80 -
3.12.	Medium of instruction	- 84 -
3.13.	Experience of Bantu Education	- 86 -
3.14.	Resistance to Bantu Education	- 87 -
3.15.	Bantu Education for a Bantu economy	- 89 -
3.16.	Bantu Education and apartheid	- 91 -
3.16.1.	The foundations of apartheid	- 92 -

3.16.2.	Apartheid and education	- 94 -
3.17.	Conclusion	- 96 -
4.	THE CHURCHES' RESPONSE.....	- 97 -
4.1.	The English-speaking churches	- 97 -
4.2.	Churches and mission bodies relinquished control	- 97 -
4.3.	The role of the church.....	- 101 -
4.4.	A brief survey of mission schools in South Africa	- 103 -
4.5.	The churches' response	- 105 -
4.6.	Institutions without subsidies.....	- 108 -
4.7.	The church persecuted	- 113 -
4.8.	The involvement of the church and others.....	- 118 -
4.9.	Racial discourse.....	- 120 -
4.10.	The response of the churches.....	- 121 -
4.11.	Control of schools	- 122 -
4.12.	Conclusion.....	- 123 -
5.	THE REACTION OF TWO CHURCH LEADERS	- 125 -
5.1.	Introduction	- 125 -
5.2.	Anglican Church Reacting to Bantu Education.....	- 125 -
5.3.	Conclusion.....	- 136 -
6.	CONCLUDING EVALUATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	- 140 -
6.1.	Introduction	- 140 -
6.2.	The road travelled in this study	- 141 -
6.3.	Overview of the main findings	- 142 -
6.4.	Recommendations	- 144 -
6.5.	Conclusion.....	- 146 -
7.	BIBLIOGRAPHY	- 148 -
8.	APPENDICES	- 164 -
8.1.	APPENDIX (A)	- 164 -
8.2.	APPENDIX (B).....	- 164 -
8.3.	APPENDIX (C).....	- 167 -

1. INTRODUCTION AND METHODOLOGY

1.1. Introduction

The ability to provide best quality education is to a great extent dependent on the relevant knowledge about the provision of mission education in South Africa. Palmer (2007:2) declares that “we teach who we are”. By implication this statement means that we are what we are because of the type of education system we find ourselves in.

Bantu education was ideologically, politically, socially and economically motivated and the people who were supposed to benefit from the Bantu education, were not included in government and had no say in education. The education and training system under apartheid has been characterized by three key features. First, the system was introduced along racial and ethnic lines and had been motivated by racial ideology and educational doctrines of apartheid. Second, there were vast disparities between black and white when it comes to resource allocation. Many black adults, youth and schooling going children had little or no access to education and training. Third, the control of the education system was in the hands of the white minority excluding black teachers, parents and students from decision-making processes.

The purpose of this study is to investigate the role played by the English-speaking churches, with particular reference to the Methodist Church of Southern Africa (MCSA), the Church of the Province of Southern Africa (CPSA), the Roman Catholic Church (RCC), the Presbyterian Church of Southern Africa (PCSA) and the United Congregational Church of South Africa (UCCSA), in their response to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa. The period in question is the three decades from 1948 when the National Party won the general election based on their grand policy of apartheid.

The writer tends to agree with Charles Villa-Vicencio in his book *Trapped in Apartheid* that the phrase ‘English-speaking’ is a misnomer (1988:16) because today the majority of their membership comprises people speaking African languages. It is true that there are other churches which use English as their official language and can trace their origins either directly or indirectly back to Britain, and which are not normally considered part of this family of churches. Villa-Vicencio (1986:16) writes of one of

these: “The Church of England in South Africa is a small church whose roots go back to the heresy charge laid against bishop Colenso of Natal by the bishop of Cape Town, Robert Gray in the middle of the last century.”

History provides an awareness of both the possibilities and complexities of education (Pazmino 1999:125). Historical research and assessment of the cultural role played by the English-speaking churches in South Africa is important due to the fact that limited research has been conducted in this area.

1.2. Aims and objectives of the research

This research will firstly analyze the initiatives taken by the English-speaking churches in South Africa in their response to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education. The main aim of this study is to trace and illustrate the role played by the English speaking churches (ESC) in their response to both the introduction and the implementation of the Bantu Education Act no. 47 of 1953 (BEA, 47, 1953). Attention is focused on ESC whose origin is to be found in Britain and which saw education as one of the Gospel imperatives.

Education policies and laws in South Africa were influenced by the Christian National Education (CNE) long before the introduction of Bantu education. This study will secondly seek to address what is perhaps central to sustainable moral education based on a theory against domination and oppression. Moral education must be based on promoting social justice. This theory on important ways hinges upon Gramsci’s (1971/1999) theory of agency and praxis. This theory is based upon the works of critical educators, (including Paulo Freire (1970/ 2000) and Peter McLaren (2005; 2007; McLean & Farahmandpur, 2005; McLean & Houston, 2005; McLean & Jaramillo, 2007; Mclean & Kincheloe, 2007) with the aim of promoting constructive forms of education. Evans (2012) picks up the point that Critical Social Theory (CST) focuses attention on social power as constitutive to creating and perpetuating socio-cultural and socio-economic systems characterized by domination and oppression (Evans 2012: 12).

As such this study has a two-fold aim: First, the research work aims to examine the results of the education system offered by the Department of Native Affairs in the form of Bantu education. Second, it aims to identify the critical role played by the English-speaking churches, particularly those which were involved in mission education, in

support of or against the introduction and implementation of the Bantu education system, and the impact thereof in the field of education in South Africa by focusing on personal and communal narratives of the effects of the role played by the English-speaking churches.

In defining the objectives of research, the researcher is specifying who or what he wants to draw conclusions about. These objectives of investigation are known as the units of analysis (Terre Blanche & Durrheim 1999:37). The broad objective of this study is to investigate the impact made by the role played by the English-speaking churches in the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act of 1953.

The introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa had profound effects on the development of economy and society at large. The way education system was handled in South Africa destroyed the culture of learning within large section of our population. The introduction of the Bantu education was based on the criticism made by the National Party government of the ineffectiveness of the missionary-dominated schools.

1.3. Sources

1.3.1. Primary Sources

The primary material is grouped into two: The first group is archival material the second group are oral sources. While the researcher found the archives easily accessible but he was disappointed at the small quantity of English-speaking churches' material available. Also disappointing was the limited material at the University of South Africa.

Archival sources: The Methodist archives are kept and preserved at Cory Library at Rhodes University in Grahamstown in the Eastern Cape. However, this research will not only depend on these sources because archives are selective; the process of archiving material is done by people and thus depends solely on their discretion as to what is important or not. The researcher has made extensive use of mission archives at Cory library in Grahamstown, the University of KwaZulu/Natal library, Unisa and University of Pretoria library.

Oral sources: A series of interviews had been conducted with the intention to go beyond what could be found in Cory Library and other institutions visited by conducting interviews as well. The advantage was that many people who were part of the process which resulted in the response of the church to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education were still alive. These people included the persons who participated in the field of education either by being students or teachers during the implementation of Bantu education. The researcher completed nine oral interviews.

Oral sources have demerits as well as benefits. Oral sources depended on memory and when an event goes way back, people find it difficult to remember it clearly. That is mainly because the information which remains is not kept in a memory box somewhere but scattered in our brain (Green 2001:23).

1.3.2. Secondary sources

The level at which the study is conducted required the researcher to use unpublished sources, newspapers, journals and periodicals. It is not easy to find exhaustive secondary literature dealing specifically with the response of the English-speaking churches to the introduction and implementation of the Bantu Education Act of 1953. There is information about some of the church's response to the introduction of Bantu education, however, that has been collected by individual churches; hence the oral interviews play an important role.

The material used was found in general history books about Apartheid in South Africa. The researcher wishes to acknowledge the good work done in both providing historical context and critical analysis by John de Gruchy and Michael Worsnip in their books *The Church Struggle in South Africa* and *Between the Two Fires* respectively in their analysis of the churches' response to apartheid and the implementation of apartheid laws. Worsnip (1991: 125) made mention of the following:

“Without the state aid, the (the Church of the Province of South Africa) CPSA could not afford to keep its mission schools going. The church was thus faced with prospect of selling or leasing its school buildings to the department. The choice needed to be made by 31 December 1954. It was an agonizing choice, to say the very least. Clayton certainly understood the issue at stake”.

Another book worth mentioning is that written by one of the leading church historians in South Africa, Rev Dr. Bob Clarke in his book called *Anglicans against Apartheid*. The study will continue to examine all the relevant sources at our disposal with an aim of bringing together a vast amount of data into a more meaningful discussion.

1.4. Methods of Research

This thesis is concerned with ESC, local African people and Bantu education. There will be little consideration of political organizations except where they impacted directly on the topic. When the researcher does talk of the political organizations he excludes the National Party government because they are the ones responsible for the introduction of Bantu education in South Africa immediately after their ascendance into power in 1948.

The research work began with wide reading of the relevant literature. The literature review helped the researcher to understand the role played by the churches in the introduction and implementation of the Bantu Education Act (BEA), and the library research helped to provide insight into how English-speaking churches saw their role in the field of education under the Bantu education system. Oral sources play an important role in this regard. The experiences and first-hand information is better handled in the stories people share about their lives and that was the main source of the data collected, analyzed and processed.

It is useful to consider the techniques for data processing to be employed (Smit 1995:24). The researcher working from a qualitative approach must state the logic and objective, and the methods selected as most appropriate.

This study utilized a combination of study methods to acquire the necessary data and meet the desired academic results. The methods of data collection for this study provided the linkages between the broad research questions and the data analysis. Three different methods were used to prepare the data, namely:

- In-depth individual interviews and semi-structured interviews with the participants.
- Direct observations means observation in this context is about picking up the non-verbal communication as the participant relates his /her story. The

interaction between the participants and the data at their disposal was observed although it was not regarded as an important activity in this study.

- Examination of legal and policy documents for references is used to promote better understanding of the subject under study.

Church documents played an important role in providing the relevant information.

These include the following:

- Primary and secondary sources
- In-depth interviews with key interviewees who were students during the time of implementation of the Bantu Education Act.
- Telephone and face-to-face interviews with key people.
- A questionnaire to elicit information and opinions (Trochim 2001:19).

This study follows a qualitative research approach (Cresswell, 2007). Qualitative research is an inquiry process of understanding, where a researcher develops a complex and holistic picture, analyses words and reports detailed views of information and conducts the study in a natural setting (Cresswell, 2007). The research question seeks to understand participant's experiences of the central phenomenon, which in this case is the impact of Bantu education.

The research is mainly based on the primary sources of archival material and oral history. The family of qualitative research methods involves a great diversity of approaches, and it might sound unlikely that there could be general standards of good practice. Yet there are some generic considerations that most would agree should be found in almost all qualitative research. Lincoln and Denzin (1994:584) point to the common denominator of all good qualitative research in the closing sentence of their monumental collection of essays on the subject. It is "The commitment to study human experience from the ground up". This means that the study is based on personal experience dictated by the environment in which one finds him or herself. The research work looks at how the participants received the introduction of Bantu education and their reaction thereof.

Good qualitative practice should take into account the researcher's impact on the context of study and on the development of the interpretive account and keep alive several possibilities or rival explanations (Terre Blanche & Durrheim, 1999:429).

Participation by the interviewees was on a voluntary basis and anonymity is guaranteed.

In looking at the government policy, we examine the level of integration of the plan and purpose of the National Party government. In examining the government's strategic implementation plan, we need to establish what exactly they hoped to achieve by their action.

We hoped to find out the success, or otherwise of the government in its policy on Bantu Education which depended on the co-operation of blacks and the churches, and the creation of delivery of a mechanism from the National Department of Education to provincial and local level. Grech (1999: 25) puts it well when he says:

“We happen to have been born in a world that takes for granted the divorce between faith and reason, between Church and state, and between science and religion and it is very difficult for us to imagine that another order of things is indeed possible, in fact, actually existed for seventeen hundred years, and was responsible for by no means despicable pattern of our cultural heritage”.

Further, we examined what mechanisms and systems were put in place to improve the implementation strategy. We think we know that many tried to stand up for the truth and waged their struggle against the introduction and implementation Bantu education.

It is essential to adopt a methodology that can elicit a rich description of how education policies were formulated and the extent to which the public was involved. The research project also made use of the reading guide method. The development of a reading guide begins with the generation of a set of questions through which data is collected, read and analyzed e.g. ‘implementation of Bantu Education’.

This current study attempted to promote a deeper insight into the use of education as a political tool to advance the aspirations of one particular racial group at the expense of others. The researcher understands research to be the process of arriving at dependable solutions to problems through the planned and systematic collection, analysis and interpretation of data. It was one of the most important tools for advancing knowledge,

promoting progress and for enabling people to relate more effectively to their environment.

A serious consideration in this study was the fear and danger of repetition of facts and information. Caution needed was required so that different perspectives on the same events qualify the argument in the different chapters.

1.5. Organization of Methodology

The distinction between primary and secondary sources was also difficult to demarcate in terms of how they were treated for the canvassing of information and the way in which the information was used.

Interviews had played an integral part of this study. The subject of Bantu Education is still on the lips of its many causalities, for they blame it for the predicament they find themselves in, such as socio-economic conditions and them being victims of oppression. Both written questionnaires and personal interviews had been conducted, to ensure that equal opportunity was given to all interviewees, irrespective of whether they can still write or not.

In line with Bailey (2004), Cohen, Mannion & Morrison (2000) and Trochim (2001), questions in the questionnaire were formulated in a non-threatening manner so that participants could feel at ease and comfortable in answering them.

1.6. Research Design

The researcher's approach to this study combines history, systematic and practical analysis. The works mentioned in this study are by no means exhaustive; on the contrary, they only serve as foundation for the study. A research design is a plan or strategy, which moves from the underlying philosophical assumptions to specifying the selection of the respondent, the data gathering techniques used and the data analysis done (Cresswell et al 2007:70). McMillan and Schumacher (1993:157) desire a research design as a strategy of selecting subjects, research sites and data collection procedures to answer the research question.

In the course of conducting the research study, the researcher managed to interview nine people and all of them are lay leaders in different English-speaking churches and they

are not English speaking people themselves. Their ages varied from 68 to 85 which helped in providing variety of experiences regarding their response to the implementation of Bantu education. The data from the interviews was then written up and analyzed and presented as a historical contextual experience for the researcher's theological reflection. Therefore reality is best understood from the perspective of the participant who experiences it (Niewenhuis, 2007: 54). In the course of data collection, the researcher committed himself to be as objective as possible in the interviews and analysis. The purpose of collecting data was articulated to every respondent before the interview commenced.

According to Mouton (1996:28) the goal or destination of all social inquiry is to produce knowledge that is as close as possible to the truth and in this study the goal is the same. The commitment to the research for truth is captured in what is known as the epistemic imperative (Mouton, 1996: 28).

1.7. Research Process

Pre-fieldwork observation was done mainly by reading the available material relevant to the study and having informal discussion with people involved in the field of education at different levels before selecting people to be interviewed. Before entering the field, the researcher conducted some pilot interviews outside the study to gain some experience on how to conduct interviews with elderly people.

The research process commenced with both primary and secondary sources, namely contemporary, archival and written literature. The questionnaire was informed by questions related to the thesis raised by both the literature and personal questions. Questions will be posed and a hypothesis formulated to check whether the study is achieving its goal.

Due to the broad scope of this study, much information was available. This required a systematic way of using the available data.

1.8. Significance of the Study

When the National Party won the general election of 26 May 1948, one of his first actions was to appoint a commission to investigate a new direction for African

education along the segregated lines of the apartheid philosophy. Prime Minister D.F. Malan appointed the secretary for the native affairs, W.W.M. Eiselen, as chairman of the commission on native education, established to investigate the “principle and aims of Education” for Africans “as independent race”. The not so strong critical response offered by the ESC against the introduction and implementation of Bantu education was largely based on the fact that their schools were funded by the government and state inspectors were sent out to ensure that the church schools conform to the required standards.

It was envisaged that this study would have the potential to make a significant contribution to the understanding of the role played by Bantu education in producing leaders lacking moral standing, the result of which is unfolding in the society we live in today, characterized by corruption, crime, violence and so on. Duncan (2004: 188) puts it well in his book *Lovedale Coercive Agency* when he says: “Christian character is the end of missionary education....We do not want to educate unless our work here produces both stability and resources in the individual, moral and mental, and a sense of responsibility to his fellow-countrymen....Without this, we feel that our work is poor and barren (LMI Reports I, 1890: 6-8; cf. Dr. Roberts, Acting Principal in 1899 Report: 2; the 1900 Report: 2; and the 1902 Report: 2).

“But character was also the foundation of education at Lovedale” (De Kock 1992: 129). Where there is Christian character, one is sure of the three following things: - genuine education, fitness for responsibility, and civilization. “The formation of character among the students was a prime focus of James Stewart’s time as Principal of Lovedale” (De Kock 1992a:129).

The objective of the educators should be to facilitate the moral development of the student so that they can attain the highest stage possible. What counts in life is not so much what we know in physics, mathematics or geography, but how well we relate to ourselves and others on the basis of the principle of justice (Mwamwenda 2004:14)

The National Party viewed education to be a key element in their plan to create a completely segregated society. The Minister of Native Affairs at the time, Hendrik Verwoerd stated that “there is no place for [the Bantu] in the European community above the level of certain forms of labor...What is the use of teaching the Bantu child mathematics when it cannot use it in practice? That is quite absurd. Education must

train people in accordance with their opportunities in life. According to sphere in which they live” (Verwoerd 1954:48-49).

In the ultimate sense, God is the teacher in Biblical education, God is the author and discloser of this truth, and both teachers and students alike stand under this truth. God calls teachers and students to understand, grow in, and obey God’s revealed word (Pazmino 1999:20)

The lesson we must take from the deep involvement of the state in education - to the point of sidelining pertinent stakeholders like the religious community – is that education has the potential of being used for purely political agendas. The researcher agrees with Malherbe (1997:1) when he says “the national aims and ambitions of a country are often better expressed in its educational system than in other institution. This fact is illustrated par excellence in South Africa’s educational history, especially in recent times”. Methodologically, this study is expected to contribute to bridging the analytical gap created by the forceful takeover of education by the State and the role played by the church in either supporting the state or resisting its attempts to use the very education system to undermine the development of the African person. The study was an assessment of how the church responded to the introduction and implementation of the Bantu Education Act of 1953. It was expected to offer an explanation as to what it was that led to the state using education for political gains. It will also help to locate the reason behind English-speaking churches’ lack of resistance to the introduction of Bantu Education, if this was the case.

1.9. Research Problem

The overriding primary research question of this research study was: What role has the English-speaking churches played during the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act of 1953? In order to answer the primary question the following secondary questions were addressed:

- How did participants perceive themselves in the history of the research study?
- How did they conceptualize the influence of the political ideology in the introduction and implementation of BEA?
- How can power be expressed in the form of mass mobilization and resistance?
- What was the role of apartheid system in the introduction of Bantu education?

- In which manner were the views of stakeholders accommodated in the implementation of Bantu education?

Graziano and Raulin (2000:40) call this the problem definition phase. They maintain that the research process always begins with identifying an area of interest and generating ideas for the study. Reflection in historical education is also problematic because the researcher has to give an account of a past educational event. According to Mmninele (1995:56) the problem can be arranged as follows:

- Chronological arrangement, that is, arrangement by periods of time. The disadvantages and inaccuracies with this arrangement are, first, that this division creates the impression that the period came overnight and was gone just as quickly, because no indication is given of a transition period before and after. Second, the entire emphasis is placed on the period when the climax was reached.
- Geographic arrangement; according to geographical place.
- Topical arrangement; also known as thematic arrangement. It concentrates on a topic. In this arrangement, data is distributed under certain headings, categories or leading considerations. Time and place, as principles in the ordering of material, are made secondary. Did the churches fail to take an active part in matters related to “critical and self-critical thinking pertaining to education? Or what role did the churches take?”

Social problems are conditions of society which have negative effects on large numbers of people; a social problem is a condition that has been defined by significant groups as a deviation from some social standard, or break of social organization; a social problem is a condition affecting a significant number of people in ways considered undesirable, about which it is felt something could be done through collective action. One characteristic of these definitions is obvious: they separate a social problem from a personal problem. If you have a toothache, that is your personal problem. If millions are demanding a national program of dental insurance, there is a social problem. If you cannot find a job, that is your problem. If millions cannot find jobs, and they are going hungry and resort to mass action, that is a social problem (De Vos 2005:395).

According to Mouton and Marais (1990:38), Mouton (1996a:47-50) and Mouton (2001:4), three factors determine the manner in which research problems (or questions, or hypotheses) are formulated: the unit of analysis; the research goal (or the type of research question); and the research approach (De Vos 2005:103).

The question of what defines a social problem has occupied thinkers for centuries. Ross et al (2004: 37) state that for purposes of evaluation, the key point is that social problems are not themselves objective phenomena; rather, they are social constructions involving assertions that certain conditions constitute problems that acquire public attention.

The particular context of this study is about socio-political conditions of education in our country during the introduction and implementation of Bantu education. The education system since the attainment of democracy in South Africa has not achieved meaningful transformation nor has it produced morally acceptable leaders, leaders who are desperately needed in a country like ours. Scripture requires that parents, teachers and spiritual leaders plan for the development of the young (Choun& Lawson, 2002:26). The reason for the above mentioned statement is in relation to the quest for better education for all, which is difficult to attain in our country due to the legacy of Bantu education. Full understanding of the response of the church during the time in question helps the church today to learn from the mistakes of the past.

The loss of central participation in African education meant a great reduction of Christian influence especially in the field of education. Some churches like the Catholic church and others resolved to run the schools as a private institution as they believed that there was a continuing need for distinctly Christian education more especially for the girls who were to be teachers and nurses (KCC Inanda File 6 Scott to Reuling 15 July 1954).

1.10. Hypothesis

The government decision to take over the control of the Bantu education from the mission schools prompted a response of the English-speaking churches which resulted in many schools being taken over by the Department of Bantu Education. It is that response which this study seeks to investigate and understand. The church was not in a

position to react as expected to the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act of 1953.

Kerlinger (1986:17) defines hypothesis as a conjectural statement of the relationship between two or more variables. Hypotheses are always in declarative sentence form, and they relate either generally or specifically, variables to variables. There are two criteria for good hypotheses. First, hypotheses are statements about the relations between variables. Hypotheses carry clear implications for testing the stated relations. Kerlinger (1986:10) defines scientific research as systematic, controlled, empirical, and critical investigation of natural phenomena guided by theory and hypotheses about the presumed relations among such phenomena (de Vos 2005:41).

Did the church do little to resist the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa? It is the suggestion of the researcher that a thorough study of the critical role played by the (ECS) to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education could give an authentic role of the churches concerned. There could be a theological justification for the role played by the English-speaking churches to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa. The hypothesis is supported by theological reflection on how many schools ended up in the hands of the government.

1.11. Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework of this research study is built on the effectiveness of education concept of Scheeres (1990) and Prinsloo's leadership and management model (2009). They both consist of contextual, multi-level and multi-factor internal variable factors such as school leadership/management variables, educational facilities, positive school centre and climate variables and other achievement goal-oriented variables which may influence student achievement.

Neuman (200:12) raised this important factor that the second step in the research process is to "focus the research question" or "focus the project". Knight (2002:15) also points out that writing and thinking will be difficult if the researcher lacks a clear focus. The objective of the research assigned becomes clear after the problem has been delimited and formally stated. After the objective has been stated, a research method is put into operation in order to try to investigate the problem. Data is collected to decide,

on the grounds of the interpretation thereof, whether the problem can be solved or not. In this study, the description of the problem, the findings and the recommendations are aimed at contributing to the theory and practice of education in the present moment and in future plans of education in our country.

Dr. H.F Verwoerd took advantage of the space created by the churches by working individually on the issues related to education of the African people and developed the famous Bantu Education policy designed to equip blacks to be fixed in their rightful position in society, and that rightful position meant being inferior (Verwoerd 1954:19). According to the churches, people were to be prepared body, mind and soul to go to heaven. Little attention was given to the fundamental structure of exploitation, oppression and control.

The primary purpose of Bantu Education Act (No 47 of 1953) was to clear the way for blacks in their role as unskilled laborers in the future Republic of South Africa. Parliament's decision of September 1953 to transfer black education from the missionary education system to the Department of Native Affairs of the central government had far-reaching implications for the way the church was to conduct its affairs. The introduction and implementation of Bantu education was not done without clearly implicating the Christian community. The non-participation of blacks as skilled workers was not right for economic reasons, in that the majority of the country's citizenship was not economically active.

A closer look at missionary education indicates that local black people had been taught skills without ensuring their full participation in the economy. They were not given an opportunity to exercise what had been learned and the actions of the missionaries were based on the scripture but to think by some people that Bantu Education was the answer to the economic crisis leaves much to be desired. Obviously this new way of life was to determine the factors responsible for change, the extent to which change has taken place and the effect of all this on education. Another contentious point is the one raised by Peter Kallaway (1997:176) when he emphasized that "the schooling of the colonized, whether conducted by missionaries or by agents of the colonial government, was part of the process of colonization". Schools, whether church- or state-financed were modeled on the educational system that had been developed in the industrialized countries, and their political motivation should be understood within the context of the spread of mass

education in Britain, Europe and North America during comparable phases of capitalist development.

Within the colonial context, schools became key institutions of control. Other negative aspects about colonial education are that it encouraged indigenous people to despise their own culture and traditions in favour of those of the colonizer. Bantu education was designed to keep black people ignorant deliberately; the colonizers fearing that schooling could give them ideas above their level and lead them to put forward unreasonable political demands for social change.

When this kind of education was designed, it was motivated by questions of how to maximize production and, by so doing, earn more profit. The black people were to be part of the machinery to make sure that production was a reality; hence they were provided with basic skills of numeracy and literacy to enable those workers to function more adequately and efficiently in the context of mechanization. This is confirmed by Tabata (1960:17) in support of Dr. H.F. Verwoerd who said: “We should not give the natives an academic education as some people are too prone to do. If we do this we shall later be burdened with a number of academically trained Europeans and non-Europeans and the biggest question is who is going to do labour” (Tabata 1960:17).

The way in which the apartheid system was introduced and implemented showed some signs that education was one of the key areas to be focused on. Obviously mission education was perceived as part of a public ministry emphasis in the church; the programme was shaped by the needs of the entire community reaching for justice in social dimensions. Church leadership failed to see the National Party’s entrenching white domination in the name of separate development. They gained Government recognition by letting them transfer mission education to the Department without asking serious questions. They must have known that by doing so, the church was likely to lose its high moral ground; in effect they were agreeing with Dr. H.F. Verwoerd that black education must train and teach the blacks in accordance with their opportunities in life.

This study seeks to clarify and uncover the positive or the negative response of the English-speaking churches to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education. The researcher believes that the ESC did not do enough to resist the introduction and implementation of Bantu education system.

1.14 Outline of the Topic

The title of this study is ‘A Critical Analysis of the Response of the English-speaking Churches to the Introduction and Implementation of the Bantu Education Act No. 47 of 1953’. The focus will be on the crucial events that led to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education. The response made by the English-speaking churches in South Africa is scrutinized to determine whether or not there is any difference in terms of the outcomes between state education and the church-facilitated education system. To preface this work the writer will revisit the word “education”. The report of the Commission of Inquiry into Native Education (generally known as the Eiselen Commission), which led to the promulgation of the Bantu Education Act, is of utmost importance in this thesis.

Consideration was to be given to the ways in which various individuals, church committees, synods, conferences and church leadership reacted to the events and the process enhancing the implementation of the Bantu Education policy.

Worsnip (1991:126) states that Clayton, in his capacity as president of the Christian Council of South Africa, wrote to the prime minister requesting an interview, desiring

“...to put before [him] ...certain matters which have caused disquiet to members of the Christian Council because they seem to us to jeopardize religious liberty, by which we mean liberty for all men to worship in accordance with their religious beliefs and to learn and teach religion”.

Prior to the contact with Western civilization, the need for the formal school, as it is conducted today, did not exist. Such an idea was totally unknown to the people of the pre-literate society. The introduction of the Western-oriented school with its virtually alien curriculum into Black society is attributed to the missionaries who deemed it necessary, for purposes of Christianization, to teach the new church members reading, writing and arithmetic (Luthuli 1981:66).

The coming to power of the National Party in 1948 was an important turning point in the history of South Africa. The new National Party government started to implement its ideology of ‘apartheid’ in all spheres of life. In the field of education, they promulgated the Extension of University Education Act of 1958 and the Fort Hare Transfer Act of

1959. Fort Hare was developing its affiliation to Rhodes. This was hijacked by the birth of Bantu Education and university apartheid in particular.

For the purposes of this study, it was important that we try to define education for ourselves. This definition of education was an addition to the one done in the earlier paragraphs. According to the Oxford Dictionary, education is systematic instruction. If we are in agreement with the above mentioned definition we can say education is also political. It is through education that people pass their learning, values, culture and skills from one generation to another. In the process of that, many new things are discovered and added to education. The researcher also believed that the socio-economic political conditions played a significant role in defining the education system.

1.12. Organization and thematic structure

This presentation of the research results follow a pattern intended to strike a balance between chronological and thematic information. Hopefully this will also influence the application of different styles, ranging from description to analysis to commentary.

Bantu Education should be clearly demonstrated. The reason of the study and its conclusion was followed by recommendations. The reasons for the study and its importance will be expressed in these chapters. Hopefully Church history will be presented as a subject and as a home to this study within a theological framework.

The first chapter introduces the research in terms of background, structure and methodology.

In the second chapter of this study presents the oral collection of data by means of interviews.

The third chapter traces the origins and implementation of Bantu education and the relationship between Bantu education and apartheid system.

The fourth chapter of this research work deals with the response of the churches to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa. The material conditions that contributed to the way the churches responded to Bantu education has been visited, with an intensive analysis of primary sources coming from churches and related secondary sources.

The fifth chapter provides the voices of the prominent clergy in the two ESC which is the Methodist Church of Southern Africa and the Anglican Church of Southern Africa. We hear how the churches responded to the implementation of Bantu education and the role played by the English-speaking churches as they were grappling with that top down approach from the apartheid regime. The experiences of the participants bring to light how they perceived the role played by the church when reacting to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa.

Finally, the findings of the study are discussed and the researcher offers more areas of study raised by his involvement in this research work.

2. ORAL SOURCES

2.1. Introduction

Clause 85(iii) of the South Africa Act of 1909 gives the following powers to provincial councils in respect of education: “Education, other than higher education and Bantu education, until Parliament otherwise provides” South African education was therefore divided horizontally into:

- a) Higher education under the control of the newly established union Government acting through a Minister of Education as head of the union Department of education.
- b) Education “other than higher” which was allocated to the provinces which thus continued to control both primary and secondary education.
- c) The implementation of the Eiselen Commission report which resulted in the introduction of the Bantu Education Act (No.47 of 1953) which came up with the following main provisions:
 - i. A central state department, the Department of Bantu Education would take over the education of the Bantu from the provinces. This meant that the education of the Bantu was to be separated from the other educational agencies and placed under the state department responsible for all matters in connection with Native affairs.
 - ii. There was to be a centralized headquarters and six decentralized regions, each under regional direction.
 - iii. Local control regions of schools through Bantu school boards and school committees (Macmillan1971:17).

In this chapter the experiences of selected individuals are presented, in terms of their experience of the system of Bantu education.

2.2. Research sample

An essential issue in any study of this nature is the selection of research participants, as it is the data which the participants provide that forms the basis from which the findings emerge. Patton (1990:185) notes that it is in the “information-richness of the cases

selected in a qualitative inquiry that validity, meaningfulness, and insights are generated”.

2.3. Selection of participants

The participants volunteered to participate in this study by responding positively to the communication made to them telephonically by the researcher. Following an initial open-ended invitation to participants to reflect on their experience of the response of the English-speaking churches to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa, and informed by Murray (2003), the interviewer reflected upon what the participants were saying and introduced additional probes in order to obtain clarification. Participants were encouraged to tell their stories in their own words with as much description and elaboration as they wished, and the interviewer probed and followed up specific avenues that emerged.

There were nine participants; they were students, teachers and school inspectors during the time of Bantu education. Two of them were women. All the participants were willing to be interviewed about their experiences during the dark days in the history of our country. Those who were involved in the interviews were themselves interested in the study and its findings. It is interesting to note the wishes of the participants that this study will not end up on the shelves of the libraries but that it will be used to learn from the mistakes of the past and help the present system of education to be morally based.

Durrheim and Wassenaar (1999) noted that an essential part of the research work is to engage in debriefing with participants immediately after intense interviews. They add that this element recognizes and respects the autonomy and dignity of the participants. Once the interview was over and the tape recorder switched off, the participants were given a few minutes to reflect on the discussion and discuss their experience of the research process. They were given the opportunity to ask any questions or raise any concerns they might have had.

The participants in this research work were selected purposely and sequentially (Neuman, 2006). The first interviews were done in the Eastern Cape. From there interviewers went to the Free State, Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal. The participants have been given pseudonyms and the specific places where they are located have been omitted for ethical reasons.

Almost all the participants were approachable, hospitable and eager to share as much as possible about their experience of Bantu education during their active life. Fontana and Frey (2005:697) make the point that empathetic interviewing in particular “is a method of morality because it attempts to restore the sacredness of human nature before addressing any theoretical or methodological concerns”. The participants made the time with them a special one, where they shared themselves and at times they would be emotional to a point of crying in the process of sharing their experiences during the time of Bantu education. It was a great privilege for the researcher to be part of their experience by sharing their struggles during the time of the apartheid system. This kind of experience is what Lincoln and Denzin (2004:1052) described as a “sacred space”. In the same vein they refer to this special space as “rare moments” (Lincoln and Denzin 2004:1053). The ages of the participants made apparent that they were part and parcel of those who experienced both the introduction and implementation of Bantu education, with the youngest being seventy-six years of age.

As this study is qualitative the researcher had to observe the ethical practices of qualitative research. As argued by Bassey (1999), research ethics have to consider respect for democracy, respect for truth and respect for persons. The researcher met the above-mentioned ethical requirements through sending letters to seek consent to all participants before carrying out data collection.

2.4. The settings

Due to the ages and socio-economic conditions surrounding the participants, the interviews took place at their homes; thus the researcher travelled to their homes to conduct the interviews. There were times when the researcher was not on time for the interviews simply because he got lost before reaching his destination. There were also times when the participants took long to remember some important points. The environment was conducive to promote a relaxed mood by having all the interviews were conducted in the language of the interviewee.. In the eyes of the researcher, the information shared by the participants was authentic because some of them were emotional and the interviews took them back to the days of their struggle.

Mr. Faku was the first to be interviewed. When the researcher arrived at his home, he found him alone in the house. The first thing Mr. Faku insisted on was that we should

share a cup of tea. Thereafter he offered a short prayer, thanking God for the opportunity to share his experience before he dies. The researcher and the participant sat on the verandah which was rather quiet, except for few cars occasionally passing the house. There was only one interruption and that was a phone call from his son in town. Mr. Faku is a staunch Methodist preacher, who started his schooling in a Methodist school. The interview with him was enriching and it was characterized by both laughter and tears.

The second participant was Mr. Ngoma, who directed the researcher over the cell-phone to his house. When the researcher arrived at his place, he met a young adult and he was shown a small study in the house. There he found Mr. Ngoma reading his newspaper. Mr. Ngoma was a former employee of the Department of Education as an inspector of schools. When the researcher arrived, the entire family was at home. The researcher was given an opportunity to greet and introduce himself to everyone at home. After sharing a few jokes with the participant, the researcher started the business of the day by going through some pictures and books related to the research topic. Mr. Ngoma switched off his cell-phone and pointed out that he did not want to be interrupted by the calls. He then assured the researcher that he was more than ready to deal with the questions related to the study. Mr. Ngoma is a good soft spoken person with amazing gentleness. He spoke with confidence from the beginning up to the end of the interview.

2.5. Methods of data collection

Breakwell (2000:247) notes that with the interview method of data collection, there are no guarantees that participants provide accurate responses; they may distrust the researcher, or they may feel too shy to tell the truth. Furthermore, even those participants who are co-operative may be unable to recall the details requested. One can overcome these challenges “by constructing a systematic set of questions, at the same time as helping the respondent to remember”.

In line with the purpose of this study, the number of participants was limited in scope. As one might expect of qualitative research, it cannot make any claim to be representative of all those who experienced the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa.

As was highlighted by Rakotsane & Rakotsane (2006), data collection techniques allow the systematic collection of information about the objects of study and about the setting in which they occur. Data collection needs to be done systematically because if it is done haphazardly it is difficult to answer the research question in a conclusive way.

2.6. Focus interviews

After administering questionnaires, participants who had completed their questionnaires also participated in an informal discussion, picking up on some of the not-so-clear answers, but done in a relaxed mood, and in most cases this was done over a cup of tea. These discussions allow researchers the opportunity to gain in-depth insights into the world of the participants. In addition, an environment conducive to self-disclosure had to be established (Krueger 1994:36). The researcher opted for a semi-structured interview format as the best obtaining the data he needed for this study.

All participants consented to the interviews being tape-recorded and transcribed. The purpose of tape-recording was to make sure that the researcher does not miss some pertinent points raised by the participants during the interviews. During the time of transcribing the accuracy of the data is guaranteed if it is recorded in the voice of the participant.

2.7. Research procedure

During the data collection process, the researcher began assessing the information he had collected from the interviews. The data collected had been presented in a comprehensive manner and perspectives from the different types of participants are highlighted on various themes presented in this study.

Qualitative research is described by Banister et al (1994:4) as “the exploration, elaboration and systematization of the significance of an identified phenomenon; [and] the illuminative representation of the meaning of a delimited issue or problem”. As the legitimacy of qualitative methods is well established in the literature (Denzin & Lincoln 1994), issues pertaining to qualitative research had been explored in a more specific manner in relation to the study at hand. The participants the researcher interviewed all had a deep belief that Bantu education did more harm than good in the lives of the African people. However, from the interviews, the researcher learnt that Bantu

education was not seen as a bad form of education by everyone. Some thought it was a better than not having education at all and on the other hand others thought it was so bad that people should be encouraged to reject it with contempt it deserved.

A number of ways of conducting phenomenological data analysis have been developed. In the words of Giorgi (1985:4) “many variations within a fundamental methodological concept are possible”. Van Manen (1998:38) reminded us that a phenomenological concern always has a twofold character, a preoccupation with both the concreteness as well as the essential nature of a lived experience. A test of the concreteness of what transformation is all about therefore, is that “one can work backward from the transformed expression to the original naïve expression” (Polkinghorne 1989:56).

Once the meaning units had been transformed, the researcher worked to synthesize them into a descriptive statement of essential, non-redundant psychological meanings. The specific situated description, in the words of Stones (1988:154) is one which “communicates the unique structure of a particular phenomenon in a particular context”.

According to Yin (1989:105) “data analysis consists of examining, categorizing, tabulating and otherwise recording the evidence to address the initial propositions of the study”. Agar (1980:164) points out that the goal of analysis is to identify those themes that summarize participants’ key concerns that recur throughout the data. Some of the participants interviewed offered more data than required in the questionnaire and that was not bad at all as it gave the researcher more information to work from. Once all the transcripts were gathered, the process of reading the transcripts started by sorting them according to the dates of the interviews. Each interview was read several times, looking for the detailed new information that would add value to the findings of the study.

In this chapter, specific data that belong together are identified and put together. The data is sorted and classified according to categories of themes that structured the questionnaire. The process of systematic patterning (Miles & Huberman 1994: 67) is employed to analyse all the data collected from questionnaires, document analysis, observation and field notes. According to Bassey (1999:70) case study research usually produces a great deal of raw data. A useful way of handling and trying to make sense of data is analysis which seeks to condense them into meaningful statements. These analytic statements need to be firmly based on the raw data. The process of analysing data began with compiling the available data as stated in the questionnaires, according

to a spread-sheet following certain themes arranged by the researcher. Analysing qualitative data is the process of making sense of sense of, interpreting, or theorizing the data.

The information from the questionnaires did not follow a certain arranged order. The participants gave information according to their experiences in relation to questions posed to them. For instance, one participant had worked with people who wanted to challenge the system and did talk about the introduction of Bantu education, and the next person gave themselves time to think about the introduction of Bantu education. Qualitative data analysis is the process of bringing order, structure and interpretation to the mess of collected data (Marshall & Rossman 1999:110).

The qualitative data in this study was analysed using a grounded theory approach. Grounded theory methods provide a set of logically consistent analytic procedures for conducting rigorous qualitative research. Paramount to the grounded theory approach is the idea that the researcher derives his or her analytic categories directly from the data rather than from a predetermined hypothesis (Charmaz 1995:47).

As a historian and someone deeply interested in the events which have led us to who we have become today, the researcher was emotionally involved with the participants during the time that the data was being generated. At that time, the researcher had to strike a balance between being a researcher and an active participant in history in the making. Of course, the researcher's own influence in choosing the topic was based on trying to see if we cannot use the same powerful machinery used by those who introduced and implemented Bantu education to introduce a transformational system of education to a society while the process of transformation, like ours here in South Africa is being experienced.

All participants were given information well in advance about the purpose of the study and their role as participants. The questionnaire designed and used was based on an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within its real-life context, especially when the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident (Yin 2003:3). The study entailed the detailed and intensive analysis of each and every questionnaire.

2.8. Context of participants

The participants in this study were people living in the Eastern Cape, Free State, Natal and Gauteng Province. As to who are they and how they were selected we will learn about that later in the study. One person interviewed is from the Free State. All those interviewed displayed a rich knowledge of the Bantu education system and all of them were either scholars or teachers during the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa.

The majority of the participants were pensioners and two of them have passed on since our interviews in 2008. Most people who participated ended up being principals of their school and a handful of them were promoted to be inspectors. The wealth of information received made it possible to satisfy the requirements of the investigation in question.

The interviews were conducted in their homes, in their study rooms or a separate room. They all felt comfortable that it should be the two of us in a scheduled place when conducting the interviews. All of them were given a questionnaire well in advance to facilitate smooth interviews on the agreed date and time. Those who were no longer able to read and write were provided with assistance. Immediately after the interviews, the person assisting with the interviews had to read back all the answers to the interviewee to check the authenticity of the information given. In some instances, the researcher found the participants had already gone through the questionnaire prior to the interview, and had attempted to answer some questions.

After greetings, introductory remarks and scene setting, the researcher would start with the interviews by asking general information questions about Bantu education. Generally, the information would be about the State's efforts to contain the size of the African presence in the cities during the 1950s and 1960s. They argued that the state's capacity to realize its aims during the 1950s was hindered by an unwitting internal contradiction in the formulation of apartheid policy, which widened the space for resistance on several fronts.

Some of the participants were allowed to start school long before the introduction of Bantu Education. They were able to adjust the way they used to do things, and adapt to the new system of education. The manner in which the whole system was introduced convinced many people that it was a good thing.

It was clear from the report of the commission of investigation set up by the Department of Bantu Education of 1961 that there were recognized churches.

Many, if not all the participants, mentioned Dr. Verwoerd in their discussion with the researcher. They all emphasized the point that Dr. Verwoerd, known as “Velevutha” among the Xhosa speaking people, was the Minister of Native Affairs. Dr. Verwoerd was convinced that Native education should be controlled in such way that it should be in accord with the apartheid policy of the state. To Verwoerd, good race relations could not exist when the education is under the control of people who create wrong expectations on the part of the Native himself. Race relations could not improve if the result of Native education is the creation of frustrated people. Education must train and teach people in accordance with their opportunities in life, according to the sphere in which they live (Horrell 1964:5-6). The abovementioned argument was used by those who wanted people to believe that Bantu education was a good thing. Many people in South Africa who are the victims of Bantu education would not agree with the statement because the results of Bantu education were not beneficial to a developing society like South Africa.

The Eastern Cape is one area where there was a great deal of activity related to both the introduction and the implementation of Bantu Education. British control of the Cape of Good Hope was firmly established when one of the British Governors ceded the Cape to Great Britain in 1814, though in fact British colonization can be dated to 1806 when British forces occupied the Cape for the second time (Dickerson 1980:1).

The participants’ commitment to education remained the same even though they were no longer active due to old age. In 1969, the salary scales for teachers were very low. The then monthly salary was R75, 00 for male teachers and R60, 00 for female teachers with a university degree and a professional certificate. This did not serve as an incentive to Africans wishing from outside the country (South Africa) to join the teaching profession (S.A.I.R.R 1969: 6).

The ages of the participants varies from the sixty to eighty-five years. At the time of Bantu education, some were scholars on farms; others were schooling in the townships. Their work experiences in teaching did cover both rural and urban contexts. Some had a sharp memory capacity. They remembered quite a number of incidents and events as if they took place yesterday. They were almost all constant in their story of Bantu

education. It is clear they experienced it differently depending as what they were doing during the time of its introduction and implementation.

The researcher was able to undertake two trips to each one of them. The first visit was based on introducing the researcher and the objective of both the researcher's visit and research work. It is at this point that the questionnaires were distributed for the participants to study and prepare him/herself for the day of the interview. That time was used to schedule the date and time for the interviews. The participant would arrange the interview based on his/her availability.

In any research, participants have the right to either agree or refuse to participate in any method of research chosen to gather information, and they reserve the right to confidentiality, privacy and anonymity (McMillan and Schumacher 2001:420).

In the research process, necessary steps have been taken to protect and avoid any harm to participants, either physically or emotionally. The participants still reserve the right not to be called by name in the study if they so choose. The final thesis will be published without disclosing the identification of the participants. Only interviewees who wished to be quoted will have their names mentioned.

2.9. Instruments

The instrument that was used for collecting data was a questionnaire that was made available to the participants in a printed format. A copy of this questionnaire may be found in Appendix A. The questionnaire was designed with two things in mind. First, it should be user-friendly. In other words, it should not be intimidating to the participants, considering their age. Second, it should help to create a comfortable atmosphere to enable the participant to provide the necessary data freely.

The questionnaire helped to guide our conversation. We can safely say this document was motivational and promoted cultural sensitivity. Crafting a convincing questionnaire in itself was not easy since it had to be a tool that is reliable with a proven track record in the academic world. For it to be academically sound, it must be developed using a social cognitive view of motivation.

The questionnaire was designed in such a way that:

- The questions give a complete response.
- The questions deal with the significant areas about the topic.
- The questions are as short as possible, and just enough to get the essential data.
- The questionnaire is attractive in appearance, neatly arranged and clearly printed.
- The questions are objective with no leading suggestions as to the responses desired.
- The questions are easy to interpret.

It is explicit from the questionnaire that the aim of the study was to investigate the role played by the church against the introduction and the implementation of the Bantu Education Act No. 47 of 1953.

2.10. Procedures

In order to address the research question, it was necessary to correlate and contrast the findings from the written sources and the live interviews.

We pick up the motivation of the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education from the paper on Bantu Education by Fanyana Mazibuko to the Education and Development Conference held at the University of Cape Town, 16-20 July 1979. In his address, he mentioned the following Afrikaner thinking on education. All the proponents of Bantu Education before Dr. H.F Verwoerd and after made it quite clear that the reason why they advocated a separate system of education for black people in South Africa was to control the inroads which black people might make into activities, jobs, pleasures and responsibilities which white South Africans regarded as preserve of the white race.

On 2 April 1945, Mr. M.D.C. de Wet (Minister of Bantu Administration) told parliament that:

As has correctly been stated here, education is the key to the creation of the proper relationship between European and non-European in South Africa ... put native education on a sound basis, and half the racial questions are solved ... I say that there should be reform of the whole education system and it must be based on the culture and

background and the whole life of the native himself in his tribe. This policy is also a danger for our Western Civilization (Centrell 1993:29).

Mr. J.N. Le Roux had this to say:

“We should not give the native an academic education, as some people are to prone to do. If we do this we shall later be burdened with a number of academically trained Europeans and non-Europeans and who is going to do the manual labour in the country? I am in thorough agreement with the view that we should so conduct our schools that the native who attends these schools will know to a great extent that he must be a labourer in the country (Verwoerd 1954:13)”.

These statements, and many more which can be unearthed, recount the sayings of prominent Afrikaners. The manipulation of black aspirations was unequivocally stated by Dr. Verwoerd in Parliament when he said:

“I just want to remind the honourable members that if the Native in South Africa today in any kind of school existence is being taught to expect that he will live his adult life under the policy of equal rights, he is making a big mistake (Verwoerd 1954:11)”.

He went on to say:

“He must not be subjected to a school system which draws him away from his community and mislead him by showing him the green pastures of European society where he is not allowed to graze (Verwoerd 1954: 11)”.

In the planning stages of Bantu Education, there was therefore this openness, this sincerity about the aims of Bantu Education. It does not matter what verbal acrobatics present-day lawmakers and administrators perform in an attempt to screen the Verwoerdian approach to the education of black people. The actual practice of the system of Bantu education does vindicate the contention that first, Dr. Verwoerd meant exactly what he said, and second, he was representative of Afrikaner, if not all white, thinking on education for black people.

To achieve their objectives as stated in the pronouncements quoted earlier, Dr. Verwoerd and other leading Afrikaners set in motion legislation and policies which were designed to frustrate all black initiatives in education. I shall first outline how the education system was manipulated to frustrate black educational aspirations and

initiatives before I refer to how it boomeranged by causing national development problems and dangerous political tensions.

The South African educational system starts the black child at a disadvantage and keeps her or him in that state until the child writes the final matriculation examinations. The black person will then repeatedly perform badly, and finally, as the Verwoerdian hoped, the person is convinced that as a black person, he or she is innately inferior and the white is superior (Mazibuko 1979:51-53).

The quantitative method was deemed necessary for the desired results to be realized. To meet the acceptable academic standard, a questionnaire was developed and once it had been ascertained that it conformed to acceptable standards by running it through with the supervisor in this study, it was necessary to test it so that the accuracy and integrity of the programs involved could be checked. There was a long process before academically acceptable standards of the questionnaire could be finalized. It is unfortunate that we could not have an online version of the questionnaire sent to the target group. The researcher's target group was the elderly - those who were still active during the introduction and the implementation of Bantu Education. The majority of the target groups were people who were not computer literate. The questionnaires were collected on the day of the interview. The participants were helped to complete the questionnaires and that eliminated the possibility of having questionnaires handed in complete or wrongly filled in. The main disadvantage was that persons with the desired information could not always be contacted without incurring travelling expenses and using much time in the process. Some of the participants filled in their own questionnaires and others were helped by the interviewer to fill in the necessary data. To maintain the ethical requirements of the study, the interviewer put in the information as it was verbalized by the participants. The tape recorder played an important role to make sure that the views and opinions expressed were those of the interviewee.

2.11. Interviews

The purpose of interviews is to gather descriptive data in the subject's own words (Cantrell 1993:32). Interviews enable the inquirer to develop insights into how participants interpret and make meaning of the world (Cantrell 1993:32). According to the views of Guba and Lincoln (1985:102), the purpose for doing interviews is to obtain

the here-and-now constructions of persons. The interviews included the participants' responses, probing questions on descriptions and explanations related to their experience of the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education. The interviews were semi-structured and open-ended. The aim of doing that was to give participants the opportunity to express themselves freely and orally to enable the researcher to obtain insights into the thinking of the participants in as far as the investigation is concern. All interviews were conducted individually, tape recorded and transcribed. Though the focus of the data collection was qualitative, some quantitative data associated with the questionnaires were quite useful in interpreting the data. Each interview took between two to three hours. Due to pre and post interview duties, the researcher could not have more than one interview a day.

Interviews can be with individuals or small groups of participants. Focus group interviewing is a form of qualitative data collected in which the evaluator functions as a discussion facilitator for a small group of participants and relies on interaction within the group to provide insights about topics proposed by the evaluator (Hatch 1995:200). The form and continuity of experience is understood to be the product of an intrinsic relationship between human beings and the world. In contrast to the assumptions that inform western science, experience is not understood merely as a mental projection onto the world as reflected in the world. The person is rather seen to be a reality that results from the openness of human awareness to the world and it cannot be reduced either to the sphere of the mental or the physical (Polkinghorne 1989:42)

Colaizzi (1978:57) points out that the meaningful study of phenomena requires us to endeavour to descriptively identify phenomena. Identification of phenomena, then, becomes the crucial first step in phenomenological research. If a researcher wishes to know or identify a particular phenomenon he or she cannot rely entirely upon theory because in doing this, the phenomenon's experiential aspect is limited.

2.12. Interviewing skills

One other important interesting personal development for the researcher during the course of this study was around the issue of interviewing skills. The nature of the study needed an efficient interviewer. The skill of handling questions and formulating probing questions to milk out all the necessary data has been sharpened by the process of

conducting the interviews in this study. At the beginning, the researcher was nervous when starting the interview sessions. Asking broad questions rather than closed leading questions seemed to be more appropriate for the study of this nature. The researcher has learnt a great deal from allowing the interviewees to bring in some subjects related to the study rather than closing them down to the anticipated questions.

Interviewing is a flexible tool for data collection, enabling multi-sensory channels, verbal, non-verbal, spoken and heard, to be used (Cohen, Mannion & Morrison, 2002:19). There are various types of interviews varying from natural conversation which uses questions asked verbally to structured questionnaires (Gillhan 2000:26).

Gillhan (2006) argues that semi-structured interviews are flexible with room for probing for more information. The interview questions, which were designed prior to the interviews, only acted as guidelines in generating data as more follow up questions were asked.

Pathon (2002) and Cohen, Mannion & Morrison, (2007) argue that purposive sampling involves selecting information rich samples for the purpose of in-depth analysis that help to illuminate the phenomenon under study – in this case learning process in historical, social context.

2.13. Field notes taking approach

The purpose of field notes is to systematically record impressions, insights and emerging themes and hypotheses (Rossman & Rallies, 2003). Chen, Mannion and Morrison (2000) advise that two types of notes be kept of observational data both “in situ and away from the situation” (:146). Neuman (2006) describes an emic approach as “perceptions and understanding” of the “insider’s” culture (:449). Based on the above approach, the researcher found it important to use a field-notes taking approach to ensure that additional information based on observing the participant’s actions in responding the questionnaire was recorded. This approach added value to the study as it gave additional information during the interviews.

2.27 Individual interviews

After having gone through the written sources about the role of the church in relation to the Bantu Education Act, the researcher began to realize that many versions from

different authors were similar and they reiterated the same information. Yet when speaking to the participants on a one-to-one basis, different versions were told. Through my interaction with both the participants and the written sources, the researcher came to realization that people experienced the introduction and implementation of Bantu education at different levels. The majority of the writers were white middle class men and the participants were black professionals. Huberman and Miles (cited in Cohen et al. 2000) explain that changes in observational protocols and interview schedules in the field reflect a better understanding of the context, thereby heightening the internal validity of the study.

The individual interviews were based on questions that the researcher had prepared beforehand which were informed by insights that had emerged from the information at the researcher's disposal and the research question.

2.14. Data analysis

Once the data was collected and ready, it was analysed by using qualitative methods. The aim of the method used was in keeping with the view of Wamuhui and Karugh (1995:17) that qualitative analysis tends to be inductive, moving from the particular to the general. The researcher found it academically acceptable to adopt the suggestion of Centrell (1993:18) for the analysis of the results from the investigation, content analysis involving the identification of categories, or themes based on ideas and classification. Data analysis is essentially a process that makes sense of the data which is done by collating, coding and explaining it from all the sources in order to describe, analyse and interpret it. A first step is to explore the data to get a sense of it (Creswell, 2005), and then to identify themes or categories as well as text segments. Successful analysis requires that the data is kept, prepared and handled accurately so that there are no errors which may give false results. The data received was transcribed immediately after the interview. That approach helps to eliminate distortion of data, based on lost memory. It is always advantageous to work on the data at your disposal while it is still fresh in your mind. Through data analysis, it became clear that there was a set of guiding principles aimed at accomplishing the implementation of Bantu Education:

- (a) Education must be broadly conceived so that it can be organized effectively to provide not only adequate schools with a definite Christian character but also adequate social institutions to harmonize with schools of such orientation.
- (b) To secure efficient and thorough co-ordination of planning institutions and adequate schools, education should be in the care of a Union Government department
- (c) Education must be coordinated with a definite and carefully planned policy for the development of Bantu societies. Such policy should pay special but not exclusive attention to the economic development of Bantu. This matter is of particular importance in view of the rising costs of social services to the Bantu.
- (d) Increased emphasis must be placed on the education of the mass of the Bantu to enable them to co-operate in the evolution of new social patterns and institutions. This does not mean a curtailment of the present facilities for education but a new emphasis on the importance of education for all, in both the “social” and the purely “school” sense.
- (e) Active steps must be taken to produce literature of functional value in the Bantu languages. At present these languages lack terminology for describing modern science concepts, and their numeral systems are clumsy and difficult to use. It should not be difficult, however, to overcome these difficulties (Hlatshwayo 1999:59).

Data collected in this study from the field were subjected to both quantitative and qualitative analyses. To meet the academic standard, in this study, data gathered was analyzed using both inductive and deductive processes, which meant that in the data analysis, the researcher kept revisiting, double-checking and refining the information at his disposal.

2.15. The role of the researcher

The researcher introduces the aims and objectives of the study to the participants. He also plays an important role in setting conducive environment for conducting interviews. The atmosphere must be conducive to allow a free flow of information. The participants must feel free to volunteer the information, and understand that he/she is at liberty to participate or not to be part of the interviews.

In line with the suggestion made by McMillan and Schumacher (2001:268), the purpose of the research was clearly explained to the participants so that they could make an informed decision as to whether they wanted to participate or not. This was done by the researcher in his correspondence with them in the form of a consent letter. The questions contained in the questionnaire were simplified and translated to the participants in the language of their choice where necessary.

For the data analysis the researcher had used the guidelines as stipulated by Miles and Huberman (1994:36) as his main reference source. According to Miles and Huberman (1994:37) data reduction entails 'the process of selecting, focusing, simplifying, obstructing and transformation the data from their original format in they were presented. One of the guiding principles used in this study to analyze data is from Skemp (1971:19) and he calls that "reflective intelligence". During this time the researcher was also continuing to review additional literature for the study in further developing the conceptual framework. There was a constant balancing of the written material and the oral interviews by the researcher. Some of the questions asked by the researcher were based on the knowledge gathered from the written sources at the disposal of the researcher.

For the data analysis the researcher had used the guidelines as stipulated by Miles and Huberman (1994:36) as his main reference source. According to Miles and Huberman (1994:37) data reduction entails 'the process of selecting, focusing, simplifying, obstructing and transformation the data from their original format in they were presented. One of the guiding principles used in this study to analyze data is from Skemp (1971:19) and he calls that "reflective intelligence". During this time the researcher was also continuing to review additional literature for the study in further developing the conceptual framework. There was a constant balancing of the written material and the oral interviews by the researcher. Some of the questions asked by the researcher were based on the knowledge gathered from the written sources at the disposal of the researcher.

2.16. Oral history used

The type of oral history used in this study was referred to by Denis and Ntsimane (2008:91) as oral testimony, eyewitness or first-hand accounts of events or situations

that occurred during the lifetime of the person interviewed. The informant tells a story about him- or herself, about what he or she has seen, heard or done in the past. In this study, the participants were telling the story of their experience during the time of Bantu education's introduction and implementation. One of the main strengths of life history of the interviews was that they yield maximum participation and deeper revelation of information.

It was important to distinguish between oral history and other forms of social practices involving interviews, as this will help to clarify the specificity of oral history in matters of research ethics. Two cognate disciplines also rely on interviews, but in a different way and with different ethical requirements. Social scientists, such as sociologists and clinical psychologists, routinely conduct interviews, either on a one-on-one basis or by way of focus groups. The purpose of these interviews is to gather knowledge on the individuals or groups involved in the research. Unless otherwise agreed, any kind of personal information remains absolutely confidential (Denis and Ntsimane 2008:65).

The oral interviews that were conducted for this study were built around an open-ended schedule and sought to provide the subjects with an opportunity to talk about themselves in the contexts in which they had experience. More valuable data was received through these interviews as they were conducted in the language of the participants and they were free to express themselves with no difficulties. The participants participated in the study voluntarily and in fact the majority of them thanked God for the opportunity to share valuable and emotional information, telling their experience and understanding of what took place during the years of Bantu education in South Africa (see table of personal details below):

Mr. Zonwabele Nabe belongs to the Presbyterian Church of Southern Africa.

Mr. Bongani Ngoma belongs to the Methodist Church of Southern Africa.

Mr. Thembani Faku belongs to the Methodist Church of Southern Africa.

Mrs. Nomathemba Sakati belongs to the Presbyterian Church of Southern Africa.

Mr. Vuyo Myoli belongs to the Roman Catholic Church.

Mr. Aaron Mfengu belongs to the Church of the Province of South Africa.

Mr. Sizwe Nogantshi belongs to the United Congregational Church of Southern Africa.

Mrs. Nozizwe Grootboom belongs to Church of the Province of South Africa.

Mr. George Lubelwana belongs to the Roman Catholic Church.

A number of the participants expressed how they had found revisiting their experiences, and what it meant to them to be part of the transition from the missionary education to Bantu education system. They had been grateful for the rare opportunity to speak about the impact of their experiences with someone who could understand them reflecting their experiences seemed as therapeutic exercise.

In the understanding of education from the participant's perspective, they saw education as something leading to a better life, getting a good job, earning a high income, knowledge and empowerment, a dream come true, providing for family, better opportunities, and a relaxed comfortable life for oneself.

The motive for many people to study is both self-development and gaining liberation. The struggle for political freedom in South Africa has always been closely linked to the struggle for quality formal education.

2.17. Presentation of Findings

According to Polkinghorne (1989:57) the phenomenological research report must include a description and documentation of the procedure employed by the researcher to collect the data.

Glaser (1992: 15) notes that a well-constructed grounded theory analysis meets four central criteria:

- *Fit*: if a good grounded theory is carefully induced, its categories and their properties will fit the realities under study in the eyes of subjects, practitioners, and researchers in the field.
- *Work*: if a grounded theory works, it will explain the major variations in behaviour in the area with respect to incorporating the main concerns of the participants.
- *Relevance*: Glaser argues that if a theory works and fits, it has achieved relevance.

- *Modifiability*: A theory should “not to be written in stone”. It should be readily modifiable when new data presents variations in emergent properties and categories. “The theory is neither verified nor thrown out”. Instead it is modified to accommodate an integration of new concepts.

2.18. Interviews

2.18.1. Interview 1: Mr.Faku

As a boy, Mr. N. Faku was a shepherd looking after the sheep and cattle of the former employer of his parents. He was born and bred at Fort Brown, about 15km outside Grahamstown on the way to Fort Beaufort.

Mr. Faku started schooling at a Methodist Primary School known as Samuel Ntsiko Primary School. His parents encouraged him to become educated till he passed standard six. The only professions available to black people those days were the following: Teaching, Nursing, Police and Clerks.

Among the participants interviewed, Mr. Faku is the one who was caught up in mainstream intellectual theological debate which challenged the role of the church in the field of education. He is of the opinion that the church should not fail its responsibility in the area of education by not taking the lead. To him God remains the one in charge of human development and means that God is in charge of education of God’s people.

In their different emphases, local theologies have sought to make the Christian faith meaningful in the context of exploitation, degradation and human humiliation. This moderates a simplistic view that sees missionary work as “establishing and maintaining western spiritual colonies throughout the non-western world” or allowing third world congregations to be “drab copies of the western religious experience” (Hillman 1993:38, 40). According to Mr. Faku, the church has been given the responsibility to make Christian faith contextual and that can be done successfully by taking lead in the field of education. During the interview, Mr. Faku had the following to say:

The forcing of the Bantu education down the throats of the black people in South Africa caused many churches to react either by handing over their schools to the government or

by arranging private schools. The church is a non-violent institution in the foot-steps of Jesus Christ and for that reason it rejected the introduction of Bantu education, not by organizing public violent protests but by peace engagements. Where necessary they called meetings between them and the government officials to discuss their side of the story about the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa. The Methodist Church of Southern Africa, was one of the churches that spent hours on end debating the implication of the implementation of Bantu education system (Faku, Grahamstown, Paragraph 6 page 18: 17 September 2007).

2.18.2. Interview 2: Mr. Nogantshi

During the interview with Mr. Nogantshi, he related the following:

“I had been teaching for a number of years under the Bantu education administration. I used corporal punishment as a method of restoring order in my school like all other teachers of our time. I must confess, I grew up in a Christian home with strict Christian principles and discipline and that influence was from mother’s side. Corporal punishment was used at home to discipline the children when they stepped out of line. Both my parents were educated under what was called Royal Reader education system. They spoke both English and Latin fluently”.

Though the implementation of Bantu education may be a disputed terrain, almost all the participants in this study shared the same view that it was introduced with the aim of placing a black person in his or her appropriate position in society, according to the architects of the system. The impact made by Bantu education on the lives of many African people is still evident in the way education is perceived by many people in our country, Africans in particular. When asked how Bantu education impacted on his life, Mr Nogantshi started by saying “I was not a politician, and mine was about to educate the children and by so doing I was making my contribution in my community but because I questioned some of the things related to apartheid system, Bantu education included, and because of that I was mistaken for a politician”.

When asked if he saw any difference between the white and black education, he responded by saying: “I recall attending the African National Congress meeting aimed at boycotting Bantu education. I was not a political activist but by virtue of being a community leader I was expected to make a significant contribution towards fighting

the Bantu education. I recognized the fact that I failed to take heed of the call. Now that I am given this golden opportunity to reflect on what had happened during my career as a teacher I come to a conclusion that my mind was colonised@ (point 5, paragraph 8, page 11-12 : Date 27 August 2007).

During the interview, Mr. Nogantshi pointed out that the following: “I hated seeing black and white working together. Certainly I was indoctrinated to believe that blacks were created by God to live separately from the whites and vice versa. I hated seeing black children not attending school; however I failed to find out the reasons why some black children were not at school. The general view was that these children were lazy and their parents were irresponsible. In some cases it turned out that it was not of their own making that they were not at school, but the Bantu education system was making it virtually impossible for them to go to school. They were systematically excluded by the introduction of school fees and the uniform. Their parents were not irresponsible but could not afford to pay school fees and buy them uniforms. The Bantu education by its nature was exclusive and tried to discourage many of our black people to stay away from education (Nogantshi, Fort Beaufort, paragraph 8, 13-15: 27 August 2007).

“Let me start by telling you about my personal experience. As a local preacher, I did not experience problems in relation to church and its role in society. I always believed that the church could be involved in Christian education on Sundays in their Sunday schools. What people call education should be left in the hands of the government, it is the responsibility of the government to ensure that its citizens are educated to improve its economic muscle. The church should not interfere in the internal affairs of education. Both Church and State can run parallel because educated individuals must be people who have a relationship with God. According to my personal experience, education without the involvement of God is politics. And politics are dangerous, they have destroyed many countries. The introduction and implementation of Bantu education was made an agenda item in official meetings of the church but what was difficult was to take a principled decision whether to reject or support Bantu education” (Nogantshi, point 4 paragraph 7 page 15 : 27 August 2007).

His views befit someone of his age. Sharing his frustration about education and democracy he said the following: “Education and democracy do not mix; once education is democratized that makes it to lose its value. I also see the damage made by the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education but on the other hand I think

Bantu education was better than no education at all as people during our school days would say – ‘half-bread is better than no bread’. People were convinced by those in authority that Bantu education was good for their future and social stability. Seemingly, the role of the church in education was in relation to the scripture part and the state was on the side of the social order. The point that I can raise is the one of disunity in the body of Christ because we used to hear from other members of the church that they are also troubled by the handing over of the schools to the government and the proposed content of Bantu education. United Congregational Church of Southern Africa (UCCSA), one of the English-speaking churches, took a stand against the introduction and implementation of Bantu education. Chief Albert Luthuli, one of the Presidents of the ANC and the first South African to receive the Nobel Peace Prize, was a member of the (UCCSA). Bantu Education Act was part of the apartheid policy aimed at destroying black people’s dignity. The UCCSA continued to oppose the implementation of Bantu education and was amongst those churches that warned the government of the likelihood of a huge reaction to the implementation of Bantu education system. Apart from opposing the implementation of Bantu education, the UCCSA also took a clear stand in defiance against the continued existence of Bantu education in our schools”(Nogantshi, paragraphs 5, 7, 8, pages 16-17: August 27).

2.18.3. Interview 3: Mr. Lubelwana

Mr. Lubelwana started his teaching in 1966 as a bachelor fresh from Teachers’ College. He did his teacher’s diploma at Kwasomxada (Healdtown). He joined other teachers by becoming a local preacher in the Methodist Church before he could qualify as a teacher. Unlike Mr Nogantshi, he was in constant conflict with the school administration for questioning some of the things done at school. He was one of those old teachers who wakes up in the morning and is in his suit even if he is not going anywhere. He started the conversation by relating his unfortunate relationship with the department of education by saying: “Although I was not popular with the department of education because of what I believe in, I was loved by some people in that office for my dedication and doing my work very well. My endeavours to challenge some aspects of education could not help much due to the fact that I was alone and sometimes isolated. I learned to be responsible and taking my teaching profession seriously due to the

influence received from my own teachers” (Lubelwana, Welkom, paragraph 9, page 15: 30 September 2007).

“The question of how Bantu education affected me is a difficult one, but what I can say is that Bantu education helped me to be a strong leader and someone who is not afraid to question things. My clash with the Department of Education officials gained me both friends and enemies. Those people who understood the reason why I was in loggerheads with the department did not find it difficult to support me. Those who were into politics supported me, covertly of course because they could easily end up being victims of the government. They tried to persuade me to join active politics of the ANC which at that time was a banned organisation. I did not want to risk my life and sacrifice my job by being a political activist. The treatment I received from the Department made me grow stubborn. I was aware about introduction and implementation of Bantu education, however, I could not do much to challenge it. As far as I am concern the system was too powerful and well managed by the Department of Bantu education. I saw some of the militant teachers losing their jobs and others were driven to exile. So coming back to your question Bantu education impacted negative on my life and many lives in South Africa” (Lubelwana paragraph 10, page 17: 30 September 2007).

“I wanted to see Bantu education gone with all my heart. I knew the pain and suffering brought about by the introduction and implementation of Bantu education system. Like all other teachers, I felt powerless. My experience about the existence of Bantu Education is that it started by instilling fear in our people and it was not easy for them to unite and stand up to challenge the well organised military system. If I am to add, I would say Bantu education was a complex issue; many people did not know how to react to its introduction and implementation. Many teachers found themselves in a dilemma of not knowing the right thing to do. They thought if they boycott Bantu education they will be denying the black child an opportunity to empower him/her for a brighter future” (paragraph 11 page 16 date: 30 September 2007).

“If I can tell you the truth about the church, it was never an organised group of people who can speak with one voice to take a political stand. The people called Christians met every week but instead of taking the opportunity to discuss bread and butter issues, education included, they saw it as an opportunity to smooth their pain and suffering by being spiritual. They spend the whole day preaching to each other and there is no opportunity for them to discuss their suffering and concerns. Only if they can be like

Jesus they follow, and go out to the community or deal with community issues in their meeting. I am saying that being a Christian myself. Correct me if I am wrong in my opinion. People should take advantage of the opportunity of coming together in the name of Jesus to unite both the implementers of Bantu education and the victims for them to share ideas. Why is it difficult for them to engage each other as brother and sister under the cross of Jesus Christ? My experience of the church is that there is no one to take the initiative to convene such a meeting. The obvious helpful conduct under the circumstance was the one saying the church must deal with Church matters and anything related to Bantu education should be dealt with in the government circles”.

According to Mr. Lubelwana, the government was the opponent of the Christian mission and by introducing the Bantu education it was trying to destroy the good foundation set by the missionary education in South Africa. The church spent a lot of time debating the impact of Bantu education both on the lives of the people and the mission of the church. Mission schools which were for years had been doing excellent work in the education of blacks were forced to use the syllabuses of the Bantu Education Department. In protest, the Anglican Church decided to close down its schools. Again the Church of the Province of South Africa’s (CPSA) response to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education was accompanied by a great deal of frustration because education was one of the important arm of mission and the mandate of the church (Lubelwana, Welkom, paragraph 12 page 20: 30 September 2007).

2.18.4. Interview 4: Mr. Nabe

Mr. Nabe was a qualified teacher with 27 years of teaching experience. He joined the teaching profession in 1963. His mother was a staunch member of the Methodist Church. His father decided not to involve himself in church affairs. His mother, who happened to reach standard two, did a splendid job by encouraging her son to be educated. His mother often pressed on him that someone without education remains trapped by the bondages of poverty. If her son wanted to be a free man, he had no option but to attend school.

During the interview Mr. Nabe had the following to say: “When I was still a child, my parents took me to school and instructed the teachers to punish me if he is out of order. There were times when my teacher would visit me and spend a long time chatting to my

parents. Whereas I would not know what they were talking about but I would be curious to know what their conversation was all about. Well with our parents, kids were allowed to sit in parents' conversation and it was difficult if not totally impossible for children to ask questions. I could sense that there was something wrong with this Bantu education; however, I could not know what it was exactly. It was interesting the way this new education system was introduced because many people were discouraged to speak ill of either the government or Bantu education itself. It was crystal clear in my mind that my interest should be to do my job, not to be involved in political activities. As a product of Bantu education myself, I did value learning and teaching more than any other thing during my working days. There is always a point in emphasizing the importance of getting African people educated. Education was the only weapon that can be used by African people to demonstrate the same standard and privileges as those of the whites. I believed if black people obeyed whites and worked closely with them that could result for a change of heart by the white people" (Nabe, Alice, point 6 paragraph 8 page 15: 05 October 2007).

In outlining significant areas experienced, Mr. Nabe alluded to the following: "For anyone to be able to teach [they] must walk closely with his/her God. Bantu education took away the schools from the churches and they were operating under the Department of Education. However, religious instruction was at the centre of the Bantu education. Discipline was important and corporal punishment was the method used to enforce discipline. I am someone who believed that corporal punishment is the only way to make learners to read and do their work diligently and this kind of discipline is supported by the Scriptures. Education is about training someone holistically and that means spiritually, intellectually and physically. Not all was dull and gloom about Bantu Education, as many black people managed to climb the social ladder because of Bantu education. Social empowered mobility was enjoyed by those who had a certain level of education. His personal background is from the family of a working class. In actual fact they were members of a working class and lived by farming. He changed his social status to middle class because of education. He also acknowledges the fact that Bantu education had failed many potential black leaders. This system of education was designed to fail black people. They were made to believe that they are perpetual minors, who could not stand on their own. They depended on the white person for all they needed in their lives (Nabe, Alice, paragraph 11, page 16: 05 October 2007).

During the interview Mr. Nabe pointed out: “I believe that education is one of the gospel’s imperatives because one of the responsibilities of Jesus was to teach. If we agree that it is so, we must point out that it was a mistake for the government to take it away from the missionaries or the churches. Preaching and education were central in the ministry of Jesus Christ, in other words Christ is an educator and education is Christ. The apartheid government implemented the Bantu Education Act to separate the education system between whites and blacks. By the time of the introduction of the Bantu Education Act, the majority of the schools were under the churches (mission schools). The Education Act compelled the mission schools to be surrendered to the department of education under the control of the state. Let me conclude your question by emphasizing the point that the English-speaking churches did not use their prophetic voice to speak against the implementation of Bantu education knowing its negative impact on the future of the African people. It is clear to me that in some instances the church responded to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education by not taking an active part in either supporting or rejecting it. Almost all the decision making bodies of my church, from Synod to Conference, they were talking about the Bantu education because it was affecting the way they were going to do their ministry and mission” (Nabe, Alice, paragraph 12, 05 October 2007).

2.18.5. Interview 5: Mr. Myoli

Mr. Myoli was also a teacher who spent most of his life teaching. He started his own schooling under the mission education system, just before the take-over of the schools by the government. He had a vivid recollection of how things were under mission education. According to him, the standard of education was very high. Many black people showed the world that they are of high quality. Mr. Myoli, unlike many people the researcher interviewed, was born of uneducated parents; both of them were known as red people. They are referred to as red people because of the red clay they use to wear on their faces. The usual clothes for them were blankets. Education received both at home and at school helped him to become a reliable and honest member of society. Although the introduction and implementation of Bantu education brought about both negative and positive consequences, he chose to use education for his personal development.

During the interview, he highlighted the following: “Both of my parents were never at school but they respected the work done by teachers at school. The fact that they were unable to write and read was of great concern to them and they always emphasize the point that they will make sure that their children are educated. The introduction of Bantu education did not help the relationship between the church and the state. The English-speaking church did very well in their role of providing education the African people, however they failed to resist the temptation of handing over schools to the government, based on the fact that they saw themselves weak and powerless to take the government to task for not helping the future of the African people in their country” (Myoli, Mlazi, paragraph 5, page 3: 11 October 2007).

“It is my conviction that some of the problems of Bantu education were caused by the churches themselves. They did not want to unite and form a strong front against the implementation of Bantu Education Act of 1953. Separate denominations handed over to the government their schools one by one. I don’t want to be very negative about the education we received from Bantu education schools, as compared to the one we were introduced to in the mission schools. According to my analyses, everything at the mission schools was motivated by love and passion to want to make a positive impact in the lives of the people, black people in particular. Learners from the Bantu education school were afraid and their teachers and everything they did out of fear not out of love” (Myoli, Mlazi, point 9 paragraph7 page 6: 11 October 2007).

“One of the lessons I picked up from the school was respect. I did my school work not out of fear, but out of respect and love my teachers. Our teachers were willing to sacrifice their time for their learners. Teachers have a responsibility to create conducive environment in their classrooms. For education to be successful, one needs both respected, ready to sacrifice and responsible teacher and a committed, prepared to learn and discipline learner. The content of education was as important as the context in which the learning can take place” (Myoli, Mlazi, page 12: 11 October 2007).

“The first mistake of the church was to allow itself to lose the prophetic voice and that meant the government could introduce Bantu education without organised resistance from the churches. Before the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act, there was no standardization of administration in the schools of the blacks. Schools then were operating under different wings e.g. mission schools, state schools and community or tribal schools. The role played by the church in the introduction and implementation

of Bantu education disappointed a number of people by not standing up firm against the handing over of schools. My church responded by debating among themselves the effects of the introduction and implementation of Bantu education without either taking any formal stand or issuing a public statement outlining our position as the church. If I remember well, the position of my church was to hand over the schools the government wanted and be out of trouble” (Myoli, Mlazi, paragraph 12, 11 October 2007).

2.18.6. Interview 6: Mr. Mfengu

Mr. Lizolile Mfengu, during the interview, shared with the researcher his appreciation for the tales he learned from school. The one he shared is “*Imbilayaswelaumsilangokuyalezela*” which points out that if you desire to have a thing done properly, you must do it yourself, or you will be disappointed if you depend on others and do nothing to help yourself, and it is about the laziness of the people. The moral lesson from this tale is that if we want to succeed in life we must do things ourselves. The participant was over the moon about the fact that the researcher was undertaking this study.

Mr. Mfengu started teaching in the time of missionary education and he had studied under the missionary education system. However he started teaching during the time of the introduction of the Bantu Education Act No.47 of 1953. He worked mainly on a farm as a school teacher. Those days black people could not afford to buy themselves cars, hence they depended heavily on public transport such as buses, trains and horse-drawn cart.

Mr. Mfengu had been a teacher more than 28 years, and started to work under the Bantu Education Act. He did have the experience of mission education. However, he learnt about the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act No. 47 of 1953 from both written and oral sources. He was a school principal for a number of years. He played a prominent role in the department of music and sports. He strongly believed that physical training at school plays an important role in enhancing the academic potential of the learners. When he started teaching, he was sent to a farm school and that helped him to see how children and farm workers in general were treated. When children were late for school, in most cases it is not their own fault. Mr Mfengu learnt that they are late for school simply because they have other errands to run before they come to school.

During the interviews he shared the following: “Like some of the teachers from previously disadvantaged backgrounds, I appreciated the opportunity of acquiring an education. The fact that I was educated made me passionate about educating other black children. The introduction and implementation of Bantu education did not worry me at all. As far as I am concerned, my role was to empower the black people whom I understood well as a fellow black person” (Mfengu, Tembisa, page 10: 15 October 2007).

During the interview, he explained the following: “Every time I see a black child denied an opportunity to go to school, my heart bleeds because I strongly believe that every child deserves a better education, for him/her to have a greater chance of taking themselves out of poverty. The fact that I could not do more in helping each and every black child to maximize his/her potential is still haunting me” (Mfengu, Tembisa, page 12: 15 October 2007).

“I would strongly argue that it is very important that we make sure that children are given a chance to explain why they behave in an unbecoming manner. Sometimes the fault is not of the child but of the education system. The education system should be based on love and respect. That is why, according to me, it is important to that education be in the hands of the church to promote correct moral standards at our schools. I believe that things change every now and then because the education system is no longer in the hands of God-fearing men and women of our land. Missionary education was replaced by Bantu Education and at some point in time the Bantu education was going to change. I am always willing to accept change and implement the new policy introduced but it must be based on sound ethical grounds. Bantu education should have been accepted as a stepping stone to a bright future but the exclusion of the role of the church did not help to promote social cohesion. It was clear from the beginning that there was no way in which Bantu education was not going to be implemented and the strategy could have been to use the imperfect Bantu Education to bring about equal education for all. Although haunted by the experiences of the past, I was always hopeful that this system comes to pass. If people cannot change them they must embrace them for their own growth and development” (Mfengu, Tembisa, paragraph 12: 15 October 2007).

2.18.7. Interview 7: Mrs. Sakati

Mrs. Sakati was a primary school teacher who worked for the Department of Education for many years. Due to her age, it was difficult to ascertain the number of years she worked for the department of Bantu Education. She was haunted by her experience as a teacher during the apartheid times. Teachers were discouraged from participating in the political activities. They were made to see themselves as important people in the community. She hated the manner in which she was handled by the department. When they started working they could not get the same salary as their male counterparts. She was still hurting and spoke with sense of anger and said: “Women were the most exploited people and treated with no respect by the education system. We were not expected to participate in the political activities of our time. But if you go to the church you would find women in majority and they are active and in fact they are the backbone of both society and the church. In many of the decisions taken, women were not consulted”.

Commenting on the refusal of some Black teachers to serve on the new school boards, Sakati said: “That was understandable because people were angry but that denied them and opportunity to exercise an influence on the direction and spirit of the education of their children” (Sakati, paragraph 9 page 9: 11 November 2008).

During the interview, she made mention of the following: “Many women were confused about what role the church can play in ensuring that schools remain in the hands of the church to control because of the issue of funds. Even if they were to stand strong and resist the handing over of the schools, how will they manage to finance them? As far as I am concerned, education was necessary for the African people to liberate themselves from the oppression of poverty” (Sakati page 10: 11 November 2008).

“The significant part I can mention about the importance of education is how it can help people to take charge of their destiny to lead people in their own countries. My own parents were illiterate but they always emphasized their wish of making sure that their children are educated. I always consider myself fortunate in that many African people did agree with my parents to educate women. During their time they associated education with power and for that reason according to them education was for males not females. My parents pointed out that women too should be empowered through

education for them to play a meaningful role in their communities. The fact that my parents were staunch members of the Anglican Church of Southern Africa contributed immensely to the way of my thinking and many people don't like critical thinking women" (Sakati page 10: 11 November 2008).

She also added the point that "Bantu education looked attractive from a distance because as far as possible it suggested that people were going to be divided according to the ethnic groups. All schools were forced to use the departmental syllabuses and were subject to the official inspection of the government (Sakati, page 11: 11 November 2008).

She related the following information, convinced that the church has an important role in the field of education: "Had the church been given an opportunity to help in the education crisis, it could have helped the department of education to make sure that the kind of education given to blacks made them not to want to be imitators of whites. The necessity of God-fearing leadership meant that the education system should give the necessary space to the church to play a meaningful role in the field of education. While it was important for Africans to develop and maintain their own language and culture, it was also important to do that with them contributing in the kind of education that suits their needs. The church failed to use the unhealthy state of education in the country to mobilise other churches to unite and challenge the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa (Sakati, Stanger, paragraph 12: 11 November 2008).

2.19. Conclusions

2.19.1. General observation

What worried most of the participants, were the political, social and economic motives behind Bantu education. According to all of the participants, the primary aim of Bantu education was to arrest the development of the African child and by so doing the child's full potential would be denied forever. The inferiority complex and lack of the necessary skills for modern society would make the African person depend on the white person's mercies for his/her survival. The difference they pointed out between mission education and Bantu education is that mission education was aimed at empowering and

liberating the African mind whereas the Bantu education was to enslave and oppress the African mind forever.

Although Kallaway (2002) highlights resources as one of the reasons why the churches thought it important to hand over their schools to the government, some of the participants do not believe that the issue of resources was the reason, because they believed that it was still possible for the churches to raise funds from their overseas sister churches as they were doing for many other mission projects. Bantu education left an indelible mark developmental life of the African child. Many African children found it difficult, if not totally impossible to have confidence in themselves. The majority of the participants said that the lack of resistance from the side of many churches was based on real financial constraints. This was the case even for affluent churches that had more financial resources than other churches. These constraints highlighted the amount of fiscal support churches would need if they were to take full control of the schools.

2.19.2. Transition from missionary to Bantu education

A point raised in the interviews concerned the transition from the missionary education system to the Bantu education system. Although this point was not specifically discussed with the participants as it was not the major focus of the study, according to Mr. Faku, this transition did present problems in the field of education as explained on the previous page.

Mrs. Grootboom is one person who was explicit about how much better she viewed the mission education: “Mission education was the best ever. If ever you become doubtful of the positive role played by the mission education, don’t go far, look at the leaders like Nelson Mandela, Oliver Tambo, Robert Sobukwe, Gatsha Buthelezi and many more, who contributed a lot in the development and liberation of the African people. Bantu education brought about many leaders leading without moral compass to lead people to the right direction, hence the great loss of what education is all about”.

2.19.3. The intention of Bantu education

The literature review in chapter two explained how Bantu education was started and how it was introduced in South Africa, based on the Eiselen report. No school remained unaffected by the introduction and implementation of Bantu education, starting from

primary, up to university level and including vocational training in the country. According to Hargreaves et al (1988:27), teachers involved in preparing and teaching courses of personal and social education have to face many problems in the course of their work - some of them quite fundamental. First, they must be able to handle controversial and sensitive subject matter in the classroom, deal with problems of bias, and avert the ever-present dangers and temptations of indoctrination. Second, in many cases they will constantly be involved in struggles to raise the status of their course and department, to secure recognition of its importance and worth among colleagues, pupils and parents.

Nogantshi and Grootboom raised this, pointing out that they were compelled by the Department of Education to teach an ideology which was aimed at indoctrinating the children and the community to accept that Bantu education was the best for an African child. In most cases they were to teach something they did not believe in. Education can be used by the politicians to advance their political agenda. The typical example is how Bantu education was introduced and implemented in South Africa, with its design to entrench the policy of separate development between white and black in South Africa.

The literature review and interviews clearly indicate two principles that were at the heart of Bantu education. First, is the designed inequality of opportunities between the blacks and whites in South Africa and second, is the use of education to work towards the realization of a racially divided society.

It is evident from the participants in this study that Bantu education was a complex system to deal with. Some churches thought it important for them to integrate whatever was suggested by the government into their education system. All the participants agreed that Bantu education was bad and mission education was far better in that it was empowering to African people. This could be argued differently by other people, based on their experiences of both Bantu education and mission education. For instance, as Mr. Faku reflected: “The introduction of Bantu education was a top-down approach from the side of the government in that the initiators of this new system of education were not giving people who were going to be affected by it an opportunity to participate from the inception up to the implementation. The initiators of this system unilaterally convinced themselves that Bantu education was the best solution to their problem”.

Mr. Ngoma put it this way: “It is clear to me that the critical control and management of schools by the churches was not in favour of how the apartheid system wanted to do education. The fact that churches were not made part and parcel of the transformation strategy by the government was not by default but by design”.

On her side, Mrs. Sakati mentioned the fact that the government made sure that the churches were made powerless and weak in the area of education. And this was well calculated on the part of the government. African education was transferred from mission managers to Bantu Local Authority’s Officers.

According to Mr. Mfengu, it was clear from the beginning, by the manner in which Bantu education was conceived, that it was designed to entrench black racial inferiority in a crude way. Mr. Nabe raised the point of how Bantu education was presented to the people. He said: The introduction of Bantu education was packaged well for some people not to see the poison inside it. The emphasis on culture and language made some people to think that Bantu education was the answer to their problems.

Mr. Nabe also emphasized the point that the introduction of Bantu education caused division among the African people themselves. Education was not talking to the African context of a communal life. The educated and the elite were treated differently whilst those illiterate and semi-skilled were seen to be less important and barbaric.

2.19.4. The churches’ response: A dilemma

Mr. Faku brought forward the following argument: “The churches were not consulted as the main stakeholder in the field of education by the initiators of Bantu education. It seems that all discussion about this new kind of education system was excluding the churches as the major players in the field of education. The churches themselves did not take any lead in either supporting or rejecting the Bantu education system imposed on them by the government. Maybe it is fair to say, according to my knowledge, denominations failed to unite and address the issue of Bantu education.

I can conclude by saying, as Mr. Faku, that the churches tried to play it safe by not challenging the government head on and bring about an alternative system of education.

Mr. Ngoma highlighted the fact that “the English-speaking churches were left with a difficult choice to make and that was either to accept the implementation of Bantu

education or refuse to hand over schools to the government. It could have been easier to say let us refuse government permission to take over schools - but how were they going to financially maintain them?”

Mrs. Sakati said: “Churches found themselves in a dilemma in that some wanted to resist the introduction and implementation of Bantu education by refusing to hand over their schools to the government but the biggest problem was the resources”.

According to Mr. Myoli, the government saw the role of the church to be a devotional one, and that they should pray for those in authority. The irony was that their prayers should ask God to continue to bless the government to continue with its noble task of ensuring that African people are excluded in any form of development aimed at growing the economy of the land.

Mr. Nogantshi puts it this way: “Of course the introduction and implementation of Bantu education was not received with open arms by the churches in South Africa. It was bad news in that it was touching one of the sensitive nerves such as education. To let go of what people are used to doing is not easy. To be told without convincing reasons to leave what you think you know best is always a challenge in life”.

2.19.5. Limited resources

Mr. Ngoma argued the point that churches were not in a position to finance schools because they depended on the government to maintain their schools.

According to Mrs. Sakati, churches would not resist the introduction and implementation of Bantu education based on the fact that they were faced with a problem of resources. She emphasized the point that churches by their nature are economically weak, hence sometimes they are rendered voiceless.

Mr. Mfengu says: “It was clear from the beginning that the churches were not adequately prepared for the introduction and implementation of the Bantu education system in South Africa. The government knew from the beginning that the church would have to work hard for it to be economically prepared for a huge responsibility of running schools efficiently. The fact that churches were economically weak and voiceless is working to the advantage of the government and its agenda”.

Mr. Nabe talked of the issue of under-qualified teachers and overcrowding at schools as a cause for concern. He further argued the point that the problem of the churches at that time was their being inability to introduce a tax system within the churches to help fund education.

2.19.6. Resistance

Having spoken to the participants, it will be unfair to suggest that churches did not attempt to do anything to resist the introduction and implementation of Bantu education system in South Africa. For instance, Mr. Nabe pointed out individuals like Dr. Nkomo from the Methodist Church in the Transvaal synod, who highlighted the dangers of accepting the introduction and implementation of Bantu education. The voices of those who were against Bantu education were not carried forward by the formal structures of the church as a collective. That meant some churches challenged the government as individual churches.

Unlike the 1970 students or pupils, the pupils during the introduction and implementation period did not see themselves defying both their parents and the government by acting against the implementation of Bantu education. Mrs. Grootboom emphasized the point that Bantu education managed to penetrate the emotions of all concerned, both those in authority and the learners. There were many people who were dropouts because it was the kind of system that did not encourage a black child to take the advantage of education with two hands. In some instances, according to Mr. Ngoma, many black parents discouraged their children from going to school and sent them to look after their cattle instead.

The data collected suggest that there was no coordination or talk between those involved in education and the churches, so that they could debate the pros and cons of the introduction of the new education system. In fact, Mr. Mfengu comments that “the white authorities sat down in their little corner called parliament to decide the fate of the African people with no audacity to check the feeling of those the education was directed to”.

Mr. Nabe laments the fact that the churches did not seem to take the effects of this new system of education seriously. The churches did not struggle enough to push the

government to see it important to sit down with churches to discuss the transition from the missionary education to the new system of Bantu education in South Africa.

This raises some questions as to how the Bantu education in South Africa could be understood as legitimate from the perspective of the Christian scriptures. Mr. Nabe pointed out that although the National Party government claimed to be a Christian government, it did not take the churches seriously. Rather, it was threatened by the role they played in the field of education because it produced critical thinkers. The only church they were comfortable with was the Dutch Reformed Church which gave them the theological rationale for their actions under the apartheid system.

Judging from the data and findings demonstrated from this study, it is clear that the English-speaking churches made an effort to impact the introduction and implementation of Bantu education, by creating space for debates in their synods and conferences to talk about the mood of the people in the country in relation to how they viewed the introduction of Bantu education. Again that was not giving the ordinary members of their church to share their views because the conferences and synods were attended by leaders. However, their actions could not lead to the non-implementation of the Bantu Education Act. It seems their biggest dilemma was how best they could resist the implementation of the Bantu education system without promoting civil disobedience and anarchy in the country. Empirical research gathered from the participants in this study indicates that English-speaking churches did not want to risk their relationship with the government by acting openly against the state in the field of education.

Most of the churches agreed that the core of Bantu education was racist and aimed at excluding the African people from the mainstream of economic activity, ensuring they would remain inferior and labourers for the rest of their lives. The voices of the participants indicated that the churches did not do enough to resist the implementation of the Bantu education system, let alone think of an alternative form of education to counteract the Bantu education system.

3. BANTU EDUCATION

3.1. The Origins of Bantu Education

The origins and implementation of Bantu Education has attracted considerable scholarly attention since its introduction in 1953 (Comaroff 1996:13). We can never exhaust the number of written sources on the issue. This chapter draws mainly from the Eiselen Commission Report and Dr H.F. Verwoerd's addresses in the white parliament. The researcher also explores the literature available on the Bantu Education Act and its implementation. The chapter concludes with an assessment of the relationship between Bantu Education and the apartheid system.

When the settlers arrived from Europe, they brought with them a culture that was completely alien to that which already existed in the country. Black youth were educated by their family groups or through initiation schools to equip them for life in a non-Western pre-industrial African society. There was neither foundation in the local culture on which Western methods of learning could be based nor it considered necessary for the slave-type of labour required of the local people (Piere, 2002:44)

In South Africa the apartheid policy included separate schools for whites, coloureds, Indians and Africans. These schools were the responsibility of the government. Separate Departments of Education was established with different public examinations for each group. Prior to this time, African education was conducted mainly in mission schools.

The education of African children was directed at preparing them for what was considered to be their role in life. (Piere 2002:42)

In 1956 there was an official decision that the mother-tongue teaching would be implemented in junior and senior secondary schools for non- examination subjects, but that Form 1 (aged 13/14) half the examination subjects should be taught through the medium of English and the other half through the medium of Afrikaans (Piere 2002 : 49).

The Afrikaners viewed themselves to be a pure race which needed to maintain its purity by racial segregation. The policy of apartheid was geared towards establishing their own Afrikaner identity and removing other groups either geographically or culturally from

them. To that effect, they needed to control other groups. A reinforcing mechanism to the ideology of apartheid was the Calvinist religion in its most severe form, adding the divine touch of the predestination of the chosen people to Afrikaner cultural identity (Kallaway 1984:161).

According to C.T. Loram, who was an American doctoral graduate of Columbia University, inspector of schools in Natal, and a member of a special commission appointed to investigate Native training colleges (Loram 1917: xi –xii), the answer to the so-called Native Question lay in their education by the dominant whites. Loram (1917:1) argued that whites must help the Native to help them. “Common sense as well as experience from America would advise us to make use of the Native himself in any attempts to solve the Native problem” (Loram 1917:3). Loram (1917:4) explained that it is advantageous to educate Natives to improve their moral, school and economic status.

The apartheid system of governance in South Africa grew from a history of colonial rule and was largely aimed at securing rights and privileges for white people at the expense of other race groups (Adonis, 2008 Beinant & Dubow, 1995).

Under the apartheid government, ‘non-whites’ (i.e. Blacks, Coloureds, Indians and Asians) were deprived of their basic human rights through the systematic implementation of a series restrictive legislation such as Bantu Education Act of 1953.

The principle which is at the heart of education that the primary right and responsibility for a child’s education rests with his/her parents was violated by the Bantu education based on a racial policy. By virtue of being black, coloured, Indian and Asian it meant you could not share the same classroom with counterparts (Beinant, W. & Dubow, S 1995:24-25).

The introduction of Bantu education was an indication that the state has a monopoly of education and it can turn the school and teachers into mere instruments for its policies. This means that the state can use education as a vehicle for the dissemination of ideas it approves and again it can be used as means for exclusion of the young minds of which it disapproves.

The Dutch settlers brought with them to the Cape a tradition of religious education. The ecclesiastical authorities took steps to ensure that all teachers were loyal to the Church,

and doctrinally sound. Although the Christian church was divided at the reformation, the notion that education should be administered by the church persisted until well into the nineteenth century. Education provision in South Africa was on a small scale until well into the second half of the nineteenth century. Such formal schooling as was available was mainly religious and under the direct control of the churches though there committees given the responsibility of handling the management of day to day running of schools like the school governing bodies. The idea of the secular schools was mooted by De Mist at the beginning of the nineteenth century.

The South African people who came to settle in South Africa from Netherlands, France, England and Germany played an important role and believe profoundly in education. Their deep religious convictions, love of freedom and desire for independence have had great effects upon their social and political growth; these formed, too, the foundations for the education. In addition, local participation by the parents had begun to emerge. A pattern of state-controlled education began to evolve at the Cape and by 1839 a Superintendent-General of Public Education was appointed.

In 1909, the provinces were given the control of education. It should be remembered that when the four self-governing colonies came together to form the Union of South Africa, each had an established system of education, their concern being mainly with primary and secondary education and teacher-training (Macmillan 1971:7)

Christian missionaries first opened schools for Africans and first trained African teachers. The great majority of African schools and almost all African teacher-training colleges were under missionary management. That was all to be changed under the Bantu Education Act of 1953.

It is clear to the researcher that the intention and effect of the Act was to break dual-control (of government and mission authorities) and to separate African education from European education. The essence of Bantu education was the need or more practical and less academic education for Africans as thought out by the Native Affairs Minister Dr. Verwoerd.

Modern education as we know it today may claim its beginnings in the fourth century *Monastic Schools*. The Monastic School developed the first rational curriculum which together with theological studies included the seven liberal arts which were divided into two main groupings: The Trivium, comprising grammar, rhetoric and dialectic; and the

Quadrivium, comprising arithmetic, geometry, astronomy and music (Mugambi 1989:81).

Bantu education is described as having an oppressive element in it as it was meant for a certain racial group. From its inception it brought about a “certain of violence and resistance”. The creation of such a culture is attributed to the country’s turbulent history specifically, apartheid and the struggle against this oppressive system (Boonzaire, 2005, Britton 2006, du Toit, 2001,).

3.2. Why educate the “Native”?

According to Loram, before the coming of a white man the education of the South African Native consisted in his adjustment to the narrow environment of his tribe through direct imitation of elders. With the coming of the white man, an entirely new environment was created, and the Native’s response to this new situation has been a gradual absorption through imitation of as much of the new as he could comprehend (Loram 1917:28). It is clear that one of the reasons for the white man to want to see the black man educated was to improve communication so that when they wanted to send them to the storekeeper they could buy, as well as be employed on the farm, in the mine or factory. Loram (1917:30) puts it well when he said “We have made homes in South Africa, and we need the Natives for work in the house, the shop, the mine and on the farms”.

Loram raises this other important point about the motivation for educating the Native:

A further reason why we Europeans should educate the Natives is because it is through our coming to South Africa that formal education has been necessary. We have introduced a new European environment to which the Native must adjust himself. For an example we have introduced an economic system in which the uneducated Native is at a serious disadvantage. The danger of the exploitation of the ignorant Native by the unscrupulous educated European or Native is very great (Loram 1917:31).

Mathonsi argues that it is clear from the ‘aims and objectives’ of the Christian National Education and the Eiselen Commission that the victory of the National Party can be seen as the signal for the introduction of a racist system in South Africa. The racist conviction of the National Party was stated clearly by Dr H.F. Verwoerd, when he was

the Minister of Native Affairs and advocated “the formulation of the principles and aims of education for Natives as an independent race...” And he repeatedly urged that Bantu Education should be an integral part of a policy of the socio-economic development of the Bantu peoples (Bantu Education Policy Document presented on the 7th June 1954:5).

Since the passing of the Bantu Education Act of 1953, much has been said and written about the new system of education for the South African Bantu, of which the Act was the necessary forerunner. Not all the comment has been based upon knowledge of the facts. The first school for the South African Bantu was established by Dr Johannes Theodosius van der Kemp after he visited Gaika’s Great Place on the Tyumie River in the Eastern Cape in 1799. He started a small school in the chief’s territory, apparently near the present site of King Williamstown. In 1821, a school for Natives was opened in the Tyumie Valley by agents of the Glasgow Missionary Society. Some years later the mission was renamed Lovedale, and by 1841 it had developed into a ‘Seminary’. Throughout the nineteenth century, educational work in the Cape was mainly the responsibility of the various missionary societies, chiefly English-speaking societies, although under the first Superintendent-General for Education of the Cape, Mr J. Rose-Innes, regulations were laid down in 1841 regarding the conditions under which grants in aid of mission schools could be payable. The early 1930’s saw very difficult times for the education of the Bantu, owing to the financial difficulties of those days. However the Welsh Inter-departmental Commission of 1935-36 recommended the inevitable, the transfer of the administration of the Bantu education from the provinces to the Central Government. It was clear, therefore, after the second successive general elections victory of the Nationalists in 1953, and following the publication of the report of the Eiselen Commission (1949-51), that legislation would be introduced to change the existing system of administering Bantu education. Since the general domestic policy of the government was one of the separate developments, education system was made to fulfil the political agenda. It was clear from the beginning that the white education will never be under the Native Affairs Department.

We have seen from the above-mentioned statement that the government of the day decided to institute Bantu education as an ideological state apparatus to make sure that black people remain perpetual learners for the rest of their lives, and white people, by virtue of being white, remain perpetual teachers forever. It was the form of education designed to confine Africans to certain forms of labour and was used to indoctrinate

blacks to psychologically accept the status of being inferior by nature. It was clear that motivations, conditions and attitudes that led to the introduction of Bantu education were not necessarily educational in nature.

3.3. Centralisation of Bantu Education

The original and idealised version of apartheid, a pipe-dream of separate but equal opportunities, envisioned the territorial, economic, cultural and political separation of South Africa's ethnic groups. The long established economic integration of the races was to be reversed so as to protect the Afrikaner nation from dependence on black labour and the inevitable political challenge that would follow. Africans were to be turned out to the thirteen per cent of the country allocated to them, their reserves or Bantustans. Whites would retain control of eighty seven per cent of the land, including the metropolitan areas of Johannesburg, Durban, Cape Town, Port Elizabeth, Bloemfontein, East London and the country's lesser industrial centres (Walshe 1983:3).

3.4. Report of the Eiselen Commission

When the Nationalists came into power in 1948, they found themselves committed for the time being to the administration of the Native Education Finance Act which had been introduced by the Rt. Hon. J.H. Hofmeyr in 1945. In January 1949, the government appointed a commission on the Native education, under the chairmanship of Dr W.W.M Eiselen with the following terms of reference:

The formulation of the principles and aims of education for Natives as an independent race, in which their past and present, their inherent racial qualities, their distinctive characterises and aptitude their needs under and ever-changing social conditions are taken into consideration (Horrell 1968: 4).

The schools were important to the churches in that they provided a vehicle for spreading the gospel and of drawing members into the church. According to White (1993:33), educational control is one of the chief agents of social engineering. Milnerite policy, following the South African war of 1899-1902, had attempted to anglicise the education of the Afrikaner so as to produce a people embedded in English culture. When D.F. Malan's National Party won the general election on the 26 May 1948, one of its first actions was to appoint a commission to investigate a new direction for African

education along the segregated lines of the apartheid philosophy (White 1993:34). The first was the appointment of the famous Commission of Enquiry into Native Education (generally known as the Eiselen Commission); the subsequent step was the publication of the Eiselen Commission report, and last the promulgation of the Bantu Education Act of 1953.

According to Hodne (1997:153) the Eiselen Commission on Native Education's first task was to find an answer to the question "Why Bantu education?" The commission stated that "no evidence of decisive nature was deduced to show that as a group of the Bantu could not benefit from education or that their intelligence aptitudes were of special and peculiar nature as to demand on these grounds a special type of education. This is a positive expression of the ability of the Bantu on the work of the Commission (Native Education Report, 1949-1951:772). The commission emphasized that educational practice must recognise and consider that it has to deal with a child, and that this child is trained and conditioned in Bantu culture, endowed with a knowledge of the Bantu language and imbued with values, interests and behaviour patterns learned from its mother (Hodne 1997:154)

3.5. Recommendations by the Eiselen Commission

We must never lose sight of the fact that the main motive behind the formation of the Eiselen commission was to entrench the apartheid system's goal of ensuring that the African people's educational development is arrested so that they remain inferior and servants of their white masters for the rest of their lives. It was in January 1949, when a commission on Native Education was appointed, which was headed by Dr. W.W.M. Eiselen its terms of reference were:

- a. The formulation of the principles and aims of education for Natives as an independent race, in which their past and present, their inherent racial qualities, their distinctive characteristics and aptitudes, and their needs in ever-changing social conditions are taken into consideration.
- b. Determining the extent to which the existing primary, secondary and vocational education system for Natives and the training of Native teachers should be modified in respect to the content and form of syllabuses, in order to conform to

the proposed principles and aims and to prepare Natives more effectively for their future occupations.

- c. The organization and administration of the various branches of Native education.
- d. Determining the basis on which such education should be financed.
- e. Such other aspects of Native education as may be related to the preceding (Horrell 1964:4)

According to White (1993:35), the background and main findings of the Eiselen report need to be traced in order to place the Bantu Education Act in its historical context. Furthermore, the Eiselen report is one of the most important and controversial documents to ever come out of the country, the consequences of which will long be felt in the educational and social spheres of the nation. And it was to give rise to the infamous Bantu Education Act No.47 of 1953.

Eiselen's document was something of an anomaly, however, as he was both scornful of liberal thought and unimpressed by the scientific findings on the educability of the Africans. The theory of "arrested development" has already been discussed, and its importance must not be ignored in any debate on the education of Black South Africans (White 1993:36). There was a general belief that an African was inherently inferior to the White.

From the interviews conducted and books read it is clear that the introduction of Bantu Education saw mission education being destroyed by the National Party of Dr. Malan for ideological reasons. The hard work and positive impact made by mission education (not suggesting that it was perfect) on the black child in particular, was not appreciated by the leaders of the then government. One of the problems was the fact that education was funded by the government but in the hands of the mission churches. One's main conclusion was that the financial provision by the state was always very far from adequate. Between 1925 and 1943, an increasing proportion of these taxes were devoted to education but it was only in 1945, when African education became a direct charge on the consolidated Revenue Fund, that there were possibilities of real advances (Horrell 1964:1). The alternative the church ought to have been thinking about at that time was a liberating education system to counter act the Bantu education.

South Africa has a long history of mission schooling and for many years mission schools promoted self-confidence, human values and civilization with Africans. Many African families took the initiative to send their children to mission schools, believing that they were serving their bright future. Duncan (2003:181) comes to a conclusion that consequently the missionaries in education aligned themselves with liberal politicians to promote the concept of Christian trusteeship which aimed to offer a form of protection to black people; a system which would maintain their power over them while appearing to care for their interests. He further argues the point that the churches played a formative role in political resistance; not surprising, for the churches provided one of the few means of free expression in an otherwise increasingly restrictive society. It was partly out of this context, beginning in the 1880s, that political innovation emerged. Resistance to missionary influence was one of the factors that led black South Africans to look further afield for educational opportunities (Duncan 2003: 304-305). The mission schools were mainly available to a relatively privileged class of Africans. Some working class members saw mission education as the only means by which to create better opportunities for themselves in later life.

3.6. Funding for an African Child

Spending on African education remained insignificant compared to white schooling (Matthews & Wilson 1981:33). We now examine the recommendations presented by the Eiselen Commission. The commission recommended that there should be a Bantu Education Account which would be made up as follows:

- A fixed amount of R 13,000,000 a year from the general revenue account.
- A fraction of four-fifths of the general tax paid by Africans.
- Such money as parliament might make available in the form of recoverable advances, to meet any deficit in the Bantu education account.
- Receipts arising from maintenance, management and control of government Bantu education schools other than receipts arising from the sale of land buildings.
- Any monies which might accrue to the Bantu Education Account from any other source.

The Extension of University Education Amendments Act, No.32 of 1960, provided that moneys required for capital expenditure in connection with Bantu universities and colleges might be advanced by the loan account to the Bantu Education (Horrell 1968:19).

Funding was found to be the central reason for not resisting the implementation of Bantu education for instance the foremost Methodist institution, Healdtown, received a letter in 1949 from the Standard Bank requesting a copy of its income and expenditure accounts, and expressing concern at its overdraft with the bank of \$11,838 (Cory Library Rhodes University MS16598 Healdtown Institution Papers. File 5 Administrative Records 1923-76. Standard Bank to Rev Grant (Headmaster), 16 July 1949).

3.7. Racial Divide in Mission Education

Gathering from the participants reflections presented to the researcher during interviews and subsequent views on education during their life time, one noticed the growing radicalism of African teachers in the 1940's, undoubtedly a manifestation of the wider political struggles of their time. According to Mr. Ngoma, one of the participants in this study, it was a reflection of the influence that graduated from Fort Hare had on the teaching profession. By 1948, the African elite were just beginning to define the new role for itself in society and their new views on African education. For quite a number of years, the National Party government would strive to suppress the voice of the African people. That regime made sure that Africans were losing confidence in themselves to do anything positive in their own country. Mr. Ngoma emphasized the fact that the years of the Bantu Education Act were the most oppressive years ever experienced by Africans in South Africa. Pass laws were tightened; forced removals were frequent; bi-racial marriages and bi-racial sex was outlawed; political parties were suppressed; African political representation was eliminated; and African education was transformed into Bantu education, a system designed to maintain the inferiority of the African population (Ngoma 24 June 2007).

Mr. Ngoma concurred with a number of sources consulted during the time of this study when he emphasized the point that at the end of 1949, the government, with D.F. Malan as the Prime Minister, was moving toward a massive reshaping of education. Mr.

Ngoma referred to the instituting of the Eiselen Commission in 1951 and its recommendations of a differentiated curriculum for African children.

The Eiselen Commission recommended that all types of post matriculation training should be planned in conjunction with the department schemes. For this reason, the subsidization of institutes providing such training for Africans should be controlled by the Department of Bantu Education and not hitherto, by the Department of Education, Arts and Science. Bantu should be allowed to attend “white” institutions only to study such subjects as were temporarily not provided at their own institution. The national conference which considered the report stated that it could not press too strongly against these recommendations (Horrell 1968:15). The introduction of Bantu education as official policy in 1954 marked the end of an era in African education. Before then, the education of Africans was provided in mission schools, established under the auspices of the different Christian denominations.

The victory of the National Party in 1948 meant the ascendance to political power of a combination of white workers, petit bourgeoisie and farmers, bound together by an African nationalist ideology. In addition, the National Party propounded a strong segregation ideology based on cultural differences and racial inferiority. The principle effect of the Bantu Education Act of 1953 was that black education was brought under state control. Although this measure had been suggested by the 1936 interdepartmental committee, it was not adopted by the previous government. The Eiselen Commission report stressed that a planned centrally controlled schooling system for blacks should be an important element in the overall development of South Africa, and in particular in ensuring its labour needs. The provisions of the Bantu Education Act leave little doubt that central control was to be the springboard for educational policies to contribute towards the reproduction of the black labour in a stable form (Kallaway 1984:171). Kallaway (1984), White (1993), and Horrell (1968) all agree that the introduction of Bantu education stressed cultural differences between black and white, and the development of a separated black community in which black aspirations could be raised. The Bantu education system would thus be able to prepare black people to accept differences as part of the unchallenged order.

Before the introduction of Bantu education system, black schools were not perfect in that they were poorly-staffed and teachers were under qualified. Mission schools in particular relied on white teachers as an important source of staffing. Overall there was

a marked deterioration in the qualification levels of teachers under Bantu education. Together with an increase in teachers without matriculation came a significant reduction of professionally qualified teachers with university degrees in comparison with the pre-1953 period (Kallaway 1984:178-9).

3.8. Dr Verwoerd's speech and presentation

One of the primary documents of the Bantu Education policy was the document called 'Bantu Education Policy for the Immediate Future', a statement made by The Hon. Dr H.F. Verwoerd, Minister of Native Affairs, in the Senate of the Parliament of the Union of South Africa, 7th June, 1954. In his document, Dr Verwoerd argued that the schools were started as mission or church schools. This was also the case in other countries but in those other countries it was a national church or at least a Christian church which served a Christian community. In South Africa, the Natives, who, according to him 'remain to a great extent a heathen community', were served by a large variety of churches while the Christian section of the Native community had been split up into numerous denominations and sects, and the following consequences were unavoidable:

There was no co-ordination of the interests of the schools with those of the community, and there was no coordination between the education given in the schools and the broad national policy. From the nature of things, the natural development from mission schools to community schools could not take place. Further he argued that there were defects of Native education under the old system.

Under the system of mission schools, the schools:

- could not serve the communities nor could they harness their energies, and
- they were unsympathetic to the country's policy;
- control by the Provincial Administration was ineffective because it could not co-ordinate the schools with other development services, it could bring no uniformity into the schools consistent with the policy of the country, and the provinces had no direct financial stake in the schools;
- a sound pedagogic maxim was sacrificed when there was a deviation from the principle laid down by the establishment of the Native Development Account

(1925) under which a direct contribution from the Natives was required in order to earn a subsidy from the State;

- the curriculum (to a certain extent) and educational practice, by ignoring the segregation or “apartheid” policy, was unable to prepare for service within the Bantu community.

Dr Verwoerd further argued that by blindly producing pupils trained according to a European model, the vain hope was created among Natives that they could occupy posts within the European community despite the country’s policy of “apartheid”. This is what is meant by the creation of unhealthy “White collar ideals” and the cause of widespread frustration among the so-called educated Natives.

For us to venture into the Bantu education we must remind ourselves of the general objectives of the Bantu Education Act. The general aims of the Bantu Education Act are to remedy the difficulties I have mentioned by transforming education for Natives into Bantu education, to transform a service which benefits only a section of the Bantu population and consequently results in alienation and division within the community, into a general service which will help in the development of the Bantu community as a whole (Verwoerd 1954:5-7).

Two other primary sources used in this study are the bulletins of 1957 and 1959. The bulletin of 1957 under the heading ‘the division of Bantu Education under the Department of Native Affairs’ raised several points:

In terms of the Bantu Act (Act No. 47 of 1953), control of the former Native Education services previously rendered by the Provincial Administrations was transferred to the Central Government in 1954. The Department of Native Affairs assumed responsibility and a Division of Bantu Education under that Department was established. The Division of Bantu Education provided, and exercised control over the following educational services:

- Lower and Higher Primary Education
- Secondary Education
- Teacher training at secondary level as well as post matric training
- Vocational training

- Night schools and continuation classes

The above-mentioned educational services were provided at the following types of schools:

- **Government Bantu Schools** - These schools were under the direct control and administration of the Department and were mainly concerned with teacher training and vocational training. They also included a few other schools situated on the government property.
- **Community Schools** - Community schools were financed by the State but were placed under the local control of a Bantu School Committee consisting of 7 members elected or appointed from amongst the parents. A number of community schools in a given of a particular language group, and with common interests, fell under the local administration and control of a Bantu School Board. Committees and School Boards were statutory bodies which functioned in terms of regulations promulgated in 1955. Each School Board had either a part-time or full-time Bantu secretary who was paid by the Department. Details concerning the existing schools boards appear in part four of this bulletin.
- **Farm Schools** - This type of school existed only on farms belonging to Europeans and where it could be shown that the farm was used for farming purposes.
- **Mine and Factory Schools** were established by the owners of the mines or factory concerned with the approval of the Department. This type of schools had to be on land belonging to the owners and they were intended for children of bona fide Bantu employees of the mine or the factory. Owners were expected to erect the building at their own expense. Where, at the request of the Department, the school enrolled other children, the owner could apply for the payment of a rent grant. The School was financed by the State in regard to teachers and other usual allowances.
- **Unsubsidized Private Schools** - There were a number of private schools in each region; these schools were registered with the Department but received no subsidy. Private schools included the remaining mission schools (mainly Roman Catholic Church Schools). There were also private community schools established by a particular community in anticipation of receiving state subsidy. All private schools were maintained and controlled by the owners.

- **Scheduled Schools** included a small number of schools which for some reason or other had not been classified, e.g., SANTA and hospital schools, and which for purposes of administration were managed by approved bodies or persons.

It is impossible to speak about Bantu Education without speaking about the apartheid system in South Africa. Dr Verwoerd, who became Prime Minister of South Africa in 1958, and who was widely regarded as a key architect of apartheid, gave an early definition in a speech he made in the South African Senate in September 1948. In his speech justifying the introduction of Apartheid system Dr Verwoerd pointed out the following:

Europeans and non-Europeans in recent years have been working up to a crisis. Ten, twenty, thirty years ago we did not know points of dispute in every field of life as we know them now. It was under the policy of the previous Government that we saw more and more trouble blowing up, clashes in the towns, crimes, and the creation of all sorts of hamlets on the borders of the towns full of poverty and misery, clashes on the trains, assaults on women (Perry & Perry 1992:33).

From the clear evidence provided, the researcher agrees with le Roux (1994:125) when he says that the education of “the black child in crisis” is always “culture bound”. This means that each group of people transmits its own culture via education. On the other hand, education is also acquired informally, through the family and the home environment and social contacts revolving around that family and its environment. Education is the process by which a human being is changed from what he or she is to something those in authority wish him or her to be. The African home, the village, the elders, the political officer, the trader, the church, the hospital, the mine are all factors with which the school as the chief educating agency must take into account. Education is liberal in nature because it aims at liberating the mind from the constraints of mediocrity. The schools were started as mission or church schools. According to the Hon. Dr H.F. Verwoerd, Minister of Native Affairs, there was no co-ordination between the education given in the schools and the broad national policy. From the nature of things, the natural development from mission school to community school could not take place.

3.9. Implementation of Bantu Education

There is a great deal of evidence in the literature to show how Bantu education was introduced and implemented in South Africa. The Bantu education required black people to surrender their potential to become great leaders in the areas of science and the economy and to become semi-skilled or general labourers. Findings from this study showed that all beneficiaries of the Bantu education system were expected to absorb the beliefs, culture and value system of their communities. Their interaction with the white culture was to be on the basis of them offering their cheap labour.

Carrim (2002) and Van Heerden (1998) respectively note that assimilation meant that only black learners were expected to make radical reductions to their culture and their language-use patterns so that they could be absorbed into their new schools and so that the historical and cultural status quo of previously all-white schools could be kept intact.

One of the participants Mr. Myoli emphasized the point that many teachers were made to teach in Afrikaans, which was their third language. In fact, they were not adequately prepared to speak and comprehend the language before they could use it as a medium of instruction. Language could also be used as a vehicle for advancing the aims of Bantu education, as we have seen it done in the process of implementing Bantu education in South Africa. While the teachers were concerned about offering what the government called appropriate education for a black child, they would ultimately allow themselves to be enculturated into the dominant white culture. In other words, they ended up being instruments of the apartheid government to indoctrinate the black mind into allowing them to be participants in their oppression and exploitation. This system of education was aimed at making sure that black learners would accept the fact that white learners had been there before them as a superior race. The black child must despise who she or he is and want to like whites in every respect. Many black learners ended up succumbing to some extent into accepting that white people are superior to them.

There was a great deal of mistrust between the African teachers and the Development of Education. The discriminatory practices and wage disparities were a cause of political instability in the field of education. The disgruntled teachers played an important role in political influence in their teaching profession and influenced a number of students to open their eyes to the political discrimination taking place in the country.

3.10. Management of Bantu schools

The participants in this study were in agreement with the report written by Horne (1997) on his findings about the management of Bantu schools. In his report, he referred to a letter from the Department of Native Education, dated the 9th of February 1955, thanking the churches for their response in affirmative to the circular dated the 2nd August 1954:

The department wishes to thank all the churches and missionary bodies that have responded to its circular of the 2nd August 1954, dealing with the transfer of control of primary and secondary schools to Bantu community organizations.

The Department showed appreciation to the protestant churches and missionary bodies for the generous measure of co-operation. This was shown in their almost unanimous decision to make their classrooms available for further use, in some cases at a reasonable or nominal rental, in other cases free of charge, after they have relinquished control to Bantu school committees or boards.

The importance and value of this decision for the Bantu people cannot be over-stressed, for it affected 99 per cent of the schools that previously came under the management of Protestant church bodies, approximately 5000 schools altogether, both urban and rural.

The Department of education came to the conclusion that the state should assume full control over Bantu Education, and that it should be the responsibility of the Union Government, on condition that there was proper co-ordination, and based on the Christian foundation laid by the churches. The primary, secondary and vocational education should fully qualify the Bantu for service among their own people (Horne 1997:189).

Before 1954 the arrangements for the administration of African education were complicated, control being divided between the state, the provincial administrations, missionary societies, and the people themselves. But the Bantu Education Act of 1953 provided for the control to be transferred by the then Department of Native Affairs, a division of Bantu Education being created within this department. In 1958 the division became the separated Department of Bantu Education.

After 1954 the subsidies that had been paid to mission and other private schools were progressively reduced and were no longer paid after 1957. Most of the churches, in consequence, were forced to sell or rent their schools to the department. The Roman Catholic church launched an appeal for funds to enable it to retain some of its schools as private, unsubsidized institutions, but the members of these schools had decreased, partly because of shortage of funds and partly because some of the buildings were situated in areas that were subsequently zoned for whites only under the Group Areas Act, or were in a black spot from which the African people were removed. In 1955, the control of technical and vocational education for Africans was transferred from provinces to the central government.

The University College of Fort Hare Transfer Act of 1959 transferred control of this college from its governing body to the Bantu education department. In terms of the Extension of University Education Act of 1959, two new university colleges were established for Africans, near Pietersburg and Empangeni respectively, and Africans were barred from attending the previously open universities unless with special ministerial approval (Horrell 1969:120). Until university apartheid was introduced, non-white students could attend the open universities of Cape Town and the Witwatersrand, where a proactive stance of “academic non-segregation” was followed. They could enrol at the University of Natal in segregated classes, but, whenever possible, with the same staff as taught the white students. Or they could attend the non-white university college of Fort Hare. The University of Rhodes occasionally admitted an African who wanted to attend a post graduate course that was not available at Fort Hare. Africans also could study by means of correspondence courses provided by the University of South Africa. Before the Nationalist government came into power, the establishment of a medical school for non-whites had been planned, to be situated in Durban under the control of the University of Natal (Horrell 1968:14-15).

For Bantu education to be introduced and practically implemented, the government thought it wise to appoint a commission to investigate and report. In 1953 the government appointed the Holloway Commission to “investigate and report on the practicability and financial implications of providing separate training facilities for non-Europeans of universities”. The desirability of such separate facilities was not included in the terms of reference. The Holloway Commission’s report was published in duplicated form in February 1955. Mainly for financial reasons, the commission

rejected suggestions that new universities for non-whites only should be established in the near future. It suggested that if segregation were desired, the most feasible scheme would be to concentrate African and Asian undergraduate students as far as possible at Durban and Fort Hare (Horrell 1968:16).

3.11. Impact on mission schools

The introduction of the Bantu Education Act saw many mission churches losing control of their schools to the Department of Education of the government of the day. On 2 August 1954, the secretary for Native Affairs sent a letter to all those conducting teacher training institutions (the very large majority were run by missions) saying it had been decided that the training of all teachers for state and state-aided schools should be conducted in Departmental training institutions only. Those running such schools might choose one of the following courses of action:

- To rent or sell their schools and hostels to the Department, or
- To rent or sell their schools, while retaining the hostels on a subsidized basis, or
- To close the teacher training school and instead conduct a primary or secondary school (Horrell 1964:20).

Another letter was sent on the same day to all superintendents or managers of state-aided missions schools. They were asked to inform the secretary of Native Affairs by the end of 1954 whether they wished:

- To retain control of the schools as aided institutions with the subsidy reduced of 75 per cent of the salaries and cost of living allowances of approved teachers, or
- To retain control of the schools or hostels under their care as private, unaided institutions or
- To relinquish control of them to Bantu community organizations.

Even if a mission school decided to retain control of their schools the minister might later, in his discretion, decide that the school should be transferred to a Bantu community organization. Any arrangements made in regards to schools in white areas would be subjected the provisions of the Group Areas Act (Horrell 1964:21).

Horrell (1964:22) noted the following as the response of the churches to the introduction of the Bantu Education Act. The synod of the Dutch Reformed Churches response was that it was a natural development that the state should accept the responsibility for the control of Bantu Education. They motivated their point but highlighted that there was nothing in the Government's education policy which necessarily conflicted with recognized Christian principles. The Synod Commission welcomed the opportunity which had been created for Africans themselves to accept responsibility for the education and rearing of their children, the opportunity the church still had of retaining some of its institutions on certain conditions the prospect of the expansion of educational facilities, and the assurance that there would now be a Union wide policy.

When the government decided to take more active interest in education it is significant that it did so for political rather than education or social reasons. Free State schools were the first schools to be established in South Africa in the 1820's as part of Governor Somerset's plan for Anglicizing the predominantly Dutch population of the Cape. Six teachers selected by the British government, opened free schools in 1822 in Graaff-Reinet, Uitenhage, George, Stellenbosch and Caledon 'for the purpose of facilitating the requirement of the English language to all classes of colonists (Rose, B. and Tunner, R 1975:97).

The Christian Council of South Africa, (CCSA) presently known as the South African Council of Churches (SACC) convened a special meeting in May 1954 which was attended by delegates from all larger churches and missionary societies in South Africa, except the Catholic Church and the Dutch Reformed churches, which were not members of the Christian Council. However, both Catholic Church and Dutch Reformed churches sent their observers to that gathering. While the meeting conceded that the provision of education was the prime duty of the state, and that it was beyond the resources of the churches to educate all African children, it stated that in view of the unaffordable fees and the results thereof - that 60 per cent of these children were still not in school - it was difficult to understand why, apart from bureaucratic passion for uniformity, successful schools under church auspices should not be welcomed and allowed to continue. During April 1956, a delegation from the Christian Council met the Minister of Native Affairs to discuss the future of private schools for Africans. The Christian Council, in their statement, reiterated the belief that there is an essential place for the private school in

Bantu Education, firstly because there is virtue in a variety of approaches, and secondly because hundreds of thousands of African children were still receiving no education at all (Horrell 1964:25).

In their comments on mission education, the commissioners in fact drew attention to a number of problems which were already abundantly clear to those involved in the provision of education: the impossibility of the missions meeting the ever-increasing demand for education, the lack of adequately trained teachers and the inability to offer effective supervision of teachers, the low standards (aggravated by irregular attendance and high drop-out rates) being attained in many of the small primary schools, and the inadequate facilities and equipment provided at many schools, as well as the growing demand by local communities for secularisation of education in line with what was provided for 'white' children. These were not problems which were unique to South Africa; similar issues were being or would be faced by Christian churches throughout Africa, as well as in other areas where they had pioneers in the provision of education to the local inhabitants (Rundle 1991:108). It must recognized that education has to deal with a Bantu child; that is, a child trained and conditioned in Bantu culture, endowed with a knowledge of a Bantu language and imbued with values, interests and behaviour patterns learned at the knee of a Bantu mother. These facts must dictate to a very large extent the content and methods of early education. The Commission considered that Bantu education should be an integral part of a carefully planned policy of socio-economic development for the Bantu people. It emphasized the functional value of the school as an institution for the transmission and development of the Bantu cultural heritage (Horrell 1968:5). Education does not exist in a vacuum but in a certain constitutional, political, social and economic context.

The curriculum in the "fundamental" or lower primary stage cannot go much further than the teaching of the "three R's" through the medium of the mother-tongue, the beginning of the study of Afrikaans and English, religious education and singing. In the past there was great deal of difference between theory and practice in these matters. In fact, the instructions in the curricula laid down the mother-tongue should be the medium of instruction until at least Standard II, and the social milieu of the pupils should be the basis of the learning process by Native teachers. Whatever the case may be, the final results was that the Bantu pupil, unlike the European child, did not achieve a thorough grasp of what he was taught in the natural way through his mother tongue. It is clear that

an education provided in this form must stand isolated from the life of Bantu society. It prepares them not for life within a Bantu community, but for the life outside the community, progressively uplifted by education, but for a life outside the community and for posts which do not in fact exist. In this way education has served to create a class of educated and semi-educated persons without the corresponding socio-economic development which should accompany it (Verwoerd 1954:16-17).

Turning to black teacher-training and technical education, in order to be in line with the new developments, the Bantu Education Act of 1953 stipulated that African teacher-training was to be brought under direct state control. All future training of teachers for state or state-aided schools was to be conducted at departmental institutions. The church missions were given the option of either closing or selling or renting the training schools. Schools deciding to continue operating on a self-financing basis were still obliged to register with the Department of Bantu Education (Bodat 1999:52).

The provision of higher education was related to the grand programme of apartheid. A corollary of the 1959 Extension of University Education Act, enabling the establishment of new racial/ethnic universities, was the 1959 Promotion of Bantu Self-government Act, while the Bantu Authorities Act sought to replace direct colonial rule in the African research with a system of indirect rule through reactionary traditional leaders and collaborationist elements that were to be granted executive and administrative powers. The Promotion of Bantu Self-government Act took this process further with the unfolding projects of geographical segregation and consolidation of ethnically structured territorial units, the Bantustans (Bodat 1999:53).

The general aims of the Bantu Education Act were to remedy the difficulties the researcher have mentioned by transforming education for Natives into Bantu education, to transform a service which consequently results in alienation and division within the community into a general service which will help in the development of the Bantu community as a whole. The means to give effect to this reformation I see in the following:

- The control of the educational system has been taken out of the hands of the provinces and placed in the hands of the Department of Native Affairs so that an informal educational policy, consistent with the general policy of the country, could

be introduced. Education could now be co-ordinated with other services and the co-operation of the Bantu community can be organised.

- The local control of schools under the supervision of the state would be entrusted to Bantu organization which must learn to render for the community as a whole a service hitherto rendered by the mission churches for a section of the community only. The mission school was being replaced by the community school.
- The department must itself control schools which serve not merely the local community but whole areas, i.e. institutions for higher education and especially for the training of teachers.
- The financial policy announced in my budget speech must be followed. In this way it will be brought about that the Bantu themselves will contribute in an increasing measure towards the cost of expanding their educational services. The principles of a Native development have been re-established in practice by the creation of the Bantu Education Account (Verwoerd 1954: 8).

3.12. Medium of instruction

The famous Eiselen report came up with a suggestion saying that in order not to confuse the African child; education must be conducted in the vernacular. The promotion of “mother tongue” education also meant the demotion of English as a medium of instruction and communication. We have seen how the commissions argued that mission education offered Africans a false perspective on their roles in society. It was clear from the statement above that the use of English as a medium of instruction was a cause for concern in the Afrikaner circles. The Afrikaners did not like the use of English as a medium of instruction for political reasons (Neil 2002:91).

On the issue of which language must be used as an official language, we see the country authorities coming up with a compromise, which made the two languages to be official languages in South Africa. An African child was expected to use his or her mother tongue at a primary level, but as soon as he or she was at higher primary school, the medium of instruction should be either English or Afrikaans. Bantu education was designed to disadvantage Africans by offering them an education system designed to limit the potential of the African child. The Bantu education system was designed to ensure that the development of an African child was arrested. The African child was to

be educated with one purpose in mind, and that was for him/her to take instructions from the white civilized person (Faku, 27 August 2007: paragraph 8, page 6, Grahamstown).

The analysis of the results of this study have painted an interesting picture of how the written sources described the role played by the churches in the introduction of Bantu education and how the world sources emphasized the role of the churches in relation to the implementation of Bantu education.

The Methodist Church of South Africa Conference was of the opinion that practical experience of instruction through the medium of the mother-tongue during the eight years of lower and higher primary schooling, which was introduced in 1955 and fully operative from 1963 indicated that the system had not been beneficial. It pointed out that this insistence on the use of a Bantu language as the medium of teaching until the completion of standard six had been, and continued to be, one of the most potent causes of African mistrust of the system of Bantu education. Conference noted with concern that it was widely held that the extended use of mother-tongue instructing had hindered the intellectual progress of the pupil, was a contributory factor to the decline in competence in the official languages, handicaps the African child particularly in learning mathematics and science because of the difficulties of teaching abstract concepts (such as mass v/s weight, density, fractions or inertia) and was one of the reasons, for what was widely regarded as a general lowering in the level of scholastic ability of African pupils entering the secondary school (Conference Report, 1969:11)

Neil in his research words highlights the following:

From the evidence submitted to the commission and from their analysis of the report itself, church and mission organizations clearly viewed it as an attempt by the state to further the aims of apartheid through extensive social engineering. The commission's composition was accepted by the churches with a remarkable degree of uniformity, despite the obscene of mission church representation. The appointment of Eiselen as chairman seemed to have satisfied missionary opinion as he was highly regarded by the church community. Rev Z. Mahabane of the Christian Council of South Africa (CCSA) commented on the highly talented man in the person of Professor W.W.M Eiselen (Neil, 2002: 93).

The reaction of the South African Outlook to the appointments was a committed chairman (Dr. Eiselen), a man with a reasonable and liberal mind motivated by a genuine concern for the welfare of the Native. However, there were some within the mission community who critiqued both its questionnaire and its terms of reference. (Neil.2002:96-97). Rev Z. Mahabane was a Methodist who was twice President-General of the ANC, Vice President of the AAC, and President of the Interdenominational African Minister's Federation. This Federation was founded in 1945 and was committed to unifying the churches to co-ordinate their opposition to racist legislation.

Dr W.G. McConkey, in his booklet *The Failure of Bantu Education*, analysed National Party propaganda on Bantu education and showed that the system introduced by the government in 1953 had failed. One of the failures he pointed out was that when the Eiselen Commission on Native Education looked at African education in 1949, they found one teacher for every 42 pupils and in order to maintain the ratio, recommended a great expansion of teacher-training programmes. But when he was writing (1969), the latest report of the Bantu education department showed one teacher for every 72 pupils (McConkey 1969:16). Dr McConkey pointed out that in 1954, 70.90 per cent of the Bantu pupils were in Sub A to Standard 2 classes. In 1967, 71.23 per cent were in the first four classes. That shows that there had been no improvement in the thirteen years of Bantu education. Bantu education had made admission to all secondary courses more difficult.

3.13. Experience of Bantu Education

According to Louw, Edwards and Orr (2001:72) a good deal of research has been done on the effects of failure on school achievement. The high rate of failure according to participants was not by default but by design. The Bantu education system put a great deal of emphasis on the colour of the skin as a determining factor of who must pass or fail in the field of education. Bantu education had been designed to keep African people thinking negatively about their potential to live decent lives. Rather than learning about their possibilities and capabilities, some learners learned about their limitations and shortcomings. Leavers (1997:15) argued that many factors could stop children from being able to learn. The way that Leavers describes the inability to learn is through each child's "level of well-being".

3.14. Resistance to Bantu Education

Baruch Hirson has argued that the only campaign against Bantu education was set in motion by the African National Congress (ANC). According to Mr. Mfengu, it was teachers within the ANC who were the first to resist the implementation of the Bantu Education Act of 1953, because it was they who would have to bear the brunt of the new system. Particularly in the rural areas, during the 1950's the teachers were a pivotal force and when politically motivated, formed an essential element in the resistance to authority (White 1993:49). That campaign itself did not yield the desired results due to the lack of implementation strategies on the ground. The other contributing factor it seemed was that the teachers themselves who were not properly organised or they lacked a political will to challenge the department of education.

The African National Congress (ANC) took a while to respond to the implementation of Bantu education. They called for school boycotts and that was not successful because they did not get support from some communities. It was parents, not students, whom the ANC attempted to mobilize in support of its campaign to resist Bantu education. Resistance to Bantu education continued after the collapse of the ANC's campaign, and the long-term aim remained to prevent its functioning (Kallaway 1984:97). Even teachers themselves did not support these school boycotts. Many teachers were reluctant to get involved because the action by the ANC threatened their long-term employment prospects. On the other hand, the Department of Education was using the very same teachers to implement the new regulations introduced by the introduction of the Bantu education division. Another contributing factor was that by this time, many of the teachers had already resigned.

Most Africans and a large proportion of the white population were opposed to this concept of "apartheid" or "separate development" and accordingly objected to a system of African education which had been developed within and for the promotion of such a concept. The system was based on the belief that Africans and Whites are inherently different and can never live together in peace. Many people challenged these beliefs and were in any case convinced that the government's policy is impossible to achieve (White 1993:50). Because most Africans in South Africa believed in integration rather than segregation, they objected to the principles underlying the educational system; and amongst many of them the very term Bantu "Education" was opprobrious. A further

point is that African leaders or organizations were never consulted about the proposed change in educational policy (Horrell 1964:118). It was therefore left to the ANC to mount a campaign against the Bantu Education Act. Although the Eiselen Commission had reported in 1951 and the Bantu Education Act had been passed in 1953, the government acted slowly in implementing its proposals. Late in 1954 it issued a draft syllabus for the lower standards allowing time for criticism before this would become operational in 1956. Schools were to be transferred to the Department of Natives Affairs on 1 April 1956, which seemed the most appropriate time to stage a mass protest (White 2002:52). According to White (2002:54) Edwards Feit has noted that the ANC regarded the Bantu education act as the most dangerous of all the laws to be passed thus far by the National Party. This was because African organizational structures had been built through access to a sound educational system, whereas the Nationalists wanted to counteract the liberating force of education. The ANC believed that Bantu Education's chief aim was to consolidate white power. Therefore the act had to be opposed in all its forms. (White 2002:54).

The findings of this study demonstrate that in those cases in which teachers interacted with learners from similar cultural backgrounds to their own, to the exclusion of learners from different cultural backgrounds, the learners with whom they interacted felt a sense of belonging; however, this does not justify the introduction of a separate education system aimed at making other race groups inferior to others. The research is going to summarize the stories of the participants in relation to their input in this study. The researcher gathered from the participants and that was confirmed by the literature written by White that sometime in 1954, the Lovedale Governing Council met and debated the issue of Bantu Education of length (White 2002:55). The discussion was not an easy one because some members did not feel strong enough to challenge the government; however, the agreement of the committee was that the members of the council should approach the government to request that institutions such as Lovedale be allowed to continue under missionary control. They promised to co-operate with the government, where necessary. We should not forget that Lovedale itself was the brain-child of the church, the Scottish church to be specific.

On the other hand, the church had already agreed that they would hand over all their primary schools and would make a plea for the retention of the secondary institutions under their control. The government responded by issuing a circular setting out the

registration conditions. The government itself was not in a position to take over the entire responsibility of the schools and the hostels. The government's proposal was that the government should take control of the school and the church or missionary educational institutions should remain with the control of the hostels.

The biggest dilemma was to have the same institutions under control of two distinct bodies. The conditions in the hostels were the reason for discontent among the students. The political motivation for giving the control of the hostels over to the churches was to settle a political score. The schools will run smoothly and professionally, whilst the hostels experience problems that could lead to riots. The government would not be blamed rather the churches would bear the brunt. The churches were not strong politically or economically and were not working together. The government took advantage of that and took over the schools away from the missionary influence. The other important point was that schools which were situated in white areas automatically fell under the Group Areas Act.

3.15. Bantu Education for a Bantu economy

Malherbe (1969:13) argued that the above mentioned topic seemed to have become basic to the concept of separate development and was based on several fallacies. The first fallacy was the underlying assumption that the economy of the Republic of South Africa was split into separate economies on racial lines; that is, a Bantu economy, an Indian economy, a coloured economy and a white economy, each ran with its own supply of man-power to be educated and trained only as and when required to meet the particular needs of each of these racial groups by themselves and separately. This assumption ignored the obvious fact that the goods and products which the country consumed or exports were produced by the combined labour of the whole population comprising all races living in this country. The revenue of the country came from taxes, direct and indirect, levied on the whole population. Morrow, Maba and Pulumani (2004:7) highlight the fact that after the National Party (NP) came to power in 1948, it took the decision, as part of the broad movement to establish its hegemony, to destroy the educational system that had produced the elite of educated Africans so important in the development of a political voice for the majority of the population. At the same time, it was hoped, it could produce a population sufficiently educated to labour

effectively in the mines, factories and farms of increasingly industrialised South Africa. The Bantu Education Act of 1953 was the key instrument in this policy.

Archbishop Clayton believed that the Nationalist government was willing to listen to the church on the question of Bantu education in 1954 in the same way that he believed that the Smuts government had taken note of the church and nation report in 1943. The fact that he was proved wrong on these other occasions did nothing to alter his view on the role of the church in South Africa. The dilemma which the archbishop faced, that of having to choose between their consciences and obedience to the law of the land, was on the very specific question of the religious freedom. They were faced with the similar choice in the case of Bantu Education Act (an act which was to affect the lives of the entire black population of South Africa). Though they did not like it, they chose, with one notable dissenter, the path of the lesser evil. The Native Laws Amendment Bill of 1957 was different only in degree from the Native Laws Amendment Act of 1937, and about that, the Anglican Church of the Province of South Africa (CPSA) had made very little complaint. However, as Huddleston rightly observes, on the issue of Bantu education, the CPSA had failed to act with any real clarity or political will. Politically the Bantu education was by far the graver piece of legislation. According to Huddleston, the bishops need not have bothered about the Native Laws Amendment Bill (Clayton 1991:142-143). It is interesting to note that the motivating factors for the introduction of Bantu education rested heavily on what Dr Verwoerd believed of a black person must be educated to support his White master. Tabata (1960) puts it well in his statement:

There is no place for him (the African) in the European community above the level of certain forms of labour..... Until now he has been subjected to a school system which drew him away from his own community and misled him by showing him the green pastures of European society in which he was not allowed to graze (Tabata 1960:7).

The pertinent question that should be asked about Bantu education is that whose interests were being served by the introduction of education? This important question leads us to be suspicious of all motives and actions. It is clear that certain knowledge has been used to manipulate or control others.

Despite the commission's recommendations, the government appointed an inter-departmental committee to obtain information on the financial implications of providing separate facilities, and in March 1957 introduced in Parliament a separate university

education bill. With one exception relating to the control of the Natal medical school (which was eventually left unchanged), its provisions were practically the same as those of the legislation that was passed two years later, the government having disregarded the representations and protest made in the meanwhile (Horrell 1968:16).

Perry and Perry (1992:38) explained that at school, the curriculum for black children was designed to discourage black children from questioning the social and political power system that they would inherit. The great heroes in the school text books were white heroes. South African history as it was taught was selective, lacked complexity and praised the part played by white settlers on the “Dark Continent”.

From the above it was clear that in any society, education is a major instrument of social control and political manipulation. Hall and Young (1987:35) emphasized the point that there were separate education facilities for Africans and Europeans from primary school to university. African education was administered by the Department of Bantu Education as an agency of the central government while the provinces controlled education for whites. Education for whites was financed out of general revenue on an annual basis. For white children it was a right given to them free with buildings, teachers, equipment, textbooks and writing materials. African education was financed from two sources: an annual grant from general revenue which was fixed at R13 million in 1953, and the revenue from African general tax and miscellaneous receipts. In addition to paying taxes, Africans had to make large contributions in other forms. They had to buy their own books, stationery, uniforms, lunches, handwork material and pay school and examination fees.

3.16. Bantu Education and apartheid

The National Party of Dr D.F. Malan came into power in South Africa on the basis of the apartheid policy. The education of the black child was the target of the apartheid policy. During the apartheid era, the National Party Government, in their attempt to entrench political rights and economic privileges in the hands of the whites, inflicted injustice of the most abominable kind on blacks (Shear 1996:xi). Shear (1996:x-xii) suggests that Dr D.F. Malan’s policy wanted to ensure that the black people of this land would remain servants of the whites, and higher education must be something difficult to reach, if not impossible for them to be admitted into and to achieve.

3.16.1. The foundations of apartheid

The separate development system introduced by the Nationalist government, best known as apartheid, became the foundation of the governing policy of the government. Apartheid had its origins in legislative and customary measures of all our colonies which formed the union of South Africa in 1910. The whites, whose fore-bearers arrived in South Africa from 1652 onwards, had established their supremacy over the indigenous Africans. Blacks were virtually excluded from the democratic political system established for white dominance (Lipton 1985:18).

The 1922, the Stallard Commission laid down the principle that an African should only be in town to minister to the needs of the whites and should depart there from when he ceases to minister. Higher expenditure on white education was another means of giving whites an advantage. The discriminatory system was rationalised by a belief in the inferiority of blacks, then widely held to have a biological basis. It was argued in Darwinian terms that blacks were lower on the evolutionary scale and that it would take them hundreds of years to “catch up” (it was not stated whether they would by then also have changed their colour). Meanwhile, it was the duty of whites to rule them, acting as their trustees or guardians and to take measures to ensure that their own, more civilized standards were not swamped by the greater black number (Lipton 1985:18).

In explaining the word “apartheid”, Ackens (1992) says it was in September 1943, when the word was used in a speech by D.F. Malan, pointing out the need for the Afrikaner people to deal with the Afrikaner issues. The word “apartheid” means ‘to keep apart’ (Ngcokovane 1989:3). He further argues that the legitimating of apartheid is a complex phenomenon in both South Africa society and culture (Ngcokovane 1989:3). The first steps taken on the way to apartheid legislation were to dismantle what few constitutional rights black people had. Though mission schools had many achievements, it was an imperfect system, and they have often been romanticised in retrospect. Throughout, there was never enough mission education; it was heavily weighted towards the early primary years – in secondary years it was predominantly concentrated in rural areas; and it was chronically under-funded (Morrow, Maaba&Pulumani 2004:5). It was not only that the mission education was also not in favour of the African culture.

After 1936, Black people (who hitherto had a limited franchise based on educational qualification) in the Cape Province could no longer vote directly for black candidates. They had to choose seven white representatives to speak for them. In 1956, the same thing was forced upon coloured people. Then in 1959, the all-white population put forward the promotion of Bantu Self-Government Act, which cancelled even this minimal representation, to be followed in 1968 by the separate representation of voter's amendment act which removed the representative of the coloured from parliament (Mwali 1987:7). For one to understand the foundation of apartheid one must try to understand the Afrikaner people. According to Ackerson (1992:44), Afrikaner people based their culture and identity on the Voortrekkers' experience. They watched two dozen ox drawn wagons and their drivers and passengers, all in the costume worn by the original Voortrekkers, who had left the Cape of Good Hope rather than accept British domination and the inhibitions on their way of life that the empire implied. The organisers of the parade exhorted the crowd to take the Voortrekker as models and to confirm the vows said to have been taken nearly a century ago by their forefathers on the eve of an impending battle with the Zulu (Ackerson 1992:46).

Arrangements for the administration of African education were highly complicated; control being divided between the state, the provincial administration, missionary societies and the people's churches (Horrell 1968:1). Ngcokovane (1989:18) concurs with Ryan (1990:43) that it was the desire of the Africans themselves for their schools to be administered in the same way as were those for whites. Several authorities had suggested a transfer of control from the provinces to the state department that was ultimately responsible for the education of all racial groups in South Africa (Horrell 1968:1).

There was a great need for the expansion of adult education services (Horrell 1989:2). Conflict under Bantu education learning and teaching was seen as an experience characterised by more than one belief, expectation or demand, which presented themselves to the learner or teacher at the same time in specific situations of learning and teaching. These demands, expectations or beliefs were not in harmony with each other since they related to each other in a manner that violated other beliefs, demands or expectations (Ramabulana 1991:69).

3.16.2. Apartheid and education

From the beginning of the apartheid system segregation was accepted as the country's policy, the Union Department of Native Affairs was created to cater for the interests of the native population, and native areas were set aside. It would have been logical therefore to coordinate Bantu education with the activities of this Department. A step in this direction was taken in 1922 by transferring to the Union the financial obligations of the province for Native education.

Dr Verwoerd explained that the general aim of the Bantu Education Act was to remedy the difficulties he had of transforming education for Natives into Bantu education, to transform a service which benefits only a section of the Bantu population. He once said: "Native education should be controlled in such a way that it should be in accord with the policy of the State.... Good racial relations could not exist when the education was given under the control of people who create the wrong expectation on the part of the Native himself". Racial relations "cannot improve if the result of Native education is the creation of frustrated people".... Education must train and teach people in accordance with their opportunities in life, according to the sphere in which they live (Horrell 1964:6).

Dr Verwoerd's thinking was in line with the recommendations of the Eiselen Commission and that was confirmed by the report that pointed out that:

What is taught and learnt in Bantu schools is never applied in practice, because the economic incentives that should operate when children leave school are either absent or such a nature as to undo the work of the schools. The reform of these economic conditions cannot be the function of an Education Department, but the success of the work of the schools is dependent upon the existence of social and economic opportunities for absorbing the products of the schools (Kallaway 2002:40).

The Eiselen Commission appeared to say contradictory things about how African education should be governed. The commissioners were committed to the centralization of educational governance, but at the same time they seemed to advocate strong local control. They recommended that executive authority for African education be transferred from the provincial Department of Education to the Union Department of

Native Affairs, and at the local level control of the schools should fall under local Bantu Authorities rather than the mission societies (Kallaway 2002:45).

The intention of the State as regards 'Bantu Education' was made more explicit in the parliamentary debates around the reading of the Bantu Education Bill. The then Minister of Native affairs, Hendrick Verwoerd rejected the schooling structure set up by missions on the grounds that it produced the 'wrong type' of black person: "Racial relations cannot improve if the wrong type of education is given to Natives" (Kallaway 2002:45).

The passing of the Bantu Education Act of 1953 realised Verwoerd's ideal. Black education was placed under state control. The missionary schools were generally forced to hand over control to the State or face closure. In 1953 there were over 5000 state-aided schools; by 1965 there were 509 (Christie and Collins 1985:171). All educational appointments, syllabi, examinations and school buildings were to be controlled exclusively by the State (Nasson& Samuel 1990:18).

The implication of Dr Verwoerd's Bantu education policy was to ensure that the control of the educational system was taken out of the hands of the provinces and placed in the hands of the Department of Native Affairs so that a uniform educational policy, consistent with the general policy of the country which was the apartheid system, could be implemented and the black child is given its place in society.

Judging from the way the Bantu education system was introduced in consultation with those involved, or stakeholders, noting Kallaway (1994: 8-9) when he says:

The colonised people of Southern Africa were not simply conquered in a military sense, did not only lose their political independency, were not simply divorced from an independent economic base, were not just drawn into a new system of social and economic life as urban dwellers or wage labour. Though all these aspects of the process of colonisation have great importance, the key aspect to be noted here is that it also entailed cultural and ideological transformation, in which the schools were major agents.

Hlatshwayo (2000:54) puts it well when pointing out that the National Party came to power on the basis of the promotion of the doctrine of Apartheid in 1948. One of the

first acts of the Nationalist Government was to appoint the Eiselen Commission on Native Education, with following terms of reference:

- The formulation of the principles and aims of education for Natives as an independent race, in which their past and present, their inherent racial qualities, their distinctive characteristics and aptitudes, their needs and under ever-changing social conditions are taken into consideration.
- The extent to which the existing primary, secondary and vocational education system for Natives and the training of Native teachers should be modified in respect of the content and form of syllabuses in order to conform to the proposed principles and aims, and to prepare Natives more effectively for their future occupations (Horrell 1968:4).

We discern one dominant principle governing African education under the Nationalist Government: African education must be different from that of the Whites.

3.17. Conclusion

In this chapter, it has been necessary to go through a significant amount of ideological material that was aimed at advancing the political agenda of the State. It is recognised that the introduction and implementation of Bantu education was a complex matter and the churches were faced with a mammoth task of raising enough resources if they were to come up with an alternative new system of education. The role played by the church in relation to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education will be surveyed and examined in more detail later in the study.

4. THE CHURCHES' RESPONSE

4.1. The English-speaking churches

Petersen (2001:120) substantiates the popular perception and “received theological wisdom” that regards the topic of apartheid and the English-speaking churches an oxymoron. He pointed out the “noble history” of opposition to the theories and practices of the apartheid system, for example, considering the actions of a missionary of the London Missionary Society, Johannes van der Kemp, who refused to preach in the church in Graaff-Reinet because it excluded Khoi-Khoi worshippers (Petersen, 2001: 120)

The study by Cochrane (1987) forced a re-evaluation of the English-speaking churches, beginning with a systematic investigation of the role of the missions and the missionaries in colonialism and the shaping of the racial and economic landscapes of early exponents of dissent against “Boer racism”. The missionaries of the London Missionary Society, especially van der Kemp, John Philip, James, James Read and Robert Moffat, were seen as examples of a continuous liberal and anti-racist agitation on the part of the English-speaking churches.

4.2. Churches and mission bodies relinquished control

The following is a list of the church or mission bodies which indicated their willingness to relinquish control of their schools and make their school buildings available to the responsible black organization, subject to satisfactory arrangements in respect of maintenance and/or rental:

- African Methodist Episcopal Church
- African Gospel Church
- Assemblies of God
- African Church
- African Lutheran Mission
- Baptist Union of South Africa
- Bantu Presbyterian Church
- Church of Scotland

- Free Church of Scotland Mission
- Church of Sweden Mission
- Christian Plymouth Brethren
- Congregational Union of South Africa
- Church of the Province(except in the case of the Diocese of Johannesburg)
- Order of Ethiopia
- Gereformeerde Kerk
- Hermannsburg Missionary Society
- Ibandla le N.E.E.H.
- Ishmaelite Church (Bantu)
- Lutheran Berlin Mission
- London Missionary Society
- Mahon Mission
- Methodist Church
- Nederduits Gereformeerde Kerk
- Norwegian Mission Society
- Paris Evangelical Missionary Society
- Pilgrim Holiness Church
- Presbyterian Church of South Africa
- Reformed Baptist Mission
- Salvation Army
- S.A. Baptist Missionary Society
- Scandinavian Independent Baptist Union
- Swedish Alliance Mission
- Swiss Mission in South Africa

The following churches desired to retain control of a few of their schools on a subsidized basis, while transferring the control of the rest to the Bantu school board concerned:

- South African General Mission
- The Free Methodist Mission (Natal)

The following churches are those that desired to retain control of their schools without state aid:

- The Catholic Church
- Seventh Day Adventist

Reflecting the Roman Catholic Church's firm stand, Archbishop Hurley of Durban announced that the Roman Catholic Church in South Africa would open a campaign to raise R400, 000.00 for African mission schools. The church, said the archbishop, could not accept the government's terms for continuing the existing subsidy to mission schools, and thus the money would be devoted to making those schools, numbering more than 600 in the Roman Catholic Church, independent of the effects of the Bantu Education Act. This step, he indicated, had been taken in accordance with the basic education principle of the Roman Catholic Church that religion was paramount in education (Horne 1997:200).

The responses of Mr. Faku (17 September 2007) indicated the way he analyzed and demonstrated the introduction of Bantu education. He emphasized:

The existence of a formal system of education was due to the missionaries who brought with them both the gospel and education to South Africa. They were charged with certain duties by the state, and yet they had no share in the administration of native education. It was in the interest of all that definite recognition should be given to the missionaries.

The establishment of the native councils was aimed at addressing the concern raised above by Mr. Faku. Mr. Faku concurred with what the researcher picked up from Loram (1917: 265) when he pointed out the following:

Whenever a form of local self-governing has been given to 'natives', they grabbed it with two hands. This was evident when some share in the administration of 'native education' through representation on the Governing Council and that resulted to the practice of working satisfactorily. Seeing however, that these councils are nothing else but learning the art of government, it is desirable that there should be understanding on them European officials or missionaries, and that in any case, their proposals regarding education should be subject to the revision of the department administering native

education. A perceived inefficiency in the administration of institutions conducted by native missionaries, has induced a feeling that supervision by a European missionary should be made a condition of government assistance (Loram 1917: 265).

Dr. C.T. Loram (1917:266), who was the inspector of native education in Natal and also served on the Native Affairs Commission in the nineteen twenties and thirties, sums up the missionary contribution as follows:

It is said that a certain wise old Bantu chief divided Europeans into two classes, namely white men and missionaries. The distinction is significant. To the thoughtful native, the white man is the disintegrating force which has broken down his tribal customs sanctions, and has replaced them with nothing but innumerable and vexatious governmental restrictions introduced for the benefit of the white men. On the other hand, he knows the missionary to be his friend. It is the missionary who educates his children, who writes his letters, who cares for him in sickness and sorrow, who acts as a buffer between him and the local storekeeper or governmental official and whose motives are always altruistic (Hellmenn & Lever 1980:157). The opinion raised above is rejected by many scholars who strongly feel that missionaries were as destructive in their approach as 'white man' in Africa.

The managing and financing of the new Bantu education was not easy for both the African communities and the government of the National Party. But in 1955, after the control of African education had, in terms of the Bantu Education Act of 1953, been transferred from the provinces to the then Department of Native Affairs, the government reverted to the former practice. It created a Bantu education account into which an annual block grant of R13 million, the amount calculated to derive from general revenue for African education previously, was to be paid; the remaining expenditure was to be met from four-fifths of the general tax paid by Africans, sundry other receipts from Africans, and advances made by the government.

Despite increased rates of African taxation from 1958, the payment of the total amount deriving from such taxation into the Bantu education account from 1963, transfer of the costs of the three African universities to consolidated revenue, to maximize the number of economic activities in the administration and sundry, African school education continued to be severely handicapped by inadequacy of funds (Hellmenn & Lever 1980:185). From the conversations with some of the participants, it was clear that the

transfer of some schools from the mission church left an indelible mark on the life of the gospel in South Africa. In the interview with Nabe, the following was explained:

The instruction from the government saying that the churches must hand over their schools to the government with little or no alternative, left many churches affected. The mark caused by this unfortunate stance of the government left some churches thinking that there was not much they could do to either engage or resist the government action. The other worrying factor at this time was that many of those opposing the Bantu Education Act were not necessarily opposing the Bantu education and that was confusing. To them there was no problem with the provision of the Bantu education. The problem, according to them, was around the fact that the Bantu Education Act wanted them to hand over the schools to government for control (Nabe, Alice, 5 October 2007).

A number of participants, such as Nabe and Faku concurs, that the then Secretary for Native Affairs sent a letter to all those conducting teacher training institutions, said it had been decided that the training of all teachers for State and State-aided schools should be conducted in the Department.

The Bantu teacher must be integrated as an active agent in the process of the development of the Bantu community. He must learn not to feel above his community, with a consequent desire to become integrated into the life of the European community. He becomes frustrated and rebellious when this does not take place, and he tries to make his community dissatisfied because of such misdirected ambitions which are aliens to his people” (Kallaway 1984:270).

Dr. Verwoerd pointed out that if there were churches wishing to maintain their schools entirely and they were free to do so at their own expense.

4.3. The role of the church

As African people were incorporated into the different states that went to make up what is now South Africa, from the mid-nineteenth century, Christian missionaries, often British, developed schools that served a minority of the indigenous population. The missionaries brought with them a heritage composed of elements such as loyalty to the

imperial power, and an unquestioning confidence in the superiority of their own culture (Morrow, Maaba&Pulumani 2004:5).

But Christians were divided over the question of apartheid; the white Dutch Reformed Churches arguing for and supporting separate development of races, the South African Council of Churches, which we have mentioned in a previous chapter, opposing it. However, it still remained a mystery to many people why a Christian church could accept such a belief and encouraged the State to institute such a policy as the one of apartheid. Some see the answer in the Calvinism of the Reformed faith. John Calvin, one of the main reformers in Europe in the sixteenth century, preached a doctrine of predestination, which stressed how God elected a people for salvation (Crawford 1989:113).Historically, however, the English-speaking churches opposed separate development, and they, together with Roman Catholic Church, they sustained the opposition over the years. This opposition was non-violent and called for justice and reconciliation between all racial groups (Crawford 1989:115).

The protest of mission churches against the Nationalist Government programme of apartheid was heard from the 1950s onwards. But it is important to realize that the hierarchies of these churches were all white, and the synods were dominated by whites. For instance, a majority of those who were theological students in the 1960s attempted to get black causes going at major church conferences and synods (Mbali 1987:44).

Under James Stewart's leadership (1870-1905) as missionary principal, Lovedale became the foremost educational centre in all Southern Africa. The declared aim of Lovedale was to teach trades and crafts and to produce teachers and preachers. But there was also an emphasis upon strict and high academic standards and upon having properly qualified men and women on the staff. The institution continued to provide a common education for black and white pupils and there was a deliberate mixing of the races so that they might come to know one another. A hospital was eventually added to all the other activities of the institution and became the first place in the country at which Africans could be fully trained as nurses. In a sense, all higher education for Africans emanated from Lovedale, including the first university college, the South African Native College at Fort Hare in Alice, though this was not opened until 1916, eleven years after Stewart's death.

Of course it is true that Lovedale was not the only institution of its kind in Southern Africa. The Methodist Healdton and the Anglican St Matthew's are both situated close to Lovedale and both were institutions of much the same type, until the Bantu Education Act of 1953 virtually put an end to the era of missionary education (Hinchliff 1968:88).

In the view of the biblical storyteller in the first creation narrative, the climax of creation was reached when God created human beings. And the most important feature of that part of the story is that they were created in the image of God (Gen. 1:26). This is the human being's most important attribute. The Bible at this point makes no reference to racial, ethnic or biological characteristics, which is remarkable considering that the piece of writing on which this information is found is in a proper sense chauvinistic. Apartheid denied not only the biblical truths referred to above but more astonishingly denied the central act of reconciliation which the New Testament declares was achieved by God in His Son, Jesus Christ. Apartheid maintained that human beings, God's own creatures, are fundamentally irreconcilable, flatly contradicting the clear assertion of Scripture that God was in Christ reconciling the world to God-self. Reconciliation could be said to sum up aptly our Lord's ministry and achievement. To deny that he had effected this is not to deny just a peripheral and fairly insignificant Christian truth, but the heart of the Christian message. Apartheid was, therefore, a heresy. It was moreover morally reprehensible on account of human suffering. It is for this reason that I believe apartheid to be intrinsically evil (De Gruchy and Villavicencio 1983:39-40).

4.4. A brief survey of mission schools in South Africa

Dr. J.T. Van der Kemp opened the first Bantu school near Ngqika's kraal in 1799, but had to abandon his efforts within a year. In 1816, the Rev Joseph Williams of the London Missionary Society established a mission station on a site not far from late Fort Beaufort and soon had some 50 pupils in school. He died in 1818. Williams' school provided education to southern eastern Bantu. In 1820, the Rev John Brownlee, also of the London Missionary Society, established a station on the Chumie river, followed shortly afterwards by missionaries of the Glasgow Missionary Society, W.R Thomson and John Bennie. In 1823, John Ross printed the first reading sheets in Xhosa on a small printing press he had brought out from Scotland. In July 1841, the Lovedale seminary was formally opened with the Rev William Govan as Principal.

According to Duncan (2008), from the beginning, black support was poor as the result of opposition arising out of concern about the effects of education on the traditional way of life, poor academic attainment in the medium of English as well as meagre financial support from Scotland (Duncan 2008:107).

In the 1850's the issue was English as language of instruction. The 1860s-70s were characterised by the industrial education at Lovedale. During the 1880s-90s they were concerned with the issue of land and buildings. At the beginnings of the 1900s there seem to be community involvement and negotiations with chiefs. Duncan writes, Govan aimed to create a small highly educated African elite fit to take their place alongside the whites in a common society. This was abandoned in favour of a policy aimed at the general uplifting of the masses to an elementary level (Duncan 2008:140).

The 1939 conference of the Natal Bantu Parents' Association expressed its opposition "to the system of teaching children only over-seas history in the Primary Schools". In 1946 Professor Z.K. Matthews wrote a review of Native Education over the previous 25 years that

Opposition has come in the main from the African people themselves. They have pointed out that there was a danger of their children being given a form of education which might be more of a handicap to them than anything else. They have demanded for their children an education which takes due account of the fact that they are living in the modern world, in an environment which includes both Western and African elements linked together indissolubly (Kallaway 1984: 86).

The Bantu Education Act of 1953, as amended in 1954, 1956, 1959 and 1961, and the Bantu Special Education Act of 1964 dealt only with the very broad outlines of the new system upon which the government decided. It was left to the responsible minister to make regulations covering all other matters (HRSC no year:3). These acts provided for the transfer of the control of Bantu education, including teacher training but excluding higher education, from the provincial administrations to the central government (Horrell 1968:66).

The starting point of the philosophy of mission education espoused by the mission churches is simple: education is part of the sacred mission of the church received from Jesus Christ. The main aim behind establishing schools by the church is that the church sees schools as a privileged means of promoting the foundation of a holistic person

whose life is grounded on Christian human values. According to Christians, Christ is the foundation of the whole educational system.

The individual to be educated is not an isolated entity but is a part of society and is educated to take up its right position in society. Many scholars are in agreement that mission education endeavoured to offer a holistic education; physical, intellectual, cultural, moral, social and spiritual.

The Christian mission of education based its philosophy on human dignity and self-worth. The motivating factor was based on the centrality of God and that in God people can find meaning and purpose in life. School-going children become thoughtful and disciplined Christians who will have to put God in the centre of their lives.

Unlike Bantu education the mission Christian education was not to provide merely a secular education including some Christian instructions but to shape and determine the life and character both of the community and individual on the basis of Christian faith and practice.

4.5. The churches' response

The churches continued running schools on mission stations until the South African parliament passed the Bantu Education Act in 1953 and the control of mission schools was transferred to the government. The English-speaking churches' role and glorious contribution to the African education was beyond doubt. Their contribution in the provision of education transformed African life in the country. The influence of the church on African people in society is immeasurable. Mission education was in a state of near collapse in the years before the introduction of Bantu education. It was financially starved, and poorly staffed. South Africa has a long history of mission schooling and for many years mission schools self-confidently proposed "civilizing values to Africans. Many families made great financial sacrifice to send their children to these schools believing that education was essential for the future development of their children.

Albert Luthuli, John Ngubane, ZK Mathews, Joshua Nkomo, Nelson Mandela, Ellen Kuzwayo and Phyllis Ntontela, but to name a few who attended the mission schools and became significant political and community leaders (Ellen Kuzwayo note that the long

list of graduates (from Lovedale) bears witness to the high standard and quality of education achieved by blacks “Kuzwayo, Call me Women (Linden, 1958: 91)

The role of mission churches in African education also came under fire. Commissioners argued that the multiplicity of religious bodies involved contributed to thwarting any overall strategy for “Bantu education” It denounced their mutual rivalries, and their overlap in distribution and function, which had led to the wasteful duplication of services in many areas (Eiselen Commission Report p. 113)

The Dutch Reformed Church, as expected, was in general agreement with government policy. Other churches were opposed to the theory of Bantu education. In other cases, the authorities in charge resolved to maintain their institutions without subsidies. The American Mission Board wanted to pressure Adams College in Natal in this way, but for various reasons the department refused to register it. Dioceses of the Church of the Province of South Africa (Anglican) were left free to decide matters for themselves. Some of the controlling authorities decided to close their schools rather than hand them over to the government department. The Roman Catholics launched a Catholic Mission School Appeal Fund with the objective of maintaining as many of their schools as possible as private institutions (Horny 1968:12-13). In 1950, the Minister of Native Affairs assured the white electorate that blacks would have no political, social or other rights equal to Europeans, and in 1959, the Promotion of Bantu Self-Government Act was passed which finalised the process of disenfranchisement started by the British. All the rights of South African citizenship were finally taken from the blacks (Saintonge 1989:53).

Here one needs to note the link between the Bantu Authorities Act of 1951 and Bantu Education Act of 1953. Both were conceived as part of the same plan with the intention of the former being to establish Bantu Local Authorities which would actively involve Africans in carrying out the government’s educational policies. These local authorities would also serve as a bridge between traditional society and the new practises acquired from school. The Eiselen Commission argued that the aim of Bantu education was twofold. First, as it affected society as a whole, Bantu education should be directed towards:

The development of a modern progressive culture with social institutions that would be in harmony with one another and with the schools which must serve as effective agents

in this process of implementing Bantu education. Secondly, Bantu education should aim at the development of the character and intellect of the individual and thus the child would be fitted for his future and surroundings. (White 1993:40-42)

The Catholic Church as a single entity contributed enormously in matters of education when its evangelization was centred on schools. Schools were used as a means of converting the black people to the Catholic faith. The church valued its schools, which it refused to lose without substantial resistance. The Catholic Church opposed the Bantu Education Act No. 47 of 1953, because the Act was unfair to the black people and also to the churches which owned many schools. The government wanted to put all schools under its central control through the Act. The intention of doing this was to make sure that the policies of apartheid were implemented without compromise (SACBC, 1969:45).

The Methodist Church of Southern Africa, like all other English-speaking churches tried to do something about the introduction of Bantu education. In his address to the Representative Session of conference, Webb was reported as having said that “the Methodist Church of Southern Africa would be failing in its duty if it did not state its conviction that any policy which aims at different education is incompatible with Church standards” (*Daily Dispatch* 19 October, 1954). He also expressed the opinion that Bantu education was going to be inferior to that provided for ‘European’ children. When the time for decision-making arrived, however, the conference was willing “to state its convictions on the question of Bantu education, but unwilling to decide not to co-operate with the Government” in the implementation of BEA. The Methodist Church of Southern Africa’s main point in response to the implementation of Bantu education was as follows:

The first point in the statement condemned the policy underlying Bantu education, “A policy which in effect aims at conditioning the African people to a predetermined position of subordination in that the State is incompatible with the church principles for which the church should stand”. The point indicated that the church had decided to hand over its schools “in order to provide for the immediate educational needs of the African people” but expressed its intention that the church should “continue to exercise a Church influence upon education wherever possible” (MCSA. 1954 Conference. Minutes 1954:102).

Those inside the church, who argued in favour of co-operation with the State in the implementation of the system, did not foresee that the time would come when they would simply be cast aside by the State, left with empty promises and no money to pay for the maintenance of buildings and property. On the other hand, little attention seems to have been given to suggestions that the Methodist Church should retain some of its institutions as private church schools, despite the fact that funding was offered by overseas Methodists to assist in the task. No satisfactory explanation has been found as to why that idea was not pursued. A careful reading of the records of the Methodist Church during the period under consideration, reveals a great deal of ambivalence among those ‘whites’ involved in education about the church’s involvement in that sphere” (Faku, 17 September 2007, Grahamstown).

4.6. Institutions without subsidies.

From its implementation strategy, the Department of Native Affairs was clear from the beginning that Bantu education was one of many ways to advance the agenda of the apartheid policy. The implementation of Bantu education meant stricter enforcement of segregation of schools and a clear definition of the function of education for the four population groups, namely the Whites, Indians, Coloureds and Blacks.

The first network of schools for South Africa’s black population was set up by the various church missionary societies who came to South Africa during the nineteenth century. From then until the 1950’s, education was controlled almost exclusively by the churches and by provincial education departments.

The Bantu Education Act No. 47 of 1953 transferred the control of black education from the mission church and the provinces to central government where it was ministered by the Department of Native Affairs. In 1958, a separate Department of Bantu Education was created, with its own minister. Under the provision of the BEA No. 47 of 1953, emphasis was placed on the first four years of primary school, with instruction in the mother tongue. The organization of the Black schools was, according to Malherbe, essential to the overall policy of apartheid which the National Party started to implement soon after it came to power in 1948. This new system of education for blacks, also paved the way for the abolition of missionary influence which the government considered to be too liberal (Malherbe 1977:545).

In that famous speech before Senate in 1954, Dr. Verwoerd gave a clear indication of the new educational policy for black people. Quoted words from his speech are as follows:

It is the policy of my department that Bantu education would have its roots entirely in the Native areas and in the Native environment and Native community. There Bantu education must be able to give itself complete expression, and there it will perform its real service. The Bantu must be guided to serve his own community in all respects. There is no place for him in the European Community above the levels of certain forms of labour within his own community; however, all doors are open. For that reason it is of no avail for him to receive a training which has as its aim absorption in the European community, where he cannot be absorbed (Rose and Tunmer 1975: 265-6).

“Missionaries knew what society they wanted their pupils educated for, but given the constraints of apartheid they acknowledged that mission education did not function effectively for the benefit of the majority. For example, the Education Board of the Diocese of St John’s saw as an undoubted failure of mission education the fact that a minute minority had used it as a stepping stone to earning a livelihood in a pathetically small and inflexible controlled employment market...it was something exotic to the essential life of the community” (WCL AD 1886 Diocese of St John’s Memorandum to be placed...p 2).

While the English-speaking churches in South Africa categorically rejected the Eiselen Commission Report’s call for the permanent separation of the races, there was much in the report which they did not agree with. Having pointed out a number of disagreements, however, they failed to offer an alternative system of education.

The ESC rejected the aim of Bantu education because they saw it as a means to perpetuate racial divisions in South Africa. The main challenge was the English-speaking churches’ unwillingness to explicitly confront the issues of racial division promoted by the National Party government. The Church of Scotland adopted a conciliatory approach to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education by trying to preserve what it could of its educational endeavours whilst striving to maintain a non-confrontational relationship with the apartheid government. It was clear that some of the English-speaking churches were encouraging their members to give the government all the assistance they could in making the transfer of schools as smooth as

possible. The leaders of the Anglican Church determined their reaction to the implementation of Bantu education quickly and decisively. The CPSA archive contained substantial material relating the introduction and implementation of Bantu education, but it largely relates to the period after the decision to lease schools was made. The material reveals that by and large the decisions were made exclusively by the Bishops not giving general membership an opportunity to give their input.

“However not all the Bishops were exclusive in their approach for instance we picked up that Bishop Reeves in Johannesburg called a general meeting of all teachers from the diocese to find out the current opinion of teachers, although the results of that meeting were not recorded” (WCL CPSA. AB 623 Diocese of Johannesburg Secretary 62). “Following the synod of 1954, the Anglican Church Bishops released a statement in which they “deplored” the intentions of the Act and were of the opinion that the Church should not make itself responsible for taking part in such an educational system. All they were prepared to do was lease their schools to the government!

The majority of us (the Anglicans) think that in many cases it would be wrong to refuse to do so. Such a refusal would throw many teachers out of employment and leave many children without the opportunity of any kind of instruction. It is incompatible with our duty to the African people to take action which might lead to such results” (WCL AB 191 File Bantu Education, statement by the Bishops of the Church of the Province of South Africa on Bantu Education Act, Nov 1954). Even the Anglican Church herself could not speak with one voice, hence in justifying his action Clayton, Reeves maintained that Bantu Education was “morally indefensible” and argued that the church has no right to assist the authorities in carrying out their plans (AB 388 Reeves to Clayton 15 Nov 1954).

“Clearly Archbishop Clayton did not believe that Bantu education threatened the real work of the church. In May 1954 he wrote the Malan emphasizing and pointing out those issues which he considered jeopardizing the freedom of religious beliefs and education. He also criticized certain aspects related to the implementation of the Bantu Education itself” (W C L, AB 191 Clayton to Malan 26 May 1984).

There is little evidence if any suggesting that the Anglican Church leadership had endeavoured to engage African opinion over Bantu education.

The Catholic Church's memorandum to the Eiselen Commission gave a direct indication of what it considered to be the rights and obligations of the church, formally and state in the field of education. The state's obligation was to foster peace and security and raise monies, thereby providing the conditions for the church to educate its followers, to protect its legislation regarding the rights of the family. (UCTL BC 282 A 1.3) Memorandum presented on behalf of Catholic Bishops of S.A on the Questionnaire on Native Education p. 3).

In October 1949, the Native Affairs Department of the SACBC initiated a campaign to collect signatures from its teachers to present to the Commission as a statement of their support for the Catholic school system. An accompanying letter of support from leaders in Cape Town noted! Catholic parents and many non-Catholic parents with children at Catholic Mission Schools not only approve of these schools, but together until his will oppose any attempt to secularize them (SACBC Box M/ African Affairs Department-General education. Catholic Teachers of the Cape Town vicariate to Eiselen, Oct 1949)

The Catholic Church proposed that they be allowed to keep their schools, as owners and managers, with a 100 per cent grant, their only concession was to suggest the establishment of special Catholic School Boards consisting of nominees from the Church, Bantu Education Department and Regional Bantu Authority, and elected Bantu Representatives. The Catholic Church was effectively demonstrating the government to reserve its policy, as Verwoerd was aware:

“He [Verwoerd] wishes to emphasize that it must be quite clear that the proposals with which your memorandum concludes, contain the direct negation of the Bantu Education Act.....

These proposals suggest that fundamental, the Government revert to the policy and practice of the past which it deemed necessary to wholly reform” (D C R BED, Interview of SACBC Delegation with Dr Verwoerd, Verwoerd's Private Secretary to Hurley 26 August 1954)

In 1954, the Cape African Teachers Association condemned the Methodist and Presbyterian Churches for handing over their schools without even making the pretence of consulting the people whose objection of [Sic] the Act they know only too well (The Churches collaborate, Teachers' vision Oct – Dec 1984. Vol XX, No.1pg.14).

When Bantu Education was formally introduced, the ANC considered it was the most dangerous of the oppressive laws, and Chief Albert Luthuli, the President of the ANC, at its annual conference in December 1954, called on African parents to withdraw their children from Bantu Education schools, not just temporarily but permanently (Fulani TB, 1988: 112)

Dr H.F. Verwoerd, then Minister of Native Affairs and time Architect of Apartheid made his intentions unambiguously clear about the future of black education.

When I have control of native education I will reform it so that natives will be taught from childhood to realize that equality with Europeans is not for them.....People who believe in equality are not desirable teachers for natives. The Bantu must be guided to serve his own community in all respects. There is no place for him in the European community above the level of certain forms of labour.....Until now he has been subjected to a school system which drew him away from his own community and misled him by showing him the green pastures of European society in which he is not allowed to graze (ANC/Som/41/cutting from unnamed British journal, "Education Today and Tomorrow", Middlesex, winter, 1980/81, p. 14)

It was against this background that the church was called to raise a prophetic voice. This approach provided the researcher with an opportunity to engage and interact with the participants regarding issues pertinent to his topic. The interpretative orientation was facilitated by the integration of three methods, which are interviews, field assessment and document analysis.

The interviews provided a foundation for conversations with participants, through conversations the researcher gained in depth understanding and relevant insight to respond to his research question. They revealed that there were aspects regarding the participant's experiences that the researcher could not get from the written sources. Through the process of data collection, the researcher experienced some difficulties that could have affected the study had he not resorted to other strategies.

The main challenge encountered was the change of dates without prior communication by three of the participants after repeated efforts to visit them for the interviews. The strategy was to keep on trying until they made themselves available.

4.7. The church persecuted

The South African government's reaction was to increase repression. If the church was to be considered a site of struggle, policies which were formulated to advance the agenda of the apartheid policies would obviously be rejected by the church. When its leading members refused to comply, they faced imprisonment or detention and expatriate church leaders were expelled from the country. Nevertheless, there had always been white church members strongly opposed to multiracial churches or societies, who fought against any change (Katjavivi 1989:17)

It seemed that one of the downfalls of Bantu education was that it was experienced as very teacher-centered, with the learners doing very little thinking of their own. This kind of education did not facilitate learning but rather endeavoured to make learners carbon copies of their teachers. Statements presented to them were to be written back to the teacher with no effort of encouraging work of their own. There were times when the participants in this research, as former teachers, would, through words, take the researcher back to their classrooms and demonstrate what was happening in their classrooms at that time. One could pick up from their presentation that their teaching experience was very traditional. Almost all the participants were products of both Bantu education and mission education. Some started their education in missionary schools and finished under Bantu education. Others started their schooling under Bantu education and finished it under the same system of education. For instance, Mrs. Sakati remembered her elder sister, saying: "I vividly remember my sister who started her schooling in 1955 and completed her studies in 1967 and the education system was still under Bantu education. The other important point was that we discussed at home the struggle of the church in resisting the implementation of Bantu education without risking being called communists by the government" (Sakati, Stanger: 11 November 2008, page 13).

The state's interest in gaining sufficient acceptability among black people for apartheid policies in education was based on its need to avoid having to resort to force at ever more frequent intervals in order to maintain itself. We delude ourselves if we think that educational policies can be formulated in air-conditioned conference rooms (or board-rooms), where academics, statesmen and administrators met, and simply be imposed

without reference to the legitimate community, religious and educational leaders, as well as to students, teachers and parents (Kallaway 1984:19).

Some of the participants were optimistic, hoping that the Bantu education was not going to be implemented and the churches would try to work an alternative so as to deal with their challenges. Sakati highlighted the following: “to some of us Bantu education was something we thought would allow the churches to work out alternative educational programmes deemed it fit for the kind of community they want to raise” (Sakati, Stanger: 11 November 2008).

One of the participant’s reflections was accurately representative of his frustrations and challenges throughout the implementation of Bantu education. Mr. Nabe pointed out: “the way I see the approach adopted was not the best because the majority of missionary churches involved in African education failed to engage Africans in a meaningful fashion when dealing with Bantu Education. Remember that Africans were not part of the government then, therefore they would not know what was discussed and agreed upon. There was no way that the government would think of approaching the African people to share their views. Within most churches, only the few Africans who sat on institutional governing councils had any influence on decision-making”.

Those Africans most intimately involved in African education were mostly expected to be doing the practical part of their work rather than to participate in the board room discussion about the future plans and policies related to education. This was one of the sources of frustration and disillusionment to be endured by the teachers during our lifetime as teachers in South Africa (Nabe, Alice: 05 October 2007 page 16).

The participants pointed out that Bantu Education started from lower primary school level and went up to university. They were all in agreement that according to the laws of the country, the established data by which university apartheid would be introduced was the 1st of January 1958. The proposed law of 1958 provided for the establishment of ethnic institutions and so from that date no blacks would be admitted to open universities without the permission of the relevant minister. The establishment of black universities would be funded from the Bantu education account.

Some of the participants concurred with the conference report of 1969 on Bantu Education, in paragraph 41. Nabe explained this by saying;

“This was about the extension of Bantu education to the University level and that meant all those black people aspiring to study at tertiary level must go to the homeland universities. One other important fact which we must not lose sight of is that Bantu education was designed to back up the Bantustans” (Nabe, Alice: 05 October 2007).

The Fort Hare University Conference draws attention to the fact that the immediate effect of the Extension of University Education Act of 1959 was to deprive certain urban Africans and members of other non-white groups of the possibility of attending university classes in the towns in which their homes were located, limit higher education to Africans in a financial position to pay boarding fees, and to make part-time study impossible except by means of correspondence courses. The continuing effect has been further to restrict the already limited number of non-whites who proceed from lower to high education.

After the introduction of the Bantu Education Act No. 47 of 1953, teachers’ organizations met and proposed to oppose it. They encouraged teachers to go out and inform Africans of the dangers inherent in Bantu Education. The attempt by teacher’s organizations (Cape African Teachers’ Association) to engage parents and communities about the dangers of Bantu education and how it could be opposed proved to be a failure due to the following:

- Teachers had little experience of reaching out to the communities.
- Many teachers had high social status.
- They did not have confidence in themselves.
- Their relationship with school boards was not a good one.
- They did not want to volunteer their time to attend meetings.
- Everything was to be done within a short space of time (Methodist Church of Southern Africa 1969 Conference Report, 1969: 5).

Many churches, except for the Catholic Church, had no resources and capacity to run private schools not using the Bantu education system. Again, churches themselves found it difficult to put their resources together due to doctrinal differences. This view came up from more than one participant, suggesting that the denominations did not encourage working together as churches in the struggle against Bantu education.

Contrary to the view of the participants, there is an idea that the South African Council of Churches condemned the implementation of Bantu education. Teachers here were prominent members of the churches and their position of not trying to fight Bantu education did influence the lack of debate by the churches at a grass-roots level (Mfengu, Tembisa: 15 October 2007, page 17).

The Teachers unions, both Transvaal African Teachers Association (TATA) and Cape African Teachers Association (CATA), took a position not to involve them in the ANC's school boycott, and their motivating factor was that children should not be used in the struggle against the government on Bantu education. They convinced parents and themselves that Bantu education was better than no education. Mr Faku raises the point by saying:

It was clear from the side of both parents and teachers that the children's future should not be compromised in the struggle against the implementation of Bantu education by encouraging permanent school boycott. The general strategy was to stay in the schools but refuse to collaborate with system by indoctrinating our children with the ideology of apartheid and oppression (Faku, Grahamstown: 17 September 2007, page 15).

The biggest struggle and dilemma for the African National Congress was the alternative to the Bantu education. If children are not going to school, where do they go and how will they get their education? According to the findings of this study, from the participants in particular, it was clear that some churches did not apply their minds to the introduction of Bantu education; in fact the taking over of the schools by the government came as a relief. Others tried to resist the introduction and implementation of Bantu education.

The Dutch Reformed churches came to the conclusion that the state should assume full control over Bantu education, and that it should be the responsibility of the union government, on condition that there was proper co-ordination and based on the Christian foundation laid by the churches. They also mentioned the fact that primary, secondary and vocational education should fully qualify the Bantu for service amongst their own people (Horne 1997:163). The Afrikaans-speaking churches did not want to fight with the government. Horne (1997) they (English-speaking churches) raised the following: "from their observation they discovered that Bantu education was not an integral part of a plan of socio-economic development aimed at benefiting all in society.

They also pointed out that education must be coordinated with a defined and carefully planned policy for the development of Bantu societies (Horne 1997:165).

Before Bantu education was introduced, black schools were poorly staffed and teacher qualifications were generally low. Mission schools, in particular, relied on white teachers as an important source of staffing. Overall there was a marked deterioration in the qualification levels of teachers under Bantu education. Together with an increase in teachers without matriculation, came a significant reduction of professionally qualified teachers with university degrees in comparison to the pre-1953 period (Kallaway 1984:178-9).

The Dutch Reformed Church (DRC), as expected, was in agreement with the implementation of Bantu education. The DRC had a great deal of influence in South Africa through its relationship with the National Party. On the other hand, other churches were opposed to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education.

John de Gruchy puts it well when he said the DRC was not the only church in South Africa, and no church could avoid its own responsibility to witness to God's kingdom in its particular situation. The other churches know they cannot expect of the DRC anything that they are not prepared to work for as well. Different as they may be, they are all part of Christ and need each other in the struggle for justice and peace (de Gruchy 1979:84)

The other point was on correlating Bantu education with Bantu culture. The architects of Bantu education such as the Eiselen Commission and the Native Affairs Minister Dr. H.F. Verwoerd, argued that Bantu education should be based on Bantu culture to a point of being the foundation upon which an education system can be built. Bantu education was aimed at moving education from its base, which is the church, to a secular education open to all sorts of ideological manipulation. The government assumed that a government education department had all the answers to educational problems at their disposal.

Mr. Faku during the interviews highlighted the following:

Education in South Africa has its roots in the elementary religious education inspired by the mainline churches from overseas. Let us re-emphasize the point that when education was started in South Africa it was for all slaves and European children together. During

their time there were regular singing lessons at school in preparation for Church services. One important point we must not leave out is that the formal education was started as a form of preparation for confirmation where candidates were taught the ability to read the Bible, to orally repeat the Catechism and write a letter. The school academic year was a period of three months. The entire control and shaping of education then was in the hands of the church aimed at benefiting both the church and the individual concerned (Faku, Grahamstown: 17 September 2007).

According to Baur (1994:272) the Belgian government, inspired by missionary circles who insisted on the “church building value of education”, decided to entrust the whole work of education to the Catholic Mission, with due remuneration. The Portuguese followed suit, but only in 1940, and even then on a much smaller scale. This led the Apostolic Delegate Archbishop Hinsley to the well-known directive to give preference to the building of schools over the building of churches. Less well known are the other points he insisted upon:

- The need for sisters to educate girls.
- The concern to educate elite to standards equal to those of non-Catholic schools.
- Not only prepare the Blacks for better serving the Whites but to raise them to a higher Christian civilization, to make them “a bit more human” and “better servants of God” (his Report 1930) .

4.8. The involvement of the church and others

One of the participants, Mr. Faku, highlighted the following important point:

The school boycotts were organized to oppose the implementation of Bantu education but that was mainly done by the students themselves and the consequences were that some of them were prevented from receiving formal education from the African schools for the rest of their lives. This important point is concurred with by Kallaway when he says, “In the same year, some 30 senior female students at Shawbury in the Transkei were sent home and about 200 male students at St Johns College, Umtata were expelled on the eve of their examinations. In 1958, Adams College in Natal they sent more than 200 students home” (Kallaway 1984:98).

According to Mr. Ngoma;

Some communities refused to give their co-operation to church leaders who decided to lease their schools to the government without their consent. In some instances, people locked up schools buildings paid for by their monies and labour when handed over to the government. The abovementioned actions were not done without public demonstrations showing their dissatisfaction of the introduction and implementation of Bantu education (Ngoma, Grahamstown: 24 September 2007).

The findings of this study demonstrates that in those cases in which teachers interacted with learners from similar cultural backgrounds to their own to the exclusion of learners from different cultural backgrounds, the learners with whom they interacted felt a sense of belonging, however the above mention does not justify the introduction of separate education system aimed at making other race groups inferior than others. The research is going to summarize the stories of the participants in relation to their input in this study. The researcher picked up from the participants that sometime in 1954, the Lovedale Governing Council met and debated the issue of Bantu Education at length (White 2002: 55).

The discussion was not an easy one, because some members did not feel strong enough to challenge the government. However, the agreement of the committee was that the members of the council should approach the Government to request that instructions such as Lovedale be allowed to continue under missionary control. They promised to co-operate with the government, where necessary. We should not forget that Lovedale itself was the brain child of the church and that church was the Scottish church to be specific (White 2002:26).

The motivation for educating the African person was to create a conducive environment for the white person to use him or her for the development of the white economy and the survival and enhancement of the life of the white person. It is clear now that restructuring missionary education to Bantu education was aimed at protecting the white workers from the threat of African competition, which began to emerge as a result of economic expansion. To make sure that the economic power would not get out of the white control, Bantu education was designed to under-educate the African people so that their academic education would become irrelevant for the labour market. Bantu education was perceived to be a bad and counter-productive system of education in the

hands of a powerful government. The churches were concerned with the introduction and implementation of Bantu education and their own role within the new political framework.

Organized church opposition to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education could not be public as the state used its laws and military muscle to suppress any opposition to the implementation of its laws (Nogantshi, Fort Beaufort: 27 August 2007). This point is disputed by other writers who thought that some churches were vocal about their response to the introduction and implantation of Bantu Education Act.

4.9. Racial discourse

The centre of this study shows that our interactions in the field of education are influenced by the conditioning of our historical background, and that influences the way we look at education today. The way people judge the best standard in terms of education is based on the previously advantaged schools. The majority of former white schools have a racial composition of mainly white teachers with sparkling token black teachers in their schools (Jansen 1998; Moletsane 1999; Meier 2005).

The findings from this research provided ample evidence that English-speaking churches tried to resist the taking over of schools but that was done individually, hence the lack of impact on the part of their endeavours.

The ignorance regarding African educational needs by the white arrogant interests displayed by the white minority government created the perception that black people were stupid and lazy. But the truth of the matter was that black children had been set up to fail, and teachers were taught to make them victims of their own educational system. The Bantu education system was set up in such a way that it should encourage white children and affirm their self-esteem and self-confidence, to the detriment of the black children who were ignored.

Findings of this study revealed that the application of apartheid policies to education was about satisfying the wishes of people such as Dr. Verwoerd. He spoke on behalf of the African people when he talked about the wrong type of education for Africans. According to him, education had brought about frustrated people because what was provided to them as African people in 'a white man's country' could not meet their

expectations. “I want to state here unequivocally now, the attitude of this side of the House, that South Africa is a white man’s country and that he must remain the master here” (Worsnip 1991:41).

4.10. The response of the churches

The data obtained in this study will also indicate that English-speaking churches, as explained in the previous chapter, had their own way of responding to the introduction of Bantu education. There seemed to be a correlation between the data received from the literature and that from the interviews.

The churches had agreed in their meetings that Bantu education was not the best way of addressing the education crisis of the 1950’s, however they did not work out the best possible solution or at least attempt to sit down with the powers that be to talk about education. The introduction and implementation of Bantu education did not affect the English-speaking churches alone but all members of the community, including members of other churches as well. Some churches did not bother themselves about Bantu education because they saw it as something political and had nothing to do with church. In fact, other churches were not involved in the field of education at all and they did not see it as their responsibility to involve themselves in matters related to education of any kind (Myoli, Mlazi: 11 October 2007). This was from the perspective of the participant. The data at the researcher’s disposal indicate that all most all the so-called English-speaking churches with schools were affected by the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act to a point of doing something about it, either by handing over the schools or trying to resist the transfer of the schools to the government.

Like the Anglican Church, the Catholic Church did not fold its arms and do nothing during the time of introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa. From the beginning, the Catholic bishops opposed the Bantu education system but with a low tone because it was that they will do more as the largest English-speaking church. In spite of being the Church in the minority, the Catholic Church managed to act decisively when it formed the Southern African Catholic Bishops Conference (SACBC) in 1947. That was a very important organisation, as it brought together all Catholic bishops from Southern Africa. It was difficult before its formation for the bishops to speak with one voice, but with its formation things changed drastically. In 1954, the

SACBC in its plenary session, called for Christians to make a sacrifice for the sake of the Catholic schools, when the government announced it would reduce school's subsidies if the Church did not hand them over. In their pastoral letter, they asked parents, teachers and all people of good will to make a sacrifice for the sake of the Catholic schools (SACBC, 1959:58).

4.11. Control of schools

The transition from mission to community schools addressed the following types of schools:

- Aided schools
- Aided community schools
- State schools and
- Private schools

The Vocational Education Act No. 70 of 1955, as amended in 1961, provided for an increase in or complete State control over technical colleges and subsidized continuation classes. Another amendment passed in 1958 laid down that all schools or classes providing vocational education or training for a trade must be registered with the Department of Native Affairs.

Neither the churches nor the teacher's organizations were able to reach consensus on the most appropriate and effective ways of responding to the provisions of the Bantu Education Act. In general, however, it seems that the church leadership concentrated on the practical aspects of the options offered to them. The financial constraints seemed overwhelming: the prospect of finding the money necessary to pay teacher's salaries, in addition to that required for administration and maintenance, was a daunting one. The majority of churches felt they had no choice but to be realistic. They bowed to the demands of the Government because they saw no other way open to them. Concern was expressed about the ideological aspects of Bantu education but that does not seem to be the overriding problem for most of those in leadership positions. One notable feature of this period is the apparent lack of consultation between the church leadership and the government (Rundle 1991:169-170).

The Act provided for the transfer of the control of Bantu education (including teacher-training but excluding higher education) from the Provincial Administrations to the central government.

(a) Types of schools.

Three types of schools were to exist. First there would be Bantu community schools, established or maintained by Bantu Authorities or tribes or communities, and in approved cases subsidized by the State.

Other State-aided schools (including mission schools) were provided for. It was laid down that before granting aid the Minister must consider whether the existence of such a school would preclude or retard the establishment of a community or a government school.

Third, all existing provincial schools would become government schools, and further government schools might be established.

(b) Illegal to conduct unregistered schools

It was rendered illegal for anyone to establish, conduct or maintain a Bantu school unless this had been registered or exempted from registration. Registration was to be at the discretion of the Minister, who might impose conditions on individual schools. Registration might be cancelled if stipulated conditions were not complied with or if, after an enquiry by the Bantu Affairs Commission (Kallaway 1984:162).

Students were not only frustrated by the control of their daily lives, they were also increasingly aware of racism. White staff members did not bother to learn the names of the African students and simply called them 'boy' causing deep resentment. Students also resented the way African staff members were treated by the authorities (WCAD1760 Committee Appointed.....p.13).

4.12. Conclusion

When we evaluate the role played by the English-speaking churches in response to the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act No.47 of 1953, we perceive that there was a struggle within the denominations to create an atmosphere conducive for a united voice. The failure of the church to unite and come up with a common strategy to work against the implementation of Bantu Education Act leaves much to be

desired. It seems that almost all the churches experienced one common problem and that was members who were pro-apartheid and those who were anti-apartheid within the same denomination. From the study done so far, it is evident that almost all the churches which ran schools during the time of the introduction of Bantu education were compelled to react to the oppressive and exploitative way they experienced under the apartheid government. It is clear that Bantu education was the instrument used by the apartheid government to promote the supremacy of the white minority over the black majority in South Africa. Even the churches themselves were at different levels in their response to the developments of Bantu education.

Politics play a very important role in dividing the church and that weakened its role in being prophetic in responding to the introduction of Bantu education in South Africa. One reason for the parting of the ways between the English-speaking churches and the Dutch Reformed Church at the end of the nineteenth century was the fact that tension between the Afrikaners and the British had spread from the Cape to the republics in the Orange Free State and the Transvaal (de Gruchy 1979:23).

The next chapter presents reflections on what transpired during the interviews with the participants. The main focus of this chapter is subject matter knowledge, pedagogical content knowledge, opinions and beliefs of the participants. The findings of this chapter reveal that the implementation of Bantu education was aimed at socialising the African people into believing that they were not good enough to be involved in economic activities of the country, but theirs was to be perpetual servants of the white people in South Africa. Again we saw the church not taking a firm stand against the introduction and implementation of BEA. For example, the Anglican Church bishop's letter to Verwoerd never mentioned the possibility of the Church finding it impossible to continue its work under a secular government which had no popular mandate or under a government that in other ways violated human freedom in almost every measure it passed and in every restriction it imposed (Worsnip 1991: 141). This type of education was designed to ensure that it closed any possible opportunity for an African child to realize his/her full potential as a citizen of this country.

5. THE REACTION OF TWO CHURCH LEADERS

5.1. Introduction

This chapter explains the response of two leaders (clergy) of these two English-speaking churches called the Methodist Church of Southern Africa (MCSA) and the Church of the Province of Southern Africa (CPSA) to the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act. For this chapter to represent the official views of the churches mentioned must reflect the minutes, words and written material presented and reported in the decision making bodies like Synods and Conferences. The prominent role played by church leaders like Bishop Clayton of the Anglican Church and Dr. Webb of the Methodist Church is taken into account.

In the previous chapter, findings were presented in the form of a qualitative analysis. The data gathered from the interviews, the researcher's observations, and the literature was presented. In this chapter, findings are drawn together and reflected upon. The findings of the research are presented by briefly, sharing from four of the individual interviews. Understanding the experiences of the participants and what they went through during the time of the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act No. 47 of 1953, helps us to understand the response of the church, the English-speaking churches in particular, to the Act from a lay person's and clergy's point of view.

5.2. Anglican Church Reacting to Bantu Education

The Bantu Education Act provided the churches with two options to choose from. The first one was for the churches to hand over black education to the government for control by the government. Or they could decide to continue to running their schools as they did in the past but would do so without the financial assistance of the government. The Anglican Church was one of the churches which played an important role in the struggle against the introduction and implementation of Bantu education in South Africa. According to Mr. Faku, the Anglican Church's confrontation with the government occurred between 1953 and 1955. It is well known that many English-speaking churches had a long history of providing education in the European model. From a distance, it is evident that the government was determined to try its level best to

eradicate what they thought was a misplaced European influence in the model of education offered by the mission schools. The Anglican Church had good mission schools, including the famous St Peter's situated in Johannesburg, where Oliver Tambo was educated. The Anglican Church proved to the government that they would not be part of government policy which aimed at destroying the African intellectual and the potential of building a bright future.

This is now the Anglican response. Between 1953 and 1956, Archbishop Clayton's attempts to negotiate with Dr. Verwoerd over Bantu Education revealed that the worst did happen. The Eiselen Commission issued an extensive questionnaire and made a careful analysis of the replies before making its report in 1951 (Clarke 2008:81).

Episcopal Synod and met with the Diocesan board of management for mission schools on 15 November 1954. He wrote immediately to the secretary for Native Affairs, informing him that on 1 April 1955 the Anglican Church would close its schools, throughout the Southern Transvaal. People and organizations tried to resist the implementation of Bantu Education by staging school boycotts. Dr. Verwoerd's counter-measures were savagely effective. Those involved in the boycott were dealt with severely and some were not allowed to go back to school again.

The choice of parents was an almost impossible one - they did not want Bantu Education and they did not want their children on the streets. They had to choose between two evils and no rule of thumb indicated which was greater, as Archbishop Clayton told his synod "a rotten education maybe better than none" (Clarke 2008: 87).

Without state aid, the Anglican Church could not afford to keep its mission schools going. The church was thus faced with the prospect of selling or leasing its school buildings to the department. The choice needed to be made by 31 December 1954. It was an agonizing choice to say the very least. Bishop G. Clayton, an Anglican bishop who was vocal during the introduction of Bantu education, certainly understood the issue at stake. In his charge to the Cape Town diocesan synod of 1953, he stated the issue in clear and concise language:

The Bantu Education Act puts Bantu Education in the hands of the Native Affairs Department, and like other recent legislation it puts dangerously wide powers in the hands of an individual minister. It makes it possible for him to use his power as to make Bantu Education the kind of education which will only fit people for a permanent

inferior positionThere is something peculiarly offensive in educating people to fit them only for an inferior position and then to withhold from them more responsible positions on the grounds that they are not fit for them (Worsnip 1991:125-126).

The English-speaking churches that took the most prominent public stand against Bantu education were the Anglican Church, the Catholic Church and to a lesser extent the Methodist Church. Partly this was because they took a more outspoken stand, and partly it was because the media had given them greater attention as large churches. Other churches that also took a stand included the Presbyterian Church of Southern Africa (PCSA), the Congregational Church and the (black) Reformed Presbyterian Church (Wilson 1991:69).

It is noticeable that in some instances, the above-mentioned churches were not speaking with one voice in their formal gatherings like Synods and Conferences. The fact that they all belonged to the Christian Council of South Africa was advantageous to their stand, by the fact of their being part of the ecumenical movement and speaking with one voice. But every time they stood alone in their home gatherings, there were always dissenting voices. It was not that they were in favour of the introduction and implementation of Bantu education, but they were concerned about the reaction of the state and the use of force to close down the churches in the country.

Another interesting point according to Wilson is that the churches that stood against apartheid and Bantu education had, in contrast to the white Afrikaans churches, the advantage of a racially mixed constituency (Wilson 1991:69). One other important point to note is that fact that once these English-speaking churches were in the hands of black leadership, became significantly more outspoken, for example, Archbishop Desmond Tutu. For the English-speaking churches to have a voice against the introduction and implementation of Bantu education, they had to ignore reactions from conservative white members of their churches.

In 1968 the Christian Institute and the South African Council of Churches (SACC) together issued a *Message to the People of South Africa*. This six-page document declared the ideology and the policy of “separate development” to be in conflict with the Christian gospel as “the good news that in Christ God has broken down the walls of division between God and human beings, and therefore between human beings” (Wilson 1991:70). However, one of the things we note about the response of the English-

speaking churches to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education is the fact that they generally did little to move from statements to action.

One of the main challenges of English-speaking churches was to challenge the Afrikaans-speaking churches by pointing out the theological problems of justifying the introduction and the implementation of Bantu education.

As the Bantu education policy came under severe criticism by other churches, Afrikaner churches were compelled to study the subject anew and even to look for new scriptural proofs. So, ironically, the opposition to apartheid actually contributed to the manner in which it was rationalized and theologized. With scripture pieced together to provide justification, apartheid theology was not a blueprint in the proper sense of the word; it was rather a network of ideas through which the status quo was rationalized and eventually legitimized (Loubser 1987:105-106).

One of the contributing factors that compelled the English-speaking churches to participate in talks against the introduction and implementation was their understanding of the words said by Anglican Archbishop Desmond Tutu:

Apartheid says our value resides in a biological attribute, in this instance, skin colour. A particular skin colour is by definition not a universal phenomenon possessed by all human beings. The Bible, on the other hand, declares that what makes each and every person of infinite, incalculable worth is not this or that biological attribute. It is the fact that we are each created in the image of God (Tutu 1989:43).

It is worth noting that in that apartheid system, education was mandatory for whites, but not for blacks. In fact, were it not for the churches, including the CPSA, who historically believed that “the best way to Christianize and civilize the Africans was to provide them with a European type of academic education”, there would have been virtually no native education. Indeed, Ndungane points out that the church presented a clear threat to the government. One of the major reasons for the attack by the apartheid government against the churches was because of the calibre of education which the churches provided. Since the government approach to Bantu education was to maintain an inferior system which it hoped would discourage Natives from high achievement, it routinely closed church schools which consistently produced leaders in every sphere of South African society (Lewis 2007:44).

It is observed that the government helped the churches to take a stand by forcing the churches to themselves be separated on racial lines. This created a platform for many churches to investigate those things that made them to be on the receiving end of pressure from the apartheid government.

The role played by the Anglican Church is evident in the tenure of Bishop Clayton. By virtue of being a bishop, he felt challenged by the introduction and implementation of Bantu education. In a letter he wrote to the government, a significant shift in the CPSA's approach racial issues was evident. Verbal protests and gentle suggestions gave way, in the document, to an actual challenge and, even more significantly, to the threat of disobedience. Unfortunately the Bishop suffered a fatal heart attack on the very day he put his signature to it. His death served to motivate other churches. The Roman Catholic bishops issued a statement that their churches "must and shall open to all without regard to their racial origin". An ecumenical body, the Christian Council of South Africa, declared, "We shall be forced to disregard the law". The Methodist Church, in a telegram to the Prime Minister, expressed a similar sentiment (Lewis 2007:52-53).

Like all other English-speaking churches, the CPSA understood the introduction and implementation of the Bantu Education Act to mean that the Act was designed to provide Africans with an inferior education, which would deny them the opportunity of working in a sophisticated labour market. The Act proclaimed that from the beginning of 1954, all African education would fall under the department of Native Affairs; denominations and missionary societies would still be able to run their own schools, provided they carried the entire financial burden, and provided the schools were registered by the department. The Episcopal synod of the CPSA, faced with the dilemma of providing no education, or of providing an inferior education, chose the lesser of the two evils, and the decision was taken to continue the school under the control of the department of Native Affairs (Suberg 1999:93).

The Bantu education commissioners, influenced by the Eiselen commission, made it clear that in their understanding the aim of Bantu education was to help African children to know their place within traditional Bantu society. If it was to be coordinated and in harmony with social development, it must be seen as one of the many educational agencies and processes which would lead the Bantu to better and fuller living (Eiselen Commission Report: para 764).

The dilemma which the Anglican bishops faced, that of having to choose between their consciences and the law of the land, was on the very specific question of religious freedom:

Where they were faced with a similar choice, in the case of the Bantu Education Act, (an Act which was to affect the lives of the entire black population of South Africa), though they did not like it, they chose, with one notable dissenter, the path of the “lesser evil”. However, as Huddleston rightly observes, on the issue of Bantu education, the Church of the Province of Southern Africa (CPSA) had failed to act with any real clarity or political will. Politically, the Bantu Education Act No. 47 of 1953 was by far the graver piece of legislation (Worsnip, 1991:142-143).

Geoffrey Clayton, who held the office of Archbishop and Metropolitan of the Church of the Province of Southern Africa (CPSA), believed that the Nationalist government was willing to listen to the Church on the question of Bantu education in 1954 in the same way that he believed that Smuts’ government would take note of the ‘Church and Nation’ report in 1943. The fact that he was proved wrong on these and other occasions did nothing to alter his view on the role of the Church in South Africa (Worsnip 1991:143).

5.3 The Methodist church’s response to Bantu Education

The Methodist Church Annual Conference of 1953 held in Port Elizabeth on Wednesday the 14th of October responded to the Bantu education Bill by approving the following resolution:

The Conference believes that in view of the Bantu Education Act of 1953, providing for the transfer of Native Education to a Government Department, presentation should be made in due course to the Department charged with the drafting of the new Ordinances for the Union, that it gives most careful thought to the section of the code dealing with the management of African schools. The Conference believes that the power of transfer or dismissal of teachers should be conferred on controlling authorities of African Schools in consultation with, and on the authority of the Department concerned, in cases where the unsatisfactory conduct of teachers makes such action desirable. The Conference therefore resolves to approach the Government with the request that prior

consultation takes place with the churches and Missionary Societies with regard to syllabus, regulations, etc., before any Ordinance is published in connection with Native Education under the new authority (Minutes of Conference 1953:97).

Concerning policy in respect to Bantu education, the Conference resolved that: (1) Whilst the Methodist Church has felt compelled to relinquish control of its Schools to the Department of Natives Affairs, it is determined to exercise a Christian influence upon education wherever possible.” Another interesting point is that the 1957 Annual Conference held in East London on Wednesday the 16th October 1957 resolved to encourage ministers of the Methodist Church to serve on school committees and school boards (Minutes of Conference 1957:116-117).

It is clear from the findings of this study that the Methodist Church did not take the introduction and implementation of Bantu education lying down. This is evident in the resolutions taken year in and year out.

Webb served his second term of office as President in 1954/55, and as the President his statements on the Church’s response to Bantu education were widely reported. He had to say the following in his Presidential address:

Never in my own life time, at least, have we been called upon to make such weighty and far- reaching decisions... Our trusteeship in this field [African education] is a most responsible one, and I pray daily that we shall be guided by Divine wisdom to come to right decisions (Methodist Newsletter, 1.11. 1954:1).

Later that month, he complained of the lack of any meaningful consultation with the churches: “... to all intents and purposes we have been kicked out...” However he conceded that the Methodist Church had adopted the attitude “that the education envisaged by the Act is better than no education at all” (Cape Times 27.11.1954)

On a number of occasions, Webb reiterated his belief that it would have been inappropriate for the Church to have defied the Government, mainly because of the effect that such a stand would have had on African education. In 1954 Methodist church administered approximately 2000 school, at which 200 000 students were enrolled, and 5000 teachers employed. On a number of occasions, Webb stated that, taking such figures into consideration, it would have been highly irresponsible for the Church to have forced the closure of all those schools.

Dr Webb prepared a memorandum on south African Methodism before his arrival in Britain in which he noted that “the full implication of Bantu Education Act have still to evidence themselves”, and that the Act had been ”taken through all its stages without consultation with the major partners in the old educational set-up” (MM: Dr Webb’s visit, 1955). He expressed his views on the Act quite unequivocally:

...the Bantu Education Act was not entirely bad. It has ironed out many anomalies that existed under the old Provincial system. It will provide education in the lower classes for twice the number of children who could possibly be accommodated before. Education had completely outstripped the competence of the churches to handle it....Our share in mission education was confined mainly to administration, at the burden of which our men were grumbling and complaining (MMS: Dr Webb’s visit, 1955).

Taking the schools away from the churches was to advance the idea of disempowering the African people. There was as much evidence from the data collected that the government’s introduction of Bantu education was a unilateral decision, underestimating the capability of the African people to participate in forums aimed at shaping their future. Mr. Ngoma (para.15) felt that the Methodist people were too moderate in their approach in fighting apartheid. Using his words we hear the following:

If the church in our country is going to be true to its pastoral, prophetic and critical task, it must also be open to self-criticism and committed to change. It was its theological responsibility to respond by condemning the introduction of Bantu education. What made matters worse was the fact that Bantu education was implemented in the name of separate development which was not theologically based.

According to him, John Wesley believed in a ‘trained mind’. The best place where the mind is trained is the school. It would be unfair to the Methodist Church to agree with Mr. Ngoma’s sentiments on this issue. There is no doubt in the researcher’s mind, as pointed out at the beginnings of this chapter, that the Methodist Church is one of the churches that stood up to challenge the introduction and implementation of Bantu education.

Even the churches themselves were autocratic in their decision to hand over the schools. According to Mr. Nabe (para. 16), we must not forget that during the time in question the churches themselves were under the control of white people. If they talk about their

response to the Bantu education, they must have spoken about between whites. He emphasized the fact that he does not recall a day where those who were going to be affected the most were called in to any meeting to formulate their response as black people. Again we must say there were instances where Christians in their formal gathering like synods and conferences, spent hours on end debating the implications of Bantu education in their lives and activities of the church. All the participants were single-minded about the failure of the church to unite and speak with one voice. The second point raised was the failure of the church to consult the stakeholders in the field of education. Third, this matter of Bantu education was seen as a political issue which did not have prominent space in the agenda of saving souls.

Had the churches consulted the people concerned, they could have picked up the desire and the courage that could have shaped the education system differently. Having said that we cannot conclude that the churches concerned did not involve those they could communicate with under the difficult circumstances. But Allen and Glickman (1998:505) talk of the “hearts and minds”, whereby change comes about because people believe in their hearts, and their minds make it possible. The education received from the missionaries emphasized that all children deserve equitable opportunities and highlighted deep respect for humanity. Hence it was impossible for them to ignore human values.

The change of control of the education system from the church to the Department of Education brought about many changes for the black children. The taking over of the D.F. Malan’s National Party government necessitated an appointment of a commission to investigate a new direction for African education.

A report to the Methodist Church recorder on the address of the chairman, the Rev S. le Grove Smith, to the Queenstown synod, gave an indication of the mixed emotions that were evoked by the ACT:

The Chairman led the Synod step by step through the details of the Bantu Education Act, pointing to the depth of despair brought about by the passing of the act, but (then) lifted Synod to the height with his message of hope and inspiration, pointing out that it would for furtherance of the Gospel [meaning not clear] (JFM in Christian Recorder, 4(a), 1954:7)

The Methodist Newsletter also reported on the chairman's address:

The Act ... was an admission of the state's responsibility for the education of its African people, but it was at the same time discrimination in its bitterest form, for no other racial group has been subjected to this severe hardship. However, we must fully realize that as the bonds of Paul had worked out into the furtherance of the Gospel, so these bonds would do likewise (Methodist Newsletter, 1 September 1954:3).

The Synod resolved to recommend to Conference "that there be no wholesale surrender of our schools, but that regional committees be appointed to consider the merits of each individual school (*Methodist Newsletter* 1.9.1954:3-4). This all took place in the African session of the Synod. The reporter noted that one of the African laymen present has asked the chairman to convey greetings from the African section to the European section, "requesting the Europeans to pray for them". It seems that the Act was not discussed at all in the European session. We must acknowledge the fact that in the 1950s, most synods met in radically segregated lay representative sessions. This practice was gradually discontinued during the sixties.

Another view of the Transvaal Synod is contained in a report on the representative session prepared by Mr. Selokeni: Rev. A. Dugmore reported that it was accepted that administration of the Primary and Secondary schools be relinquished. He had information that the subsidy would be 75% on the teachers' salary. He proposed that Synod should give the schools over to the Government... (but) suggested that the church retains the Hostels as long as possible. Synod accepted and agreed that the church should run the hostels of the Institutions under Government control (TD: Synod Files, 1954 Location Cory Library).

It would be African parents and teachers who would have been asked to sacrifice most if the church had stood firm against the state, and Webb's comment seems to indicate that those teachers who were present at the Transvaal Synod did not feel that they could take that risk. A similar situation prevailed at the conference held later that year. At a meeting of the Christian Council in 1954 in Cape Town, it was noticed by members of the council that there was a fear among some that an attempt would be made by the apartheid regime to indoctrinate the Bantu students and teachers once the transition period was over. Since the Prime Minister had indicated that a certain type of Afrikaner

feels he has a divine right to educate the youth of this country along the lines designed to preserve white supremacy and Western civilization” (Cape Times, 20.5.1954).

Dugmore is on record as having expressed approval for the state takeover of primary schools, since Africans would thus be given greater responsibility for the education of their children. As far as other schools were concerned, he thought “that we should co-operate with the State as that there is something that can be gained for the African people and the kingdom of God” (Cory Library, Rhodes University, Grahamstown, ms 16/598/8, Box 58, Christian Council File).

The 1955 Methodist Missionary Review included two articles on the future of education: the Rev E.W Grant wrote on ‘The End of an Epoch’, and the Rev S.G Pitts on ‘The Beginning of an Era’. Both referred to the objections the church had to the content of Bantu Education. Both stressed the importance of the church responding constructively to the challenge which faced it.

Grant urged that increased attention be paid to Sunday school and youth work in the African congregations: “Here and now there suddenly lies open to us an immense field of services with possibilities beyond our present sight...The end of an epoch must be the beginning of another” (Methodist Missionary Review, 19 June 1955:27). In a similar vein, Pitts commented: “What the church now faces... is really the beginning of a new era in its educational work, and it believes it now has to learn what opportunities the new set-up will afford and seize them to the full (Methodist Missionary Review 19 June 1955:34).

In September 1956, the Board of African Education noted that subversive propaganda was being circulated about the Methodist Church’s policy in respect of Bantu Education. It was recommended that the church should follow the lead of other denominations that had printed a statement in the vernacular on their stance on Bantu Education for distribution free of charge to their members. The following year, however, it was reported that the church had not been able to bear the cost of such a project; instead a circular letter would be sent by the secretary of conference to superintendents of African circuits with the request that the information be circulated among their members. No copies of such a circular have been seen and it is not known whether it was sent out. Whether it would have had the desired effect is, in any event, open to question.

In the ensuing years, pressure was put on the church to adhere to government policy. Two recorded instances have been traced. In the 1957/58 Kilnerton report (Kilnerton was a Methodist school situated in the area of Silverton in Pretoria), it was noted that the Native Affairs Department had agreed to an extension of Kilnerton's special dispensation (to continue to exist in a 'white group area') till the end of 1960, on condition that hostels be handed over to the government at the beginning of 1958. The Department refused to give cogent reasons for this demand and we are left with a firm conviction that it was prompted by a hostile attitude to the Church's racial policy (Cory Library, Grahamstown: ms 15,270. Northern Transvaal Synod minutes, 1958).

An example of the above-mentioned statement is the expropriation of the Federal Theological Seminary from Alice in the Eastern Cape. Dr. Gqubule (2011) writes the following:

The expropriation order served on the Seminary has come as a complete shock, aggravated by the fact that the expropriation order allows only 30 days before the Seminary land and buildings are taken from us. The Minister of Bantu Administration and Development is reported as having stated that it was only after prolonged negotiations that the action against the Seminary has been taken. In fact no such negotiations have taken place. Three years ago the Churches were asked by the Fort Hare University to sell the Seminary. After careful consideration of the request the Churches advised the University of Fort Hare that they were not prepared to sell. No further communication has been received by the Seminary from the University or the government (Gqubule 2011: 67).

5.3. Conclusion

The English-speaking churches researched in this study failed to work together as a collective in resisting the implementation of Bantu education, but they worked tirelessly in their denominations and forums to debate possible options to avoid the implementation of Bantu education. One of the main reasons they handed over their schools to the government was the financial constraints they experienced. It is equally true that they were traumatised by the prospect of losing their schools even though they capitulated. Not only did they lose schools but they also lost the good investment made in the African pupils by providing European education - for them to live a better life in

the country of their birth. The introduction of Bantu education was an opportunity on the side of the Government to develop a unique exclusive education system based on the apartheid policy. There is a difference in the way the literature and participants interviewed define 'Bantu education'. According to some authors, Bantu education was political and to others it was economic. Almost all the participants agree that Bantu education was aimed at making black people inferior to white people for the rest of their lives. Mr. Myoli says it was perpetual colonisation of the mind (Myoli, para. 11-12).

The overt response of the participants paints a picture of the white government deciding what is best for black people in the land of black people without consulting them. What was best in this country belonged to white people and whatever was bad must be given to black people. Education is the tool to empower people and the philosophy of the then government was to make sure that black people would not access this tool of empowerment. The participants in this study were leaders both in the church and the community. The introduction and implementation of Bantu education affected them as students, teachers, professionals and leaders in their communities. The research conducted here reveals that the response of various churches responded in a variety of ways but a common thread was the way the Bantu Education Act affected the church financially. Missionary education was in the hands of the church, but teachers were paid by the government and many churches were not in a position to pay the teachers. However there were teachers who were prepared to sacrifice for the sake of ensuring that Bantu education was not implemented. It is said the archbishop of the Anglican Church, Tata Desmond Tutu, was one of the teachers who resigned from teaching because of the implementation of Bantu education.

The implementation of Bantu education added new problems and intensified old ones. This policy had several intentions:

to end the semi-autonomy of the mission schools; implement a system of school boards and committees that would, it was hoped, include conservative elements in the black community; orient education towards the rural areas, in spite, or because of, increasing urbanisation; control black teachers and pupils more completely; and implement a curriculum that was 'appropriate' for Africans (Morrow, Maaba&Pulumani 2004:7).

The implementation of Bantu education met vigorous opposition in 1955 and 1956, especially from the ill-legal ANC. There was a partially successful attempt to boycott

schools, and set up alternative institutions called ‘cultural clubs’. It was urban parents and teachers, organised mainly by the ANC, who were responsible for the boycott of 1955 to 1956; the bulk of the African pupils in towns were young, in junior primary schools, and not of the age to take independent political stands. Secondary pupils were generally at school in the rural areas, and though they had their own traditions of militancy, these tended to find expression in the idiom of food riots and the like (Morrow, Maaba&Pulumani, 2004:7-8)

The churches, unlike the ANC, did not attempt any organised resistance in a form of public demonstrations or boycotts against the implementation of Bantu education. This is one of the downfalls of the church because they could not put their energies and resources together for them to be effective in their struggle against or for the implementation of Bantu education. Nevertheless, that does not necessarily mean that the churches did not challenge the government in its endeavours to take over the control of the schools.

A theological and practical question which arises from this study is what value does the church, add to the field of education. The engagement and direct participation of the church in the field of education is a direct response of the church of Christ to *Missio Dei*. The main argument in this theological reflection drives us into understanding that the church must be an integral part of education. As seen in the previous chapters that the church could not fold arms and nothing when the government was taking over the schools without the church’s participation and input in how the government was proposing to introduce the Bantu education. There is a unique contribution which the churches bring to the field of education.

The ESC tried individually to provide an alternative to the Bantu education but they could not succeed due to financial constraints. The desire of the church to want to resist Bantu education is like what Tutu argues when he says:

Nothing could be more political than helping a group of slaves to escape from their bondage. For the Israelites, therefore, the Exodus liberation was not just a spiritual or mystical experience. It was highly materialistic and had to do with being protected from an enemy in pursuit, being fed when hungry, being provided with water to quench their thirst (Tutu 1983:74).

The grounded theory analysis concluded by highlighting categories common to their experiences of the church and Bantu education. Despite their similarities in their experiences, there were many differences in the way in their understanding of the response of the churches to Bantu education. It becomes clear through the course of the exploration that the role of the church in the field of education cannot be underestimated. It seemed clear that the challenges of engaging Bantu education could have resulted in obvious clashes between the church and the state.

One could come to the conclusion that the National Party leaders took a negative stand *vis-à-vis* the African mind. There was a strong belief that the African mind, after attaining some inferior education and cultural instruction they would simply outgrow the idea of being treated equal. It is clear from this study that between 1948 and 1994, all teachers who were trained in South Africa under Bantu education in the teachers' training institutions, either colleges or universities, were compelled by law to conform to an educational philosophy that was squarely based on the ideological premises of apartheid education.

The rigidly applied form of education from nursery to university was not done excluding the church. The church itself was the victim of the same government it was expected to work with in providing education to its nation.

6. CONCLUDING EVALUATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1. Introduction

The approach in this study provided the researcher with an opportunity to engage and interact with the participants regarding issues pertinent to this topic. The interpretative orientation is facilitated by the observation and document analysis. The interviews provided a foundation for conversations with participants, through conversation the researcher gained in-depth understanding and relevant insight to his research question. The interviews revealed that there were aspects regarding the participant's experiences that could not get from the written sources.

Through the process of data collection, the researcher experienced some difficulties that could have affected the study, had he not resorted to other strategies. The main challenge encountered was the withdrawal of three of the participants after repeated efforts to visit them for the interviews. The strategy was to focus and add more time for the available participants.

This study aimed at understanding the role played by the English-speaking churches to the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act of 1953. The researcher's interest in this study was prompted by the desire to provide a better understanding of the role of the church in the field of education. This research enabled the researcher to have a better understanding of the role of the church and how it was perceived by those who experience both the mission education and Bantu education system of education. The findings from this study has provided the researcher with many answers that informed his own professional understanding the context in which the churches were struggle with issues related to the implementation of Bantu education.

As shown in chapter one of this study the researcher has adopted an interpretative orientation employing a qualitative case study approach. This approach made it possible for the researcher to engage and interact with the participants regarding issues pertinent to the topic of this study. The interpretive orientation approach is facilitated by integration of three methods which are: oral interviews, data interpretation and document analysis.

The collection data and literature review gave the participants an opportunity to understand the data received during interviews. The oral interviews provided a foundation for conversation with the participants, through these conversations the researcher gained an in-depth understanding and relevant insights to respond to his research question. The interviews revealed that there was something common about the participants was that was their concern about the manner in which the whole issue of Bantu education was handled by those in authority then and the churches. The research did not experience serious difficulties regarding the availability of participants and their actual participation in the study. The warm reception and enthusiasm experienced during interviews has been expressed already by the researcher in the previous chapters.

6.2. The road travelled in this study

The purpose of this study was to explore and analyze critically the role played by the English-speaking churches in the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act no. 47 of 1953. The rationale for the study is based on the view that the role of the church in education yielded positive results for church and nation. Before the introduction and implementation of Bantu education, the churches played a significant role in the provision of education despite the difficulties associated with finances and shortage of human resources. The purpose of this study was to examine how the Bantu Education Act diminished the role of the missionaries in education by using the state power to take overall control and financing of Bantu education. Bantu education, contrary to the missionary education, created value-less cultural communities, taking the African people away from Ubuntu philosophy (it is one of several African approaches to a comprehensive understanding of the process of cultivating cohesion and positive human interaction with one another and with creation in daily life). The other concern was related to the lack of a political will on the part of the then government when it came to the implementation of a value-based education system in South Africa.

It is clear that the introduction and implementation of Bantu education was the cornerstone of apartheid policy, started long before the taking over of National Party in 1948. For example, at the congress of the Free State of the National Party on the 13th October 1921, General Hertzog emphasized that:

It is our firm policy that segregation must take place. To the Black man right will not be given to live where he wishes, but land will be set aside for him...also industrially there must therefore be separation between the two races, otherwise there will be no peace in South Africa (Radebe 1989: 15).

Data collected during the course this research provided evidence that racism was the motivating factor behind the introduction of Bantu education. This was motivated by individuals, groups and by the secondary sources. One example of collective institutional racism is the findings of the Eiselen Commission. An example of conscious racism is contained in the speech of Dr. Verwoerd when motivating for the introduction of Bantu education in line with the implementation of apartheid policy.

The response of the churches is to be drawn from their understanding and the manner in which they had experienced Bantu education. No one can dispute the fact that the Bantu Education Act was aimed at destroying the dignity of the black children and the education rooted in missionary education. Many church schools were forced to close down and the education of the black children was taken over by the government based on apartheid policy. Among the churches we investigated, it was clear that the government in its endeavour to take away the dignity of the black pupils, the following points were set out:

- The government should assist churches to provide an educational system aimed at an integrated approach to benefit all of its citizens irrespective of their race.
- education resources should be made available to all pupils of the land irrespective of their skin colour.
- the central government should decentralize the educational system based on geographic regions or areas rather than ethnic divisions.
- the state should commit itself to a formal and compulsory education for all children irrespective of their gender and race (Paine 1981: 61)

6.3. Overview of the main findings

Findings in this study have shown that the response of the church to the introduction and implementation of BEA was silence in terms of action, but not always. Deliberation

on BEA exacted a great deal of energy and time from many churches and their leadership. As stated in the previous chapter, the church talked about Bantu education but failed to act in resisting it. What is clear from the research is that almost all the churches were not pleased with the implementation of Bantu education, and they ended up in a state of confusion about their role in the field of education. At the time, churches were central in providing education in the country. Hence the following observations are included:

The findings of this study leave a challenge to the church and those involved in the field of education to recognise that education is a call of God to equip and empower God's people to challenge social ills like poverty, crime, corruption etc.

The second point raised by the participants in this study is the need for a dialogue between the church and the government, the department of education in particular. The main argument was the need to respect the views of the parents who happened to be Christians and respect the role of the church in their lives.

The researcher is saying this study pointed out the importance of taking into account their context of vulnerability. One of the initial emotions displayed by the participants was that of hoping that the church was going to remedy the situation by having an open dialogue with state on behalf of the poor, the vulnerable and the victims of the system. Their experience was somewhat different to their expectation.

The present study explored the meaning and experiences of the participants interviewed, all of whom came from different places. A grounded theory analysis (a method of analysing is observed and the interpretation is guided by the fact that points are from the participants) of the interviews with the participants suggested the following insights.

The church and education fulfilled a diversity of roles in the lives of the participants and members of the community at large. There was nothing suggesting that the church was in support of the Government actions of taking over the schools, except for the one reason and that was related to finances. Clarke (2008) comes to a conclusion that the trenchant criticism by black teachers provided the most striking commentary upon African perceptions concerning the application of the new system of Bantu Education. Whilst there were many who were careful to keep their own counsel for fear of victimisation, and some others spoke up in favour of the state control for the same reason, a significant number of African teachers did neither. Some left the profession.

Others raised their voices in urgent criticism of the serious short-comings of the state control. The Department of Native Administration issued regulations governing the conditions of service of Bantu teachers in government schools, defining “misconduct” for which summary dismissal was the penalty (Clarke 2008: 86-87).

Looking on the positive side of the study it is revealed that all the participants were people who had an experience of both mission education and Bantu education at different levels; some experienced both systems of education as teachers and students.

They showed competency in the way they handled the questions and conversation during our interviews and they revealed conceptual understanding of how the mission education and Bantu education operated. The way they were so involvement in their church’s activities brought about intelligent and academic insights about how they perceived the response of the ESCs to Bantu education.

6.4. Recommendations

It is the opinion of the researcher

- That all stakeholders in the field of education should be given an opportunity to make their contribution and use their valuable experience
- that discussion be held to design a robust, well-informed and responsible process aimed at making education accessible to all.
- that a community-based consultation look at the context of the people in order to offer a job creating education system.
- that the Department of Education take the responsibility of researching the causes of high rate of unemployed graduates.
- that the findings and recommendations contained this study be presented to the key stakeholders who play an important role in the field of education.

Obviously new lessons are to be learned from the mistakes of the past and the purpose of this section is to pick up on the areas worth noting for future reference. Although it could be argued that education today is offered by the government of the people by the people for the people, in terms of the manner in which it handles the needs of people,

especially those involved in education, there are important lessons to be learnt from the history of how education was handled from the religious, ideological and political agenda. This study has identified and described both the positives and negatives of education in the hands of the church. Some of the recommendations are as follows:

- Integrated and desegregated schools in South Africa need developmental and educative programmes to address the legacy of the Bantu education. The Bantu education did not come by default but by design to ensure that black people of this country are perpetually excluded from the mainstream of our economy.
- Curriculum development in the schools should ensure that learning material is inclusive of the continuous deepening of values at all schools both in urban and rural areas of our country.
- It is imperative for those churches which are in the process of promoting the opening of doors to learning, culture and transformation should help the government to cultivate a culture of holistic approach to education.

Future studies that are similar to this research work should include or address the following:

- A comprehensive study on how the universities could help the Department of Education to draw up a curriculum aimed at decreasing the high rate of unemployed graduates in our country.
- An impact that could be made in the field of education by the lessons drawn from the implementation of the Bantu education system in South Africa.
- A comparative study to explore the difference between those people who were products of Bantu education and those who were products of missionary education in South Africa.
- Lessons for the church to unite and resist anything that threatens the continued existence of the human values in the area of education.
- A study aimed at ensuring that the government encourages the implementation of an education system that promotes liberated minds rather than one that enslaves the citizens it ought to protect.

The final summary of this study, its findings, conclusion and recommendations should help the church to take up its rightful position on issues related to field of education. The church should, with its Gospel imperative and experience in the field of education, feel compelled to help in the crisis of education.

6.5. Conclusion

This study was qualitative and narrative in nature. It provided insight into the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education. At the same time it raised many questions that suggest a need for further research. Atkinson and Delamont (2005: 835) indicate that “what people say is a form of action”. In relation to this statement, the churches failed to translate what they said about the dangers of the implementation of Bantu education and their willingness to take concrete action against the implementation of Bantu education in South Africa. We learn from this study that churches can play a positive role in reminding those responsible for the implementation of education that education can easily become an instrument of oppression, or emancipation. If ideology is the driving force or the motivation for implementing a certain kind of education, this study tells us that the results are likely to be oppression. But if the motivation is emancipation the church must be able to influence the implementation of human values. People in the image of God should be respected for who they are rather than what they can achieve in pleasing those in authority.

Lincoln and Denzin (2000:1047), talking about the future, raise the concept of “the seventh moment” (this concept is referred to as the moment of completion). The concept, based on their discussion around qualitative research, has been relevant to the conclusion of this study. The authors emphasize the point that “writing the present is always dangerous”, teaching us that what is popular today might not be popular in ten or twenty years’ time from now. When Dr Verwoerd wrote the laws of Bantu education, he was convinced that the ideas and what they did then to keep African people in their rightful position, according to their thinking, would be forever popular. The second point raised by their debate is the shared belief that political liberation must always begin with the perspective, desires, and dreams of those individuals and groups who have been oppressed by the larger ideological, economic, and political forces of a society or a historical moment (Lincoln & Denzin 2007:1048).

One of the positive research findings is that education based on values is sure to produce leaders and professional of integrity and moral standards. In any research work it is important for the researcher to be informed of the background, attitudes or biases against certain aspects of the community targeted for the study. The use of good research methods and acceptable approaches helps to eliminate some of the concerns regarding the authenticity of the findings.

Because some of the churches were resistant to the new changes in the education system, they expressed their satisfaction by giving little co-operation to the state, without actually exposing themselves to possible victimisation by the state.

7. BIBLIOGRAPHY

Primary Sources

Archives:

Cory Library, Rhodes University, Grahamstown, South Africa:

MS 786 Lovedale Institution records

MS 7277 South African Teachers Association

MS 14230 Lovedale Institution Records

MS 14517-14557 Congregational Union of South Africa 1834-1963.

MS 15001-15944 Records of the Methodist Church of Southern Africa 1749-1979.

MS 16598 Healdtown Institution 1927-1976.

PR 3548,3550-3562,3564-3593,3596-3603 Methodist Church of South Africa, Mission Education.

PR 3953 B. Mahlasela 1951-70.

Other Printed Primary Sources

I Grant, Healdtown Institution 1855-1955; Centenary Brochure (Healdtown Institution, Healdtown, 1955)

H. Verwoerd, Bantu Education Policy for the Immediate Future Government Printer, Pretoria, 1954).

Oral Interviews:

Zonwabele Nabe (Alice, 05 October 2007)

Bongani Ngoma (Grahamstown, 24 September 2007)

Thembanani Faku (Grahamstown, 17 September 2007)

NomathembaSekati (Stanger, 11 November 2008)

Vuyo Myoli (Mlazi, 11 October 2007)

Aaron Mfengu (Tembisa, 15 October 2007)

Sizwe Nogantshi (Fort Beaufort, 27 August 2007)

Nozizwe Grootboom (Port Elizabeth, 08 December 2008)

George Lubelwana (Welkom, 30 September 2007)

Abrahams, G. (1989). *The Catholic Church and apartheid: The response of the Catholic Church in South Africa to the first decade of National Party rule, 1948 – 1957*. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Allan, G. (1961). *Verwoerd – the end: a look-back from the future*. Cape Town: Purnell and Sons

Allen, L.& Glickman, C.D. (1998). *Restructuring and renewal: Capturing the power of democracy*. In A. Hargreaves, A. Lieberman M. Fullan& D. Hopkins (Eds.), *International handbook of educational change* (pp. 505 – 528). Dordrecht, Boston, London: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Anderson, J. D. (1988). *The education of Blacks in the South, 1860 – 1935*, London: University of Carolina Press

Arber, R. (2008). *Race ethnicity and education in globalised times*. Amsterdam, Springer Science and Business Media Reproduction, in Kallway P. (eds) *Apartheid and Evaluation; The education of Black South Africans*. Johannesburg: Ravan Press 160 - 183

Atkinson, R.C. (1968). *A proposed system and its control processes*, New York: Academic Press

Babbie, E.& Mouton, J. (2005) *The Practice of Social Research*. Oxford University: Press

Balia, D.M. (1989)*Christian Resistance to Apartheid*, Johannesburg: Skotaville publishers

Banister, P. Burman, E. Parker, I, Taylor, M. &Tindall, C. (1994).*Qualitative methods in psychology: A research guide*, Buckingham: Open University Press

Bassey, B. (1999). *Case Study Research in Educational Setting*. Buckingham: Open University Press
Bassey, M. (1999). *Case Study research in educational settings*, Berkshire: Open University Press

Bate, S.C. 1999 'The church Under Apartheid,' in Brain, J & Denis, P. (ed.)*The Catholic Church in contemporary Southern Africa*. Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications, 314 – 348

Baur, J. (1994). *2000 Years of Christianity in Africa: An African Church History*, London: St Paul Multimedia

Beinant, W. & Dubow, S. (1995) The historiography of Segregation and apartheid. In W. Beinant & S (eds), *Segregation and apartheid in the twentieth – century South Africa* (pp. 1-25)

Berg, B. L. (1998). *Qualitative research methods in the social sciences* (3rded) Boston: Allyn & Bacon Publishers

Berg, B.L. (2004). *Qualitative research methods for social sciences*, Boston: Pearson Publishers

Berger P.L. & Goodsel, B. (1988). *A Future South Africa*, Cape Town: SABA Foundations

Behr A. (1988) *Education in S.A. Origins, Issues and Trends: 1952-1988*, Pretoria: Academica Pretoria.

Berh, L.A. & Macmillan, R. G. (1966). *Education in South Africa*, Cape Town: Cape and Transvaal Printers Ltd

Blasé, J. (1991). *The Politics of Life in Schools*, London: Coruin Press

Biko, S. (1978). *I write what I like: Selected writings*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Boesak A. (1977), *Farewell to Innocence*, New York: Maryknoll

Boonzaier, F. (2005). Women abuse in S.A: A brief contextual analysis. *Feminism and Psychology*, 15 (1), 99 – 103

- Britton, H.(2006) Organising against violence in S.A. Journal of Southern African Studies, 32 (i) 148 -163
- Bray, M. (with Lillis K. 1988) Community Financing of Education: Issues and Policy Implications in Less Developed Countries. NewYorkPergamon.
- Bryman, A. (2004). Social Research Methods (2nded.). Oxford:Oxford University Press.
- Buckland P. and Hofmeyer J. (1993) Education and Governance in South Africa, Johannesburg: The Urban Foundation.
- Calitz, L., Funglestad, O.L., &Livayort S. Leadership in Education.Sandown :Heineman Publishers (Pty) Ltd.
- Campbell, B. (2004). Phenomenology as Rsearch Method (pp. 1-7) Victoria: Victoria University of Technology (online) available <http://www.vu.edu.au/alinng/paper/bev.html> (2004, November 11)
- Cantell, D.C. (1993). Alternative paradigms in environmental research : The interpretative perspective. In R. Mraazak (Ed.).Alternative paradigms in education research.Lathbridge: NAAEE
- Charmz, K. (1994). “The Grounded Theory Method : An explication and interpretation”. In Glaser, B.More Grounded theory Methodology : A reader, pp. 95 – 115. Mill Valley : Sociology Press
- Christie, P.& Collins, C. 184. Bantu Education: Apartheid Ideology and Labour
- Christine, P. (1990). Open Schools, Braamfontein: Ravan Press (Pty) Ltd.
- Clarke, B. (2008). Anglicans against apartheid,Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications
- Cochrane J. (1987), Servants of Power, the role of the English-speaking Churches in South Africa 1903 – 1930. Johannesburg: Ravan Press
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., &Marrison K., (2000) Research methods in education, London: Routledge
- Cohen, L., Manion, L. & Manson K.(2007). Research methods in education (6thed). London: Routledge

- Cole E. (1967) *House of Bondage*, New York: random House
- Comaroff, J. (1985). *The culture and history of a South African People*, Chicago: Skotaville publishers
- Comeras, C. (1996). *Nursery-aged Child: A developmental view*. *Steiner Education* 30 (1), 6 – 11
- Colaizzi, P.E. (1978). *Psychological Research as the Phenomologistview it*. In *Existential Phenomological Attending for Psychology*, Edited by R.S. Valle and M. King (pp. 48 -71). New York : Oxford University Press.
- Curtis, S.J. (1963). *History of Education*, Cambridge: University Tutorial Press
- Creswell J.W. (2003). *Research design: Qualitative, and mixed methods approach* (2nded) Thousand Oak: Sage publications
- Davenport T.R.H. (1998) *The Transfer of Power in S.A.* Cape Town: David Phillip
- Dean E., Hartmann P. &Katzen M (1983) *History in black and white: an analysis of South African school history textbooks*, Paris: united Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
- De Gruchy, J.W. (1979) *The Church Struggle in South Africa*. Cape Town: David Phillip
- De Kiewiet, C. (1975) *A History of S.A.: Social & Economic*, Oxford: Oxford University Press
- Denzin, N.K. & Lincoln, Y.S. (eds). (1994). *Handbook of qualitative research*. California: Sage Publications.
- Denzin, N.K. & Lincoln, Y.S. (2000).*Handbook of qualitative research*. California: Sage Publications.
- Du Toit, P. (2001) *South Africa, Peace: The problem of post- settlement violence*. New York: NY Polgrane
- De Vos, A.S., Strydom, H., Fouche, C.B.,&Delpont, C.S.L. (2005) *Research at Grass roots*. (3rd Ed.). Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

- Dielties, V. and Motimele M. (2003) Review of S.A educational policy 2000-2002. Pretoria: Department of Education
- Dixison, A.D. and Rousseau C.K. (2006). U.S.A. Education and Children, U.S.A., Library of Congress Cataloguing – in- Publication Data
- Dultz, R. (1994). Educating the entire person. U.S.A.: Library of Congress
- Duncan, G. A. (2003). Lovedale Coercive Agency, Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications
- Easton, S.C. (1975). Man and world in the light of anthroposophy. New York: Anthroposophic Press
- Eggleston, J. Dunn, D. & Young, A. (1986). New York: The Bemrose Press Ltd
- Eisenhardt, K.M. (2002). Building Theories from Case study research: In A M Huberman & M.B. Miles (eds) The qualitative researcher's companion, Thousand Oak: Sage publications
- Fairelough, N. (2001). Language and Power (2nded). London: Longman
- Faloli, T. (200). Key events in African history, New York: Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publications Data
- Fontana, D. (1985) Classroom Control, London: British Psychological Society
- Fulani, T. B. (1988). People's Education for People's Power, London: Longman Publishers
- Gillhan, B. (2000). Case Study Research Methods. London: Continuum
- Giorgi, A. (1985). Sketch of a Psychological Research (pp. 1 – 7). Edited by A. Giorgi, Pittsburgh: Duquesne University Press.
- Glaser, B. G. & Strauss, A. C. (1967) The Discovery of Grounded Theory, Chicago: Aldine Press
- Green, B. (2009). The primary practice and the problem of representation, Rotterdam: Sense publishers

Green, D. (1994) What is quality in Higher education? The society for research into higher education, London: Open University Press

Grundy, S. (1987).Curriculum, Product or Praxis, London: The Falmer Press.

Harber C. (2001) State of Transition: Post Apartheid Educational Reform in S.A.London: Symposium Book.

Goulding, C. (2002). Grounded Theory: A practical guide for management, business and market research, London: Sage Publications.

Gqubule, S. T. (1996). Meet the Brown Bomber, Alice: Lovedale Press

Hall, K. & Young, A. (1979).Education and the Black experience, California, R&E research associates, inc.

Hartshorne, K. (1990), Crisis and Challenge of Black education, London: Oxford University Press

Hewson L.A. (No Year) An introduction to South African Methodists, Cape Town: The Standard Press, Limited

Hinschliff, P.G.(1968) The Church in South Africa. London: SPCK

Hirson, B. (1979). Year of Fire, Year of Ash: The Soweto Revolt: Roots of a Revolution? London: Zed Press

Hodne I. E (1997).Missionary Enterprise in African Education (The Cooperating Lutheran Missions in Natal, South Africa, 1925 – 1955).Stavanger: Allservice A/s, Stavanger

Hofmeyr, J.W. and Pillay, G.J. (1994) A History of Christianity in South Africa.Vol. 1. Pretoria. HAUM

Horell M. (1968) Bantu Education in 1968, Johannesburg: South African Institute of Race Relations

Huberman, A.M. and Miles, M.B. (1994). Data management and Analysis Methods : In: N.K. Denzin& Lincoln, S. Yvonna (Eds), Handbook of Qualitative Research: Thousand Oaks : Sage

- Hyslop, J. (1991). *Food, Authority and Politics*, Johannesburg: Ravan Press
- Jansen, J.A. (1998). *Curriculum reform in South Africa, a critical analysis of outcomes based education*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Jansen J. and Sayed Y. (2001) *Elementary Educational Policies: The S.A. Experience*. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press
- Kallaway P.(ed) *Apartheid and Education, Reproduction: in The Education of Black South Africans*. Johannesburg: Ravan Press, 160 – 183.
- Kearney, P.(ed)2006. *The memoirs of Archbishop Denis E. Hurley OMI*. Pietermaritzburg: cluster Publications.
- Kallaway, P. (1984). *Apartheid and Education*. Johannesburg: Ravan Press (Pty) Ltd.
- Kallaway P. (1998) *Reconstruction, Reconciliation & Rationalisation in S.A. Politics of Education*, Johannesburg: Ravan Press (Pty) Ltd
- Kallaway, P.(ed)2002. *The History of Education under Apartheid, 1948 – 1994: the Doors of learning and culture shall be Opened*. New York: P. Lang Press
- Kallaway, P. Krius, G. Fatear A.&Donn, G. (1997). *Education after apartheid, South African education in transition*, Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press
- Kelly, A. V. (1995). *Education and Democracy*, London. British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
- Kogan, SM. (1975) *Education Policy Making*. London: Allen and Unwin Publications
- Kraak, A. 1998, *Competing Education and Training Policy Discourses*, Maryknoll: Orbis David Philip
- Krueger, R. A. & Cassey, M.A. (2000). *Focus groups: A Practical guide for applied research*: Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- Kruger, R.A. (1994). *Focus Groups :A practical guide for applied research*. London: Sage

- Lachman, G. & Rudolf, S. (2007), An introduction to his life and work. Edinburgh: Floris Books
- Lemon, A. (1976), Apartheid, A geography of Separation, England. Saxon House, Teakfield Ltd
- Lerumo, A. (1987). Fifty Fighting Years, London: Inkululeko Publishers.
- Lincoln Y.S. &Denzin, N.K. (2000). The seventh moment: out of the past. In N.K. Denzin& Y.S. Lincoln (Eds.), Handbook of Qualitative Research (2nd ed.), (pp. 1047 – 1065). Thousand Oaks, London, New Delhi: Sage Publications
- Linden, I. (1994) Back to Basics: Revisiting Catholic Social Teaching, London: CIIR
- Loram C.T (1917) The Education of the South African Native, New York: Longman, Green and Co.
- Lungu G.F. The Educational Policy Process in Post- Apartheid South Africa Johannesburg: Orbis David Philip
- Luthuli, A. (1963). Let My People Go, London: Collins Clear-Type Press
- Madriz, E. (2000). Focus groups in Feminism Research In N.K. Denzin& Y.S. Lincoln (Eds) Handbook of Qualitative Research. London: Sagepp. 45 - 53
- Magubane, B. (1993) 'Apartheid' in The Oxford Companion to Politics of the World. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Maso, J. (2002). Qualitative Research. (2nd Ed.). London: Sage Publications
- Mansburgh, N. (1909). South Africa 1906 – 1961, London: Oxford University Press
- Mashemba G. (1990) A Conceptual Critique of the People's Education Discourse (Johannesburg: Educational Policy Unity, Aldestat, Herts Press
- Matthews, Z.K. (1981). Freedom for my people. Memoir by M. Wilson: London : Rex Collins Press
- Malherbe, E.G.1969. Bantu Manpower and Education A Theme Paper delivered on January 17 at the 1969 Conference on Education, Johannesburg: South African Institute of Race Relations.

Malherbe, E.G.1977. Education in South Africa Volume 2(1923 – 1975). Cape Town: Juta& Co., LTD

Malherbe, E. F. J. & Beckmann, J. L. (2003) Education Law, Pretoria: university of Pretoria Press

Maxell, J.A. (2005) Qualitative research design: An interactive approach (2nded) California: sage

Maykit, P. &Morelanse, R. (1974). Beginning Qualitative Research: a philosophical and practical guide, London: Falmer Publishers

Mbali, Z. (1987) The Churches and Racism (A black South African perspective) London: SCM Press

Mbeki G. (1984) South Africa: The Peasant's Revolt London: International Defence and AID Fund.

McGregors R.A. (1992). Education Alternatives. Cape Town : The Rustica Press.

McKenney, B. (1994) Reconstructing Education for a New S.A., Johannesburg: David Philip

McMillan, J.H. &Schumcher, S. (2001). Research in Education.A Conceptual Introduction.(5th Ed.). New York. Addison Wesley Longman, Inc.

Merriam, S. B. (2001). Qualitative research and case study application in education, San Francisco: Jasse-Bass

Miles, M.B. & Huberman, A.M. (1994).An expanded source book: Qualitative Data analysis. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications

Mminele S.P.P. (1995). History of Education. Pretoria: National Books Printers

Merriam, S.B. (2002). Introduction to Qualitative Research. In S.B. Merriam (Ed.), Qualitative Research in Practice: examples for discussion and analysis. San Francisco, Jasse-Bass.

Merriam, S.B. (2001). Qualitative research and case study applications in education (5thed.) New York. Longman

- Morrow, S.&Maaba B &Puluman. (2002). Education in Exile, Cape Town.HSRC Press.
- Mouton, J. (1996), Understanding Social Research. Pretoria: Van Schaik publishers
- Mugambi, J.N.K.,(1995). From Liberation to Reconstruction: African Theology After the Cold War, Nairobi: East African Educational Publishers
- Mutloatse, M. 1983. Hope and suffering, sermons and speeches.The Right Reverend Desmond MpiloTutu. Johannesburg: Skotaville Publishers.
- Mwamwenda, T.S. (2004) Educational Psychology, An African Perspective. South Africa, Heinemann Publishers (Pty) Ltd
- Neuman, W.L. (2003). Social research methods qualitative and quantitative approach (5thed) Boston: Pearson Education Incl.
- Ngcokovane, C. (1989). Demons of Apartheid, Johannesburg: Stokaville publishers
- Okul, H. (1976). Church and Politics in East Africa, Nairobi: Uzima Press Limited
- Olssen, M. (2004).Culture and Learning. New York Library of Congress Cataloguing – in- Publication Data
- Pathon, M.Q. (2002) Qualitative research and Evaluation Methods (3rd) London, Thousand Oaks: Sage
- Paton, A. (1973) Apartheid and the Archbishop: The Life and Times of Geoffrey Clayton. London: Jonathan Cape, 1974. First published by David Philip
- Paton D. M. (1958) Church and race in South Africa, London: SCM Press
- Patton, M.Q. (1990). Qualitative evaluation and research methods (2nded.) London. Sage Publications
- Pells, E.G.(1938). 300 years of education. South Africa, Johannesburg: The Rasica Press
- Peires J.B. (1981) The house of Phalo: a history of the Xhosa people in the days of their independence, Johannesburg: Ravan
- Peterson, K.M. (2003). How do I teach ... and keep my sanity. Markhorn, Ontario: Pembroke Publishers

- Pelze, A.N. (1996) Verwoerd Speaks, Johannesburg: APB publishers
- Polkinghorne, D.C. (1989). Phenomenological Research Methods. In Existential Phenomenological Perspectives in Psychology : Exploring the Breath of Human Experience. Edited by Valle and S. Halling (pp. 45 -46). New York:Plenum Press
- Polkinghorne D.E. (2005). Language and meaning: Data collection in qualitative research. Journal of Counselling Psychology. London: Routledge
- Rakotsane, F.C.L. &Rakotsane M.A. (2006).The ABC of Research Project, Dissertation and Thesis Proposal Writing. Lesotho: Choice Publishing co. Randall, P. (1972). Apartheid and the Church, Johannesburg : Christian Institute of Southern Africa.
- Ridding R. & Butterfield, S. (1990). Assessment and Examination in the Secondary School. New York: Library Cataloguing
- Roberts, C.M. (2004). The dissertation journey: A practical and comprehensive guide to planning, writing, and defending your dissertation. Thousand Oaks, California: Corwin Press
- Rose, B. &Tunner, R. (1975) Documents in South African education, Johannesburg: A.D. Donker Printers
- Sayer, A. (2000).Realism and social Science, London: Sage
- Shepherd, R.H.W. (1994).Lovedale, South Africa: The story of a century, 1841 – 1941, Alice: Lovedale Press
- Short, A. (1985).Seeking Change, Nederlands. Bernard van leer foundations.
- Skemp,.R. (1971). The Psychology of learning Mathematics, Harmondsworth, UK : Penguin Publishers.
- Skemp, R. (1989) Mathematics in the primary school , London : Routledge
- Silverman, D. (2004). Qualitative research Theory, Method and Practice, (2nded.). London: Sage Publications

- Smith, C. (1991). *The emergence of Liberation Theology: Radical religion and social movement theory*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press
- Smith, E.W. (1949). *The Blessed Missionaries*. London. Oxford Press
- Sono, T. (1999). *African Teachers's struggle for educational justice*. South Africa Pretoria, J.L. van Schalk Publishers
- Staley, B. (1996), *Between form and freedom*. U.S.A. Stroud. Harthorn Press
- Steiner, (1996), *The education of the Child*. Hidson , U.S.A. Anthropomorphic Press
- Stone, C. & Russell, R.F. (2000). *Transformation versus servant leadership*, London: Sage
- Stones, C.R. (1988). *Research : Towards a Phenomenological Praxis*. In D. Kruger. *Introduction to Phenomenological Psychology* (pp. 141 – 152). Cape Town :Juta and co.
- Strassberger, E. (1974) *Ecumenism in South Africa 1936 – 1960*, Johannesburg: Zeninth Printers
- Strauss, A. & Corbin, J. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research. Grounded theory Procedures and techniques*. Newburg Park: Sage Publications.
- Tabata I.B. (1960) *Education for Barbarism in South Africa, Bantu (Apartheid) Education*, London: Pall Mall Press
- Terre-Blanche, M., & Durrheim, K. (eds). (1999) *Research in practice: Applied Methods for the social sciences*. Cape Town: UCT Press
- Thorne, S. (2000). *Data analysis in qualitative stage*, California: Sage
- Trochim, W.M.K., (2001) *Research Methods Knowledge Base*, Cincinnati: Atomic do
- Tutu, D. (1999). *No future without forgiveness*, London: Random House
- Tutu, D. (1989). *The Words of Desmond Tutu*, London: Hodder& Stoughton Press
- Van Dijk, T.A. (1998) *Ideology: A Multidisciplinary Approach*. London: Sage

Van Manen, M. (1988). *Researching Lived Experience : Human Science for an Action Sensitive Pedagogy*. Canada. Alehouse Press.

Van Rensburg, F.A. (1975). *Trends in Bantu education in the Republic of South Africa*, Pretoria: Institute for Statistical Research, Human Research Council

Villa-Vicencio, C. (1988). *Trapped in Apartheid: A Sociological History of English-speaking churches*, New York and Cape Town: Orbis/David Philip

Villa-Vicencio, C and de Gruchy W. (eds) (1986). *Resistance and Hope*, Cape Town: David Philip

Walker, E. A. (1957). *A History of Southern Africa*, London: Longmans, Green and co.

Walsh, C.E. (1996) *Education Reform and Social Change*, New York., Library of Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

Walshe P. (1995) *Prophetic Christianity and the Liberation Movement in South Africa*. Pietermaritzburg, Cluster Publications

Walshe, P.,(1970) *The Rise of African Nationalism in South Africa: The African National Congress, 1912 – 1952*, London: C. Hurst,

Whiteside J. (1906) *History of the Wesleyan Methodist Church of Southern Africa*, Cape Town: Ravan

Wilson, L. (1991). *Steve Biko: A Life: understanding dissonance in oral history*, Cape Town: David Philip Publishers

Wilson, D.M. (1991). *Against the Odds, the struggle of the African night schools 1945 – 1967*, Cape Town: Centre for African Studies

Worsnip, M. E. (1991), *Between the Two Fires*, Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press

Yin, R. K. (1989). *Case Study Research: Design and methods*. Beverly Hills CA: Sage publications

Newspapers, Journals and Periodicals

Conference Minutes: The Methodist Church of Southern Africa, 1950 -1956

The Congregationalist: official organ of the Congregational Union of South Africa, 1949 – 1950

Daily Dispatch; October 1954

Healdtown: the annual report of the Healdtown missionary Institution, 1947-1963

The Presbyterian Leader: a monthly magazine issued under the auspices of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church of South Africa, 1949 - 1950

The American Peoples Encyclopaedia, (1966),New York: Grolier Incorporated1966.

Perry H. Educational Demands and Principles of the Progressive Educational Movement,1992

Nzimande B. Inside Parliament : Making Laws and contesting Policy in South Africa Education,2001

Manganyi N.C. Public Policy and the Transformation of Education in S.A, 2001

Mothopo, M.A. A. Phenomenological evaluation of outcomes based education with specific influence in South Africa, Praelisnai, 2004

Lemmer, E. Educational Renewal in S.A. : Problems and prospects, 1991

Lewis, S.G. and Motala, S. Educational Decentralisation and the quest for equality, democracy and quality, 2004

Muller J. People's Education and The National Education Crisis Committee 1987

8. APPENDICES

8.1. APPENDIX (A)

The Referencing Style

The referencing of the data from the interviews is done in such that it make life easy for the researcher to present the findings as correctly as possible. To avoid confusion from the data collected, transcribed and presented an academically accepted system of referencing was to be adopted and that system is as follows: The number we will see indicates the number of the interview, for instance if the number is 5 means that the information presented is from the 5th interview and the number to follow will signifies the page number of the transcribed data from that interview. The third number to follow will be indicating line numbers from the page of the interview. The simple clear example is as follows: (5;3;21-24). The numbers in the bracket above means the data is from the 5th interview and the page is third page and the lines in that page are from line 21 to line 24.

8.2. APPENDIX (B)

Questionnaire

This questionnaire is about your personal experience regarding the response of the English-speaking churches to the introduction and implementation of Bantu Education Act of 1953.

Please note the following:

- There are neither correct nor wrong answers
- You will remain anonymous before, during and after this study
- Information from this questionnaire will only be used for research purposes
- Your experience is more important than any possible political affiliation.

Section A:

Date of Birth	
Occupation	
Level of Education	
Gender	
Home Language	
Denomination	
Area of your Schooling	
Area of your employment	
Employed for how long	

Section B

This country would be a better place if Bantu education was not introduced and implemented! To what extent do you agree / disagree with above mentioned statement and why?

What were your likes/dislikes about the implementation of Bantu education?

Was there anything good about it?

What are your views regarding introduction and implementation of Bantu education?

Do you feel the skin colour was factor in education?

Was the government justified by introducing and implementing B.E?

How did both perpetrators and victims handle the issue of Bantu education?

What system of education was there before the Bantu education?

How was that system?

What role did it play in the development of the African child in South Africa?

Was your church involved in the education system before the introduction of Bantu education?

What was your church reaction to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education?

Do you consider the church response to be an appropriate one?

Do you believe that the church was justified in its response?

Do you think the role of the church had an impact in the way education was implemented in South Africa?

Share some debates about Bantu education inside and outside the church.

What was the reaction of the church, teachers and students to the introduction and implementation of Bantu education?

Share more information about you being a student during the time of missionary education and Bantu education.

Do you agree that church involvement in education promotes good moral standing in society?

Now that you are reflecting on the impact of Bantu education, what sort of feeling does it evoke in you?

Is there any written material you can share with the researcher?

If you have got any questions or comments or additional information to share, feel free to talk to the researcher.

Thank you for taking out time to participate in this interview. The researcher wishes to express his heartfelt appreciation and gratitude for your full co-operation and participation in this study. It is our hope that this shall help us to take further steps to influence the government to improve education system in our country.

8.3. APPENDIX (C).

Letter of consent to participant

Dear

Part of my PhD research work is based on a questionnaire. The research takes the form of a study, using both qualitative and quantitative approaches. My intention is to conduct interviews. These oral interviews will be conducted by the researcher himself.

I plan to keep you aware of the developments regarding my visit to your area for the purpose of conducting oral interviews with you.

This letter serves to ask you if you would be willing to participate as one of the participants in this particular study. Should you choose to participate you will be asked to available yourself on the day to be decided by the both yourself and the researcher.

The duration of the interviewing session will last for about three to four hours. This interview will be conducted at your convenience and should not add addition pressure on your schedule and precious time.

If you are willing to participate in this study, please fill in the consent box below.

Please be assured that your identity will be protected with the written report through the use of pseudonyms, once again, please do not feel under pressure to participate in this study.

Kind regards

.....

Consent box

I----- consent to being a participant in this study and make the documents available to the researcher for data analysis and reporting purpose.

I agree to make myself available at my convenience for an interview if necessary. I also understand that I am under no obligation and that I am able to withdraw from the study at any given time, should I choose to do so.

NAME -----

SIGNATURE -----

DATE -----